BABEL

AFIAL

Aspectos de Filoloxía Inglesa e Alemá

Nº 30 - Ano 2021

30

Servizo de Publicacións

Universidade de Vigo


BABEL
AFIAL

BABEL-AFIAL
Nº 30; Ano 2021

EDITA
Servizo de Publicacións da Universidade de Vigo
Campus Universitario de Vigo
36310 Vigo, España

MAQUETA
Oficode, S.L.

ISSN 1132 - 7332 - eISSN 2660 - 4906
DEP. LEGAL PO -603 - 02

Indice / Contents / Inhaltsverzeichnis

Artigos / Artículos / Articles / Artikel

Recensións / Reseñas / Reviews / Rezensionen

'What you thought you have forgotten': *The Mersey Sound* Revisited

Ángeles Jordán Soriano (ajs895@ual.es)[1]
Universidad de Almería

Abstract

The Mersey Sound (1967) was the best-selling poetry anthology of the sixties in the UK. Apart from its commercial success, it is also an important document in terms of the study of working-class literary output in this decade. Despite this, its position within the British literary canon has often been neglected in academic realms. It is for this reason that the present article aims to offer an insight into the scholarly importance of this anthology through offering arguments for its re-evaluation. Moreover, in this research its current status will be explored, looking in particular at contemporary literary criticism of working-class mass culture and art. To this end, I will first discuss the main justifications for a reconsideration of the significance of the collection and describe its context and origins. This will be followed by an analysis of the content of the volume and its current relevance. Conclusions drawn from this will include possible reasons for its absence in many academic poetry guides and will also stress the need to recover and reappraise the anthology in future research on working-class British poetry.

Keywords: *The Mersey Sound*, British poetry, Liverpool, Beat poetry, working-class literature.

"Lo que creías haber olvidado": una revisión de *The Mersey Sound*

Resumen

The Mersey Sound (1967) fue la antología poética más vendida de la década de los sesenta en el Reino Unido.

Esta obra no solo supuso un éxito comercial, sino que también se erige como un documento vital para el estudio de la producción literaria de la clase obrera a lo largo de esta década. Sin embargo, en el ámbito académico, su gran papel ha sido frecuentemente desvinculado del canon literario británico. Por esta razón, la intención de este artículo es la de presentar la importancia académica de esta antología y, a su vez, ofrecer motivos para su revaluación. También se explorarán las causas de su estado actual teniendo en especial consideración la opinión de la crítica coetánea acerca del arte de la cultura de masas y de la clase obrera. Para llevar a cabo esto, comenzaré presentando en profundidad las principales razones para reexaminar la importancia de esta antología y describiré su contexto y génesis. Esto será sucedido por un análisis del contenido de esta obra y su relevancia en el contexto actual. Toda esta información será útil para sacar conclusiones, no solo con respecto a las posibles razones de su ausencia en numerosos volúmenes de poesía, sino que también servirá para reconsiderar la necesidad de recuperar y revalidar esta obra en futuros estudios sobre la poesía británica producida por la clase obrera.

Palabras clave: *The Mersey Sound*, poesía británica, Liverpool, poesía Beat, literatura de clase obrera.

1. Introduction

Liverpool had become a very popular place by the early sixties. Its fame was in great part due to the city's most successful band, The Beatles, whose first appearance in the US in 1962 brought with it a growing exposure of Liverpudlian culture to the world. Although The Beatles would indeed be the most prominent figures associated with Liverpool throughout the decade, in the same year that they conquered America the city was also experiencing the blooming of another revolution, in this case, poetic. The literary movement was known as Merseybeat[2] or Mersey Sound, and although it was never

intended to be 'literary,'[3] it proved to be a landmark in the literature of the sixties, after Penguin invited three Liverpool poets —Adrian Henri, Roger McGough and Brian Patten— to publish their work under the title *The Mersey Sound* in 1967. In a relatively short space of time, the volume enjoyed unprecedented success, eventually becoming the best-selling poetry anthology of the decade in the UK, according to Penguin's own publicity.

In order to understand its success, it is important to consider what made this book relevant and different from other publications of the decade. Among the most prominent themes, readers can find the Americanisation of the British working class, paradoxically combined with the regional identity of the city of Liverpool, this in turn conditioned by its specific situation of isolation and its unique folklore. Moreover, other frequently occurring elements were contingent on the modernising effect of the swinging sixties in the country, especially those which challenged tradition; poems devoted to pacifism, sexuality or the evolution of the country towards modernity abound in the anthology. Since the target readership was the working class, these poems are characterised by their lack of complexity, which partly explains why *The Mersey Sound* has been defined by Morag Shiach as "often comic, frequently polemical and always accessible" (544).

Such an approach collides with some previous tendencies in British poetry, such as The Movement.[4] Although these latter authors, who were closely associated with the British New Left, also wanted to make poetry simple and appealing to the average English citizen, they differed from the Mersey poets, and other genuine working-class authors, in their conception of "good" poetry, which for them favoured form over content. They were classicist in outlook, and the critics of The Movement often rejected some of their work which, albeit stemming from the working class, was too modernist and American-oriented, as I will discuss below.

Despite its negative reception in academic circles, the legacy of *The Mersey Sound* in British counterculture is undeniable, acknowledged by beatnik figures such as Allen Ginsberg and constituting the main source of inspiration for subsequent poets, such

as John Cooper Clarke. Besides, *The Mersey Sound*, along with other releases from the end of the decade like The Beatles' *Sgt. Pepper's Lonely Hearts Club Band* (1967) and *Children of Albion: Poetry of the Underground in Britain* (1969), seem to have been key in the intellectual recognition of pop and working-class culture, which until then had been demonised, or considered banal and meaningless (Sinfield 287).

Despite all this, references to the anthology are scant, especially in scholarly discourse. For this reason, the present article seeks to offer an insight into these poems and to revaluate this important poetic movement, the impact of which sometimes appears to have been forgotten, perhaps as a result of the negative criticism of contemporary critics. Additionally, a consideration of the poems will offer us a critical glimpse into the socio-political events of the decade, as well as the long-lasting relevance of the concerns of the poems in Britain today, especially concerning the working class.

2. Context and Origins

In order to begin dealing with *The Mersey Sound*, it is necessary to outline the origins and evolution of the movement which gave rise to the anthology. Several sources argue that it is difficult to establish the exact date of the beginning of the poetical Mersey Sound. However, there is a general agreement that its development was parallel to that of the musical Merseybeat, taking place, in this case, between 1962 and 1963. It was at this time that Adrian Henri[5] (1932-2000), an art teacher from the area, began to organise artistic gatherings in the clubs and basements of Liverpool 8, then the trendiest and more bohemian area of the city (Hobson). At these events, which sought to emulate American happenings, he combined his surrealist live painting with music and poetry. It was only a matter of time before these meetings caught the attention of Roger McGough[6] (1937-), a literature teacher at a local school, who, like Henri, was imbued in the Liverpudlian underground scene, in his case with his band of comedians, The Scaffold, formed by McGough himself, John Gorman, and Mike McGear, Paul McCartney's younger brother. With the intention of organising a poetic performance, Henri and McGough put an advert

in the local newspaper, which was answered by Brian Patten[7] (1946-). He was a 15-year-old student, and a future journalist and writer who, like the other two artists, shared a desire to make art, especially poetry, that appealed to the Liverpudlian working class.

They were highly influenced by the American beat poets, not just in the use of the free-verse and the transgressive topics they shared, but also in that their poetry was performative and not intended to be written down in a conventional way, at least not until the point when Penguin asked for it. Indeed, this can be seen in the existence of different versions of the poems depending on the performance. It is true that some of them were written in manuscript form in order to be performed. However, as Catherine Marcangeli[8] suggests, these looked more like scripts, since they contained a sort of draft with lyrics, performance indications, and even drawings (Hobson). Also in relation to the Beat connection, we should note that these poets gained such prominence in a short amount of time that, during the 1965 International Poetry Incarnation in London, they were visited and commended by Allen Ginsberg. Moreover, the following year, they were contacted by the publishers, who wanted to collect the trio's most popular poems as part of the Penguin Modern Poets series. This, then, was the birth of *The Mersey Sound* (1967).

The first edition of the anthology is divided into three sections, each featuring the work of one of the poets. It opens with 30 of Henri's poems, followed by those of McGough (24), and ends with those of Patten (26). Each section has been expanded in subsequent editions, and indeed we might mention here that *The Mersey Sound* has never been out of print since (Persoon & Watson 263); the most recent edition was released by Penguin to celebrate the 50th anniversary of the volume in 2017. Whilst Henri, McGough and Patten were part of the same movement, certain heterogeneity can also be observed in their contributions. In the case of Henri, we find the frequent use of more surrealist and visual poetry with abundant allusions to pop culture. Although these pop references are also present in the poems by Patten and McGough, in their case surrealism is often replaced by more explicit political commitment, albeit with humour. Further notable differences in their poems can also be highlighted; thus, most of McGough's poems, although still experimental in content, display a

more traditional structure, usually being consistent in terms of the number of stanzas and lines per stanza. On the other hand, free verse or prose poems occur more frequently in Patten and Henri's sections. Devices such as listing and the use of different fonts are also common, especially in the case of Henri.

With regard to the cover of the 1967 edition, this was very unusual in comparison to other poetry anthologies of the time. It was designed by Alan Spain, an art-designer for Penguin known for his modernist style and his collages which often exploited the contrast between black and white photographs and images in primary colours. In the case of *The Mersey Sound*, the most salient feature is the use of a striking red tone. The cover is a collage which displays a red skyline of the city of Liverpool and the name of the book in a psychedelic font common in the mid-sixties, all in vertical—another frequent feature of Spain's work. This collage also includes black and white pictures of a carousel and a woman screaming, something reminiscent of the city's Beatlemania. The cover thus emphasises the pop nature of the volume, in that these authors wanted to appeal to the same audience that enjoyed the musical and artistic British scene, rather than merely the literary one.

Indeed, crucial in the reception of the volume was its success among the working class. Marcangeli notes that:

> setting up readings and performing weekly in front of an audience made them acutely aware of the need to be accessible, and entertaining, so poetry readings often had musical interludes or musical accompaniment—the Art College and a variety of pubs and music venues, as well as ad hoc performance spaces were only a short walk from each other, making such collaborations all the easier and spontaneous (Marcangeli 149).

In fact, the poets themselves have noted that it was very inspiring to see their success in managing to make poetry funny and interesting for the average customers of the city's pubs and clubs, often typically keen on football and drinking. The book, then, allowed them to achieve their goal of introducing poetry to everyone. Nevertheless,

this approach to the common citizen was used by critics to critique the volume. Patten recalls how they were called "the three-headed pantomime horse", and Henri even laughs at this kind of harsh criticism, quoting from critics during his performances, for instance, "the fact that the people of Liverpool thought that their bad poetry is different from other bad poetry, does not make it so" [sic] (qtd. in Hobson). However, it is important to mention that, likewise, the Liverpool Poets also disliked academia since, as mentioned, "poets suddenly found themselves the spokesmen of a real community — a community which took its standards from the art schools rather than the universities" (Lucie-Smith 32). The poet Edward Lucie-Smith also notes how "the reason why the generally modernist inclination of English poetry in the sixties has tended to escape critical recognition has something to do with another phenomenon: the decentralization of the poetic community and the tendency for poets to reject the academic world and academic criticism" (31). Moreover, in the particular case of *The Mersey Sound*, other factors may have caused this negative criticism. In this aspect, it is important to take into consideration that the poetry of this volume was not originally intended to be read but performed. In fact, it was one the most praised features of these poets, as several scholars highlight that by performing their poetry, "the Liverpool Poets came to represent the democratic ethos of the 1960s, which would at least soften the strict class boundaries that define British society" (Persoons & Watson 287). Therefore, without the performative dimension, some of the elements which made these poems popular, such as the presence of spontaneity and lack of complexity, could be considered as a flaw for certain critics.

Yet, it was indeed a fact that the local population, including the working class, loved this poetry, as we can infer from its commercial success and the subsequent reissue of the anthology in 1970 with additional new poems. According to Sinfield, in the sixties the New Left became bewildered by the mixture, for them an incompatible one, of "commerce and rebelliousness" found in the new forms of art produced by working class. As part of their annoyance, some of the authors and critics who had fought against elitism less than a decade before had, paradoxically, become the new elite that was now disparaging the kind of art that they did not consider "good" enough (284-285). Sinfield expands on this idea by arguing that:

> the conception of 'good' culture generated in welfare-capitalism, I have shown, took much from the residual leisure elite. Movement and Angry writers eschewed self-consciously artistic modes and presented 'down-to-earth' attitudes on class and sexuality, but their conception of 'good' culture was not very different - they adopted jazz as a protest but also as an art. The New Left actually revalidated 'good' culture and 'responsible' institutions. All this came into question as the rebellion of middle-class and higher-educated young people impatient with the reticence of their parents coincided, briefly and almost uniquely, with the rebellion of lower-class young people, built upon the rock-'n'-roll and skiffle subcultures. There were new kinds of employment in cultural production for the upper-middle-class young, and unaccustomed people invaded the old kinds. These young people had acquired the confidence not to compromise with 'good' culture but to challenge it with new modes [...] 'Art', 'literature' and 'poetry' looked like grafitti, advertisements, comics and pop songs, and the kind of attention usually given to 'good' culture was lavished on popular and commercial forms (283-284).

This sort of contradiction within the ideology of The Movement can be observed in several claims made by its writers. For instance, in 1964 Philip Larkin, a fundamental figure in The Movement, asserted in a BBC interview that his poetry was still considered by more elitist critics as "welfare-state subpoetry" which was still not good enough for their standards (1964), something very similar to what most of The Movement poets thought of works like *The Mersey Sound*.[9]

It is important to note that similar events were taking place during this period across the country, but with the greatest focus in London. The Poetry Incarnation in 1965 and the massive success of *Children of Albion* (1969) stand as proof that poetry was changing, and that these events constituted the beginning of a new Poetry Revival in the UK, as Juha Virtanen, expert in performative poetry, labels it (27-55). With regard to this, we might highlight the fact

that in his volume *Poetry and Performance During the British Poetry Revival 1960-1980: Event and Effect* (2017), Virtanen omits *The Mersey Sound* from the movement, and indeed Liverpool's poetry scene is not even mentioned. Moreover, when Ginsberg's visit to the city is described, it is said to be merely related to the musical scene, with Virtanen not including Henri's meetings with the Beat poet and Ginsberg's praise to the three of them[10]. This is a curious and significant omission, especially in light of the aim of the present article to illustrate the lack of recognition of this anthology. Going back to Virtanen's arguments on this revival, we might consider his analysis of the venue for the Poetry Incarnation, since the fact that it was the Royal Albert Hall, a place where the most popular rock and pop bands had been playing days earlier, seemed to be a sign that poetry was closer than ever to the rock and pop music scene (35). Such an argument is indeed pertinent here, since it can also be applied to the origins of *The Mersey Sound*, as well as to the decision of the poets to perform in Liverpudlian pubs, sometimes even accompanied by musicians.

As previously noted, Sinfield argued that in the sixties the idea of "good" culture started to be compromised by the culture of the younger generations, most of them from working-class origins, which thanks to the welfare state had gained access to higher education. These generations, in turn, produced their own kind of cultural creations, greatly influenced by contemporary trends such as pop. As it had already happened with The Beatles and the subsequent working-class artists throughout the decade, the style of the Mersey poets was conditioned to a significant degree by two major factors: the Americanisation of British culture and the modernisation of the country during Harold Wilson's government, which coincided in time with the key years of the Merseybeat. As we have said, both the welfare state in post-war Britain, which granted education to a broader population of young citizens, and the government-led modernisations in the sixties, were crucial for the rise of new artists. Wilson's Labour government supported this through subsidies for artists and measures such as the abolishment of the Censorship Act. On the other hand, the BBC, under the leadership of Hugh Greene, known for "encouraging more liberal attitudes within the corporation", also promoted the cultural scene (Waymark 3). The historian Dominic

Sandbrook observes that in the sixties, the UK was the country with most art academies and art schools in the world, and these places were vital for the rise of British subcultures and the underground scene of the decade (Sandbrook 77). Besides, in such a scenario, where art was sponsored by the government, a larger variety of publications appeared which, under different conditions, might otherwise never have seen the light (Sinfield 27-39).

Returning to the American influences of this poetical movement, the Mersey Sound, despite being named after the city's river, provides a perfect symbiosis between the American beatnik movement and British culture, with special emphasis on the working class. Even the modernist techniques found in *The Mersey Sound* originally from the influence that American poets had on British modernism, which explains why The Movement was even more reluctant to accept this style, since the effects of Americanisation were in conflict with their political ideas (190).

The influence of American culture can also be observed in the praise for pop culture that can be found in the poems, which in this case might have differed from the antimaterialism found in beat poets such as Ginsberg. Although the recurrent use of irony in the Mersey poets might have hindered the intended aim of critiquing certain not-so-positive elements of American culture, such as consumerism, it is clear that they did not aim to be as explicitly critical as the American poets were, but rather to describe British society's reconfiguration towards American habits. With regard to this, it must be taken into account that during the sixties it was common among transgressive artists to take American mass culture and consumerism as an alternative to the British establishment (Sandbrook 73). Therefore, in their attempt to escape from the elitism of British traditions, working-class artists embraced American culture as if it represented freedom and the 'good' alternative. It is a complex issue to determine whether this was the case with the Mersey Poets, since the use of irony is recurrent in almost all their work. Nevertheless, in Stephen Wade's words, "the Liverpool Scene identify this community more easily with run-down urban areas in the US than with the culture-soaked cities in the UK, where university campuses and English departments manage poetry readings in polite outlets, mainly for 'cultured' people" (10).

Considering all these features, it is true that most of them could be applied to any working-class creation, for instance the poetry anthology *Children of Albion* (1969),[11] which, similarly to *The Mersey Sound*, was published by Penguin. So, why is *The Mersey Sound* different? Why was its role as a working-class publication in the British Poetry Revival eclipsed over time by *Children of Albion*? In the following section, I will approach these questions in order to underline its importance, offering an analysis of the collection and setting out the main reasons why the denial by academic writers of *The Mersey Sound*'s key role in the British Poetry Revival of the sixties could be problematic.

3. Content of the volume and current relevance

Although *Children of Albion* may offer a more pluralistic vision, in that it collects poets from all areas of Great Britain, *The Mersey Sound* is a vital document towards exploring the unique regional features of the poetry of Liverpool. With regard to these particular elements, some scholars argue that in the case of the Mersey poets, orality is not a feature taken from the beatnik poetry but something very common and particular to the folklore of Liverpool, as Stephen Wade argues in one of the few academic publications devoted to *The Mersey Sound* (8). In fact, although Andrew Duncan, when dealing with Liverpool poetry, claims that "it would be wiser to suggest the USA as the place where the mutation originated", he also argues that in north-western England, this tendency towards performative poetry had always been very strong, from the time of the first Scandinavian invasions. During this period, in order to narrate the deeds of heroes, orality took precedence over writing, while in the centre and south of the country, a more developed written style was more frequently seen (133).

Moreover, Wade also finds other features which distinguish *The Mersey Sound* from American poetry and which place it closer to a more British identity. For example, he establishes many parallelisms between some of the nineteenth-century Lake poets and the Mersey poets. Among these, he highlights spontaneity, the way that authors embrace the genuine English working class, not an elite audience, and above all, the inclusion of socio-political topics, similar to those

of poets such as Shelley. Although this political aim is also found in The Movement, the tendency with the latter to adhere strictly to classical structures undermines any sense of spontaneity. Such similarities of the Liverpool poets with elements from notable poems of established British literature, in this case, are set alongside references to modernity, and are probably intentional, as these poets were intimately familiar with the British tradition. Besides, this is also seen in the high number of allusions and paeans to well-known authors throughout the anthology. One frequent reference, as was also the case with the American Beat poets, is to William Blake. He is mentioned in Henri's poem, "Mrs Albion, you've got a Lovely Daughter" and according to Patten, this poem was inspired by an experience with Ginsberg. During his visit to Liverpool, while Henri was showing Ginsberg the most iconic landmarks of the city, the Beat poet was impressed by some graffiti, including the phrase "Billy Blake is fab" (Hobson). This anecdote also stands as an example of the particular symbiosis between the contemporaneous Beat poets, England in the swinging sixties, and the Romantics.

Moreover, other topics found in *The Mersey Sound* relate to anti-war themes, some of them on international issues, such as condemning Vietnam War, despite the fact that Wilson's government avoided participation by the UK. We might also recall that the British government was involved in a conflict with Rhodesia at the time the anthology was released, and indeed the anti-war tone of these poems is sometimes more general and seems to refer to other wars. In fact, some poems allude to memories of World War II from the poets' own childhoods, such as McGough's "A Square Dance" and Henri's "Great War Poems". There are also poems that reflect their fears about the possible consequences of the Cold War. In this respect, their intention is similar to that of the poets of *Children of Albion*, since most of them were closely involved in the Campaign for Nuclear Disarmament. It is worth mentioning that due to the surrealist style of some poems, references to previous wars and conflicts can be mixed, as in McGough's "Mother the Wardrobe is Full of Infantrymen" and Henri's "On the Late Late Massachers Stillbirths and Deformed Children a Smoother Lovelier Skin Job". The latter was inspired by John Milton's "Sonnet XVIII: On The Late Massacre In Piemont", and while it depicts a dystopian scene

resulting from Nuclear Armament, Henri employs irony and offers allusions to Hiroshima, to various politicians from around the world, and above all, to the consequences for the natural environment. These elements are combined with consumerist features and journalistic headlines:

> The Triple Tyrant Macmillan Kennedy Watkinson
> The West governments are satisfied as to the moral
> necessity to resume Racing from Newmarket
> EXTRA SPECIAL!
> Atmospheric testing: A test card is shown
> continuously from to a.m. until 15 minutes
> before slayn by the bloody Piemontese
> why pay higher fares?
> There is always trouble when President Kennedy the
> jovial gravel-voiced little sailor
> defends glamorous Olive Oyl from contamination of
> the atmosphere
> EXTRA MONEY their moans
> The Vales redoubled to the Hills
> Another fire blazes in the city of London AND ALL
> THAT JAZZ
> Do you draw your curtains with a walkingstick?
> The mutation was caused by a heavy dose of radiation
> received
> by the Mother at Hiroshima
> This baby's eyes and nose had merged into
> one misshapen feature in the middle of its
> forehead, lost 6' from Hips
> sufferers can now wear fashion stockings
> Early may fly the Babylonian wo
> followed by
> TOMORROW'S WEATHER
> The Epilogue
> close down (Henri et al. 15-16).

Similarly, in McGough's "Mother the Wardrobe is Full of Infantrymen", the poet introduces the topics of war and nuclear conflict, combining them with humour and surrealist situations:

"mother there is a centurian tank in the parlour/ i did i asked the officer/ but he laughed saying 'Queens regulations'/ (piano was out of tune anyway)/ mother polish your identity bracelet/ there is a mushroom cloud in the backgarden" (83).

Apart from the previous topics, the anthology has a generally transgressive tone towards tradition. As already noted, elements related to pop, sex, and how Liverpool was moving towards modernity are common. Among these, we might highlight Patten's "Maud, 1965", a poem intended to be a modern adaptation of Alfred Tennyson's "Maud". In this poem the speaker relocates the protagonist of the Victorian poem to the Swinging Sixties; Maud wears Mary Quant clothes and wanders "among the office blocks" and buses of a modern city (103-104). As in Henri's poems, the coexistence of popular elements with canonical literary and artistic references here establishes "a web of references that made his work both complex and accessible" (Marcangeli 139). Such references to other poems and songs were not merely used to offer an analogy to the sixties lifestyle and leisure, but also to condemn other contemporary conflicts, such as war or issues related to racism and nationalism. There are several poems that question the meaning of patriotism, for instance, "I'm Dreaming of a White Smethwick", added to the anthology in the 1970 edition. This poem alludes to the racist events that took place in Smethwick, combining them to the lyrics of the popular Christmas song in order to parody Enoch Powell's infamous speech "Rivers of Blood" (1968):

> I'm dreaming of a white Smethwick,
> One I didn't want to know,
> Where they'll have allwhite, allright children
> And the White and White Minstrel Show [...] I saw
> black father christmasses
> Burning in the snow,
> Protesting to the Opposition
> About what happened a while ago.
> The last blackbird's been shot in Smethwick
> And the council's doing allright,
> The M.P.'s in the Commons
> Making sure his words are white (Henri et al. 98).

As this example serves to illustrate, in *The Mersey Sound* political criticism is almost always coupled with the use of irony, wit and humour, creating a tone which, in this case, differs from the kind of tone found in the performative poetry of the International Poetry Incarnation, where poets tended to address political themes in a more indignant and directly challenging way, or through a solemn tone, as is the case in Adrian Mitchell's "To Whom It May Concern (Tell me Lies about Vietnam)".

Indeed, humour and regionalism were not only the distinctive mark of *The Mersey Sound* in comparison with other contemporary performative poetry, but also one of the reasons why they may have been misjudged and underrated. Being dismissed for too great a proximity to popular culture and for being associated with the local working class was not only a criticism present in the sixties but in the following decades too. Owen Jones notes that, if in the sixties "Old Labour" at least showed a desire to address and solve problems arising from class, after Thatcherism and the rise of "New Labour", the working class became a group mocked and blamed for their own condition, and indeed forgotten by left-wing politics as these turned to focus more on identity rather than class (7-9). In fact, he argues that "at the root of the demonization of working-class people is the legacy of a very British class war" (10). The underestimation of art and artists based on allusions to their class and expected audience remains present in contemporary criticism, which shows how working-class artists still have to fight to express their ideas and still face the same negative criticism, and sometimes prejudices, that *The Mersey Sound* encountered. As an example of such attitudes nowadays, we might take the case of artists such as Sleaford Mods, a working-class duo whose *sprechgesang* style in British pubs recalls the performative spirit of the Mersey Poets. They also share several features, with regard not only to style but to their working-class claims. Among these we might note themes that are present both in the sixties and in the current decade, such as racial tensions, the impending rise in nationalism — in the case of Sleaford Mods, especially alluding to Brexit— and the vindication of their working-class identity[12]. Moreover, the most significant element in the style of both is the use humour as the main means of conveying the message, something that has led to acclaim from a broader audience.

4. Conclusions

In view of the previous discussion, we can conclude that *The Mersey Sound* merits a revaluation, this for several reasons, which will be summarized in what follows.

First, it is important to note that this volume displays unique features from the regional style of Liverpool which cannot be found in other kinds of poetry such as the *Children of Albion*. These particular features, which allow readers to glimpse the daily lives of working-class Liverpudlians, were the ones which had been highly criticized by other authors who nevertheless claimed to support the intellectualization of the lower classes, such as Michael Horovitz. This does not imply that all the poets of *Children of Albion* undervalued *The Mersey Sound*. In the case of Adrian Mitchell, whose performance at the International Poetry Incarnation was perhaps the most politically committed, was a close friend of the Mersey poets and was even mentioned in some of their poems. Yet the fact that *The Mersey Sound* was treated as regional, second-class poetry by some of those who claimed to belong to the same social class reveals a complex and elitist hierarchy that lurks beneath the labels low-middle class and working-class authors. The best way to illustrate this is to observe how authors of The Movement who had been neglected by the establishment in turn rejected the modernist style of works such as *Children of Albion* or *The Mersey Sound*, and similarly (and paradoxically) the poets of the former anthology claimed that the latter was too "pop". In different ways, all these movements that rejected elitism in literature accused the following non-elite group of not writing "good" poetry. In this hierarchy, *The Mersey Sound* seems to have been judged for its pop elements, its regionalism, and the fact that it was performed to a genuine working-class audience in Liverpudlian pubs and common venues. This contrast was indeed a broad one in comparison to the performance of the poems of *Children of Albion* in London's Royal Albert Hall. The proof that the style of *The Mersey Sound* was more appealing to the average English citizen is the fact that it remains the best-selling poetical anthology in the UK. For all these reasons, I am inclined to believe that *The Mersey Sound* stands as one of the most fitting examples of the state of working-class poetry in the sixties, as well as being one of the earliest examples of the revival of British performance poetry.

However, as noted above, the role of the Mersey Poets in the British Poetry Revival of the sixties has seldom been recognised in the literature. The canon continues to attribute great merit to *Children of Albion* whilst omitting the Liverpool poets, or mentioning them only vaguely, for instance, when Andrew Duncan argues that "the new poetry of the sixties did have origins partly in Liverpool and adjacent regions" (131). It is important to note that, although academic work has favoured *Children of Albion*, portraying it as fundamental in the British Performative Poetry Revival and continuing to allude to it as such in recent studies, in terms of accessibility it had been as neglected in some ways as *The Mersey Sound* has been in others. Thus, commercially speaking, *Children of Albion* is almost impossible to acquire these days since it is out of print, although some of its poems can be found separately in other sources; by contrast, the poetry produced by the authors of The Movement is widely available, and has even been translated into different languages. Once again, despite the alleged academic importance of the *Children of Albion* and the value and commercial success of *The Mersey Sound*, underground poetry fell into the shadow cast by a more elitist group.

I would also like to return to one specific feature of *The Mersey Sound* which was also a matter of criticism, its Liverpool-centred themes. For this reason, Henri, McGough and Patten are sometimes labelled the Liverpool Poets. This can be observed, for instance, in Persoons and Watson's guide of poetry *The Facts on File Companion to British Poetry 1900 to the Present* (2009). This is striking considering that, if we set aside its references to Liverpool, *The Mersey Sound* shares almost all its features with the Beat British Poetry as associated with *Children of Albion*. For this reason, we might note that the category "Liverpool Poets" might itself be double-edged. On the one hand, it emphasizes the unique and regional features of these three poets, elements which we might assume to be positive in light of Ginsberg's preference for regionalism in Beat Poetry (Walker 47). Nonetheless, in view of the rejection of *The Mersey Sound* in academic studies and even by other working-class authors such as Michael Horovitz, the implications of naming Henri, McGough and Patten "Liverpool Poets" must be considered carefully, since this could serve as a means of underrating them, effectively detaching them from the Beat and underground poetry performed in London, despite the similarities

and their political commitment—although in their case, with more humour.

In fact, humour was one of the key elements that led to the success of these poems in their depiction of the working class. Although for some scholars this approach to the working class through humour was seen as a reason to underrate the radical content of the poems, this way of dealing with certain issues concerning class can still be observed in contemporary manifestations of working-class poetry, especially when dealing with similar topics, such as politics and class identity, as we have discussed above. This may show how the vindications of working-class artists and the struggle to deconstruct their "demonization" remains a battle to be fought.

Considering all these arguments, it seems that there are several factors which have contributed to the lack of academic interest in this particular volume outside Liverpool, and its almost non-existent global exposure. In the decades which followed the publication of *The Mersey Sound*, Henri, McGough and Patten continued with their own solo careers, enjoying considerable national impact. Hence, although vindicated over time, they are perhaps better known for their late publications. However, this should not obscure the importance of their origins and the value of the volume presented in this article. For this reason, it is important to celebrate the role of *The Mersey Sound* as a pioneering work in performative and working-class poetry in Britain, which challenged the elitism of contemporary poetry, even that of the underground, and above all, which showed itself to be the audience's favourite, as the best-selling poetry anthology of all time in the UK.

Notes

[1] The research on this paper has been supported by Lindisfarne Research Group and the project CEI Patrimonio (University of Almería).

[2] *Mersey Beat* was also a musical magazine from Liverpool which covered the cultural scene of the same decade. For this reason, the name is also used to refer to the musical movement from the city prior to the British Invasion. Although the vast majority of the artistic

movements which took place in this area during those years were interrelated and often multidisciplinary, in order to offer a clearer analysis, I will differentiate the musical Mersey beat from the poetical one, which is the focus of the present study. In order to do so, I will refer henceforth to the Liverpool poets as *The Mersey Sound*, the title given to their poetry anthology.

[3] Due to the multidisciplinary nature of this movement and its detachment from traditional literary groups, Stephen Wade labels it a "movement that was not conscious of being 'literary' at all" (ix).

[4] Coined in 1954 by J. D. Scott, editor of *The Spectator*, the term The Movement refers to a group of writers who supported the use of traditional poetical rules and promoted Englishness in their poems, being "against cosmopolitan Modernisms identified as non-native" (Tuma and Dorward 287). In the fifties, their poetry was considered anti-establishment literature, since most of these authors belonged to the lower-middle class and sought to provide less elitist content. Apart from these features, they were a heterogeneous group, and in the sixties some writers moved towards different styles. The Movement authors were, for example, Philip Larkin, Elizabeth Jennings, Donald Davie, Kingsley Amis and D. J. Enright, among others.

[5] Although *The Mersey Sound* was the first major success of these artists, Henri, McGough and Patten had prolific careers after the publication of this volume and received several awards for their artistic contribution. It is important to note how Adrian Henri continued his promotion of poetry in the following years. He also created a poetry-and-rock band named Liverpool Scene which toured with acclaimed groups like Led Zeppelin. Moreover, in 1969 he took part in the Art Council Writers' Tours to promote literature in rural areas.

[6] McGough is also well-known for having written several children books, plays and programmes for the BBC. In 1985 he won a BAFTA for his script of the film *Kurt, Mungo, BP and Me*. He is currently collaborating in the BBC radio programme *Poetry Please*, where the poems requested by the audience are performed by a cast of acclaimed British actors.

[7] The same year *The Mersey Sound* was released, Patten also published a solo collection of poems named *Little Johnny's Confessions*. Moreover, he is currently very interested in the promotion of poetry among children, having published several children books and anthologies such as *The Puffin Book of Modern Children's Verse* (2006).

[8] Marcangeli is known for her recent research on the figure of Adrian Henri as 'a total artist'. She has explored Henri's multidisciplinary artistic career and, as his partner, she had edited and posthumously published some of his later works. Besides, in contrast to the scant attention paid to *The Mersey Sound* in the previous decades, in 2017 Marcangeli participated with McGough and Patten in the BBC documentary "Sex, Chips and Poetry: 50 years of the Mersey Sound" (2017), a homage to the 50th anniversary of the first publication of the volume. During the same year, the three of them took part in other anniversary events commissioned by the Liverpool City Council.

[9] Paradoxically, the earliest positive comments McGough received on his poetry were from Larkin in the fifties when, as a student at Hull University, he coincided with Larkin, who read his poems. Nevertheless, this was before McGough discovered Rimbaud and the Beats, and his style at the time was more conventional (Wade 7).

[10] Testimonial and visual documents of their meetings can be found in the interviews and images offered by Patten, McGough and their acquaintances for the BBC documentary "Sex, Chips and Poetry: 50 years of the Mersey Sound" (2017). Besides, as Luke Walker reveals, Ginsberg was probably more interested in these regional poets than in those of the International Poetry Incarnation, since he had previously accused the British Beat scene of "not taking advantage of the variety of regional tones and dialects available" (47).

[11] Edited by Michael Horovitz, it collects the poems read in the International Poetry Incarnation of 1965, the most multitudinous event of performative poetry of the decade. Both share topics such as Beat poetry and the influence of William Blake. Despite the fact that it includes the work of more than sixty poets, the diversity of Horovitz's selection is often questioned, since just 7% of them were female authors, and the Mersey poets are excluded. According to Horovitz, these poets were too "pop", instead of "bop", the latter term, he claims, describing the poets of *Children of Albion* (qtd. in Walker 53). Again, this may be linked to the appropriation of jazz by New Left artists and their rejection of pop as a symbol of mass culture.

[12] Jason Williamson and Andrew Fearn, members of Sleaford Mods, were described in 2015 as "the new voice of Britain's disaffected working class" due to their strong commitment to depicting the situation of this social group (Kutchinsky). Their later album, *Spare Ribs* (2021), had reached number 4 in the British music

charts by January 2021, being the most prominent example of a working-class-themed band in the top 10. Therefore, they also resemble the Mersey poets in terms of the commercial success they have enjoyed.

Works cited

Duncan, Andrew. *Centre and Periphery in Modern British Poetry*, Liverpool UP, 2005.

Henri, Adrian, et al. *The Mersey Sound: Restored 50th Anniversary Edition*, Penguin Random House UK, 2017.

Hobson, Ellen, dir. *Sex, Chips and Poetry: 50 years of the Mersey Sound*, with Adrian Henri, Brian Patten, Roger McGough, Catherine Marcangeli, BBC, 2017.

Jones, Owen. *Chavs. The Demonization of the Working Class*, Verso, 2011.

Kutchinsky, Serena. "Are Sleaford Mods Britain's most political band?" *Prospect*, 2015, https://www.prospectmagazine.co.uk/arts-and-books/are-sleaford-mods-britains-most-political-band. Accessed 20 Jan. 2021.

Larkin, Philip. "Down Cemetery Road" by John Betjeman. *Monitor*, 1964, https://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/b00drs8w

"The London Underground." *Frieze*. https://www.frieze.com/article/london-underground. Accessed 4 Dec. 2020.

Lucie-Smith, Edward. "Introduction". *British Poetry since 1945*, Penguin Books, 1980.

Marcangeli, Catherine. "Adrian Henri – Total Artist". *Crossing Borders: Appropriations and Collaborations*, vol. 38, 2017, pp. 140-156.

Mitchell, Adrian. "To Whom It May Concern". International Poetry Incarnation in Royal Albert Hall, London, 1965.

Persoons, J. and Robert R. Watson. *The Facts on File Companion to British Poetry 1900 to the Present*, Facts On File, 2009.

Sandbrook, Dominic. *White Heat: Britain in the Sixties*, Abacus, 2007.

Shiach, Morag. "Nation, Region, Place: Devolving Cultures." *The Cambridge History of the Twentieth Century English Literature*, edited by Laura Marcus and Peter Nicholls, Cambridge University Press, 2008, pp. 528-44.

Sinfield, Alan. *Literature, Politics, and Culture in Postwar Britain*, edited by Alan Sinfield, Bloomsbury, 1997.

Tuma, Keith and Nate Dorward. "Modernism and anti-Modernism in British Poetry." *The Cambridge History of the Twentieth Century English Literature*, edited by Laura Marcus and Peter Nicholls, Cambridge University Press, 2008, pp. 510–528.

Virtanen, Juha. *Poetry and Performance During the British Poetry Revival 1960-1980: Event and Effect*, Palgrave Macmillan, 2017.

Wade, Stephen. *Gladsongs and Gatherings Poetry and its Social Context in Liverpool since the 1960s*, Liverpool UP, 2001.

Walker, Luke. *The Routledge Handbook of International Beat Literature*. Edited by A. Robert Lee, Routledge, 2018.

Waymark, Peter Astley Grosvenor. *Television and the Cultural Revolution: the BBC under Hugh Carleton Greene*, PhD thesis, The Open University, 2006.

Recibido / Received: 12-3-2021 *Aceptado /Accepted: 14-7-2021*

Descripción de GUL Ms Gen 831

Carmen María Pastor Ayala (carmenpastor@uma.es)
Universidad de Málaga

Resumen

Los manuscritos de recetas médicas del periodo del inglés moderno temprano han sido objeto de numerosos estudios. En este estudio presentamos uno de ellos, el GUL Ms Gen 831. Este trabajo describe el códice desde el punto de vista codicológico, donde, además del contenido, se detallan las dimensiones, el estado de conservación de las páginas y la encuadernación. Por otro lado, se ha llevado a cabo un estudio paleográfico, donde se analizan la puntuación, el tipo de letra, los errores y las correcciones que contiene el códice. Además de esta descripción se ha querido dar una visión general de la importancia de tener estos libros en las casas.

Palabras clave: libro de recetas médicas, periodo del inglés moderno temprano, escritura de mujeres, manuscritos, signos de puntuación.

Description of GUL Ms Gen 831

Abstract

Early Modern English medical recipe manuscripts have been the object of many studies in the last years. This article presents one of them, the GUL MS Gen 831. This study offers a description of the book from the codicological point of view, that is, it explores its content, dimensions, how pages are preserved, and its binding. On the other hand, the manuscript is viewed from a paleographic perspective, analyzing in detail punctuation, font, errors and amendments exhibited in

the text. To own this kind of books in this period was a sign of literacy.

Keywords: medical recipe books, Early Modern English period, women's writing, manuscripts, punctuation marks.

1. Introducción

En este trabajo describiremos el manuscrito Glasgow, Biblioteca de la Universidad de Glasgow, Ms Gen 831, depositado en el departamento de *Archives and Special Collections* de la citada Universidad. Se trata de un manuscrito del siglo XVII que contiene recetas médicas, escritas por dos personas, pues se aprecia una letra distinta en la última receta. Hay además unos dibujos de trazados muy sencillos en páginas posteriores.

En los últimos años ha ido creciendo el interés por los recetarios en el periodo del inglés moderno temprano y sobre todo aquellos escritos por mujeres (de la Cruz Cabanillas 13). En aquella época no eran muchas las mujeres que sabían leer y escribir. Las oportunidades de recibir una educación más completa eran muy desiguales con respecto a los hombres: "Classical education was largely a male prerogative in the Early Modern Period" (Nevalainen 136). Pero lo cierto es que las mujeres con cierta educación y cultura llevaban la contabilidad de sus casas, se implicaban en las tareas domésticas y en los cuidados de la salud familiar y no solo por responsabilidad sino también por innovación y prestigio social. Isabel de la Cruz Cabanillas (14) argumenta que estas actividades se veían reflejadas en los libros de recetas: "Cooking and household medicine were both responsabilities of English housewives. That is the reason why they often appear together in manuscripts."

El interés creado por el estudio de las mujeres que escribieron en el periodo del inglés moderno temprano es reciente y se ha centrado muy especialmente en los libros de cocina y recetas médicas. Es interesante ver cómo a través de estos libros de remedios caseros y culinarios podemos abordar trabajos de investigación, no solo lingüísticos sino también sociales. Prueba de ello lo encontramos en

el proyecto Perdita (de la Cruz Cabanillas 13), que incluye un conjunto de manuscritos dentro de esta categoría y son paralelos al códice objeto del presente estudio.

La metodología que se ha seguido para el desarrollo del presente trabajo ha sido la siguiente: en primer lugar, se ha realizado una transcripción semi-diplomática del texto, la cual consiste en transcribir el texto tal cual está en el original. El códice está digitalizado en la biblioteca de la Universidad de Glasgow, departamento de *Archives and Special Collections*. La digitalización del manuscrito ha facilitado el acceso y la lectura del mismo. Una vez transcrito el texto, se ha llevado a cabo, por un lado, la descripción codicológica del códice, donde además del contenido, se detallan las dimensiones, el estado de conservación de las páginas y la encuadernación. Por otro lado, en lo que respecta a la paleografía, se han analizado los diferentes signos de puntuación encontrados en el texto, los errores, las correcciones y el tipo de letra en la que está escrito el manuscrito.

2. El Códice

2.1. Contenido

El Ms Gen 831 de la Universidad de Glasgow contiene cincuenta y cinco recetas médicas y dos recetas culinarias, está datado entre 1645 y 1700, según la ficha técnica ofrecida por la biblioteca de la Universidad de Glasgow. El texto está escrito en inglés del periodo moderno temprano aunque tiene algunas palabras e incluso títulos de recetas escritas en latín, sobre todo los nombres de hierbas que iban a ser utilizadas en la elaboración de las recetas. Algunos ejemplos de estos nombres son: *scordium*, *carduus* (1) y el título de la receta: *aqua admirabilis et preciosa* (3). El hecho de que se nombraran estas hierbas en su lengua original se debía, en gran parte, a que el lenguaje científico se mantenía, en este caso, en latín, que se consideraba la lengua culta.

El códice tiene setenta y dos páginas escritas con gran variedad de remedios de fácil elaboración en el entorno doméstico para tratar distintas dolencias, como infecciones, parto, resfriados, fiebre, etc. Los títulos de las recetas indican el comienzo de cada una y, en el caso

del Ms Gen 831, no siguen un orden lógico o clasificado por órganos o enfermedades.

La última receta del manuscrito es de cocina y tiene una letra diferente a las anteriores. Se trata de una segunda persona que escribe en un mismo libro, o quizá podríamos decir que, en este caso, es muy apropiado el término inglés de *notebook* traducido al español como "libreta," ya que podían ser utilizados para incorporar nuevas recetas a medida que se iban necesitando o eliminarlas si se verificaba que no eran eficaces, además de ser escritos por diferentes miembros de la casa. De la Cruz Cabanillas (14) corrobora esta idea considerando que "[t]he manuscripts were not static pieces, as they were erased and expunged inasmuch as useless recipes could be removed or crossed out."

Aparte de los remedios y las dos recetas culinarias, hay hojas con dibujos de figuras humanas, hechos con palitos, en tinta negra que, según la ficha técnica ofrecida por la biblioteca de la Universidad de Glasgow, serían realizados por un menor. El resto del libro tiene cincuenta y cuatro páginas en blanco.

En cuanto a la forma que presentan las recetas, normalmente encontramos el título de la receta seguido de un párrafo principal que explica todo lo necesario para llevar a cabo la tarea. Francisco Alonso Almeida (72) establece el siguiente patrón para las recetas medievales y del Renacimiento: título, ingredientes, preparación, aplicación, almacenamiento, eficacia, número de tomas, referencia a la fuente e información adicional. Este autor aclara que los ingredientes son los únicos imprescindibles para que una receta sea precisamente eso, un conjunto de ingredientes que, mezclados y cocinados de alguna forma, da un resultado con un fin, ya fuera alimenticio o terapéutico. En el periodo del inglés moderno temprano el modelo de presentación de las recetas es de: título, ingredientes, preparación, aplicación, eficacia, almacenamiento, fecha de caducidad y virtudes. La mayoría de las recetas del códice Ms Gen 831 presenta esta última estructura, aunque encontramos algunas que siguen a las del Renacimiento en cuanto que nombra a las fuentes de donde proviene la receta (Lady Chesterfield, 25), se da información adicional ("too if man, woman or child," 69) y las *efficacy phrases* al final de cada receta (<approued>, 14; <probatum>, 25; <with gods blessing>, 25). Pero, según De la Cruz Cabanillas, las

recetas del periodo moderno temprano se distinguen además de las del periodo medieval en que ahora "recipes show an increasing tendency to use lavish ingredients. This can be due to a desire to sound exotic or to emulate the sophistication of French cuisine" (17). En el Ms Gen 831 no encontramos ninguno de estos nuevos ingredientes, lo que nos conduce a pensar que el comercio con Asia y América aún no tenía demasiada influencia, al menos en ese entorno social. La mayoría de los ingredientes que tenemos en las recetas del Ms Gen 831 son nombres de hierbas escritas en latín.

2.2. Colación y encuadernación

El volumen consta de dos tapas de piel de animal en color marrón. La primera página está en blanco, la segunda está arrancada (hay un trozo visible en el interior). La primera receta comienza en la tercera página, numerada con "1." A partir de la setenta y dos, hay páginas sueltas con algunos dibujos de palitos con forma humana. Estos dibujos, según la ficha técnica ofrecida por la biblioteca de la Universidad de Glasgow, parecen haber sido hechos por un menor: "Some of the blank leaves have been used by a young child for drawings of stick men, probably 17th or 18th century." El resto del libro son hojas en blanco.

En lo que respecta a la encuadernación, esta consistía en una serie de tiras de cuerda o cuero a las que se les cosían las hojas y fijaban unas tablas junto con un lomo que solían cubrirse con un trozo de piel de animal de color marrón (Obegi 14). El Ms Gen 831 de la Universidad de Glasgow presenta una encuadernación típica de la época, la cubierta es de piel suave, de color marrón y liso. Los bordes de la cubierta están desgastados por el tiempo. El libro tiene las siguientes dimensiones: 14,5 cm x 9,3 cm.; lomo: 1,9 cm.

2.3. Ms Gen 831

2.3.1. Codicología

Datación

Para el análisis codicológico del Ms Gen 831 empezaremos por los

datos de la ficha técnica que ofrece la biblioteca de la Universidad de Glasgow en su departamento de *Archives and Special Collections* (collections.gla.ac.uk/#/details/ecatalogue/271316). El códice data entre 1647 y 1700.

Autoría

Se desconoce el nombre de la persona o personas que copian el texto. En todas las recetas médicas hay un mismo tipo de letra. Pero la última, que es de cocina, está escrita por una segunda persona, con un tipo de letra diferente, más alargada y fina. Encontramos además algunos dibujos sencillos que representan a humanos, y que, según la ficha técnica ofrecida por la biblioteca de la Universidad de Glasgow, habrían sido realizados por niños pequeños. Los números de las páginas en el margen superior derecho (solo están los impares) han sido escritos más recientemente y a lápiz porque son de forma distinta a los números que aparecen en las cantidades de las recetas, que, aunque son arábigos también, al compararlos podemos ver que son más actuales.

Como hemos señalado en la introducción de este artículo, hay un interés creciente en los últimos años por el estudio de los libros de recetas médicas y culinarias escritos por mujeres en el periodo del inglés moderno temprano. De la Cruz Cabanillas (2) argumenta que "[w]omen compiled the information they considered useful from different sources, initially for consultation, but this kind of book was also a way of socializing." Efectivamente, este aspecto del intercambio de información y de socialización se ve reflejado en el Ms Gen 831 puesto que se hace mención a varios nombres de personas, como Mr Gaskins, Sir George o Lady Chesterfield. En concreto, una de las recetas se refiere a Lady Chesterfield como "My Lady Chesterfield" con el posesivo *My* que nos indica que esa persona era muy cercana a la que escribe la receta. Estos nombres hacían que las recetas tuvieran una mayor validez al tratarse de personas conocidas y que habrían probado la eficacia de estas recetas de fácil elaboración doméstica.

El Ms Gen 831 aparece físicamente junto a otros libros de la época y de la misma temática en un panel que se desarrolló en la Universidad de Glasgow en 2018 denominado "Historical Conversations, Gender History Panel." Aquí la Dra. Catriona Macleod de la citada universidad incluye, entre otros, el códice objeto de

nuestro estudio, el Ms Gen 831. Los manuscritos de esta muestra fueron escritos por mujeres o compilados por ellas. Entre los libros que figuran relacionados con el Ms Gen 831 están el de Mary Harrison, Ms Ferguson 61, el de Betty Maxwell, MS Murray 271 o el de Walter Peter and Margaret Alexander. Además de estos, en *Perdita Project* (2021) encontramos libros de recetas de cocina y otros que incluyen recetas médicas, como por ejemplo el Ms Sloane 2486 de Margaret Baker de 1650, que son también paralelos al Ms Gen 831.

Materiales y tinta

El material más común durante el periodo del inglés moderno temprano era ya la hoja de papel. Respecto a la tinta, esta es de color negra en todas las recetas. No hay adornos en este manuscrito ni tampoco diferentes colores. Los dibujos de palitos con forma humana de las hojas sueltas también están en tinta de color negra.

Dimensiones e interlineado

El MS Gen 831 comprende setenta y siete páginas escritas por delante y por detrás (recto y verso) con las siguientes dimensiones: la página mide 14 cm de largo y 9,2 cm de ancho; el margen izquierdo 0,6 cm y el margen derecho 1 cm. La primera línea está a 0,9 cm. El interlineado es de 0,5 y la sangría del primer párrafo es de 0,5 cm.

Desde el título de la receta a la primera línea de la misma hay una separación de 1,3 cm, pero no se sigue el mismo patrón pues en todas las páginas no es así. Cuando termina una receta, hasta el final de página, la separación es de 0,8 cm. Aunque tampoco es igual en todas, ya que a partir de la segunda página no hay espacio ni en la parte superior ni en el margen derecho. Entre receta y receta se deja un espacio de 1,6 cm. Y esto sí es igual en todas las demás. A veces encontramos que, aunque delimitado por unas líneas dobles en el margen izquierdo y solo una en el derecho, la persona que escribe se sale un poco de esta línea para no separar la palabra que está escribiendo.

Paginación

Los números de las páginas son como los actuales, posteriores a los que contienen las recetas puesto que están escritos a lápiz. Las medidas y las cantidades de las recetas están expresados en números arábigos.

Aunque, según Nadia Obegi (26), los números romanos eran frecuentes en Inglaterra aun incluso en el siglo XVI, el Ms Gen 831 está datado un siglo más tarde por lo tanto no aparece ningún número romano.

Conservación

El códice está bien conservado aunque tiene desgastados los bordes en la cubierta. Se puede leer con claridad.

2.3.2. Paleografía

En este apartado estudiaremos los números, las abreviaturas, la puntuación, los errores y las correcciones del MS Gen 831.

Numeración

En cuanto a los números, estos se utilizan para indicar las medidas: "3 spoonfulls of it at a time" (43); o el tiempo de duración de las tomas: "3 days together" (48). Cuando se trata de indicar mitades, se escriben en letra: "halfe a pound" (37).

Abreviaturas

Hay pocas abreviaturas en el MS Gen 831. Petti (22) señala que la función de las abreviaturas es la de ahorrar espacio. En nuestro caso, las únicas que hemos encontrado se refieren al título de personas y no tienen el punto que les acompaña hoy día: Sr George (Sir George Hastings), en la página 19; Mr Gaskins (Mister Gaskins), en la página 38; y Mrs Deberdes, (Missis Deberdes), en la página 62.

Signos de puntuación y funciones

En este apartado se llevará a cabo un análisis de los signos de puntuación y sus funciones en el MS Gen 831. Para ello hemos hecho una transcripción semi-diplomática del manuscrito y utilizado una aplicación informática llamada *AntConc*, diseñada por Laurence Anthony, que nos ha permitido cuantificar la frecuencia de cada signo de puntuación en el texto objeto de este trabajo. Soluna Salles Bernal (82) argumenta que

> [t]he *punctus* is the earliest punctuation mark in English, introduced by the Romans from the Greek system. Its function as a major pause was already

> established in the 15th century, though it also acted as a type of comma until its standardization in the early 17th century (Petti 25).

Para el análisis de su estudio, Salles Bernal sigue la clasificación de Lucas (3) pues permite ver la función de los signos de puntuación en relación al contexto donde se aplica, es decir, permite ver el uso dado a estos signos a nivel macro-textual, oracional y sintagmático. Según Obegi (31),

> debemos distinguir entre puntuación gramatical y retórica. La primera muestra las relaciones estructurales entre los constituyentes de la oración de forma que proporciona sentido sintáctico. La segunda ayuda al lector a producir una adecuada exposición oral al texto.

Consideramos que la puntuación en el Ms Gen 831 es la denominada gramatical aunque el autor o autora utiliza de forma indistinta algunos de los signos. Es el caso del punto, de la coma, y del punto y coma. Esto puede deberse al hecho de que en el siglo XVII no estaban aún bien definidas las funciones de estos signos.

En el Ms Gen 831 distinguimos los siguientes signos de puntuación: el punto (.); el punto y coma (;); el punto final de oración, que tiene varias representaciones en el códice, como son el punto, doble barra, punto (.//.); barra sola o vírgula (/); y perioslash (./.). Los dos puntos (:); la coma (,); el guión (-); guión curvado (~); doble guión (=); y paréntesis (()). En el Ms Gen 831 no encontramos signos de exclamación, ni de interrogación ni tampoco corchetes. A continuación mostramos los resultados cuantificados en la Tabla 1.

	Signos de puntuación
Punto	70
Dos puntos	53
Punto y coma	302
Coma	337
Vírgula y perioslash	83
Doble guión	70
Guión curvado	3

Tabla 1. Signos de puntuación en el MS Gen 831

La utilización del punto en el manuscrito Ms Gen 831 es, a nivel discursivo, de separación entre receta y receta. A veces encontramos que el punto está seguido por una barra y otro punto indicando el final del texto (./.). Este signo se conoce como "perioslash, denominado así por Arakelian (1975) y se dice que es el equivalente al punto y final actual" (Criado Peña 89). El ejemplo que mostramos a continuación es el final de una receta con las recomendaciones de uso y el signo de *perioslash*.

> nously. in summer use a spoone=
> full once a weeke; and in Winter
> too./. (5)

Pero como se ha mencionado, en el códice no se sigue una regla fija en la utilización de este signo. Otra de las representaciones del punto es el punto, doble barra, punto (.//.), y aunque la función macrotextual es la de indicar el final de una receta, en la página 3 del códice se observa que, una vez terminada la receta, las recomendaciones de uso se sitúan en un párrafo aparte y termina de nuevo con el signo de (.//.).

> putt into Bottells for your use.//:
> drinke once herver before din=
> nner. and herver after dinner; and an hour after
> supper if you …..; the
> quantity of a quarter of a
> pinte.//. (3)

A nivel oracional, el punto separa unidades sintácticas independientes, colocándolo al final de la oración. Normalmente detrás van palabras que indican secuencias de tiempo como por ejemplo: *first*, *then* o *when*.

Después de punto gramatical encontramos también oraciones coordinadas con las conjunciones *and*, *or* y *but*. En el caso de *and* a veces introduce oraciones condicionales con *if*: "and if it bee a very freat soare […]" (36).

En cuanto a los dos puntos (:), es el signo de puntuación gramatical que menos se utiliza en el códice. Su uso es similar al de la coma y al

de punto y coma puesto que lo encontramos en la separación de cada ingrediente.

Es muy frecuente el uso de la coma (,) y del punto y coma (;) en el MS Gen 831 a nivel oracional y frasal. El uso funcional como pausa corta parece ser indistinta en los dos signos. Desde luego, se considera necesaria esta pausa después de cada ingrediente a utilizar en la receta porque detalla al lector/a la incorporación de los mismos, paso a paso. A continuación de estos, se indica el proceso de elaboración, de cómo se debe hacer la receta para que tenga el resultado adecuado. El escriba usa, de nuevo, las comas, el punto y coma o los dos puntos haciendo que el lector no pierda detalle. Destacamos su importancia porque se trata de curar o suavizar las dolencias de una enfermedad y el éxito o fracaso iba a depender de la correcta elaboración de la receta recomendada. En el ejemplo de abajo se puede ver el uso de los dos signos en un mismo párrafo.

> Take of sags, Selondine: Rue,
> Rosemary; wormwood, the hearbe
> Rosesolis; (1)

El ejemplo es interesante porque reúne los tres signos de puntuación que, a primera vista, parece que se usan de forma indistinta, aunque un análisis más detallado revela que la primera línea, que es introducida por una oración de imperativo, "Take of sags," utiliza la coma detrás del primer ingrediente y, después, la coma utilizada detrás del último sirve como introducción a otra oración: "being all cleane scrapt."

2.3.2.1. Errores y correcciones

Los errores y correcciones encontrados en el códice son importantes ya que, según Laura Esteban Segura (160), "[t]he analysis and classification of error and corrections in manuscripts can be helpful when editing Early English texts, as they can ease the process of revision once the text can be transcribed."

Pasamos a detallar los errores y las correcciones encontrados en el Ms Gen 831.

Omisión

Podemos observar varias omisiones en el códice, bien palabras enteras o letras que han sido omitidas y después insertadas, normalmente colocadas encima del mismo renglón. Por ejemplo, "Mingle **in** Rose **with sugar** on the […]" (9), donde la preposición *in* y la frase preposicional *with sugar* están insertadas a posteriori por encima de la línea. Las recetas médicas a veces se copiaban de colecciones impresas y otras veces de manuscritos. En estas ocasiones la persona que copia no entiende bien lo que hay escrito en el original y por ello traza una línea en señal de que existe una palabra en ese espacio. En el Ms Gen 831 encontramos que hay números entre estas líneas:

————-5————–9; ————-,————–6; ———— ————,————–8; ————–o————–-3; ————————7————–5. (37)

Adición

Decimos que hay adición cuando se repite alguna palabra, consonante o vocal en un texto. En el MS Gen 831 tenemos una frase a final de página, "8 onces of the best" (17), y al comienzo de la siguiente página continúa repitiendo "of the best […]" (18). Como hemos mencionado, la repetición de consonantes también se considera adición: **sugarr* (14).

Correcciones

Aunque el códice no presenta muchas correcciones, la primera letra que vemos en el libro está tachada. Se trata del artículo indeterminado <A>, como si fuese a copiar "A receite […]." Pero al tratarse del título que da nombre al libro, el copista se dio cuenta que tendría que ser en plural y tachando el artículo indeterminado singular pasó al sustantivo plural *Receites* (1).

Esteban-Segura (156) argumenta que las tachaduras pueden ser de tres formas: una línea que cruza la palabra, dos líneas cruzando la palabra o un tachón que cubre la palabra entera quedando oculta al lector. En el MS Gen 831 tenemos una línea que cruza la palabra (35), dos líneas que cruzan la palabra (17) y un tachón que oculta la palabra (45).

Decoración

En el códice no encontramos decoraciones como en los libros del periodo del inglés medio, pero en dos recetas vemos algunos guiones curvados, a modo de decoración, entre el título y el comienzo de la receta (9).

2.4. Tipo de escritura

La denominada escritura romana se desarrolló en Italia a finales del siglo XIV, basada en los manuscritos carolingios que, a su vez, imitaban las formas de las clásicas griegas y romanas que sobrevivieron en los monumentos y edificios. De acuerdo con Heather Wolfe (3), "Roman letters were upright and circular with spaces between each letter."

El Ms Gen 831 presenta una escritura romana en todas las recetas y, efectivamente, se aprecian espacios entre las letras. La última receta, que es de cocina, tiene la escritura más fina y alargada asemejándose más a la italiana o itálica, que según Wolfe (3) "was often described as a cursive hand based on the shape of an ellipsis or oval, with joined letters that sloped to the right, and many letter forms that could be formed with minimal pen lifts (and were thus faster to write)." Este es un rasgo que se aprecia en esta última receta y la diferencia de las anteriores: la palabra se traza de una sola vez, sin dejar espacios entre ellas. En el Ms Gen 831 encontramos, pues, los dos estilos, corroborando así que son dos las personas que escribieron en este libro de recetas.

Minúsculas

En cuanto a las letras minúsculas, cabe destacar la <u> detrás de la vocal <e>, que es como <w>; sin embargo, es más identificable con la vocal <u> actual cuando se escribe detrás de otras vocales o consonantes. Algunos ejemplos son: *Rhewme* y *wounded*; *suffereth*, *nature*, *youth*, *but* o *colour* (4).

Mayúsculas

Todos los nombres propios están en mayúsculas para distinguirse de los nombres comunes. Sin embargo, todas las palabras que

empiezan por la consonante <C> están en mayúsculas en todo el libro (salvo algunas excepciones), ya sean sustantivos: *Children*, *Cloth*, *Consumption*, *Cough*; adjetivos: *Close*, *Could* (*cold*); o verbos: **Cnn*, *Come*, *Comfort* o *Chopp*.

La palabra *Water* se escribe en mayúscula en el MS Gen 831 cuando se refiere a un caldo o líquido ya elaborado, es decir, como algo específico (7). Cuando la palabra se refiere al agua clara, *Running water*, la consonante <R> se escribe en mayúscula y la palabra *water* en minúsculas (10).

3. Transmisión de las recetas médicas

Este apartado pretende dar una visión general sobre los manuscritos escritos por mujeres en el periodo del inglés moderno temprano. El GUL Ms Gen 831 es un libro de recetas médicas que, aunque se desconoce el nombre de la persona que lo copia, es muy probable que fuese una mujer porque las características del libro, su contenido y uso son muy similares a otros recetarios médicos de la época que sí están confirmados que fueron escritos o copiados y compilados por mujeres. Disponemos de varios ejemplos en *Perdita Project* que, como ya se ha mencionado, son paralelos al códice objeto de esta descripción.

Sara Pennell dice que las recetas médicas y culinarias viajaban en forma de cartas a familiares y amigos. La autora afirma que "textual mobility is the key to creation and survival of these manuscripts" (238). Efectivamente, los familiares y amigos probaban estas recetas y las compartían a su vez con sus vecinos y otros amigos, de forma que así se iban difundiendo, normalmente desde las capitales donde vivía la clase alta de la sociedad hasta lugares más rurales.

Otro medio de transmisión de estos remedios de fácil elaboración doméstica eran los sirvientes. Según Pennell (243), "[a]part from socially elevated and kin, servants were a valuable source of recipes." No debemos olvidar que quienes poseían libros en sus casas eran personas con un elevado estatus social. Tener una biblioteca era símbolo de elevada posición cultural y económica. Los sirvientes que

trabajaban en esas casas debían tener un mínimo nivel de educación y cultura. Además, si procedían de otras ciudades, estos sirvientes ya proporcionaban su saber culinario y médico procedente de su lugar de origen. Inglaterra en aquella época (1647-1700) recibía a migrantes de todas partes del continente europeo. La ruta de las especias creó un comercio nunca antes visto y la incorporación de los nuevos ricos a la sociedad inglesa trajo consigo la proliferación de sirvientes en las casas más acomodadas. La mayoría de estos sirvientes habían recibido educación y, además de las labores del hogar, debían de saber leer y escribir puesto que algunos se dedicaban al cuidado de los hijos de los señores. En el MS Gen 831 encontramos una receta que hace referencia a Lady Chesterfield y se dirige a ella con el posesivo "My Lady Chesterfield" (22). En otra receta encontramos "my lady Goldinge used to warme […]" (59). El uso de los posesivos en las cartas personales sugiere cariño o afecto hacia esa persona. En el caso de los sirvientes indica respeto hacia el dueño o, en este caso, hacia la señora de la casa. *My Lord* o *My Lady* formaba parte del vocabulario diario de los criados. Esto, a su vez, implica que algunos sirvientes pudieran dedicarse también a la escritura de estos libros. En los recetarios se encuentran también frases que dan valor añadido a las recetas porque usan nombres de personajes, supuestamente conocidos, que o bien ya las han probado, *probatum* (25), o bien las han recomendado:

> to make the true receite
> of Mr. Gaskins cordial (38)

De la Cruz Cabanillas confirma este hecho argumentando que "[m]anuscripts are proven to be living artefacts shared with servants, visitors and friends. This is clearly evidenced by the fact that many of them are written in different hands and many acknowledge the name of the contributor" (14).

El Ms Gen 831 da pruebas evidentes de que esto era así. La última receta del códice está escrita por una segunda persona. Como muchos manuscritos de la época (*Perdita Project*), en un mismo libro las recetas médicas aparecían junto a las recetas de cocina y normalmente era colocado en las cocinas de las casas porque era en ese lugar donde se elaboraban.

Según Elaine Leong (83),

> [m]any families had a designated notebook in which to record, create and communicate these necessary bits of practice knowledge and hundreds of such books now survive in archives and libraries, each representing the varying needs, interests and aspirations of generations of men and women.

Efectivamente, estos libros nos ayudan a entender el interés que había en la época por aprender y adquirir nuevos conocimientos. No solo era importante tener las recetas sino también todo lo que conllevaba, esto es, la capacidad de copia y la elaboración del remedio médico o receta de cocina junto al éxito o fracaso del resultado final que, a su vez, se convertiría en testigo para las generaciones posteriores.

A nivel lingüístico es indiscutible el valor que tienen estos libros. En la época del inglés moderno temprano la lengua se va estandarizando gramaticalmente y creciendo en vocabulario por motivos políticos, económicos y literarios.

4. Conclusiones

En este trabajo se ha llevado a cabo la descripción física del GUL, MS Gen 831. Aunque se desconoce la autoría de este manuscrito, hay indicios para suponer que fue escrito por una mujer. Destacamos además la labor difusora de estos libros de recetas médicas y culinarias.

La mención de algunos nombres propios en el códice verifica la eficacia de los remedios en donde aparecen. En el Ms Gen 831 hay algunos nombres de personas como "Mr Gaskins" o "Lady Chesterfield" que eran conocidas por la que copia la receta y que tendrían la reputación suficiente como para que fueran mencionadas como fuentes. Según de la Cruz Cabanillas (2), "the sources of information are often given in a text as a way of identifying and validating the recipe." Estos textos arrojan luz para conocer mejor la

época y sociedad en la que se escribieron. A nivel lingüístico aportan datos interesantes para ver la evolución de la lengua inglesa hasta el momento; estamos en un momento de estandarización de la lengua y de un incremento de vocabulario extraordinario debido a motivos políticos, económicos y literarios.

Este estudio presenta, por un lado, las características físicas del códice desde un punto de vista codicológico. Se ha situado el manuscrito en su época y realizado una descripción física del mismo. Por otro lado, se ha llevado a cabo un estudio paleográfico, donde se ha visto que las cincuenta y cinco recetas médicas y las dos culinarias que se encuentran en el Ms Gen 831 se asemejan en su estructura, en su forma de presentación. Los ingredientes y su elaboración son el centro de atención de estas recetas y están escritas para ser leídas por el receptor con detenimiento, de ahí que el uso de los signos de puntuación ejerza una función relevante, puesto que los remedios tratan de curar o suavizar enfermedades o lesiones y las recetas culinarias tratan de nutrir y agradar al paladar; por lo tanto, es muy importante que se escriban los pasos correctamente para alcanzar el éxito. Miriam Criado Peña (87) señala que

> Calle Martín and Miranda García (2005-37) point out the difference between the uses of the ordinary virgule and the perioslash, stating that the former is mainly used with linking purposes as a conjunctive mark whilst the latter has a disjunctive nature and therefore performs a splitting function within a text.

Sin embargo, como se ha podido comprobar en los ejemplos dados, no hay apenas diferencia en cuanto al uso de uno y otro en el Ms Gen 831.

En el análisis paleográfico también se han encontrado algunas diferencias con las consonantes, sobre todo la <C>, que se escribe en mayúscula cuando va al inicio de palabra (aunque hay algunas excepciones en el códice). Esto no ocurre con las demás consonantes.

En cuanto a las vocales, merece especial atención la vocal <u> que, como se ha comprobado, varía su uso según su posición dentro de la palabra, alternando como consonante <w>.

Con la descripción de este manuscrito hemos dado un primer paso en su estudio. Creemos necesario seguir la investigación con un análisis lingüístico que será de gran interés para completar el estudio de este manuscrito.

Obras citadas

Alonso Almeida, Francisco. "Genre Conventions in English Recipes, 1600-1800." *Reading and Writing Recipe Books 1550-1800*, edited by Michelle DiMeo and Sara Pennell. Manchester University Press, 2013, pp. 68-92.

Anthony, Laurence. "AntConc Homepage." *Laurence Anthony's AntConc*, 2014, www.laurenceanthony.net/software/antconc/.

Calle Martin, Javier, y Antonio Miranda García. "Editing Middle English Punctuation. The Case of MS Egerton 2622 (Ff. 136-152)." *International Journal of English Studies*, vol. 5, Feb. 2005, pp. 27-44.

Criado Peña, Miriam. "Punctuation Practice in Early Modern English Scientific Writing: The Case of MS 3009 at the Wellcome Library, London." *Miscelánea: A Journal of English and American Studies*, vol. 61, 2021, pp. 81-97.

De la Cruz Cabanillas, Isabel. "Genre and Text-Type Conventions in Early Modern Women's Recipe Books." *Revista de lingüística y lenguas aplicadas*, vol. 12, no. 1, 2017, pp. 13-21.

Esteban Segura, Laura. "Digital Editing of Early Modern English Medical Manuscripts: Scribal Errors and Corrections." *Onomázein: Revista de lingüística, filología y traducción*, no. 50, 2020, pp. 149-161.

Gibson, Jonathan. "The Perdita Project: Women's Writing, Manuscript Studies and XML Tagging." *Open Research Online*, Iter Inc. in Collaboration with ACMRS, Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 30 June 2008, oro.open.ac.uk/36882/.

Leong, Elaine. "Collecting Knowledge for the Family: Recipes, Gender and Practical Knowledge in the Early Modern English Household." *Centaurus*, vol. 55, no. 2, 2013, pp. 81–103.

Macleod, Catriona. "Gender History Panel" (20 February 2018). *Historical Conversations*. https://scothistconvo.wordpress.com/2018/03/20/gender-history-panel-20-feb-2018/.

Obegi Gallardo, Nadia. "Estudio y edición de *Book of Operation* en GUL MS Hunter 95, ff.82r-155v (t.4.12)." Facultad de Filosofía y Letras, Universidad de Málaga, 2012. PhD Dissertation.

Pennell, Sara. "Perfecting Practice? Women, Manuscript Recipes and Knowledge in Early Modern England." *Early Modern Women's Manuscript Writing. Selected Papers from the Trinity/Trent Colloquium*, edited by Victoria E. Burke and Jonathan Gibson, Ashgate, 2004, pp. 237-258.

Salles Bernal, Soluna. "Punctuation Patterns in a 17th-Century Medical Manuscript: A Corpus-Based Study of G.U.L. MS 303, *Treatise on the Diseases of Women*." *Nordic Journal of English Studies*, vol. 15, no. 4, 2016, pp. 78-106.

Wolfe, Heather. "Women's Handwriting." *The Cambridge Companion to Early Modern Women's Writing*, edited by Laura Lunger Knoppers, Cambridge University Press, 2009, pp. 21-39.

Recibido / Received: 15-3-2021 *Aceptado /Accepted: 15-7-2021*

Are CLIL Teachers-to-be Motivated? A Qualitative Study

Marta del Pozo Beamud (marta.pozobeamud@uclm.es)
Universidad de Castilla - La Mancha

Abstract

In recent years, CLIL has gained momentum in Europe and many have been the authors who have analysed the relationship between CLIL and motivation. The vast majority of these studies have focused on learner motivation (Doiz et al., Lasagabaster, Lasagabaster and Sierra, Seikkula-Leino). This study aims to redress that balance by examining teacher motivation, more specifically, the extent to which teachers-in-training of CLIL are motivated. Participants are final-year Primary Education degree students at UCLM (M=21.5), who completed an open-ended questionnaire examining both intrinsic and extrinsic motivations. Results demonstrated significantly high levels of intrinsic motivation.

Keywords: undergraduate students, teacher motivation, CLIL.

¿Están los futuros maestros de CLIL motivados? Un estudio cualitativo

Resumen

Durante las últimas décadas, CLIL ha ganado impulso en Europa y muchos han sido los autores que han analizado la relación entre CLIL y la motivación. Sin embargo, la gran mayoría de estos estudios se centran en la motivación del alumno (Doiz et al, Lasagabaster, Lasagabster y Sierra, Seikkula-Leino). Por lo tanto, también se debe prestar atención a la

motivación de los maestros, de ahí nuestro interés en analizar la motivación de futuros maestros de CLIL. Nuestros participantes son futuros profesores, es decir, estudiantes en su último año de Educación Primaria en la UCLM. Es decir, la edad media es 21,5 años. Para determinar si están motivados (motivación intrínseca/extrínseca), completaron un cuestionario abierto, ya que la naturaleza de esta investigación es cualitativa. En general, los estudiantes muestran una gran cantidad de motivación intrínseca.

Palabras clave: estudiantes universitarios, motivación docente, CLIL.

1. Introduction

The main premise of the CLIL approach to language learning is that learners can successfully and effortlessly learn content and language simultaneously (Mehisto et al., Pladevall-Ballester). With its foundation in the Canadian model (one of the first, pioneering models of the CLIL approach within the field of bilingualism), CLIL is now prevalent in Europe with an ever-increasing number of countries and educational establishments adopting the method (Pérez Cañado, "Are Teachers Ready?"). In order to ensure optimal functioning when adopting the CLIL approach, it is appropriate to determine the motivation and satisfaction of all involved. Most studies have focused on the motivation and concerns of students and practicing teachers. This study considers the motivation and concerns of those who will work in this field in the future.

1.1. Understanding motivation in CLIL

1.1.1. Bilingualism and CLIL

It is evident that bilingual education and more specifically the CLIL approach to second or foreign language learning is now

widespread in Europe. The number of bilingual schools is growing exponentially on both a national (in this case in Spain) and international level (Moya Guijarro and Ruiz Cordero). This type of education usually takes place in formal contexts (schools, secondary schools, universities, etc.) with the main objective being for the individual to learn two or more languages simultaneously. Since CLIL is a content-based L2 approach, the main premise is that content enhances L2 learning when using a second or foreign language as the vehicular language (Bentley 5, Mehisto et al. 9). According to Christian Abello-Contesse (4), Bilingual Education is an umbrella term "to refer to the regular use of two or more languages for teaching and learning in instructional settings when bilingualism and biliteracy are two of the explicit long-term goals."

Bilingual education translates into different types of educational programmes of a certain duration, in which individuals are instructed in a systematic way, receiving content through two or more vehicular languages. Bilingual Education (B.E.) is "a generic concept that refers to various types of educational programs that provide systematic instruction in two (or more) languages for a prolonged period of time" (Abello-Contesse 4). Within these programmes, CLIL (Content and Language Integrated Learning) has been of particular interest because of its influence over the last decades within the European context (Amengual-Pizarro et al. 6). The rationale of the CLIL approach is that students learn a language (a second or foreign language) other than their mother tongue whilst learning content from other non-linguistic subjects. That is to say, the main interest is not language learning in an isolated manner since the foreign language becomes the means by which content related to natural sciences, social sciences, mathematics, physical education, etc. is learnt (Mehisto et al. 9, Coyle et al. 3).

1.1.2. Motivation

Motivation is one of the most studied affective variables involved in the learning of a second or a foreign language. According to Zoltan Dörnyei and Itsván Ottó (64),

> [m]otivation can be defined as the dynamically changing cumulative arousal in a person that initiates, directs, coordinates, amplifies, terminates, and evaluates the cognitive and motor processes whereby initial wishes and desires are selected, prioritised, operationalised and (successfully or unsuccessfully) acted out.

In recent years, there have been many theories regarding this complex psychological dimension. One of the most prominent theories is the Self-determination Theory, a key approach to understanding the function of motivation within the teaching-learning process. This began as a theory within the area of psychology, moving on later to the field of language learning.

The theory proposes a continuum that starts with intrinsic motivation, is followed by extrinsic motivation and terminates in amotivation (Ryan and Deci 16). The most notable difference between extrinsic and intrinsic motivation lies in the fact that the former is linked to the attainment of a specific goal, whilst the latter is related to a genuine interest in a specific activity (Deci and Ryan 233). Furthermore, extrinsic motivation is made up of four different subtypes: external regulation, introjected regulation, identified regulation or regulation through identification and integrated regulation (Ryan and Deci 16-18).

Firstly, external regulation is the least autonomous regulation, since the individual is governed by external demands and contingencies built into society. Thus, what motivates individuals is to obtain rewards or avoid punishment. Secondly, introjected regulation is a partially internalised type of regulation, but it is not part of the individual in an integrated way. Behaviour associated with this regulation includes the avoidance of emotions such as guilt or shame, or even to improve the ego or esteem. Thirdly, identified regulation or regulation through identification is a process of identification which involves the journey from external regulation to true self-regulation. However, on certain occasions these regulations do not fully reflect the thoughts and values of an individual. That is to say, an individual internalises ideas or external values from external

sources, even though, on occasions, they may not be in line with their own. Fourthly, integrated regulation constitutes the most autonomous form of regulation. In contrast to what happens with the previous regulation, there is complete harmony between the individual and the outside, since this regulation is related to the values, goals and needs of the individual. As can be seen, integrated regulation is very much like intrinsic motivation. However, in the case of integrated regulation, there is a certain goal driving the behaviour and actions of an individual, whilst as previously stated, intrinsic motivation is related to the enjoyment of an activity per se (Ryan and Deci 18). Finally, amotivation is "the absence of any kind of motivation" (Dörnyei and Ushioda 23), and is usually associated with non-acting and passive behaviours (Ryan and Deci 17).

1.1.3. Teacher motivation

According to Catherine Sinclair, there is a special type of motivation known as teacher motivation. It can be defined as "[w]hat attracts individuals to teaching, how long they remain in their initial teacher education courses and subsequently the teaching profession, and the extent to which they engage with their courses and the teaching profession" (37).

As previously stated, intrinsic motivation refers to the internal desire to carry out an activity, out of pleasure and interest. In the case of students, they are intrinsically motivated when they are willing to learn a second or a foreign language simply because they enjoy the process. Teachers are intrinsically motivated when they are willing to help their students fulfill their potential, as stated by Eudokia Karavas (61):

> Teachers, regardless of sex, teaching experience, position held and location and type of school, have been found to derive their greatest satisfaction and experience a great sense of achievement through working with and for young people and by assisting young people to realise their potential, experience success and grow into responsible adults.

On the other hand, extrinsic motivation is always associated with the attainment of a specific goal. Students are generally extrinsically motivated when they are willing to learn a foreign language or a second language as a means to an end (i.e., being rewarded, getting a job, promotions, and so forth). In the case of teachers, they are extrinsically motivated when they take into consideration factors such as the community's opinion of them, the level of support by the system to implement curricular changes, available support services, promotion prospects, their status, conditions of service and salary (Farber, Hargreaves, Shann, cited in Karavas 62).

Attention should be paid to the aforementioned factors since they can have a negative effect on teachers' levels of motivation. In Karavas' words, "[t]hese extrinsic, systemically based factors have been identified as powerful dis-satisfiers which detract from or militate from the core business of teaching and which can significantly affect teachers' motivation and their desire to remain in teaching" (62).

1.1.4. CLIL and motivation

1.1.4.1. CLIL and student motivation

When investigating student motivation, it is important to be aware of the difficulty in establishing whether levels of motivation are due to the actual type of educational programme students receive, their levels of motivation prior to starting the programme, or both. Another factor to consider is the effect on motivation of those students who experience difficulty following such programmes (Cenoz et al. 14-15).

Nevertheless, studies have shown that students participating in CLIL programmes demonstrate greater motivation and more positive attitudes toward language learning than students learning the more traditional way (EFL) (Doiz et al., Fernández Fontecha and Canga Alonso, Lasagabaster, Lagasabaster and Beloqui, Lasagabaster and Sierra, Pladevall-Ballester, Seikkula-Leino, Sylvén and Thomson).

1.1.4.2. CLIL and motivation of in-service teachers

With regard to practicing teachers, various authors both from Spain and the rest of Europe have applied mostly qualitative approaches and

analyses when examining these teachers' needs and concerns. Pérez Cañado ("Teacher Training Needs" 285), for example, found that participants (a cohort of students, teachers, teacher trainers and coordinators all across Europe) had good linguistic and cultural competence but lacked basic training in CLIL methodology. She discovered that content teachers had more difficulty than language teachers with regard to interlinguistic and intercultural competence in addition to creating materials, something of great importance (Adams and Cruz-García), and managing resources. Pérez Cañado ("Teacher Training Needs" 285) proved that being proficient in English and/or having spent time abroad also had an impact on linguistic aspects.

In Italy, Infante et al. (162) found that for qualified and practicing teachers, the experience was a positive one. Through their expertise and motivation, these teachers were able to problem-solve assertively while less experienced teachers admitted to needing both more training and access to an online sharing site where their concerns could be expressed with other colleagues in the world of CLIL.

In Spain, Pena Díaz et al. (169-171) conducted a study prior to the implementation of a bilingual programme in Madrid. They found that teachers destined for the programme were highly motivated despite uncertainty and pressure. Fernández and Halbach (17) re-analysed the perception of teachers participating in this programme and concluded that witnessing their students' motivation and reduced anxiety led to their own sense of satisfaction.

These findings are consistent with those of Pena Díaz and Porto Requejo (157) who found that teachers in Madrid had a positive attitude towards the project although the majority pointed to the need for more theoretical knowledge and the need to improve their level of English. These teachers also felt that they would benefit from observing their colleagues. The success of the project was seen to be the result of students and teachers' adaptation.

In Catalonia, Pladevall-Ballester (50-55) also found teachers' experience of CLIL to be positive since they witnessed higher levels of motivation in their students and noticed that students apparently learn in a meaningful way almost without being conscious of the

process. Practicing teachers also stated that despite students' low level of English, they were able to follow the classes through the use of gestures and mime, etc. In addition, teachers noticed that anxiety levels in their students decreased. There was a need expressed for more support from the institutions, more time for lesson planning and more training.

1.1.4.3. CLIL and motivation of pre-service teachers

As has been previously stated, there are few studies that look at teachers in training. Pérez Cañado ("Are Teachers Ready?" 216) in a European study found that older teachers had a higher level of English and consequently needed less training. Within Europe, teachers in Spain were less knowledgeable when it came to understanding CLIL as a theoretical concept and in terms of their own personal development. Outside Europe, this was also found to be the case with Latin American teachers. In Japan, Kumawaza also found positive attitudes and motivation within the cohort of teachers in training. Kyriacou and Coulthard in the UK, however, obtained inconclusive results since their respondents did not demonstrate much interest in working with children and were neutral regarding self-development. CLIL can therefore be seen to be motivating for students and in-service teachers alike. The aim of this study was to ascertain the nature and degree of motivation in CLIL teachers-to-be regarding their future teaching. We further sought to determine, based on our students' responses, whether they were intrinsically or extrinsically motivated.

2. Method

2.1. Participants

Participants were university students (total 10, M=21.5). Females outnumbered males by 9:1. Participants were in their last year of a degree in Primary Education at the University of Castilla-La Mancha, in Cuenca, Spain. Nine were Spanish and one Romanian. All were enrolled in a compulsory CLIL methodology subject specialising in English, and as such, CLIL teachers-to-be. The obligatory nature of

this subject should be taken into consideration when examining the type of motivation experienced by the participants.

It is worth mentioning that both primary and infant education teachers in Spain have to attend university courses along with placements of three months' duration in different schools during their third and their fourth years, respectively. They also decide whether to become English specialists, music specialists, and so on. After graduating, they can choose whether they would like to pursue a career in teaching in the public sector or in the private/semi-private one. If they decide to work in a public school, they have to pass a state exam in which they have to demonstrate both the theoretical and practical knowledge that they have acquired during the previous four years. Those teachers who wish to work in private or semi-private schools are not required to sit the state exam, instead they face a regular job interview with the school board.

With regard to the context of the study, Cuenca is a very small town with just one university. The vast majority of students are from the province itself or from other cities or villages in the same region (Castilla-La Mancha). There are usually more female students than male students, particularly in the Infant Education Degree, this usually being the case on a national level.

2.2. Instruments and procedures

Since the nature of this study was qualitative, subjects completed an open-ended questionnaire (10 questions; see Appendix). The questionnaire was based on previous ones (see Dörnyei and Ushioda, Roth et al.). Following the steps of authors such as Roth et al., we decided to base our questionnaire on the Self-determination Theory. The questionnaire was administered by the researcher in class. Before starting, the researcher carefully explained the instructions and students were able to ask questions. When students agreed to participate voluntarily, they had one hour to complete the questionnaire.

In order to interpret the data gathered, qualitative content analysis was carried out. In this type of analysis, themes and main ideas of the

text are considered the primary content. This content (respondents' answers) is divided into categories, which are the centre of the analysis (Mayring 160-161). In the case of our study, the two categories are extrinsic and intrinsic motivation. Once categories have been outlined and defined, researchers must find examples that illustrate the definition of each category in the informants' narratives (Mayring 163).

3. Results and discussion

In this section, the most relevant answers provided by the future teachers are analysed. In the first question ("I would like/wouldn't like to become a CLIL teacher because…") nearly all of the participants (eight) mentioned teaching/educating students as their primary motive for becoming CLIL teachers. Thus, we were able to affirm that almost all of the subjects were intrinsically motivated to become CLIL teachers because they prioritised students and students' well-being over their own personal interests and ambitions. What is more, one subject also said that he/she loved English and derived pleasure from teaching it.

> Student #6: I would like to become a CLIL teacher because I have never learnt at school subjects like language, natural sciences in English and I would like to teach it to know how the students react […] I like to teach and I like English.

In the second question ("My main motivation(s) for using CLIL methodology in the future is…") six subjects again stated that teaching pupils was their main motivation, whilst the rest (four) were motivated because they considered CLIL to be an innovative method or because they were keen to enhance their teaching practice. In any case, all of them showed again a great amount of intrinsic motivation since they once again put students' needs, interests and well-being first, and wished to improve their teaching.

> Student #7: The innovation because it is something new and different for them, and they can learn new content with a new methodology. In that case, children can pay

> more attention in the classes. From my point of view, CLIL methodology is a tool, which is necessary for children. Because they are going to have the opportunity to learn new content in another language.

In the third question ("What I like most about CLIL is…") all of the participants highlighted the fact that their main interest was the act of teaching students itself and letting pupils be the protagonists of their own learning process. Such answers are consistent with answers to questions 1 and 2, where future teachers agreed on the importance of doing everything possible to facilitate the learning process in an innovative way through projects, etc. We can therefore again conclude that participants were intrinsically motivated.

> Student #1: In CLIL, students should be the absolute protagonists.

In the fourth question ("Teaching CLIL will mean social prestige, which I find/do not find particularly relevant because…") almost half of the participants were keen to become CLIL teachers because of social prestige, thus implying extrinsic motivation (integrated regulation). Since the remaining participants did not prioritise social prestige as a reason for pursuing a career in teaching, they would appear to be intrinsically motivated.

> Student #4: The real objective is that pupils can learn.

In the fifth question ("I find/do not find CLIL teaching rewarding because…") seven participants claimed that teaching students was most rewarding for them, whereas the rest of the participants found it satisfying for personal reasons. Regardless, all of them find teaching rewarding either because they wished to have a positive impact on their students or simply because they wanted to enhance their practice, thus favourably influencing the well-being of their students.

> Student #7: CLIL teaching can open my mind about all the things that I don't know anything about.

In the sixth question ("I consider/do not consider teaching values

and educating people to be a core aspect of teaching CLIL since…") all the teachers-to-be considered values to be a matter of great importance. Their primary role was seen to be to educate their pupils and teach them solid values. One could therefore affirm that they are all intrinsically motivated since their main preoccupation is to help their students become better citizens of the world.

> Student #3: As teachers we have to educate people, not only give them contents.
>
> Student #5: I think that teaching values should be a basic aspect of my teaching.

In the seventh question ("I believe/do not believe that teaching CLIL will be positive for my professional career since…") all participants were aware of the positive aspects of CLIL teaching, all picturing themselves working in bilingual schools in the future, the prospect of which they believe will be enriching and rewarding. In this case, their responses clearly showed a tendency for extrinsic motivation (integrated regulation) since it was their prospective careers which were the focus of concern.

> Student #7: In the future all the schools would be bilingual, so it is a big opportunity to work in one of them.

One of the participants also highlighted the importance of dedication to being a teacher and of being able to transmit this to students. In this particular case, this teacher-to-be was also intrinsically motivated due to the fact that, apart from being concerned about his/her future career in teaching, he/she is also keen to make an impact on his/her students' lives.

In the eighth question ("If I become a CLIL teacher, I will look for new methodologies/ways of teaching because…") all the participants strongly believed that new methodologies are most beneficial for students. Two of them also expressed an internal desire to improve as teachers. These teachers-to-be can be seen to be intrinsically motivated since they are willing to use new

methodologies in order to have a positive impact on their students' needs, interests, motivation, etc., and they are also willing to enhance their everyday practice.

> Student #3: Our objective is to improve the teaching in our country and improve ourselves as teachers.

In the ninth question ("If I ever become a CLIL teacher, I would/would not like to make an effort to please my students' parents") six of the subjects agreed with this statement, whereas four of them placed more importance on children and their well-being. What is more, one teacher-to-be claimed that teachers should know better than parents what is best for children when it comes to education and students' needs. Six subjects were extrinsically motivated (integrated) because their practice would be guided/influenced by external factors, in this case, parents. In contrast, four teachers could be seen to be intrinsically motivated due to the fact that their practices would not be affected by opinions and judgements of their pupils' parents.

> Student #4: I think that it isn't important because the principal objective is that the students could learn in a good way and if it is not pleasant for the parents, it isn't important for me. But I think is better to have a good relationship with their parents too.

As regards the last question ("Teaching CLIL will/will not be a dream come true due to the fact that…"), for all the subjects teaching CLIL would indeed be a dream come true. Nonetheless, for two subjects that dream is somehow something more general, rather than personal. Nonetheless, we can once again affirm that the total number of the teachers-to-be were intrinsically motivated because they dream about becoming successful CLIL teachers one day.

> Student #3: I love teaching and I love English. In my opinion to be a CLIL teacher will be my perfect profession because I will be able to create new projects about English and communication, and I will be able to see good results in my children, which makes me happy.

Having presented the results, we can confirm that our participants (CLIL teachers-to-be) showed a great amount of intrinsic motivation in nearly all the responses to questions, except for questions 4, 7, and 9, where extrinsic motivation (internal regulation) is present. In other words, participants find factors such as social prestige, professional development or parents' endorsement pivotal. These results are not consistent with those by Karavas (64) in Greece, whose participants considered extrinsic factors such as salary, promotion or status to be of lesser importance when it comes to choosing a career in teaching. This may be due to the compulsory nature of the CLIL module.

On the other hand, teaching and educating students appear to be teachers' main priorities along with enhancing their teaching practice by being able to constantly update their knowledge, methodologies, and so on. Our participants were willing to prioritise their students' needs, interests and motivations over their own personal needs. Such results are in line with those found by Kumazawa (50) in Japan, who discovered that some of her participants (pre-service teachers) were passionate about the educational process. Our results are also in accordance with those presented by Karavas (64) in that she discovered that participants in her study were intrinsically motivated since they considered reasons like working with young people/helping them/changing their lives or the interest/love for the subject they teach the most important ones. However, it should be noted that, in a similar study carried out by Kyriacou and Coulthard (119, 122) in the UK, working with children was not a priority for their participants (undergraduate students). Furthermore, our students demonstrated a wish to be constantly learning; self-development is crucial for them and this would certainly have a positive repercussion for their students. Neither are these results very much in line with those obtained by Kyriacou and Coulthard (119, 124) in the UK, who stated that their participants were very neutral about the importance of self-development when considering a career as a school teacher. It should be noted, however, that the structure of teacher training can vary between different countries; students might have to take more general degrees and specialise in education in postgraduate courses. This, of course, would have an impact on the pre-service teachers' motivation.

We can affirm that the results found are consistent with those of Fernández and Halbach, Infante et al., Pena Díaz et al., Pena Díaz

and Porto Requejo, Pérez Cañado, and Pladevall-Ballester, to name but a few. These studies were carried out with in-service teachers in Europe and in Spain and not with pre-service teachers, but the results could be extrapolated to our sample. All the aforementioned authors agree that their participants had a very high degree of motivation. However, it should be noted that in some regions CLIL students are selected based on external factors such as good grades and in some cases they are not in a position to choose whether they become part of the programme or not. Despite having important needs and concerns, they are practitioners who strive every day to improve and they feel great pride and personal satisfaction when witnessing how their pupils succeed in the learning of content and language at the same time, despite the difficulties (their poor level of English, content or both, etc.).

4. Conclusion

Once the results were analysed by using the categorisation system in which two main categories were outlined (extrinsic and intrinsic motivation) and having found definitions of both types of motivation in the informants' responses, we proceed to present the pertinent conclusions.

Pre-service teachers are driven primarily by intrinsic motives in addition to some extrinsic motives in their everyday practice. They strive to make a positive impact on their students' lives. As we have seen, they also value extrinsic aspects such as social status, parental recognition, etc. In Karavas' words,

> [t]eachers are aware of instability and unpredictability that characterises their profession, they choose to enter teaching on the basis of altruistic and intrinsic reasons, motivated by their love of the subject, their desire to help children realise their potential and driven by their firm belief that they can make a difference in students' lives. They generally seem satisfied with various aspects of their work such as the recognition they receive for their efforts from students primarily and from parents, their

> benefits and working hours and their status as EFL teachers in school and in society. (71)

Notwithstanding, with these motivations also come desires and needs that should be heeded by the institutions. Our study highlights the importance of and need for permanent training for all CLIL 'actors': in-service, pre-service, etc., along with material and personal resources. It is clear that those who are striving to make a success of CLIL need to feel supported by their colleagues and the local/national institutions.

These results have certain pedagogical implications given that participants generally show high levels of intrinsic motivation. Firstly, it would be advisable for them to try to maintain such levels of motivation during their future practice, and this is not necessarily an easy task. As authors like Han and Yin (3) and Kumazawa (49) state, teachers-to-be are full of ideals, passion and altruism, factors that tend to decrease once they start teaching and face reality. Therefore, such ideals are quite often most unrealistic, and this can affect teacher motivation negatively (Kumazawa 53). Secondly, if they are motivated, they can surely transmit their motivation to their own students. Moreover, one could also look for connections between the teachers' style(s) and the motivation of their students, as Noels did (125). In fact, this relationship is bilateral since teachers are also very much affected by their students' motivation. Teachers around the globe are known for being enthusiastic if they feel their students are enthusiastic too, and for feeling demotivated if their students are not very motivated (Karavas 61). However, according to Han and Yin (14), "[a]mong the examined relationships between teacher motivation and teaching behaviours or styles, and student motivation, the linkage is rather uncertain due to the research design and paucity in existing literature." Such relationships should be further explored through new studies and approaches. It is therefore possible to extrapolate that if future teachers are motivated, and given that they are particularly keen to learn about CLIL methodology, this will necessarily have a positive effect on their training and ultimately their careers as teachers.

Regarding future research, we would like to carry out the same study with a larger sample in order to obtain a bigger picture since we

are aware of the limited number of participants. What is more, it could be interesting to analyse the results from a gender perspective in order to discover whether female teachers are more motivated than male teachers, as is often the case among students (Baker and MacIntyre, Dörnyei et al.). Finally, it would be advisable to replicate the study at other universities (nationwide and internationally) to discover whether there are regional/national/international differences and, if so, why, since, as stated in the introduction section, there are few studies examining future CLIL teachers' motivation.

Works cited

Abello-Contesse, Christian. "Bilingual and Multilingual Education: An Overview of the Field." *Bilingual and Multilingual Education in the 21st Century: Building on Experience*, edited by Christian Abello-Contesse, Paul M. Chandler, María Dolores López-Jiménez and Rubén Chacón-Beltrán, Multilingual Matters, 2013, pp. 3-23.

Adams, Heather, and Laura Cruz-García. "Use of Teaching Materials in Foreign Language Classes for Trainee Translators in Spain." *Babel–AFIAL: Aspectos de filoloxía inglesa e alemá*, no. 26, 2017, pp. 101-118.

Amengual-Pizarro, Marian, Jesús García-Laborda, and Cristina Calle-Martínez. "Methodological Approaches in the Didactic Second Language Context." *Verbeia*, no. 1, 2017, pp. 5-15.

Baker, Susan C., and Peter D. MacIntyre. "The Role of Gender and Immersion in Communication and Second Language Orientations." *Language Learning*, vol. 50, no 2, June 2000, pp. 311-341.

Bentley, K. *The TKT Course: CLIL Module*. Cambridge University Press, 2010.

Cenoz, Jasone, Fred Genesee, and Durk Gorter. "Critical Analysis of CLIL: Taking Stock and Looking Forward." *Applied Linguistics*, vol. 35, no. 3, 2014, pp. 243-262.

Coyle, Do, Philip Hood, and David Marsh. *Content and Language Integrated Learning*. Cambridge University Press, 2010.

Deci, Edward L., and Richard M. Ryan. "The 'What' and 'Why' of Goal Pursuits: Human Needs and the Self-Determination of Behavior." *Psychological Inquiry*, vol. 11, no. 4, 2000, pp. 227-268.

Doiz, Aintzane, David Lasagabaster, and Juan Manuel Sierra. "CLIL and Motivation: The Effect of Individual and Contextual Variables." *The Language Learning Journal*, vol. 42, no. 2, March 2014, pp.209-224.

Dörnyei, Zoltán, Kata Csizér, and Nóra Németh. *Motivation, Language Attitudes and Globalisation: A Hungarian Perspective*. Multilingual Matters, 2006.

Dörnyei, Zoltán, and Itsván Ottó, "Motivation in Action: A Process Model of L2 Motivation." *Working Papers in Applied Linguistics*, vol. 4, 1998, pp. 44-69.

Dörnyei Zoltán, and Emma Ushioda. *Teaching and Researching Motivation* (2nd edition). Pearson, 2011.

Farber, Barry A. "Stress and Burnout: Implications for Teacher Motivation." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, New York, March 1982.

Fernández, Raquel, and Ana Halbach. "Analysing the Situation of Teachers in the CAM Bilingual Project after Four Years of Implementation." *Content and Foreign Language Integrated Learning: Contributions to Multilingualism in European Contexts*. Peter Lang, 2010.

Fernández Fontecha, Almudena, and Andrés Canga Alonso. "A Preliminary Study on Motivation and Gender in CLIL and Non-CLIL Types of Instruction." *International Journal of English Studies*, vol, 14, n. 1, 2014, pp. 21-36.

Han, Jiying, and Hongbiao Yin. "Teacher Motivation: Definition, Research Development and Implications for Teachers." *Cogent Education*, vol. 3, no. 1, August 2016, www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/2331186X.2016.1217819.

Hargreaves, Andy. *Changing Teachers, Changing Times: Teachers' Work and Culture in the Postmodern Age*. Teachers College Press, 1994.

Infante, Debora, Guido Benvenuto, and Emilio Lastrucci. "The Effects of CLIL from the Perspective of Experienced Teachers." *CLIL Practice: Perspectives from the Field*, 2009, pp. 156-163.

Karavas, Evdokia. "How Satisfied are Greek EFL Teachers with their Work? Investigating the Motivation and Job Satisfaction Levels of Greek EFL Teachers." *Porta Linguarum*, no. 4, June 2010, pp. 59-78.

Kumazawa, Masaño. "Gaps Too Large: Four Novice EFL Teachers' Self-concept and Motivation." *Teaching and Teacher Education*, no. 33, July 2013, pp. 45-55.

Kyriacou, Chris, and Melissa Coulthard. "Undergraduates' Views of Teaching as a Career Choice." *Journal of Education for Teaching*, vol. 26, no. 2, August 2010, pp. 117-126.

Lasagabaster, David. "English Achievement and Student Motivation in CLIL and EFL Settings." *Innovation in Language Learning and Teaching*, vol. 5, no. 1, 2011, pp. 3-18.

Lasagabaster, David, and Raquel Beloqui. "The Impact of Type of Approach (CLIL versus EFL) and Methodology (Book-based versus Project Work) on Motivation." *Porta Linguarum*, no. 23, January 2015, pp. 41-57.

Lasagabaster, David, and Juan Manuel Sierra, "Language Attitudes in CLIL and Traditional EFL Classes." *International CLIL Research Journal*, vol. 1, no. 2, 2009, pp. 4-17.

Mayring, Philipp. "Qualitative Content Analysis." *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung*, vol. 1, no. 2, June 2000, www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/ article/view/ 1089/2385.

Mehisto, Peeter, María Jesús Frigols, and David Marsh. *Uncovering CLIL: Content and Language Integrated Learning in Bilingual and Multilingual Education*. Macmillan Education, 2008.

Moya Guijarro, Arsenio Jesús, and Begoña Ruiz Cordero. "Un estudio sobre la diferencia de nivel de competencia lingüística entre alumnos pertenecientes a centros bilingües y no bilingües en la comunidad autónoma de Castilla-La Mancha (España)." *Estudios filológicos*, no. 62, 2018.

Noels, Kimberly. A. "Learning Spanish as a Second Language: Learners' Orientations and Perceptions of their Teachers' Communication Style." *Language Learning*, vol. 51, no. 1, June 2008, pp. 107-144.

Pena Díaz, Carmen, Raquel Fernández Fernández, Antonio García Gómez, and Ana María Halbach. "La implantación de proyectos educativos bilingües en la Comunidad de Madrid: Las expectativas del profesorado antes de iniciar el proyecto." *Porta Linguarum*, no. 3, January 2005, pp. 161-173.

Pena Díaz, Carmen, and María Dolores Porto Requejo. "Teacher Beliefs in a CLIL Education Project." *Porta Linguarum*, no. 10, June 2008, pp. 151-161.

Pérez Cañado, María Luisa. "Teacher Training Needs for Bilingual Education: In-service Teacher Perceptions." *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, vol. 19, no. 3, December 2014, pp. 266-295.

Pérez Cañado, María Luisa. "Are Teachers Ready for CLIL? Evidence from a European Study." *European Journal of Teacher Education*, vol. 39, no. 2, January 2016, pp. 202-221.

Pladevall-Ballester, Elisabet. "Exploring Primary School CLIL Perceptions in Catalonia: Students', Teachers' and Parents' Opinions and Expectations." *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, vol. 18, no. 1, 2014, pp. 45-59.

Roth, Guy, Avi Assor, Yaniv Kanat-Maymon, and Haya Kaplan. "Autonomous Motivation for Teaching: How Self-determined Teaching may Lead to Self-determined Learning." *Journal of Educational Psychology*, vol. 99, no. 4, 2007, pp. 761-774.

Ryan, Richard M., and Edward L. Deci. "An Overview of Self-determination Theory: An Organismic Dialectical Perspective." *Handbook of Self-determination Research*, edited by Edward L. Deci and Richard M. Ryan, The University of Rochester, 2002, pp. 3-33.

Seikkula-Leino, Jaana. "CLIL Learning: Achievement Levels and Affective Factors." *Language and Education*, vol. 21, no. 4, 2007, pp. 328-341.

Shann, Mary H. "Personal Commitment and Satisfaction among Teachers in Urban Middle Schools." *The Journal of Educational Research*, vol. 92, no. 2, 1998, pp. 67-73.

Sinclair, Catherine. "Initial and Changing Student Teacher Motivation and Commitment to Teaching." *Asia□Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, vol. 36, no. 2, 2008, pp. 79-104.

Sylvén, Liss Kerstin, and Amy S. Thompson. "Language Learning Motivation and CLIL: Is There a Connection?" *Journal of Immersion and Content-Based Language Education*, vol. 3, no. 1, 2015, pp. 28-50.

APPENDIX: THE QUESTIONNAIRE

FL MOTIVATION

Answer the following questions.
Age:

Gender: M / F

1. I would like/wouldn't like to become a CLIL teacher because …
2. My main motivation(s) for using CLIL methodology in the future is…
3. What I like most about CLIL is…
4. Teaching CLIL will mean social prestige, which I find/do not find particularly relevant because…
5. I find/do not find CLIL teaching rewarding because…
6. I consider/do not consider teaching values and educating people to be a core aspect of teaching CLIL since…
7. I believe/do not believe that teaching CLIL will be positive for my professional career since…
8. If I become a CLIL teacher, I will look for new methodologies/ways of teaching because…
9. If I ever become a CLIL teacher, I would/would not like to make an effort to please my students' parents.
10. Teaching CLIL will/will not be a dream come true due to the fact that…

Recibido / Received: 29-3-2021 *Aceptado /Accepted: 5-6-2021*

Sounding an Idol: The Television as Imagetext in Don DeLillo's *White Noise*

Simon Pritchard (siprit82@yahoo.com)
Universidad Autónoma de Madrid

Abstract

The response of critics to Don DeLillo's seminal novel *White Noise* has centred on the connections that can be drawn between this work and the critical context that surrounded it upon its publication in 1984, namely the climate of radical scepticism ushered in by critics like Jean Baudrillard. This article attempts to argue that the relationship between the novel and this critical climate is far more antagonistic than has been acknowledged previously. Drawing upon the critic W.J.T. Mitchell's reading of Friedrich Nietzsche's concept of the "sounding", as opposed to the iconoclastic smashing, of idols, the article will "sound" the idol which is at the centre of DeLillo's novel: the television. This will show the critical distance that DeLillo deliberately established between his text and the texts of postmodern theory that were fashionable throughout the later twentieth century (particularly at the time *White Noise* was published) and will place DeLillo in a more contemporary context, his face turned not only to the past, but to the critical horizons ahead of him.

Key words: Iconoclasm, Idolatry, Imagetext, Postmodernism, Baudrillard.

Sondeando un ídolo: la televisión como imagen-texto en *White Noise* de Don DeLillo

Resumen

La recepción de gran parte de la crítica a la novela fundamental de Don DeLillo, *White Noise,* se ha

centrado en las conexiones establecidas entre esta obra y el contexto crítico en el que apareció en 1984, es decir, en el clima de escepticismo radical introducido por críticos culturales como Jean Baudrillard. En este artículo se argumenta que la interrelación entre esta novela y aquel contexto crítico es mucho más antagónica de lo que se ha admitido hasta ahora. Partiendo de la interpretación que el crítico W.J.T. Mitchell hace del concepto nietzscheano de "sondear", en contraposición a la destrucción iconoclasta de ídolos, este artículo "sondeará" el ídolo central de la novela de DeLillo, la televisión. Así, se demostrará la distancia crítica que DeLillo interpuso expresamente entre su texto y los textos de teoría posmoderna tan en boga a finales del siglo XX (especialmente a la publicación de *White Noise*) y se situará a DeLillo en un contexto más contemporáneo, su mirada orientada no solo al pasado sino también hacia los horizontes críticos futuros.

Palabras clave: iconoclasia, idolatría, imagen-texto, posmodernismo, Baudrillard

1. Introduction

On the now iconic cover of the British paperback edition of Don DeLillo's *White Noise* an image confronts the reader. It is an arresting image which demands interpretation, but which immediately frustrates a simple reading. The image is of a boy facing an oblong of white light that looks like a television screen, evoking the various cinematic depictions of encounters with alien life-forms, or the fabled light that is supposed to beckon the dying to the afterlife. The figure in the foreground facing away from the viewer and into the light seems to be fixated; the outline of his back and shoulders barely seems like an outline at all, fading as it does into the black of the background. Indeed, his shoulders seem to be merging with the edge of the oblong of white light, as if the screen were beginning to absorb or consume him.

Many critics of *White Noise*, whose work will be considered in some detail in this article, have settled on this approach to a reading of the novel itself. To them, it is a satire on the consumption of the subject by the culture of the image, this being a novel whose characters float in a morass of simulacra, where the distinction between the real and the fictional has broken down, where the "objective" world is revealed to be a world of mere simulations; it is a novel, therefore, which aptly renders Jean Baudrillard's world of hyperreality. However, another look at the image might lead to an alternative interpretation and might point towards a different reading of the novel. The boy's head is more substantial than the rest of his body; it remains defiantly anchored in the foreground, silhouetted by the light of the screen, relying on this light to render its form, but distinct nonetheless. The boy is clearly captivated by what he sees, but his posture shows him to be immobile, rooted to the spot, as if something were preventing him from moving closer to the light and being consumed within it. There seems to be a doubleness at play, between his attraction to and repulsion from the image. This sense of duality is again replicated when we take a closer look at the silhouette of the boy's head. On either side, the boy's ears create the illusion of the profiles of two faces looking in opposite directions. This makes the image seem like a reversal of the famous gestalt image where the profiles of two faces in black reveal also the figure of a white vase. This article will take a similar approach to the reading of *White Noise*, foregrounding doubleness by acknowledging the pertinence of Baudrillard's theory for an

understanding of the novel and recognizing the valuable critical work that has been done in this area, while, at the same time, trying to break away from the extreme and uncritical application of Baudrillard to DeLillo which has dogged much of the critical response to his work since the 1980s. It is much more fruitful to explore how DeLillo straddles theoretical boundaries, or manages to steer a middle course between them, in this case between the postmodern scepticism of "the real" and the subsequent return, in recent decades, of bodies and objects to the centre of critical discourse. This approach will reveal a more antagonistic relationship between DeLillo and the theories of what might now be referred to as "high postmodernism" and will place him in a more contemporary context, his face turned not only to the past, but to the critical horizons ahead of him.

To select one example of the former reading of *White Noise*: Michael W. Messmer describes DeLillo, after a brief recapitulation of some of the theories of Jean Baudrillard, as "one of the most acute and penetrating observers of American hyperreality" (103). Messmer offers an example of how the ideas of Jean Baudrillard can be uncritically mapped onto DeLillo's writing: "[a]s … Baudrillard … argue[s], in the cultural space of hyperreality, the distinction between the real and the simulated … is blurred, and with that blurring, I would argue, comes a distancing which is conducive to the fascination which DeLillo's characters experience as they witness disasters through the medium of television" (Messmer 105). The critic displays the deafness of tone that characterizes many of the early critical responses to *White Noise*. Often, early critics would note DeLillo's awareness of the then contemporary writings of figures like Jean Baudrillard and would go on to map out those connections, all the while seemingly oblivious to the critical distance opened up by DeLillo's satirical tone. This inability to judge the tone of the novel is particularly surprising considering how tone is established in the very first paragraphs of the novel, along with the narrator Jack Gladney's unmistakeably satirical take on events. His description of the arrival of new students with their parents to the university campus of the College-on-the-Hill where he teaches not only sets up the satirical tone of the novel, but also establishes the image as a central theme: "I've witnessed this spectacle every September for twenty-

one years … The students greet each other … Their summer ... bloated with criminal pleasures, as always. The parents stand sun-dazed near their automobiles, seeing images of themselves in every direction … something about them suggesting massive insurance coverage" (3).

The instinctive reading of DeLillo as expositor of Jean Baudrillard's thinking was common in early responses to the novel, but it has persisted and can even be seen in more recent, and in otherwise balanced and critical, approaches to DeLillo's novel. When prominent DeLillo critics such as Frank Lentriccia, John N. Duvall and Leonard Wilcox discuss the scene mentioned above, even they succumb to the same kind of misreading. In his article on *White Noise* Lentriccia provides, in statements that bear the influence of the most extreme and declarative passages of Baudrillard, the critical context the novel should be read in. This is a context where "the distinction between the real and the fictional can't be sustained … not while watching TV, nowhere in America, certainly not in the burgeoning variety of theories of postmodernism"; this is a context where the image is all-consuming, where the image, (rather than the individual or even the masses) has infiltrated every area of life and has the power in its hands: "[f]or this environment-as-electronic-medium radically constitutes contemporary consciousness and therefore (such as it is) contemporary community - it guarantees that we are a people of, by, and for the image". Lentriccia's reading of the barn scene displays the same innocence of DeLillo's tone as the critics mentioned above. He claims that ""THE MOST PHOTOGRAPHED BARN IN AMERICA" is the ostensible subject of the scene; the real subject is the electronic medium of the image as the active context of contemporary existence in America" (Lentriccia 415). As will be argued presently, this is simply not the case; the real subject of the scene is the very critical discourse that Lentriccia, and countless other critics, use to illuminate the scene. What is lost on these critics is that the very theories they are employing in their analysis of the scene have already been consumed by DeLillo and are being critiqued in his text.[1]

Other critics of *White Noise* have taken an alternative approach to the novel, one that is more in keeping with the novel's resistance to a single interpretation and one that acknowledges DeLillo's fondness

for ambiguity and contradiction. Tom LeClair is perhaps the earliest DeLillo critic to accept this ambiguity and contradiction as an indispensable feature of DeLillo's fiction, as something which is not to be unlocked, explained and, therefore, neutralized, but to be explored or "sounded". His response to the end of *White Noise* is evidence for how fertile is the literary ground that DeLillo lays with his fiction; to a reader as obsessively detailed and imaginative as LeClair, his undecided, and perhaps undecidable, endings are the fuel for much thought. As he observes of the novel's denouement: "[i]f it appears at this point to drive toward a conventional hopeful ending, DeLillo springs several compacted reversals and ironies in its last few pages" (LeClair *222*). According to LeClair, these "reversals and ironies" sound a note of uncertainty for both the characters in, and readers of, the novel. The question, for instance, the novel poses regarding the nature of nature (now that this once stable category has been so disrupted by contemporary developments in science and technology) does not produce a single, unambiguous answer. Rather, as LeClair writes, "because of [the] multiple categories of the natural, the general response of Jack Gladney (and, I believe, of the reader) is uncertainty about some single natural order" (*224*). In other words, while the term "natural" has been problematized by notions like the commodification of nature, or the invasion of the body and mind by bio-engineering and modern forms of communication, the response should not be to declare that the category of the natural has been smashed, consumed or annihilated. The nature of the change undergone by the category of "the natural" is more uncertain than that. Uncertainty, it seems, is a word that best describes LeClair's reading of the end of the novel: he writes of the character's "uncertain acceptance of the uncertain" and describes how "DeLillo passes to the reader the uncertainty that Jack has found dangerous throughout the novel" (*223*). LeClair offers a reading of *White Noise* as the drama of an existential paradox: "[w]hat the Gladney's refuse to accept", he writes, "and what forms the basis for DeLillo's understanding of systemic fact and value is the loop: the simultaneity of living and dying, the inherent reciprocity of circular causality that makes certainty impossible" (*226*). However, instead of responding to this uncertainty with a contrived polemic that extinguishes it, as some critics have, LeClair allows it to remain, finding in it the seeds of a hopeful reading of DeLillo's fiction. He

claims that, "flowing from this pervasive strangeness or mystery might be a sense of hope, or at least the possibility that human existence could be open rather than closed" (227). The present reading of DeLillo's treatment of television is consistent with this tentatively hopeful approach.

Another critic who shares this optimistic interpretation of DeLillo's fiction is Peter Boxall. His chapter on *White Noise* in his full-length work entitled *The Possibility of Fiction*, offers a catalogue of DeLilloean contradictions. He makes many statements on the novel that seem inspired by LeClair's theoretical position in that they seem to loop back on themselves: he describes how "*White Noise* is set in an eternal present which fails, eternally, to become present" (Boxall 111), claiming that "[i]t is perhaps this historical scenario, in which time is both endless and at an end, and in which death has entered life, that lends the novel its millenial character" (112). Finally and most tellingly, declaring that "[t]he avant-garde, in *White Noise*, is continually dying, and always already dead" (127). This last statement is Boxall's main point about the novel: that it is a contradictory work of art which straddles the boundary between a radical avant-garde gesture and just another consumer product. It cannot fully escape the cultural and economic system it is part of, so as to critique that system from the outside, but, from within, it can still do what the avant-garde does best, which is to force "the continual collapse and reformulation of boundaries and distinctions", in order to "destabilis[e] … the limits of culture" (127). As is the case in LeClair's and the present study's reading of DeLillo, it is precisely within the contradictoriness and ambivalence of DeLillo that an optimistic interpretation of his fiction is to be found. As Boxall puts it: "[i]t is this troubling equation of resistance with accommodation, of critique with non-critique, that finally determines the novel's engagement with its historical contexts", but from this uncertain footing, "the novel performs the possibility of making history anew, and of casting ourselves into a new future which has not yet been written" (129-130).

Another prominent critic, who not only honours DeLillo's use of ambiguity and ambivalence, but also finds in it intellectual and critical inspiration, is Mark Osteen. Osteen argues that DeLillo's fiction is effective *precisely because* of how it resists fixed conclusions

and singular responses. As he explains: "*White Noise* is rich enough to provoke contradictory responses, and it will continue to intrigue us because it eludes full explanation" (Osteen, *White Noise* xiv). Osteen's focus may be on the "language we speak", while the present study is occupied more with DeLillo's treatment of the image. Nevertheless, this emphasis on the doubleness that pervades DeLillo's fiction is shared by the approach followed in the present study. Osteen is also led, with LeClair and Boxall, towards an optimistic reading of DeLillo's fiction. For him, what *White Noise* "most of all affirms is the power of fiction itself" (Osteen, *American Magic* 190-191), and this affirmation comes from DeLillo's deliberate frustration of simple and singular interpretations of his novels. Consistent with the idea, that will be explored presently, of how DeLillo steers a middle course in his fiction between idolatry and iconoclasm, Osteen explains how "*White Noise* neither simply satirizes nor sedates, but does something more difficult than either: it makes us work" (191).[2]

2. Theoretical Background

When the reader moves on from the ambivalent image they find on the cover of *White Noise*, they encounter in the first pages of the novel not more images, but instead a litany of objects. Jack Gladney's description of his new students' arrival at term opening, relies on such an enumeration:

> "the stereo sets, radios, personal computers … the tennis rackets, soccer balls, hockey and lacrosse sticks, bows and arrows; the controlled substances, the birth control pills and devices; the junk food still in shopping bags – onion-and-garlic chips, … Waffelos and Kabooms, fruit chews and toffee popcorn; the Dum Dum pops, the Mystic mints" (3).

However, to affirm that this litany of objects has been presented "instead" of more images is to make the age-old assumption that images and objects are natural opposites and, therefore, completely distinct. As the critic W. J. T. Mitchell explains this assumption does not hold up under scrutiny. He states the difference between things, objects and

images: "[t]he thing appears as the nameless figure of the Real that cannot be perceived or represented. When it takes on a single, recognizable face, a stable image, it becomes an object" (Mitchell, *What Do Pictures Want?* 156). So, while things are a "raw material, an amorphous, shapeless, brute materiality awaiting organization by a system of objects", objects are those things that have been incorporated into that system, in turn becoming something a subject can perceive, becoming a "stable image" (156). Things we call images are also, of course, objects, however nebulous and seemingly ephemeral they may be. A popular meme viewed widely for a few days or hours before being forgotten has an objective existence and has its place in a taxonomy of virtual phenomena; the same can be said even of an image in one's mind. In short, images and objects are not completely discrete and separate opposites, rather they exist in a dialectic relationship to one and other; while they occupy different realms, they are intimately connected and often overlap. In light of this, the idea of a culture of virtuality and dematerialized images *supplanting* the objective world is rendered incoherent; this would require a severing of the dialectical relationship between image and object. Rather, for Mitchell, it is precisely at the moment that images have seemed to supplant objects that objects, in fact, re-assert themselves and refuse to be supplanted: "the triumph of virtuality and the dematerialized image is accompanied by an unprecedented fascination with material things" (Mitchell 152). DeLillo is aware of this, so his novel, as a critique of the one-sided concept of hyperreality, abounds in imagistic objects and objective images. The objects listed in the opening chapter of *White Noise* are simultaneously images of a culture, one that is technologically advanced, competitive, hedonistic and consumerist.

Therefore, as an alternative to much criticism on *White Noise*, which sees it as a story of the triumph of the image over the object, this article will look at how one particular type of object *functions as an image* in the novel. This object is one of a trio that Mitchell describes as "objects of ambivalence and anxiety ...[ones]... that can be associated with fascination as easily as with aversion" (158); they are the totem, the fetish and the idol. In this article, the television, by far the most multivalent object in the novel, will be analyzed as an idol, a producer of images and an image in itself and something which inspires idolatry as much as it provokes iconoclasm.

Mitchell describes these objects as "bad objects", clarifying that he "does not mean simply "bad" in a straightforward moral sense, but "bad" in the sense of producing a disturbance, uncertainty and ambivalence in a subject" (147). It could be argued that these same responses are produced by DeLillo's fiction; it will be fruitful, therefore, to approach *White Noise* with these so-called "bad objects" in mind. The present article will focus on one particular example of the "bad object" in the novel, chiefly epitomized by the TV's ambivalent presence, as an object which simultaneously attracts and repels viewers.

It is important to clarify the method followed in the present study, one that Mitchell explains with such precision it is worth quoting at length. His explanation of Nietzsche's method of "sounding", rather than smashing, idols is entirely consistent with DeLillo's treatment of images throughout his body of work. Mitchell argues that much of the criticism on images has been dogged by the either/or trap of having to treat images in either an iconoclastic or an idolatrous way; he writes of "the ineluctable tendency of criticism … to pose as an iconoclastic practice, a labour of demystification and pedagogical exposure of false images", claiming that "[c]ritique-as-iconoclasm is … just as much a symptom of the life of images as its obverse, the naïve faith in the inner life of works of art" (8). What Mitchell goes on to write can be read as a blueprint for the treatment of the image in this article and as an accurate account, evident in all of his works, of DeLillo's highly ambivalent conception of the image:

> [m]y hope here is to explore a third way, suggested by Nietzsche's strategy of "sounding the idols" with the "tuning fork" of critical or philosophical language. This would be a mode of criticism that did not dream of getting beyond images, beyond representation, of smashing the false images that bedevil us, or even of producing a definitive separation between true and false images. It would be a delicate critical practice that struck images with just enough force to make them resonate, but not so much as to smash them (8-9).

The theorist Jean Baudrillard largely fell into the either/or trap referred to above by Mitchell; the view of the image as a corrupted,

and corrupting, false idol fit to be smashed by an iconoclastic critical practice is ingrained in his theories of postmodern culture. It is necessary to briefly recapitulate his concept of hyper-reality. According to Baudrillard, we are living in a reality of pure simulacra, where "abstraction is no longer that of the map, the double, the mirror or the concept", rather "[I]t is the generation by models of a real without origin or reality: a hyperreal" (Baudrillard 1). The dramatic, and somewhat awe-inspiring, reason Baudrillard gives for this turn of events is that a rupture occured at some point in contemporary culture between the signifier and signified, between the sign and any referent. It is not simply that the connections between images and their objects, between signs and their referents are arbitrary; rather, it is that, in the world of the hyperreal, objects and referents play no part in the construction of our reality. Ours is a culture of images only and this is, for Baudrillard, the terrifying, yet compelling, reality we face. Baudrillard's picture of culture is an extreme and totalizing one; for him, there is no "outside the image," no escape from the network of representations that constitute our reality. It could be argued that this kind of thinking runs counter to the central axioms of postmodern theory, which disavows textual closure of any kind and places ambiguity and openness to contradictory interpretations at the centre of critical practice. In Baudrillard's view of culture there is no ambiguity, no allowance for a contradictory interpretation that might see a way out of his web of representation. Baudrillard could be seen in this light as an outlier, an iconoclast of, and within, postmodern critical discourse. Although numerous studies of DeLillo have originated in this theoretical ground, this article aims to show that these studies have taken a critical misstep and that DeLillo's work might be better serviced by another strain of postmodern criticism, a strain which remains true to postmodernism's original commitment to non-closure and openness to ambiguity. The origins of this current in postmodernism can be found in the work of Roland Barthes, which is developed by contemporary critics like Jacques Ranciére, Alexander R. Galloway and the aforementioned W. J. T. Mitchell.

Roland Barthes' conceives the image as always being engaged in a dual poetics. This dual poetics, firstly, involves what he calls the punctum (the sheer presence of the subject of the image, the imagistic impact we experience and which requires no commentary)

and, secondly, the studium (the image in Jacques Ranciére's terms as "a vehicle for a silent discourse which [the semiologist] endeavour[s] to translate into sentences" (Ranciére 11). Images have an immediacy and impact that language does not have; at first, they silently move us. However, when we talk of an "impact", what we also mean is the nonsilent explosion of discourse that particular images can generate within a wider culture and through other media. Ranciére argues that, in Barthes, we find a rejection of the studium, with its semiotic reduction of society to a "great web of symptoms and a seedy exchange of signs" (11). Ranciére, instead, seeks to explore how both aspects of the poetics of the image function in a society ever more in thrall to the production, dissemination and consumption of images. He maintains faith in the "two potentialities of the image: the image as raw, material presence and the image as discourse encoding a history" (12). Ranciére's reading of Barthes recovers from modernism the idea that the act of reading and of engaging in literary discourse can have political consequences. In opposition to the paralysis induced by the former branch of postmodernism, which sees readers as passive spectacle-gazers trapped in a hyper-reality, this alternative (to) postmodernism allows for the active engagement with history that modernism saw as an essential function of literature. Alexander Galloway's analysis of the emergence of digital media and its impact on earlier models of the image is fitting here: "[t]he catoptrics of the society of the spectacle is now the dioptrics of the society of control. Reflective surfaces have been overthrown by transparent thresholds" (Galloway, 2012: 25). As will be shown here, this more optimistic variety of postmodernist thought provides a better prespective from which to view the similarly optimistic fiction of Don DeLillo.

3. The Sounding of an Idol

Mitchell's concept of the "imagetext" can be very useful as an approach to DeLillo's fiction. It is a conceptualisation of images that has serious political and philosophical implications. Mitchell makes clear his aim to explore "the interactions of visual and verbal representation ...[and]... not merely to describe these interactions, but to trace their linkages to issues of power, value, and human interest" (Mitchell, *Picture Theory* 5). Mitchell shows that images are highly-

contested sites where the personal, political and ontological interests of viewers are staked: the "fault-line ...[between verbal and visual]... representation is deeply linked with fundamental ideological divisions" (5). Nowhere is this idea more pertinent than to the subject of the third "bad" object: the idol. Ostensibly, idols are representations of gods, but they can be seen as any object or image that is deified or worshiped. Additionally, in Francis Bacon's conceptualization of the "idols of the mind," idols can also take the form of dangerously deceptive ideas. A synthesis of these two concepts underlies DeLillo's use of idols in *White Noise*.

The "idol" at the centre of DeLillo's novel, the thing which is the source of so much aversion and fascination, the "imagetext" both worshiped and desecrated, is television. Throughout the novel the TV is personified (or idolized) by the attribution of a voice: it is repeatedly identified in the narrative as "saying" various things. The first thing that Jack hears the TV "say" is very telling: "Let's sit half lotus and think about our spines" (18). The Gods of Buddhism, Hinduism and Jainism have been depicted sitting in the half lotus position in statues for millenia, so it is as if the TV, in its first message, is taking the form of an idol and making a call to prayer, asking those around it to assume the position of worshippers. In fact, the very first mention of television puts it at the centre of a weekly family ritual that resembles the weekly ritual of church attendance. Every Friday the Gladneys gather to eat Chinese food and watch television together: Jack Gladney's wife "Babette had made it a rule. She seemed to think that if kids watched television one night a week with parents or stepparents, the effect would be to de-glamorize the medium in their eyes, make it wholesome domestic sport". The act of worshipping the TV once a week is presented as a kind of moral corrective. Also, the act of idolatry, a potentially dangerous and subversive act, is to be contained, rendered safe by virtue of it being forced into a particular context. This specific form of idolatry is sanctioned in order to dispel other forms, forms which are more dangerous and deserving of iconoclasm. In fact, like a weekly trip to church, "[t]he evening ... was a subtle form of punishment for us all" (16).

Within the novel, the status of the television as an idol is discussed by Murray J. Siskind, Jack's colleague at the College-on-the-Hill. As

a form of research into the peculiar power of television, he explains to Jack how he has "been sitting in [his] room for more than two months, watching TV into the early hours, listening carefully, taking notes". He considers this to have been a "great and humbling experience … Close to mystical" (50;51). Murray presents himself here as the classic DeLilloean writer, the recluse alone in a room (or on an island) struggling to understand the world, struggling to gather the strands of reality into a coherent narrative. With the amount of pop-cultural references that DeLillo includes in the novel, one might read the quotation above as a description of his research process for *White Noise* and to see Murray as a kind of surrogate for the author, especially as this type of figure is recurrent throughout DeLillo's fiction (Fenig in *Great Jones Street*, Branch in *Libra*, Bell in *Americana*).

Murray is very much a hybrid figure. With his scheming and plotting and pushing of the narrative forward he acts like a god, yet he is also very much a worshipper of "gods". The main object of Murray's worship is, amongst other artifacts of popular culture, the television. The very words he uses to describe television can be also applied to idols: "[s]ealed-off, timeless, self-contained, self-referring" (51). Idols might well refer to gods, but they can also simply refer to themselves in the sense that the object, or the image, of the god becomes itself the object of worship. To have power, the idol obviously does not require the actual existence of any deity to which it refers. In this sense idols are "sealed-off, self-contained, self-referring". They aspire to be "timeless" and, to an extent, they are, at least until that inevitable time when they become the target of an iconoclastic attack.

For several of Jack's colleagues the TV is a disseminator of dangerous images and, as such, very much resembles an idol fit for iconoclastic engagement. As Mitchell notes of idols, they "present the greatest dangers and mak[e] the greatest demands" (159-160). One of the "demands" the TV makes is for the attention of viewers and it does this by producing images that shock. The Gladneys spend one of their TV nights fixated before images of "floods, earthquakes, mud slides, erupting volcanoes" and as Jack observes, "we'd never before been so attentive to our duty." The problem, however, is two-fold; firstly, the capacity for viewers to feel shock is blunted over time and

so their appetite for shocking images becomes insatiable and, secondly, the TV itself has an insatiable appetite for the attention of those viewers. As Jack observes: "[e]very disaster made us wish for more, for something bigger, grander, more sweeping" (64). Also, when Jack asks his colleagues about his family's captivation at the hands of such mediated disasters, Alfonse offers his analysis: "... we're suffering from brain fade. We need … catastrophe to break up the incessant bombardment of information" (66). This is a vision of the TV as marauding conqueror bombarding people with information, stupefying its viewers with "brain fade" and demanding attentiveness to, and worship of, its images at all costs.

However, a closer look at the psychological mechanics that underlie what Alfonse calls "brain fade," shows that what Jack and his family are experiencing is an entirely normal reaction to the images that constitute their shared culture. The psychologist Michael Apter's notion of "parapathic emotions" is relevant here. He makes the startling, yet entirely plausible, claim that, "all emotions are enjoyed, even supposedly unpleasant ones like fear and anger and horror and grief and disgust, in the presence of detachment" (Apter 72). That is to say that the "negative" emotions felt by viewers of TV disasters like the Gladney family can be experienced as pleasure because of the "presence of detachment" they can feel by virtue of being removed from the situation that is being represented. This "protective frame" (74) of detachment turns these negative emotions into positive, enjoyable ones – they lead to the release of rewarding brain chemicals like dopamine and endorphins. "Brain fade," then, is the inevitable process of increasing tolerance and dependency that accompanies such experiments with brain chemistry.

Michael Apter's interpretation of the significance of parapathic emotions is particularly relevant for the present analysis of DeLillo's treatment of the image in *White Noise*. On the one hand, Apter would identify with the Gladneys' ambivalent experience of mediated horrors because "enjoyment ... can be derived from the fictional (or even documentary) treatment of those things we most fear or that most worry us: the threat of Islamic terrorism, of nuclear war, of major hurricanes, and the like" (74). He would understand why the Gladneys Friday evening was so much fun; because "television news, with its

tales of killings, calamities, and catastrophes, can be the most entertaining program of the evening" (74). Apter also understands how the Gladneys are manipulated by their imagistic culture to crave and consume these visual thrills. "The television moguls," he claims, "understand this well, and find every excuse to show us these arousing snippets over and over again, so that we can wallow in our shocked "horror" and "outrage" (74). However, Apter provides a positive interpretation of the phenomenon of parapathic emotions, an interpretation which is in line with the one that can be read in DeLillo's novel. These emotions, he claims "are, of course, genuine emotions, not pretence (or "pretend") emotions." And this is because, "not only is one aroused when the heroine dies in a film, but there is a sense in which one is genuinely upset" (73). Our enjoyment of parapathic emotions, therefore, stems from our capacity to feel genuine empathy and compassion for others. The implication is that exercising these emotions in positive ways – instead of having them manipulated for commercial reasons – can produce beneficial effects. We see this in the reading of fiction. As Apter states, "these [parapathic] emotions are not just passing "bad moments," but rather the very lifeblood of the fictional process" (73). That does not mean that reading words stimulates positive parapathic emotions, while seeing images stimulates negative ones; rather, that the psychological process behind both activities is analogous. The viewing of images, therefore, could have positive as well as negative outcomes. This idea is particularly relevant to DeLillo's ambivalent treatment of the image, especially as Jack's bondage at the hands of the "bad" object, the idol of the television loosens when the novel draws to a close.

If Murray is one of the novel's main idolaters, then his students are presented as the iconoclasts poised to smash his idol and usher in a new order. While the parents of Murray and Jack's students may have smashed the idols of their time (the archetype being the figure of Richard Nixon), their generation might wonder what idols remain to be smashed. Murray claims, with a prescience that neither he nor DeLillo could have possessed at the time, that the TV is such an idol. As Murray explains, "[m]y students … are beginning to feel they ought to turn against the medium [of TV], exactly as an earlier generation turned against their parents and their country", and this because, for them, "[t]elevision is just another name for junk mail …

[It] is the death throes of human consciousness" (50-51). This could be read as striking a note of hope; the hope being that new generations will resist the superficiality and banalization of culture, creating something new, more substantial and meaningful. However, what Murray goes on to say immediately brings this into question: "[the new generation] are ashamed of their television past. They want to talk about movies" (51). The joke is that the iconoclasm of the generational battles of the past (the 1950s, 1960s and 1970s) has been replaced by a thoroughly postmodern form of iconoclasm, namely, the smashing of one medium of image reproduction and the erection of another as its replacement: iconoclasm incorporated. While the radical youth of the mid-twentieth century had clear lines to draw between them and the previous generation –on matters of war and peace, on issues of sexual and racial politics, and on differences of a philosophical and ontological nature— the youth of the late twentieth century draw lines between different forms of imagistic media.

Once again, it is important not to take Murray's words as a reflection of DeLillo's position. It is not even clear whether one should take Murray's words as a reflection of his *own* position; he is, after all, plotting against Jack from the very beginning. Murray is also a satirical figure, a character who embodies the excesses of postmodern theoretical discourse. In this case, he is presented as the straw man for those critics of postmodern theorists who see them all as nihilists rejoicing in meaninglessness, celebrating the banal. "TV … welcomes us into the grid", explains Murray, with apparent glee, "the network of little buzzing dots that make up the picture pattern. There is light, there is sound. I ask my students, "What more do you want?"" He explains how he implores his students to worship the surface elements of the medium, to worship the TV like an idol: "[l]ook at … the bright packaging, the jingles, the slice-of-life commercials … the coded messages and endless repetitions, like chants, like mantras. "*Coke is it*, *Coke is it*, *Coke is it*"" (51).

The fact that Murray's students resist his proselytizing and choose to engage in their own form of iconoclasm is predictable; as Mitchell explains in his writing on idolatry and iconoclasm, these two activities are deeply interrelated and are often part of the same cyclical process. Mitchell offers two examples where this cyclical process is shown in

action: one relates to the history of empirical ideas and another to the history of imperial conquest.

Firstly, Mitchell discusses the philosophical rift between empiricism, specifically John Locke's faith in the direct impressions of sensory experience, and German idealism, particularly Immanuel Kant's allegiance to the abstract schemata of a priori categories. However, as Mitchell shows, Locke's ideas were once themselves the iconoclastic reaction to the previous idols of the "innate ideas" of scholastic philosophy, and, likewise, Kant's idealism would soon to become the idols for future iconoclastic philosophers to smash. Mitchell describes the process thus:

> [t]he iconoclastic rhetoric in each of these philosophical revolutions has a ritual familiarity: the repudiated image is stigmatized by notions such as artifice, illusion, vulgarity, irrationality; and the new image (which is often declared not to be an image at all) is honoured by the titles of nature, reason and enlightenment (Mitchell, *Iconology* 165).

The cycle is completed when the iconoclastic reaction (Kant's idealism) resembles the thinking that preceded the target of the iconoclasm (scholastic philosophy). This kind of process is seen in Murray's students' rejection of TV in favour of film. Their dismissal of TV as "the death throes of human consciousness" resembles the reaction to TV of the parents of the 60s generation. In this regard, the students take on some of their grandparents' reactionary conservatism.

Secondly, Mitchell explains how the process of idolatry/iconoclasm is central to imperial conquest: "[e]ither the empire is ruled by a god, a living idol, or the empire sets its face against idolatry in all its local forms and makes iconoclasm a central feature of colonial conquest" (Mitchell, *What Do Pictures Want?* 160). So, the act of iconoclasm is predicated on the erection of an alternative idol in the place of the smashed idol; this idol can then, of course, be the target of future iconoclasts as new empires rule. Iconoclasts necessarily become idolaters as the process continues in a cyclical fashion.

The scene in *White Noise* where this relationship between iconoclasm and idolatry is most clearly played out, and when the status of the TV as the novel's most attractive and repulsive idol is established, occurs when the Gladney family take shelter from what is described as an "Airborne Toxic Event" in an abandoned Boy Scout camp out of town. The great unknown of the toxic cloud produces an appetite amongst the evacuees for impossible myths and reduces their critical faculties sufficiently for idolatry to creep in. The evacuees form crowds of idolaters and the objects of their idolatry are many. Babette tries to comfort a group of blind and elderly evacuees by reading to them. She reads from a tabloid newspaper of what various "leading psychics" predict for the coming year; she reads to a captivated audience of how, "a Japanese consortium will buy Air Force One and turn it into a luxury flying condominium", of how "the ghost of Elvis Presley will be seen taking lonely walks at dawn around Graceland", and of how "the spirit of Lyndon B. Johnson will contact CBS executives to arrange an interview on live TV" (145). The response of the audience is like that of the faithful idolater, prostrate before their idol: "[n]o one seemed amazed … There was no interest shown in discussion", because the stories "occupied some recess of passive belief" (144). A crowd also amasses around Heinrich, Jack and Babette's son, whose discourse is antithetical to his mother's. He speaks with great confidence and knowledge about the Airborne Toxic Event and the response to it by the authorities, relying on scientific evidence he has gleaned from school and information he has gathered from various media outlets. His discourse may be the opposite in content to that of his mother's, but the tone he uses is very similar. As Jack narrates: Babette "employed her storytelling voice ...[with its]... sincere and lilting tone" (142), and Heinrich, while "talking about the airborne toxic event in a technical way" used a voice which "sang with prophetic disclosure" (130). His audience's response is also similar to the response of his mother's audience: "[p]eople listened attentively to this adolescent … [they] moved in closer, impressed by the boy's knowledgeability" (130). However, Heinrich's apparent smashing of idols of the mind is revealed to be just another form of idolatry. Channeling Jean-Francois Lyotard's vision of the ever-increasing specialization of science, Heinrich brings into question the authority of his rationalist, evidence-based approach to an evermore complex reality: "[w]hat good is knowledge", he asks,

"if it just floats in the air? It goes from computer to computer. It changes and grows every second of every day. But nobody actually knows anything" (148-149).

The evacuees are shown to be the product of a culture depicted in part one of the novel as fixated on catastrophe, with consumerism offered as a kind of panacea. In these early chapters, the sources of individual and collective catastrophe are shown to be so numerous and so relentlessly advertised by numerous media outlets, that the rational response of the individual is one of stupefaction and impotence, attenuated only through an immersion in consumerism. This culture of mediated catastrophe also fuels the demands among the residents of Blacksmith for various "idols of the mind". Therefore, the reasoned and plausible claims of Heinrich are given and received as if they were prophecy, while the absurd and utterly implausible predictions offered by Babette are offered and accepted as irrefutable fact: a form of idolatry of the mind reigns.

Before addressing the final scenes of the novel, it is necessary to consider the importance of Jack and his wife Babette's youngest son Wilder. Early on in the novel, there is a scene, with Wilder at its centre, where the children of the family are surprised to see Babette, their mother, on the television. This scene is an example of DeLillo "sounding the idol" of the TV rather than indulging in the kind of iconoclasm displayed by numerous other contemporary authors and theorists. The children discover their mother televised on a local cable station giving her weekly classes to retirees. In this moment of discovery the TV seems to Jack to be not just another household object; rather it is imbued with a terrible symbolic potency with ostensible god-like powers. He describes the image of Babette in a language that Murray has used previously to describe TV: "distanced, sealed off, timeless". Her image has an effect like that of an idol on the faithful: "[s]he was shining a light on us … We were being shot through with Babette. Her image was projected on our bodies, swam in us and through us" (104-105). Jack tries to maintain some skepticism, some doubt, some acceptance of ambiguity: "I tried to tell myself it was only television". However, Murray's proselytizing for the TV as idol has had an effect and reduced Jack to a child at the knees of its mother/idol: "[o]nce again I began to think Murray might

be on to something … A strangeness gripped me, a sense of psychic disorientation … A two-syllable infantile cry, *ba-ba*, issued from the deeps of my soul" (104). If the TV is an idol then it can either be worshiped or smashed, yet Wilder's response to the TV with its projected image of his mother is to do neither. His response is an example of a "neutral" way, as Jack explains: "[o]nly Wilder remained calm" (105). It might be a "neutral" response in that it is not like that of his siblings who are "flushed with [the] excitement" of zealotry, but his response is, nevertheless, meaningful and compassionate. As Jack narrates, "Wilder approached the set and touched her body, leaving a handprint on the dusty surface of the screen" (105). Although the screen is a threshold Wilder cannot traverse to reach his mother, his attempt to touch her image is a gesture which enacts an existential paradox best summed up by Ernest Becker: there may be bodily barriers between us that we cannot cross, we may be "housed in heart-pumping bod[ies]", but through symbolic acts, like Wilder's, through a "symbolic identity that brings [us] sharply out of nature", we are capable of making connections, however tenuous (Becker 26).[3] Wilder's response might be interpreted as neither iconoclasm nor idolatry, but also as showing a trace of both. On the one hand, he strips her image (but does not smash it) of any mysterious potency, re-rendering it as simply the image of a particular boy's mother and, on the other, he celebrates (but does not worship) that image as having meaning for him personally. Thus, he alone "remain[s] at the TV set, within inches of the dark screen, crying softly" (104-105). This image, which inspired the cover of the 1985 edition addressed earlier in this article, is perhaps one of the most significant images in the novel, as it acts as a reminder of the importance of accepting nuance and ambivalence when considering complex realities, of the benefits of steering a middle course between the fluctuating planes of two extremes, and of the potential significance and beauty of what DeLillo calls a "neutral" life.

4. Conclusion

In the final scenes of the novel, the child Wilder takes centre stage. The last chapter opens with an account of how Wilder "got on his plastic tricycle, rode it around the block, turned right onto a dead end

street and pedaled noisily to the dead end" (322). The repetition of the word "dead" not only builds tension, but it also sets up Wilder as a surrogate for Jack, the novel's protagonist, who has also been facing a kind of "dead end" from the beginning of the novel. With this thrilling and deeply moving passage, DeLillo scorns the idea that all contemporary art suffers from a "waning of affect." Wilder finds his way to the freeway behind the Gladney's house and somehow defies death by cycling across the first lane, over the grass median and across the second lane of speeding traffic. This journey mimics the very structure of the novel, with its long first and third parts that straddle the short median of the second. As Wilder makes it safely to a ditch on the far side of the freeway a passing motorist finally reaches the boy and "hold[s] him aloft for the clamoring elders to see" (324). This climax can be read as an enactment of Jack's journey through the novel as he dices with the perils of either/or thinking and the worship of "bad" objects, all the while learning how to, like Wilder, steer a middle course towards human contact, towards the ambiguous "muddles and quirks" that constitute a richly symbolic, yet inexorably finite, life. It is also a scene which leads to the most lasting image of the novel's close.

That image is entirely appropriate in that it is one of a "middle course". Along with other Blacksmith residents, Jack, Babette and Wilder go to the freeway overpass near their house to view the sun on its course as it hangs, briefly suspended in the middle distance between the two fluctuating plains of earth and sky. DeLillo saves his most lyrical prose for his depiction of the sunset that captivates those gathered to watch it: "[l]ight bursts through, tracers and smoky arcs. Overcasts enhance the mood … There are turreted skies, light storms, softly falling streamers … Rain brings on graded displays, wonderful running hues". The language here recalls his earlier description of the Airborne Toxic Event. The crowd's response before the sunset is similarly ambivalent: "[s]ome people are scared by the sunsets, some determined to be elated, but most of us don't know how to feel, are ready to go either way" (324). This uncertainty felt by the onlookers of the sunset is similar to that felt by the readers of *White Noise* towards the end of the novel. Indeed, the sunset is presented by DeLillo as an imagetext which represents the art of fiction: he writes of how "[c]louds intensify the drama", of how the "sky takes on content, feeling an exalted narrative life" and of how the "sky is under a spell,

powerful and storied" (324-325). Like so many of DeLillo's novels, then, *White Noise* ends with a meditation on the power of fiction and the uneasy position it occupies between the avant-garde and the mainstream, between being an alternative, oppositional artform and being another commodity, absorbed by the wider culture. Several critics have explored this idea, most notably Peter Boxall, quoted above. However, the sunset not only represents this, but it also becomes a fitting emblem for the middle course, suggested by the novel, between the dangerous extremes of iconoclasm and idolatry. In this sense, how the sunset functions on a diegetic level (as an emblem of an uncertain response to a complex existence, of the response of characters who are "ready to go either way") points towards how the sunset should function on an extradiegetic level (as an image that the critic might "sound", rather than iconoclastically critique). DeLillo guides the reader/critic to the best middle course in the reading of the novel.

This middle course can be seen as a "sounding" of images rather than their worship or destruction, an acknowledgement of how they might hold power over viewers and, if not a smashing of the image, then at least, through an analysis of how an image functions, a breaking of this spell that they seem to have. The Baudrillardian approach to images, which regards them as ubiquitous objects of a kind of cultural worship and which provokes the iconoclastic criticism that W. J. T. Mitchell has critiqued, is an approach that runs counter to this less unequivocal, more richly ambiguous, treatment of the image. Many critics who employ Baudrillard's theories to analyse *White Noise* have fallen into the trap of making the kind of extreme, declarative, unambiguous statements about the novel that Baudrillard has made about culture more generally. For them, Jack is trapped in a world of simulations from which there is no escape and is suffering, like all postmodern subjects, the "collapse of the real" (see Messmer, Lentriccia, Duval, Wilcox, and so on, quoted above and in endnotes). This paper has aimed to avoid this either/or trap, opting instead, in its analysis of the TV in *White Noise*, for a middle course between iconoclasm and idolatry.

For Jack, this middle course is a position where the magical promises of the idols that tempt him throughout the novel lose their

power to captivate him completely. He instead can look upon the sunset as something other, as something real and rooted in the present that he occupies with his wife, son and fellow citizens. Nevertheless, it is also a position from which the sunset can be seen in all its symbolic power: it denotes the enormity of that which is not Jack, and so forces him to accept his, and humankind's, unenviable condition of being knowingly mortal. The sunset, then, is both these things: something real, something earthbound and yet something deeply symbolic. The sunset does not symbolize the promise of immortal life, but neither does it signal the coming of an apocalypse; perhaps it is emblematic of the precarious position of humankind: mortal and yet looking out at an infinite universe, getting a glimpse of eternity. The image of the sunset is, like many such images before, deeply ambivalent: it is not to be worshipped, but neither is it to be rejected (or "smashed"), like an idol. This article has been an attempt to find that "somewhere in between" in its treatment of the imagetext of television, "sounding" it to see what it says about the aesthetic and ethical positions that DeLillo occupies.

Notes

[1] For similar readings of DeLillo, see John N. Duvall: "Jack Gladney lives in a world of simulations, modelings of the world tied to no origin or source" (Duval, 1994: 138), and Leonard Wilcox: "The informational world Baudrillard delineates bears a striking resemblance to the world of *White Noise*: one characterized by the collapse of the real and the flow of signifiers emanating from an information society, by a 'loss of the real` in a black hole of simulation and the play and exchange of signs" (Wilcox 346). Other critics who have contributed to this strain of DeLillo criticism are John Frow ("The Last Things Before the Last: Notes on *White Noise*", 1990), Scott Rettberg ("American Simulacra: DeLillo in Light of Postmodernism", 1999), Bradley Butterfield ("Baudrillard's Primitivism and *White Noise*: *'The only avant-garde we've got*'", 1999), Stephen N. doCarmo ("Subjects, Objects, and the Postmodern Differend in Don Delillo's *White Noise*", 2000) and Michael Stockinger ("Experiments on Living Matter or How to Save the Narrative from Extinction: The Unfinished Story of Jean

Baudrillard's and Don DeLillo's Cultural Pathology", 2000).

[2] In more recent criticism, there is evidence of this more nuanced, critical analysis of how the theories of Baudrillard interact with the fiction of DeLillo. This article aims to follow this more nuanced approach. Mark Schuster's book-length study of the connections between the novels of DeLillo and Jean Baudrillard's work is one such example. In it Schuster explores many differences between the two figures, pointing out, for instance, how DeLillo, "unlike Baudrillard … envisions a world in which subjectivity remains intact and the subject has the capacity to alter the ideological framework of society" (Schuster 4). Another recent contribution to this strain of DeLillo criticism was made by the critic Mark Brown who argues that: "the text [of *White Noise*] itself demonstrates DeLillo's suspicion of literary and cultural theories which propose postmodernity's potentially infinite deferrals and regressions." Brown, instead, "relocates the novel as a text which explores postmodern themes, while at the same time demonstrating DeLillo's parodic intentions towards postmodern culture by consciously locating textual authority at the moment of death" (Brown 19). Erik Cofer also aims to push the analysis of DeLillo's fiction beyond the critical parameters of postmodernism, specifically employing the concept of post-postmodernism, explored by Jeffrey Nealon (Cofer).

[3] Becker sums up the existential paradox best when he writes: "[m]an has a symbolic identity that brings him sharply out of nature. He is a symbolic self ... He is a creator with a mind that soars out to speculate about atoms and infinity, who can place himself imaginatively at a point in space and contemplate bemusedly his own planet … Yet, at the same time … man is a worm and food for worms. This is the paradox: he is out of nature and hopelessly in it; he is dual, up in the stars and yet housed in a heart-pumping, breath-gasping body" (Becker 26).

Works Cited

Apter, Michael J. *Danger: Our Quest for Excitement*. One World Publications, 2006.

Baudrillard, Jean. *Simulacra and Simulation*. Translated by Sheila Faria Glaser, University of Michigan Press, 1994.

Becker, Ernest. *The Denial of Death*. The Free Press, 1973.
Boxall, Peter. *The Possibility of Fiction*. Routledge, 2006.
Brown, Mark. "'The Boundary we Need' Death and the Challenge to Postmodernity in Don DeLillo's '*White Noise*.'" *Journal of English Studies*, no. 18, 2020, pp. 17-36.
Butterfield, Bradley. "Baudrillard's Primitivism & *White Noise*: 'The only avant-garde we've got.'" *Undercurrents* vol. 7, Spring 1999.
Cofer, Erik. "Owning the End of the World: *Zero K* and DeLillo's Post-postmodern Mutation." *Critique: Studies in Contemporary Fiction*, vol. 59, no. 4, 2018, pp. 459-470.
DeLillo, Don. *White Noise*. Viking Penguin, 1984.
doCarmo, Stephen N. "Subjects, Objects, and the Postmodern Differend in Don DeLillo's *White Noise*." *Lit: Literature Interpretation Theory*, July 2000, pp.1-33.
Duval, John N. "The (Super)Marketplace of Images: Television as Unmediated Mediation in DeLillo's *White Noise*," *Arizona Quarterly: A Journal of American Literature, Culture and Theory*, vol. 50, no. 3, 1994, pp. 127-153.
Frow, John. "The Last Things Before the Last: Notes on *White Noise*." *Introducing Don DeLillo*, edited by Frank Lentricchia, Duke UP, 1991, pp. 175- 191.
Galloway, Alexander, R. *The Interface Effect*. Polity Press, 2012.
LeClair, Tom. *In the Loop: Don DeLillo and the Systems Novel*. University of Illinois Press, 1987.
Lentriccia, Frank. "Don DeLillo's Primal Scenes", *White Noise: Text and Criticism*, edited by Mark Osteen, Penguin Books, 1998, pp. 421-416.
Messmer, Michael W. "On the Blurring of the Real and the Fake," *Bloom's Major Novelists*, edited by Harold Bloom, Chelsea House Publishers, 2003, pp. 103-105.
Mitchell, W. J. T. *Iconology: Image, Text, Ideology*. University of Chicago Press, 1986.
—. *Picture Theory: Essays on Verbal and Visual Representation*. University of Chicago Press, 1994.
—. *What Do Pictures Want? The Lives and Loves of Images*. University of Chicago Press, 2005.
Osteen, Mark, editor. *White Noise: Text and Criticism*, Penguin Books, 1998.

—-. .*American Magic and Dread: Don DeLillo's Dialogue with Culture*. University of Pennsylvania Press, 2000.

Ranciére, Jacques. *The Future of the Image.* Translated by Gregory Elliot. Verso Books, 2009.

Rettberg, Scott. "American Simulacra: Don DeLillo's Fiction in Light of Postmodernism." *Undercurrents*, 7 (Spring 1999).

Schuster, Mark. *Don DeLillo, Jean Baudrillard and the Consumer Conundrum*. Cambria Press, 2008.

Stockinger, Michael. "Experiments on Living Matter or How to Save the Narrative from Extinction: The Unfinished Story of Jean Baudrillard's and Don DeLillo's Cultural Pathology," *Simulacrum America: The USA and the Popular Media*, edited by Kraus, Elisabeth and Carolin Auer, Camden House, 2000, pp. 49-67.

Wilcox, Leonard. "Baudrillard, DeLillo's "White Noise," and the End of Heroic Narrative", *Contemporary Literature*, Vol. 32, Number 3, 1991, pp. 346-365.

Recibido / Received: 14-4-2021 *Aceptado /Accepted: 18-5-2021*

Travelling Wives and Unprotected Women: Representing the Female Traveller in Tom Taylor's mid-Victorian Comedies (1860)

Victoria Puchal Terol (mariavictoria.puchal@campusviu.es)[1]
Universidad Internacional de Valencia

Abstract: Throughout the second half of the nineteenth century, Britain would boast of an economic and social prosperity, improving both national and international transport and tourism. However, certain social issues such as the *Woman Question*, or the altercations in the colonies raised questions about the Empire's stability. In London, galleries, museums, and theatrical stages, would reproduce images of the colonies to satisfy the people's appetite for the foreign. In these, mobile women were usually reduced to stereotypical characters. Thus, we can find a clear categorization of the female traveller: on the one hand, the faithful wife who accompanies her husband, and, on the other, the wild, undomesticated female (Ferrús 19). This article scrutinises women's position and representation as travellers during the Victorian period. With this purpose in mind, we analyse two comedies written by English playwright Tom Taylor (1817-1880) for London's stages: *The Overland Route* (Haymarket 23 February 1860) and *Up at the Hills* (St. James's Theatre 22 October 1860). The plays' setting (colonial India) offers us the opportunity to further discuss gender ideology and its relationship with travel during the mid-Victorian period.

Keywords: Victorian theatre, women, Tom Taylor, female representation, travel.

Esposas viajeras y mujeres desprotegidas: representación de la mujer viajera en las comedias de Tom Taylor a mediados del siglo XIX

Resumen: Durante la segunda mitad del siglo XIX, Inglaterra alardeaba de una prosperidad económica y

social, reflejada en la promoción de los medios de transporte y del turismo. Sin embargo, movimientos sociales como la *Woman Question* o los altercados en las colonias hacían cuestionar la estabilidad del Imperio. En Londres, numerosas representaciones teatrales y otras formas de entretenimiento visual reproducían unas colonias en las que la mujer, a menudo, se veía restringida a ciertos estereotipos de viajera. De esta manera, existe una categorización clara de la mujer viajera: por una parte, la esposa que acompaña a su marido y, por otra, la no domesticada o salvaje (Ferrús 19). En este artículo abordamos la situación y representación de la mujer Victoriana viajera en el teatro Londinense y analizamos dos comedias escritas por el dramaturgo inglés Tom Taylor (1817-1880): *The Overland Route* (Haymarket 23 Febrero 1860) y *Up at the Hills* (St. James's Theatre 22 Octubre 1860). Estas obras, ambientadas en la India colonial, nos permiten ahondar en cuestiones de género y su relación con el viaje durante la época victoriana.

Palabras clave: teatro victoriano, mujer, Tom Taylor, representación femenina, viaje.

1. Introduction

In 1851, on the occasion of the Great Exhibition at Hyde Park, over six million visited the city of London. The spectacular Crystal Palace, built solely with the purpose of showcasing Britain's industrial advances, was transformed into a sort of altar in which the visitor could revel on the Imperial mission without leaving the comfort of his or her own country. Among the most popular stands, the Indian section stood out for its perceived exoticism, and it is no wonder why: in there, one could find a real stuffed elephant mounted by a magnificent howdah (or carriage), sent as a gift by Indian rulers to Queen Victoria, as well as other objects from the colony compiled by the British East India Company. As these suggest, behind a façade of instruction and public service, a feeling of nationalism and exaltation of the British Empire lingered. After the tumultuous 1840s which were mainly

remembered by Ireland's Great Famine and the ensuing migration crisis, the 1850s set off to bring prosperity to the country and to re-signify the meaning of the Empire.

Almost a decade later, a second Exhibition in 1862 further established London (and Britain) as a global force. This time, the event would boast of its international nature, emphasizing its intention to promote "friendly relations among all nations of the earth" (*London Evening Standard* 6). Less remembered than its predecessor, the International Exhibition of 1862 attracted a greater number of people than the first, including more foreign visitors and organized groups from factories, institutions, and schools, and even certain female groups patronized by benefactors such as the girls from the London Orphan Asylum and the wives and children of groups of working-class men from Chatham (Hobhouse 135).

In a way, the Crystal Palace, the International of 1862, and the displayed objects became symbols of what William L. Burn named the "mid-Victorian equipoise", a period of apparent prosperity and peace in England during the 1850s and 1860s. According to Burn, both events contributed to hierarchical acceptance and peace amongst social classes, creating an illusion of companionship and national identity. Jeffrey Auerbach mentions how such enormous exhibitions were transformed into spaces for identity formation and affirmation of British nationalism and imperialism (228-231). However, contrary to what the "age of equipoise" might suggest, the mid-Victorian period was, in fact, a time for both social and political action (Hewitt). In this sense, it is worth to question the real purpose of both exhibitions, which had been celebrated shortly after England's victory overseas in the First Opium War (1839-1842) and the Second Opium War (1856-1860). The timing might have been coincidental, but the result was nonetheless relevant; the exhibitions had acted as loudspeakers of the benefits of the Empire, a justification for the colonial missions abroad, and ultimately, as an example of a growingly mobile society.

Within this context of change, several socio-political movements started to rise, amongst which it is worth noting the groups of middle-class women who made the idea of female emancipation go from a whisper to a shout. Taking after Mary Wollstonecraft and her contemporaries from before the turn of the century, considered as the

first wave of feminism (Shands 2), female-led groups such as the Langham Place circle or the Kensington Society gathered and fostered a sense of female community, developed campaigns for women's rights, and organized lectures around London to raise awareness about the old-fashioned passive role of women. Some of the leaders of the movement were Harriet Taylor Mill (wife of John Stuart Mill), Barbara Bodichon, and Emily Davies. They fought against the discrimination of women, going as far as the House of Commons with their pleas for female rights, and published propagandistic essays in favour of female emancipation on the national newspapers. However, a side of society still clung to the traditional "domestic ideology" that had previously relegated women to the home (Hall 28), thus expressing concern over what the media called the *Woman Question*. The *Illustrated Times* described the *Woman Question* as an untimely attempt to discuss the position of women in British society, insisting that "no one, except one or two female enthusiasts who have found no followers, says that women are qualified by Nature to fill all such positions as hitherto have been reserved exclusively for men" (102). Besides condemning women's ability to be consistent in their education, the newspaper went on to classify them as *the weaker* men. Some years later, the *Globe* would still insist on the intellectual inferiority of women and would remark women's supremacy over their own realm: the home (2).

Indeed, as the feminist movements of the mid-Victorian period suggest, there was a growing concern over women's mobility outside the home. With the steady advances of a new wave of intrepid women, the *strong-minded women*, the *fast girls*, and *girls of the period*, defining femininity became an arduous task. Away from home, women had to endure public scrutiny and face moral judgement. Their ventures in a growingly mobile city, in public transport, or in public spaces, became opportunities to rethink what it meant to be a woman. Soon, the city offered feminised spaces that recreated the safety and welcoming nature of the domestic real (shops, tea saloons, all-female clubs…). These, as Lynne Walker suggests, encouraged women outside and materialized the gender differences of the mid-Victorian period (77). In Section 2, I comment on how female mobility outside the country found justification in the ongoing civilising mission of the Empire. We need to question the motives that encouraged the travelling habits of

mid-Victorian women and what such physical mobility implied for them. Which are the strategies adopted by women when travelling alone? Why are the experiences of female explorers erased from the literature or dismissed as "observing" discourses? As I shall contend in the following section, the country's own interest in travel and the improvements in public transport made possible the journey of British women to the colonies both as travelling wives and unprotected females. However, as we shall see, myriad, lesser-known female figures were on the move during the period.

In Section 3 I analyse two comedies by acclaimed playwright Tom Taylor, written for the London stages: *The Overland Route* (1860), first performed in the Haymarket theatre, and *Up at the Hills* (1860) for the Lyceum. I believe that by scrutinising the popular drama of the Victorian period, we will be closer to understanding the Victorians' own way of seeing the world. As both Tracy C. Davis and Jacky Bratton suggest, the success of Victorian popular theatre was inherently linked to its ability to connect with the audience's real experiences outside the theatrical venue. Saving the genre's conventions, the Victorian stage offers interesting representations of Victorian femininity. In my study of Tom Taylor's plays, I focus on the performance of mobile women, offering stereotyped female characters that remind of the period's problematic female mobility outside the country. As I shall contend, the duality of *travelling wife* or *unprotected female* goes on to remind us of unspoken rules of female behaviour. In the end, by exploring these characters and the well-known symbolism in their manners, we will be able to understand the position of women during the mid-Victorian period.

2. Female Mobility in the Mid-Victorian Period

In her study of Australian women's mobility from the colony to the metropolis, Angela Woollacott explains how "women's physical mobility, around the city and around the world, was tightly linked to modernity's other forms of gender instability, such as that occasioned by women's political and career claims" (61). Thus, the scrutiny of the Victorians' physical mobility can prove to be an advantageous perspective through which we can explore and understand the

importance of social hierarchies, gender roles, and the process of identity formation, especially in women. In light of what John M. MacKenzie has described as the "Empire of travel" (19), there is a need to establish the Victorians' space-time relationship and their strategies to negotiate with the "expansion of cultural geography" (Byerly 289). As Alison Byerly contends, the popularisation of travel as leisure contributed to the Victorians' altered perception of the world that surrounded them (289). As consequence, Stephen Kern affirms that, after the mid-century, Britain experienced a "reorientation of thinking about space and time" due to the destabilising advancing technology and its effect in the daily lives of the Victorians (1). Such reorientation implies the incorporation of physical spaces not only in mid-Victorian literature, as Byerly suggests, but also in contemporary everyday practices. Thus, we ought to scrutinise the Victorians' interaction with physical spaces, in the metropolis and beyond, to further comprehend material renegotiations of gender roles and class systems.

The development of both London's metropolitan transport and of Britain's railway network between 1840 and 1860 made possible an expansion of its users' demographics, now comprising the working- and middle-classes as well as the higher classes (Strong 25-26). Within this context, the pleasures of travelling and its cultural benefits could be experienced by a broader range of people. Peter Bailey attributes the popularization of leisure activities to the social structuring and the improvement of the living conditions of the middle class (*Popular*). Travelling became a national pastime for the middle-upper classes, with the interest being both on foreign trips and on domestic journeys. Furthermore, by the 1870s, the development of third-class rail travel increased the national lower-class tourist numbers, which evidences the structural social changes of the mid-Victorian era (Bailey, *Leisure* 81).

After the mid-century, the opportunities for female physical travel exemplify the changing gender roles and the attempts to work through the separation of spheres. Along with the female quest to recognise the multiple definitions of *woman*, the social riposte to female physical mobility evidenced the gender barriers that were yet to overcome. Outside the city, the female traveller was also scrutinised

and classified according to her position. If women were supposed to be still or immobile in the metropolis, when they travelled, their particular "observant" nature made them the perfect complement to the male leaders of the nation:

> [Travellers] constitute two great classes: those who discover, and those who observe —that is, those who penetrate into regions hitherto untrodden by civilized men, and add new lands to the maps of the geographer; and those who simply follow in the track of their bolder or more fortunate predecessors, gathering up fuller, and, it maybe, more accurate information. To the latter class… belong our female travellers. (Adams 215)

William H. D. Adams' differentiation between active male explorers and "observant" female travellers follows up the gender conventions existent in the nation. As his description attests, the perfect role for women is that of companion. Adams' message is clear: women "simply follow in the track" of the bold, male conquerors. However, we cannot forget the strategies adopted by female travellers, which are especially noticeable in their writings. As Shirley Foster and Sara Mills contend, "for women to adopt the role of the adventure hero by describing the dangers that they have overcome is to undermine their own claims to femininity" (258). Thus, by positioning themselves as passive, observant companions, women reaffirmed their socially accepted feminine status and complied with the female ideal.

Adams' description of the female traveller echoes the mid-century's debates about female education and the national necessity to have good-educated, well-trained wives and mothers, and places women back at the tailgate of the gender and social hierarchy (Levine). For some critics, female travel was inextricably linked to emigration, and it was a question of morality and social improvement: in 1862, The *Illustrated Times* praised the emigration of "educated young women" as an exercise of "women's legitimate moralising and civilising influence on society" and insisted in their essential role in the colonies as "wives and mothers" (102). This "redundancy of middle-class single women" (Dreher 3) had emerged after the 1851

British census revealed a "statistical surplus of women"; this data, in combination with the unmarriageable, unemployable situation of many women, provoked the public questioning of the established gender roles. While the debate of the *Woman Question* commented on the employment prospects for women from all classes, the surplus of women instigated the necessity of re-evaluation of gender divisions.

In response to such *problem*, feminists of the era patronized female emigration as best "remedy" for idleness, and as effective means to "make women happy" (Dreher 5). The feminist perception of emigration differs from the *Illustrated Times'* defence of female emigration as quest for doing "women's work" outside England — marriage and childbearing— (102); in turn, feminist groups leaded by the Langham Place and Maria Rye's *Female Middle-Class Emigration Society* emphasized emigration's main goal of "independence" and not matrimony (S.C. 1-10). As Marie Ruiz contends, both the *Female Middle Class Emigration Society* (1861-1886) and the *Women's Emigration Society* (1880-1884) can be seen as pioneering models of emigration societies in England (29). However, the controversy over the lack of eligible British females in the colonies propitiated the conservative critics' insistences on women's *natural* work to be done abroad: establishing and caring after a family.

Thus, several women travelled to the colonies in search of a husband. Perhaps as an overstatement, Anne De Courcy describes how "in England, a land where women outnumbered marriageable men, a girl without beauty, money or grand relations had little hope (of making a good match); in India, she was showered with immediate proposals" (9). Despite such an exaggerated statement, women were in fact travelling to the colonies in hopes of profitable matrimony. Traditionally, these groups of women were named "fishing fleets" due to their purpose of "catching" a rich Company civilian or military officer. The custom of sending women to colonial settlements highlights the commodity-like nature of women at the time; like *trading goods*, cargoes of eligible women were shipped to India to achieve the Imperial enterprise of the British nation. In this sense, female physical mobility outside the country reinforced established gender roles and reminded of the traditional security fostered by marriages and family. Many feminists of the period opposed female

emigration due to the unescapable female confinement in the household. This was because the jobs that were usually offered to female emigrants, generally limited to governess or housemaid. For some feminists, staying in the country would exert pressure on the employment regulations for women and would open up new, desired paths for female enterprise. A. James Hammerton explains how feminists believed that female emigration was "an unjust safety valve to siphon off pressure for progressive reform" (57).

The period's debate on women's emigration propitiated an oversimplistic categorisation of the female traveller. Beatriz Ferrús explains how female travellers usually fell into two categories: "wild women" and "faithful wives accompanying their husbands" (19). Such categories attempt to put order to an unruly situation when, in fact, women were travelling much more than before. Despite the critics' predilection for the stereotypical nineteenth-century lady travellers—the ones who "shocked their contemporaries by venturing into previously 'unexplored' territory, or who travelled unchaperoned, or who put [themselves] in dangerous and potentially life-threatening situations" (Foster and Mills 2), a plurality of women travelled abroad, whether for pleasure or for professional reasons. To name just a few, besides the "eccentric woman traveller", we can find other female figures such as missionaries, settlers, governesses, tourists, and emigrants. In short, as this list suggests, to oversimply Victorian female travellers would be a mistake.

Even though at present we perceive female travellers as proto-feminists who anticipated the fin-de-siècle's suffragist movements (De la Torre 250), the Victorian period restricted their mobility through constraining travelling rules and strategies to manipulate their self-presentation. For instance, there is a rise in the publication of travel etiquette books addressed to women, like Florence Hartley's *The Ladies' Book of Etiquette, and Manual of Politeness* (1860) or the latter *Hints to Lady Travellers at Home and Abroad* (Campbell-Davidson). These conduct books remarked the importance of feminine behaviour during the journey and reminded female travellers of valid unwritten laws of decorum and domesticity. Moreover, according to Lady Eastlake, the "peculiar domestic nature of an Englishwoman's life" had prepared her to be an excellent traveller, equipping her with

"the four cardinal virtues of travelling: activity, punctuality, courage and independence" (98).

One of the applicable rules for women on a journey was to always carry with them properties that would "replicate the domestic sphere", such as hot water bottles and sewing kits (Foster and Mills 8-9). Famous travellers and travel writers insisted on maintaining "proper" feminine English clothes during their journeys, like Mary Kingsley, who used to wear full skirts in her African explorations. Indeed, as the period's etiquette book recommend, sticking to the English codes of femininity and wearing gender-appropriate clothes became a sort of protection against male molestation and offensive behaviour. Above all, conduct books remind their female readers about their exposure during their journeys, and insist on preserving female dignity through "perfect propriety" and courteous behaviour with others. For instance, Hartley devotes a chapter of her etiquette handbook to explain the proper behaviour of a lady in her travels, remarking her inherent unprotectedness when she travels, and addressing her in an infantilized tone (35-39). In turn, Campbell-Davidson insists on women's vulnerability and reminds them to "keep still and be ready for action" in the case of danger (12). As she contends, "if there is no man, the woman will have to act for herself, but even then she will find it the best plan to keep still till the decisive moment arrives" (12). In the end, these etiquette books leave the female reader with a lingering sense of caution and warn about all the possible threats a woman might encounter while away from home.

It is especially interesting to analyse the recollections and writings of Victorian female travellers in colonial contexts, as they show us the gendered power relationships that were at work during the period, both inside and outside the metropolis. While it is true that "not all women travel in the same way nor do they write in the same way" (Foster and Mills 4), we can still find some similarities in their public self-representation. One of them is self-effacement. As Indira Ghose suggests,

> by constructing themselves as busy collecting picturesque scenes or curious flowers…, looking on while men managed the dirty business of politics,

> women travellers epitomize the stance of British women in empire—as located outside of historical and material conditions. (*Women* 9)

As we have previously mentioned, female travellers (especially female travel writers) benefited from that perceived difference between sexes; thus, they usually wrote with a "humbler" voice than their male contemporaries, frequently employing a self-deprecatory tone. For instance, to avoid the scorn of the critics and in an attempt to counteract their public image of eccentric explorers, women like Anna Forbes felt the obligation to remind their readers of their femininity: "I am only a small and very feminine woman, and no masculine female with top-boots and a fowling-piece" (281). With this remark, the authoress is straying away from the "eccentric female explorer" stereotype that permeates Victorian female travel writing, and, as recommended by the travel etiquette books of the period, she is using her "femininity" as a vantage point (Wagner 175).

We have previously seen how the newspapers commended Englishwomen for their decisive colonial role, encouraging women to travel to the colonies to fulfil their roles as wives and mothers. Due to the improvements in transport and the bountiful marriage market in India, many women travelled from Britain to India after the mid-century. While early Victorian female travellers like Anne Elwood or Emily Eden had boasted of their pioneering role in visiting the Indian colonies and wrote with curiosity and amazement, the violent events of the mid-century provoked a shift in the travellers' perceptions. As Ghose contends, the Indian Mutiny of May 10th, 1857, revived the interest in the colonies (*Memsahibs* 6-7). After the uprising of the Indian soldiers against British officers and their families, numerous women wrote about their stories of survival amongst the chaos. Due to the gruesome nature of the Mutiny, women's safety in the colonies was questioned. As we will see in Section 3, these survival narratives were also adapted on stage back in London, where the audiences were eager to get news from the colonies.

Women's life in the colonies was thoroughly commented by the newspapers; for instance, *The Saturday Review* described the hardships of living in Anglo-Indian society:

> […] a lady in India is commonly deprived of those home duties and occupations which brighten and give a perpetual charm to the domestic hearth in England. The care and education of her own children are denied to the mother in a country where she most needs such employment. If not prepared to part with them at an early age, she must run the risk of losing them altogether; and what has she to supply their place and lighten the oppressive leisure which their absence has created? The Englishwoman at home may escape from the dullness and solitude of her own drawing-room by out door exercise and amusements at any hour of the day throughout the year; but the killing sun or merciless hot breeze generally keeps her less fortunate sister in the East a close prisoner to the house, from sunrise to sunset, all the year round. (*The Saturday Review* 10)

As we shall see, the lifestyle of the British women in India was much commented and parodied on the popular stage. In the following pages, I identify these previously mentioned strategies adopted by women in their travels and how these are represented on the Victorian stage. As Section 3 attests, the travelling lady complied to Hartley's etiquette rules (35-39) and sought the protection of other ladies (sorority) or that of elderly gentlemen, which is listed as one of the strategies to avoid unwanted male attentions.

3. Tom Taylor's Comedies

Tom Taylor was famous among the Victorians because of his intelligent, fast-paced dialogues and his unique way of portraying Victorian society. Even though Winton Tolles describes Taylor's work as representative of the theatre of the mid-century (254-5), there are still many understudied texts of his that could further contribute to our way of understanding the Victorians' tastes and perspectives. The only collection of plays that was published during Taylor's own lifetime was that of *Historical Dramas* (1877), a volume that highlights his interest in female figures and which features an array of texts inspired by remarkable historical ladies such as Joan of Arc, Anne

Boleyn, and Mary Tudor. As Martin Banham contends, Taylor was heavily influenced by melodrama, domestic drama, and verse drama, and was usually inclined to remark the "serious role of drama and the theatre" during the mid-century (4). Undeniably, Taylor's wit and satire not only found a place on the pages of *Punch*, the satirical newspaper in which he worked as an editor and contributor, but also on his play scripts.

The first play we shall analyse is *The Overland Route*, first performed at London's Haymarket under the patronage of John B. Buckstone's management.[2] Such was the play's success, that Buckstone maintained it in the theatre's repertoire until the Bancrofts took over. Still, in 1882, the Bancrofts revived Taylor's *The Overland Route* after a personal P&O cruise trip to Constantinople, perpetuating the play's take on the Indian Mutiny and highlighting the interest in the intrigues of Britons abroad. Due to the capture of the real Nana Sahib, leader of the Indian mutineers, the interest for the Mutiny rose up again in London in 1860.[3] In Taylor's *The Overland Route*, the extensive character list of military officers, colonial commissioners, adventurers, and servants, served the purpose of dramatizing the social intrigues and personal recollections of their real-life counterparts' stay in India. It was such the success of Taylor's play that the Simla Amateur Dramatic Club revived the story in 1882 at the Gaiety Theatre in Simla, India (Banham 12). The stories of the three main female leads, Mrs. Sebright, Mrs. Lovibond, and Miss Colepepper, mainly revolve around their romantic involvement with the men aboard the steamer with the purpose of survival in a foreign setting. First, we meet Mrs. Jenny Sebright, a lady who is passing as a widow for her own protection:

> MRS. SEB: You know, a prudent married woman, without her husband, has no chance aboard these horrid P.O. boats. But a widow's always sure of attentions. (Taylor, *Overland* 17)

Her relative anonymity on board of the steamer, allows Mrs. Sebright to use men to her own convenience. Taking advantage of her attractiveness as a widow, she encourages Mr. Colepepper

(Commissioner of Badgerypore District) and Sir Solomon's attentions. However, when Dexter, a doctor-adventurer, reveals her true identity as a married woman, Mrs. Sebright lives in fear of public humiliation. Her character reminds of women's inclination to travel during the mid-century. In real life, widows were usually in need of chaperones and published advertisements on the newspapers soliciting female travelling companions. For instance, the *Bath Chronicle and Weekly Gazette* featured a widow's classified advertisement soliciting employment as "lady housekeeper, travelling companion, or any other position of trust" (4). Other unmarried women solicited engagement as travelling companions in exchange of "a comfortable home" (*Illustrated London News* 85). Pauline Nestor argues that women's growing participation as travelling companions meant their incursion outside the domestic and "freed" them from conventional "feminine" behaviour (39). Nevertheless, those who were adamant to women's unrestricted mobility claimed that it was not enough to be chaperoned by another woman, as women were vulnerable to theft and physical assault when travelling without the protection of male individuals.

In Taylor's *The Overland Route,* Mrs. Sebright experiments a change of behaviour and humour after the steamer's shipwreck. The stage directions at the beginning of Act III announce Mrs. Sebright with a "*gay and cheerful*" appearance, wearing "*a coquettish made-up costume and handkerchief tied over her head*" (Taylor, *Overland*). As the scene moves on, we learn that Mrs. Sebright has "developed such a talent for nursing" since their wreckage and has been tending over other female passengers all night. In spite of her transformation, Mr. Colepepper praises her efforts to remain "ornamental" or, in other words, to remain feminine (Taylor, *Overland* 17). However, Mrs. Sebright's physical transformation takes a secondary role after the wreckage: her *true nature* as a nurturing woman redeems her of her coquettish past aboard the ship. For her, the journey positively influences her character, making her rediscover her true value as a tender, feminine caregiver. In short, Mrs. Sebright's mobility allows her to learn a moral lesson, which she thinks taught by Dexter, the play's hero. Throughout the story, Taylor describes him as an adventurer, a doctor, a newspaper editor, and a volunteer during the mutinies in India. Dexter's eventful journey is hinted at during the

play, as the audience catches glimpses of Dexter's recollections of his encounters with the Indian natives. Overall, his role as a mediator and mentor positions him at the top of the moral hierarchy, a sort of patriarch. In consonance with the times, Mrs. Sebright yields to Dexter's teachings and thanks him for her own achievements: "how shall I ever thank you enough for teaching me how much pleasanter it is to wait than to be waited upon" (Taylor, *Overland* 39). Accordingly, Mrs. Sebright thanks Dexter for his mentorship and for showing her the selfish ways of a domesticated woman.

The second female lead in *The Overland Route* is Mrs. Lovibond, a woman who has been abandoned by her husband. The journey aboard the steamer is also a transformative experience for her, who after reuniting with her neglecting husband, learns to forget her jealous ways. Mr. Lovibond is now a successful merchant and has amassed a fortune in Singapore; his new situation leads him to reclaim his wife back, as long as she keeps her meek nature. She is put at fault for her abandonment when Mr. Lovibond blames her of excessive harshness in the past. In turn, she pleads to "expiate" her previous behaviour "by being all meekness and indulgence" (Taylor, *Overland* 16). Her tender nature after their reunion stuns Mr. Lovibond:

> MRS. LOV: I'll do anything you bid me, dear. Good bye, 'till you see me again.
> *Exit* R. *tent*
> LOVIBOND: Now I call that a woman; and since she's so changed —she's an angel —better than an angel! She hasn't any wings to fly away with; and she *has* something to sit down upon! (Taylor, *Overland* 44)

Lovibond's reference to his wife's lack of wings reminds us of a wife's duty to stay by her husband, no matter what. As a changed wife, Mrs. Lovibond is now bound to her husband. After being away from the home and enduring hardships, she is now a changed woman who has learnt her physical place (by her husband) and her metaphorical place (attending his wishes). In the end both Mrs. Sebright and Mrs. Lovibond decide to define themselves as travelling wives rather than as freed women, especially after a frightening situation. They find

comfort in the protection of men and change their own untraditional behaviour to feel secure.

The *London Evening Standard* commended the play's purpose of amusing the crowds "by producing a picture of a certain phase of society, drawn with considerable regard to truth, and much humour and breadth" (6). *The Overland Route* was a complete success. It was praised by the audience on its opening night and repeated the nights thereafter. It was perhaps Taylor's own inspiration in the real wreckage of a Peninsular and Oriental steamer at the Red Sea what thrilled the audience. However, as the *London Evening Standard* suggested, not all of Taylor's characters would obtain the audience's sympathy: only Miss Colepepper, the third female lead, would gain the audience's favour. Miss Colepepper, the valiant daughter of the Commissioner of Badgerypore District, survived a housebreaking by the Indian mutineers thanks to the aid of Dexter. Throughout the play, her main purpose is to make her father know about Dexter's help, and her indebtedness to him leads to a romantic interest on both parts. Notwithstanding, Miss Colepepper is presented as a woman who prefers to avoid social obligations (she escapes the steamer's saloon to read a book and gaze at the skylight in Act II). In conversation with Dexter after the wreckage, Miss Colepepper highlights female endurance:

> DEXTER: […] Ah! Miss Colepepper, this is life — stripped to the buff. In our artificial world, men are so buckramed, and padded, and corksoled by aids and appliances, that they neither shew nor use their muscles. After all, we may have a few curs among us; but, on the whole, Englishmen peel well; don't they?
> MISS COLE: And Englishwomen?
> DEXTER: What —*you* fishing for a compliment? (Taylor, *Overland* 40)

Indeed, the play's female characters show great examples of female endurance after their physical journey, all three overcoming a disastrous halt in their lives (the wreckage). However, despite the

play's colonial background, the social intrigues binding the characters with one another overshadow the identity reconfiguration of British women abroad. Additionally, their discomfort in the public spaces of the play further contributes to their perceived of out-of-placedness in such a foreign setting. Away from home, the women from Taylor's play have to struggle with their own position to survive, ultimately having to return to more the traditional definition of femininity.

After the success of *The Overland Route*, Taylor created another comedy set in India: *Up at the Hills*.[4] It was first performed at the St. James's Theatre, London, on October 22nd, 1860. As a venue typically managed by women, the St. James's Theatre was "in the heart of fashionable London" and thus attracted a particularly polite, middle-class audience (Bratton 8, 158). Indeed, under the management of the Wigan matrimony from 1860 to 1863, the St. James's prospered with a comic repertoire, patronizing burlesques, dramas of French inspiration, farces, and spectacular extravaganzas. In *Up at the Hills*, Taylor sought to bring a glimpse of Anglo-Indian society to the metropolis, discussing topics such as British women's social morality while at the Station, the soldiers' dubious entertainments, and the reversal of roles in matrimony.

While it is unclear the actual geographical placement of the play, the stage directions in Scene I indicate that the scene is set "at a hill station in India", with the sight of "Himalayah rhododendrons", and a view of "the vast ridges and profound valleys of the Himalayahs" (Taylor, *Hills* 3). Taylor's lack of attention to detail in placing the setting was addressed by *The Saturday Review*, which reminds us of the nation's attraction to the foreign:

> People who stay at home must of course borrow their ideas of things abroad from the reports of travellers, who proverbially tell strange tales… Even at the present day, when an unprecedented interest in Indian affairs has been excited by the thrilling horrors of the still recent mutinies, the mass of educated people have no very clear idea whether the Hills are in Bengal or Madras. (10)

Furthermore, the newspaper echoes public concerns over the verisimilitude of the events depicted in *Up at the Hills*, remarking its lack of veracity and warning about a different kind of Anglo-Indian lifestyle in the colony. However, Taylor's depiction of society got the attention of a large audience, especially due to its resemblance to his previous hit, *The Overland Route*. Perhaps it was the main female narratives what made the critics condemn the play; indeed, despite what the colonial setting might suggest, the play strays from stereotypical masculine plots of physical adventures and conquest and focuses on the social and psychological intricacies of two women instead. Thus, in *Up at the Hills*, we find two female leads: Mrs. Isabella Colonel McCann (played by Leonora Wigan, the manager) and Mrs. Clara Eversleigh (played by Ruth Herbert, an actress of infamous beauty).

In *Up at the Hills*, Taylor tells the story of a young widow, Mrs. Eversleigh, who had exchanged flirtatious letters with Major Stonihurst before her widowhood. Stonihurst, a despicable man who takes advantage of everything and everyone, threatens her to discover their *criminal conversation* if she does not agree to marry him. However, his plan is ruined after the wife of the Station's Colonel, Mrs. McCann arrives to Mrs. Eversleigh's bungalow and asserts her omnipresent influence, tricking a young ayah (or Indian maid) named Monee to steal the accusatory letters from his bungalow, and leaving him with no proof of Mrs. Eversleigh's carelessness.

Following the *dangerous flirtation* of the widow Mrs. Eversleigh with Major Stonihurst, the audience learns about her dependability on him, and about his aggressive advances to marry her before her year of mourning runs out. Away from the respectability and security of her own home in the motherland, Mrs. Eversleigh is introduced as an unprotected, clueless widow abandoned at her mercy in India. Indeed, as Tamara S. Wagner suggests, "a traveling wife was protected by the presence of her husband against the most powerful of terrorizing influences, namely the solitude, which magnifies perils and weakens resistance" (176). Stonihurst takes advantage of Mrs. Eversleigh's unprotectedness and makes her believe she would be lost without him:

> STONI: […] those fellows would eat you up alive, unprotected female as you are, if you were left to fight them single-handed. But you will be out of your mourning soon. (Taylor, *Hills* 6)

As the story progresses, we understand Mrs. Eversleigh's indebtedness to Stonihurst, who has been helping her with receipts, accounts, and even clothing matters. Her unprotectedness at the Hills is manifested through a series of physical indispositions: she is discovered reclining languidly in a lounging chair, surrounded by her Indian servants (3), and only shows "*great animation*" at the appearance of Stonihurst (6). Her physical revival when she is around her male suitor emphasizes her dependency on him, as well as her physical uneasiness at such a setting without her late husband or children to take care of. Thus, we see an isolated woman who has lost her bond with the colony after her husband's decease. In a way, life at the Station has gone from promising (the prospect of colonization and prosperity) to threatening (her lack of familial protection or employment). Additionally, perhaps Mrs. Eversleigh's commented beauty also positions her at the centre of the plot as token to protect. Throughout the play, her moral respectability and her physical integrity are at test; however, in both cases she is saved by a woman, Mrs. Colonel McCann:

> MRS. EVER: And I have to thank you for this.
> MRS. MCC: Yes; without affectation I may say you *have* —nobody but me.
> MRS. EVER: I could not have slept with that sword suspended over my head.
> MRS. MCC: A sword of your own forging too —they are always the sharpest; and now, good night.
> MRS. EVER: Good night.
> MRS. MCC: *(taking up her hair)* I don't wonder the flies are caught in this golden web! Poor Tunstall! Is he to be the next eaten, you insatiable little spider? (Taylor, *Hills* 56)

Mrs. Colonel McCann's remark on Mrs. Eversleigh's beauty as an "entangling" spider web for men partly puts the blame on her.

Moreover, Mrs. Eversleigh' flirtatious letters to Stonihurst while she was still married are used as the backbone for female motivation. The menace of making public a *criminal conversation* and the fear of losing her reputation leads the female protagonist to participate in dubious practices.

The second female lead, Isabella McCann, is described as the leader of the Station, despite just being the wife of the Colonel. The soldiers rely on her for everything and affirm that the regiment would be a chaotic place were it not for her work. Greenway, a military officer, describes her position in the Station:

> GREENWAY: […] all the fellows in Our's swear by Mrs. Colonel Mac —she's as good as a mother to us, lectures us and lends us money, and helps us out of scrapes with old McCann. (*Hills* 10)

As a "mother", as Greenway says, Mrs. McCann has the obligation —but also the inclination— to care for the members of her Station. As such, she is aware of every gossip lingering about, and can exert her authority even at a house that is not her own. At Mrs. Everleigh's bungalow, Mrs. McCann practically behaves as if it were her own, letting herself in when the hostess is absent and bringing along her two nieces, Kate and Margaret. Her position as leader of the community is a direct consequence of her profitable marriage; in other words, she is able to command everyone around her due to her being the wife of the colonel. In other scenario, her position would have been completely different. It is her status as a (travelling) wife what allows her to move along the Station and the Hills at wish, and to quarrel with Stonihurst for Mrs. Eversleigh's reputation. Mrs. McCann's manipulations of the Indian ayah, Monee, and her close relationship with her husband's officers, allow her to outwit Stonihurst and save her friend.

In the end, her social manipulations prove successful both for her friend and for her own benefit, as she manages to find acceptable suitors for her just-arrived, *redundant* nieces (Dreher 3). In *Up at the Hills,* Kate and Margaret remain unaware of the "moral atmosphere"

and the lingo of the colonial settlement but are never unprotected. This is due to their bond with their aunt, Mrs. McCann. However, the girls' journey to the colony has a sole purpose: that of finding matrimony. Their situation reminds us of the previously mentioned *fishing fleets*. Both Kate and Margaret quickly grow accustomed to the rules of the colonies and fully take on their roles as leaders of the household, thus requiring the assistance of the ayahs and reaffirming their perceived superiority in the colony. Margaret is convinced of their "civilising" duty as travelling English ladies in the colonies (Taylor, *Hills* 34).

As these characters suggest, the representation of a wife's domestic and educational duty while in a colony is repeated throughout the plays of the 1860s. As Taylor's plays show, on stage, the colonial wife is usually *shipped* to her waiting husband-to-be. The prospect of replicating the Western ideal of domesticity and establishing prosperous families serves as protection for the women who are displaced to a foreign land. Agency and independency are represented as dangerous behaviour when away from home; in the end, the unprotected female on stage will have to struggle to return to the traditional role of womanhood if she wants to survive.

4. Conclusion

We have previously warned of the perils of oversimplifying the Victorian female traveller. As we have said before, the plurality of Victorian women who were travelling both inside and outside the British metropolis embodied the changing ideals of femininity, and at the same time, evidenced a shift from traditional to transgressive womanhood. The popularisation of conduct and etiquette books for lady travellers demonstrates the growing concerns about British women's femininity and mobility. As this paper attests, these concerns were unavoidably expressed by the literature and the printed press.

We have analysed two of Tom Taylor's comedies, *The Overland Route* and *Up at the Hills*, and shown how the popular representation of the mid-Victorian female traveller further perpetuated the simplistic, patriarchal differentiation between "unprotected" and

"protected" women. While it is true that it would be difficult to provide a single definition of the Victorian female traveller, the characters that we have considered in the previous pages show us the period's tendency to differentiate between "travelling wives" and "unprotected females". Thus, Mrs. Sebright, Mrs. Lovibond and Miss Colepepper in *The Overland Route*, and Mrs. Eversleigh and Mrs. Colonel McCann in *Up at the Hills* are all constructed and defined according to their relationship with men. Altogether, it is their relationship (or lack thereof) with men what makes them vulnerable to external dangers. Still, as we have previously said, these women can find some respite thanks to their friendship and sorority. In the end, these female characters continue to manifest both the unspoken and the written rules of femininity of the Victorian period.

Notes

[1] The research for this article has been funded by the projects FFI2017-86417-P and GIUV 2017-354.

[2] All the following quotes from *The Overland Route* have been taken from the original manuscript of the play, which is stored at the British Library in London, with reference Add. MS 52990 A.

[3] The interest in the Mutiny lasted for the first half of the decade of the 1860s. One of the dramatic adaptations we can find is *Nana Sahib; or, A story of Agmer* (27 October 1863). The play was written by F. Fenton and W. R. Osman and it was first performed at the Victoria Theatre, London. The original manuscript of the play can be found in the British Library, with reference Add. MS 53026 M.

[4] All the following quotes from *Up at the Hills* have been taken from the original manuscript of the play, which is stored at the British Library in London, with reference Add. MS 52996 H.

Works Cited

Adams, William H. D. *Celebrated Women Travellers of the Nineteenth Century*. Swan Sonnenschein & Co, 1882.

Auerbach, Jeffrey A. *The Great Exhibition of 1851: A Nation on Display*. Yale UP, 1999.

Bailey, Peter. *Popular Culture and Performance in the Victorian City*. 1998. Cambridge UP, 2003.

—-. *Leisure and Class in Victorian England: Rational Recreation and the Contest for Control, 1830-1885*. 1978. Routledge, 2014.

Banham, Martin, editor. *Plays by Tom Taylor*. Cambridge UP, 1985.

Bath Chronicle and Weekly Gazette. 27 July 1869: 4.

Blunt, Alison. *Travel, Gender, and Imperialism: Mary Kingsley and West Africa*. The Guildford Press, 1994.

Bratton, Jacky. *The Making of the West End Stage: Marriage, Management and the Mapping of Gender in London, 1830-1870*. Cambridge UP, 2011.

Burn, William L. *The Age of Equipoise. A study of the Mid-Victorian Generation*. Allen and Unwin, 1964.

Byerly, Alison. "Technologies of Travel and the Victorian Novel". *The Oxford Handbook of the Victorian Novel*, edited by Lisa Rodensky, Oxford UP, 2013, pp. 289-312.

Campbell-Davidson, Lillias. *Hints to Lady Travellers at Home and Abroad*. Iliffe and Son, 1889.

Davis, Tracy C., editor. *The Broadview Anthology of Nineteenth-century British Performance*. Broadview Press, 2012.

De Courcy, Anne. *The fishing fleet: husband-hunting in the Raj*. Hachette, 2012.

De la Torre Laviana, María. "Susan Hale: Una viajera en el camino hacia la emancipación". *Odisea*, vol. 11, 2010, pp. 249-257.

Dreher, Nan H. "Redundancy and Emigration: The 'Woman Question' in Mid-Victorian Britain." *Victorian Periodicals Review*, vol. 26, no. 1, 1993, pp. 3-7.

Hall, Catherine. "The Early Formation of Victorian Domestic Ideology." *Fit Work for Women*, edited by Sandra Burman, St. Martin's P, 1979, pp. 15-32.

Hammerton, A. J. "Feminism and Female Emigration, 1861-1886." *A Widening Sphere: Changing Roles of Victorian Women*, edited by Martha Vicinus, 1977. Routledge, 2013, pp. 52-71.

Hewitt, Martin. *An Age of Equipoise? Reassessing mid-Victorian Britain*. 2000. Routledge, 2017.

The Era. 15 November 1863.

Eastlake, Lady Elizabeth Rigby. "Lady Travellers." *Quarterly Review*, June 1845, pp. 98-137.

Fenton, F. and W. R. Osman. *Nana Sahib; or, A story of Agmer*. Victoria

Theatre, 27 October 1863. British Library Add. MS 53026 M.
Ferrús, Beatriz. *Mujer y Literatura de Viajes en el Siglo XIX: entre España y las Américas*. Publicaciones de la Universitat de València, 2011.
Forbes, Anna. *Unbeaten Tracks in Islands of the Far East: Experiences of a Naturalist's Wife in the 1880s*. Oxford UP, 1987.
Foster, Shirley and Sara Mills. *An Anthology of Women's Travel Writing*. Manchester UP, 2002.
Ghose, Indira. *Memsahibs Abroad: Writings by Women Travellers in Nineteenth Century India*. Oxford UP, 1998.
—-. *Women Travellers in Colonial India*. Oxford UP, 1998.
Globe. 13 April 1868, p. 2.
Hartley, Florence. *The Ladies' Book of Etiquette, and Manual of Politeness*. Lee, Shepard and Dillingham, 1860.
Hobhouse, Hermione. *The Crystal Palace and the Great Exhibition*. 2002. Continuum, 2004.
Illustrated London News. 12 January 1861.
—-. 27 July 1861, 85.
Illustrated Times. "Woman's work in the world." 14 June 1862, p. 102.
Kern, Stephen. *The Culture of Time and Space, 1880-1910*. Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1983.
Levine, Philippa. *Victorian feminism 1850-1900*. Hutchinson Education, 1987.
London Evening Standard. 27 Februrary 1860, p. 6.
—-. 29 April 1862, p. 6.
MacKenzie, John M. "Empires of Travel: British Guide Books and Cultural Imperialism in the 19th and 20th Centuries." *Histories of Tourism: Representation, Identity and Conflict*, edited by J.K. Walton. Channel View Publications, 2005, pp. 19-38.
Mills, Sara. *Discourses of Difference: An analysis of women's travel writing and colonialism*. Routledge, 1991.
Nestor, Pauline. "Female Friendships in Mid-Victorian England: New Patterns and Possibilities." *Literature & History*, vol. 17 no. 1, 2008, pp. 36-47.
Ruiz, Marie. *British Female Emigration Societies and the New World, 1860-1914*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2017.
The Saturday Review. 6 July 1861, p. 10.
S.C. "Emigration for Educated Women." *The English Woman's Journal*, 1 March 1861, pp. 1-9.
Shands, Kerstin W. *Embracing Space: Spatial Metaphors in Feminist*

Discourse. Greenwood P, 1999.
Strong, Michele M. *Education, Travel and the "Civilisation" of the Victorian Working Classes*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.
Taylor, Tom. *The Overland Route*. Comedy in three acts. Haymarket, 17 February 1860. British Library Add. MS 52990 A.
—-. *Up at the hills*. Comedy in two acts. St. James's Theatre, 22 October 1860. British Library Add. MS 52996 H.
Tolles, Winton. *Tom Taylor and the Victorian Drama*. Columbia UP, 1940.
Wagner, Tamara S. "Travel Writing." *The Cambridge Companion to Victorian Women's Writing*, edited by Linda H. Peterson. Cambridge UP, 2015, pp.175-188.
Walker, Lynne. "Vistas of Pleasure: Women Consumers of Urban Space in the West End of London 1850-1900." *Women in the Victorian Art World*, edited by Clarissa Campbell Orr. Manchester UP, 1995, pp. 70-87.
Woollacott, Angela. *To Try Her Fortune in London: Australian Women, Colonialism, and Modernity*. Oxford UP, 2001.

Recibido / Received: 15-3-2021 *Aceptado / Accepted: 15-7-2021*

Recensións / Reseñas
Reviews / Rezensionen

Greenblatt, Stephen. *Tyrant: Shakespeare on Power*. Penguin Random House, 2018. 212 pages.

Amira Aloui (amira.aloui@ieas-szeged.hu)
University of Szeged

The early modern era (late fifteenth century to late eighteenth century) has been classified in historiography as the age of absolute monarchs and tyrants (see Tuck). The stage has always invested in debating political thought in a mediated way through figures like Julius Caesar, Macbeth, and King Lear. Stephen Greenblatt's *Tyrant: Shakespeare on Power* examines the psychopolitical mechanisms leading to the rise of tyrants in seven plays by William Shakespeare. Greenblatt is a renowned Shakespeare scholar who holds the John Cogan University Professorship of Humanities at Harvard University and is the founder of the new historicist approach to literary texts. In *Tyrant*, he examines seven plays by Shakespeare, namely the *King Henry VI* trilogy, *Richard III*, *Macbeth*, *King Lear*, *The Winter's Tale*, *Julius Caesar*, and *Coriolanus*. The ten chapters that the volume comprises are short and interpretive *à la* new historicism.

Unlike Ben Jonson, who got imprisoned after performing *The Isle of Dogs*, Shakespeare knew how to criticize contemporary politics without being subject to any kind of sanction, except for the example of the famous performance of *Richard II* that inspired Robert Devereux's "late innovation" (*Ham*. II. 2., 326), which Greenblatt often quotes.[1] He undertakes the same approach, i.e. new historicism, in his analysis of the play, thus denying its demise or, at least, its 'calcification', as it has been claimed.[2] The author prefaces the book with the question "how is it possible for a whole country to fall into the hands of a tyrant" (1), therefore evoking Buchanan's radical political philosophy of the state when he underscores that a "king rules over willing subjects… a tyrant over unwilling" (1).[3] Arguing that tyranny is a collective responsibility, Greenblatt remarks that all "must bear some responsibility, even those who merely remain silent and imagine that they therefore free from blame… By multiple acts of this kind, taken by respectable people eager to be 'guiltless from the meaning', tyranny is enabled" (75-76). The author's last argument permeates the whole book, which is

structured according to two parallels. First, Greenblatt brings to the light the ruler versus subject prism; then, he similarly addresses the psychological versus the political play.

In the first chapter, "Oblique Angles," the author sets the tone for the entire volume by posing the aforementioned prefatory question that was accurate in Shakespeare's age and remains so: "How is it possible for a whole country to fall into the hands of a tyrant?" (1). Although the book leaves this question unanswered, and despite the new historicist approach that Greenblatt undertakes, sociological and anthropological studies may provide the answer/s. This chapter briefly addresses a number of oblique angles through which Shakespeare tackled political issues to evade censorship.

In the second chapter, "Party Politics," Greenblatt examines the *King Henry VI* trilogy, addressing ways that make societies fall to the tight grip of a despot, including, by way of example, weakness at the centre of this realm, including the existence of political factions that can lead to disorder, civil wars, or *coup d'états*. In the same regard, the third chapter, "Fraudulent Populism", unsurprisingly alluding to Trump, discusses populism as a form of cynical exploitation (35).

The next three chapters —"A matter of Character", "Enablers", and "Tyranny Triumphant"— provide a reading of *Richard III* from three different perspectives. Greenblatt shows how Richard III's inward/psychological world interferes in the political arena, thus making him a tyrant. The internalized disgust by Richard II is reflected in the political and moral horror that he inflicts (57). After examining the psychopathology of tyrants, Greenblatt turns to what *enables* tyranny, that is, subjects, calling them "enablers" (66). In this regard, the audience becomes complicit in and responsible for enabling tyrants to exist:

> Within the play, Richard's rise is made possible by various degrees of complicity from those around him. But in the theatre, it is we, the audience, watching it all happening, who are lured into a peculiar form of collaboration. We are charmed again and again by the villain's outrageousness, by his indifference to the

> ordinary norms of human decency, by lies that seem to be effective even though no one believes them. (81-82)

In "Tyranny Triumphant", Greenblatt examines the horror that follows a tyrant's rise to power, arguing that the skills that enabled Richard III to become one are not sufficient for the preservation of the state.

The seventh chapter, "The Instigator", examines what the author calls the "twisted self" through *Macbeth*, where internalized sexual anxieties become the real force behind tyranny. In the author's view, the element that often separates rulers or tyrants from subjects is the madness of the former. In the eighth chapter, "Madness in Greatness," King Lear and Leontes in *The Winter's Tale* become the embodiment of the ruler who is drawn towards tyranny by emotional instability (113).

The last two chapters, "Downfall and Resurgence" and "Resistible Rise", present the readers with the downfall of tyrants and the horror and disorder that they leave behind as well as the possible yet "resistible" rise of societies against tyranny, which provides a somewhat positive ending, similar to that in *The Winter's Tale*. Finally, in "Coda", Greenblatt reflects on Shakespeare's theatrical and dramatic career, as well as his nuanced and relativist criticism of subjects.

In his analysis of these seven plays by Shakespeare, Greenblatt focuses on the dualism "tyrant versus subjects" while implicitly criticizing twenty-first century politics by blaming the people's complicity and (purposeful) collaboration in enabling political tyranny in its modern sense, including populism and post-truth politics. In this sense, he claims that "Caesar is dead… but Caesarism is triumphant" (154), thus summing up the complicated mechanism underlying tyranny in Shakespeare's world. Tyranny could be very prevalent in our contemporary societies, particularly after the rise of the extreme right around the globe, which the author links to Shakespeare's plays when he states that they "probe the psychological mechanisms that lead a nation to abandon its ideals and even its self-interest" (1-2). Although Greenblatt is 'cautious' not to discuss

twenty-first century politics, he implicitly hints at the readers' complicity in the corrupt world of politics by concluding with a rhetorical question, namely "What is the city but the people?" (189). The conclusion aligns itself with Buchanan's political philosophy, with which the author chooses to open his book, remarking that the people and the law are one and the same thing:

> B.—Is not… the voice of the people and of the law the same?
> M.—The same.
> B.—Which is the more powerful, the people or the law?
> M.—The whole people, I imagine. (67)

Greenblatt recognizes, via Shakespeare, an implicit sense of political interest by engaging the reader in the tyranny of modern politics and societies.

Given its interpretative and not overly 'academic' tone, the book may be read outside the scholarly circle of Shakespearean researchers, thus allowing Shakespeare to face a world full of populism, corruption, and post-truth politics, where tyranny still persists. In so doing, Shakespeare's audience becomes engaged in the ethical task of reading. It is no longer the tyranny of one ruler over his subjects, but that of fake news, social media, and world corporations controlling the masses. The power of this volume lies in its capacity to make Shakespeare face the contemporary world with its horror and immorality. Greenblatt manages to make Shakespeare speak again—*Shakespeare loquentem*.

Notes

[1] The term 'innovation' in *Hamlet* most likely refers to the Essex Rebellion taking place after the performance of *Richard II*.

[2] The demise of new historicism has been widely discussed. Veeser (2), for instance, compares historicism to the "flayed, crucified, disemboweled body" of Christ.

[3] George Buchanan is a sixteenth-century political philosopher who became known for his espousal of the radical politico-

philosophical views on the state and sovereignty and resistance theory. He became associated with tyrannicide and assassination after publishing his volume *De Jure Regni Apud Scotos; A Dialogue Concerning the Rights of the Crown in Scotland*, in which he justifies resistance against tyrants and denounces the contemporary theories of reason of state. Among his most radical views is that a king should be a subject of the law and should, therefore, stand in front of a judge after committing an error. The latter aligns with Devereux's famous saying "What, cannot princes err? Cannot subjects receive wrong…When the principle of honour collided with those of an unconditional submission to a political authority, which prevailed?" (in Shapiro 59).

Works Cited

Buchanan, George. *De Jure Regni Apud Scotos; A Dialogue Concerning the Rights of the Crown in Scotland*, translated by Robert Macfarlan, Portage Publications, 2016.

Shakespeare, William. *Hamlet Prince of Denmark*, edited by Willard Farnham. Penguin Books, 1980.

Shapiro, James. *1599: A Year in the Life of William Shakespeare*. Faber and Faber, 2006.

Tuck, Richard. *Philosophy and Government 1572-1651*. Cambridge University Press, 1993.

Veeser, Harold Aram. "Re-membering a Deformed Past: (New) New Historicism." *The Journal of the Midwest Modern Language Association*, Vol. 24, No. 1, Cultural Studies and New Historicism (Spring, 1991), pp. 3-13. *JSTOR*, https://www.jstor.org/stable/1315021#metadata_info_tab_contents.

Xu, Zhichang, Deyuan He, and David Deterding, editors. *Researching Chinese English: The State of the Art*. Springer International Publishing AG, 2017. 282 pages.

Claudia de la Iglesia Sanjuán (claudia.iglesia@uvigo.es)
Universidade de Vigo

As globalisation has spread and become prevalent in the world so has English established itself as the bearer of knowledge which has been included in the teaching curriculum of many, if not all, countries. Such is the case of China, where English is viewed nowadays as an instrument to achieve professional goals and its teaching and learning has been endlessly promoted. Thus, researching Chinese English, defining it and establishing it has been the focus of scholars in the past decades. As its title well indicates, the volume *Researching Chinese English: The State of the Art* presents a detailed portrait of the status of the current research on Chinese English as well as its future.

The volume comprises a preface and seventeen articles whose underlying theme is the situation of Chinese English (henceforth CE) in China. The preface presents the readers with a brief summary of the current concerns in CE research, its status in the country and its use in education and the media. In the first introductory article, the editors give a detailed description of the main topics covered, which range from whether this variety should be named Chinese or China English; its nativisation in China; its place as a variety of English within the World Englishes family; where and how it is used; how its speakers perceive it, and the context of English language teaching (henceforth ELT) in China. Besides outlining the themes of the book, the editors also provide an overview of each of the five parts within the volume. Each article is preceded by an abstract that gives the reader essential information on the topic discussed and they are poised as an example of what is currently being done in a particular research area of CE. Beyond these introductory pages, each of those five parts deals with a specific aspect of linguistic research, beginning with some of its smaller features and expanding towards wider and, sometimes, multidisciplinary aspects. Thus, Part I focuses its two chapters on segmental aspects of language such as pronunciation and

syllable structure of CE; Part II includes five chapters whose topics range from pragmatics to lexis and grammar; Part III is formed by five chapters that deal with attitudes and reactions towards CE; Part IV moves towards cultural conceptualisations on CE with two illustrative articles, and Part V presents two chapters where one provides information about previous research on CE and the other one outlines the future lines of investigation on the topic.

Part I begins with an article by David Deterding where he focuses on the phonemes produced by a group of students in interviews which, based on his own perception, caused misinterpretations of the originally intended message. The author concludes that there are few misunderstandings which might be due to the researcher's very own expertise, as he is most likely used to understanding CE accents. Despite this, it would be advisable to have more researchers carrying out interviews and comparing their analyses. Besides, he recognises the need for greater corpora that covers other regions of the country for two main reasons, namely (1) to make it possible to define CE phonetic features more precisely and (2) in order to check whether there is some degree of regional variation regarding some specific phonetic features as seen in Ao and Low (31). In the second chapter, Lian-Hee Wee deals with the syllable structure of Hong Kong English (henceforth HKE). He uses a rather innovative task on a homogenous group of speakers of this variety to obtain this structure. The subjects were trained to reorganise the segments in several Cantonese monosyllabic and disyllabic words backwards and then, they were asked to do the same in HKE. The researcher concludes by providing a prototype of the HKE syllable structure but adds that such variety is still unstable and calls for further testing.

Part II presents five articles whose topics cover syntactic, lexical and pragmatic aspects of CE. The common denominator of all five is the fact that they show evidence that CE is becoming nativised and thus, evolving into its own variety. The authors try to prove this either by confirming that there are certain syntactic structures unique to CE; that there are specific collocations whose meaning is distinctive or has been modified, or by displaying co-occurrences of collocations that are exclusive to this variety. The first study in this section focuses on the lexis-grammar relation in the ditransitive verb *give* in CE. The

researchers conclude that this verb has been nativised and that the patterns found are distinctive of CE in comparison with similar structures from Inner and Outer Circle varieties. The data used to reach these conclusions is taken from an online discussion forum as the authors fittingly argue that this type of source produces more spontaneous and natural language. Interestingly, such data was compiled in a corpus which is also a common element in the following studies. Despite tackling lexical and syntactic aspects respectively, the second and third chapters in Part II also use corpora to investigate their main hypotheses. On the one hand, Liang and Li use the Chinese English Corpus, which they employ to find borrowings from Chinese and collocations with new meanings in CE, and the written part of the British National Corpus by way of comparison. Among the results, the authors indicate that the NP "all-round way" is CE specific and that "all-round" has acquired a distinctive meaning when collocating with a noun. On the other hand, Liu, Fang and Wei use the Chinese Media English Corpus (henceforth CMEC) and the British Media English Corpus for comparison purposes. The authors discovered that in the CMEC, nominalisation structures are more complex, which could be due to the compressed nature of Chinese reflected on CE or to the process of colloquialisation that BrE is undergoing in media language.

As stated above, the two chapters use corpora which include written language that comes from the media, academic journals or government documents (Xia et al. 419-421). Some authors in the book defend that CE is more frequently used in university settings which is why they argue that data from advanced users in universities should be taken into consideration, collected and included so as to show a greater, more realistic perspective. Such is the case of the fourth and fifth articles in Part II which introduce corpora compiled by the authors in university settings, i.e. compositions written by users of CE. The fourth study focuses on the position of subordinate clauses with connectors *although*, *if*, *when* and *because* in writings of graduate students. In this case, the data are not directly compared with any similar corpus, but Jiang uses Quirk et al. (997, 1037) and Biber et al. (194) as reference. The results show that the graduate students tend to place the subordinators *although*, *if* and *when* in initial position. Their equivalents in modern standard Chinese appear more often in this

position as well, so the author considers this an example of transfer and nativisation of CE. Regarding the methodology, the researcher states that the data gathered were written by advanced users of English but the only parameter that they take into account to measure the proficiency of the subjects is the fact that they have been studying English for 10 years. While devoting time to learning a language is essential to achieve a certain degree of fluency, there are many other factors to take into consideration when evaluating language proficiency (Moyer 72). Thus, the number of years of study may not be enough of a metric to determine whether the subjects are advanced users or not. In comparison, Ren uses the results of an exam to divide students into two groups: those who are highly proficient and those who are low proficient. This is crucial since the study deals with pragmatic aspects in students' thank-you emails towards university professors, as Ren claims that "even among competent L2 users, their linguistic and/or pragmatic performances differ considerably" (110). He determines that there is no significant difference between the two groups insofar as the strategies used and that text length was greater in the highly proficient group. The most frequent strategies to show gratitude among the students are thanking the professor at the beginning or at the end. Ren also highlights "promising hard work in the future" as a strategy in Chinese culture which it is considered an example of transfer.

For Parts III and IV the topic shifts towards ELT and, as in previous chapters, universities become the focal point under research. Teachers and students are the subjects of study in perceptual and attitudinal investigations in the four chapters that form Part III. The challenge to the current model of ELT in China is presented as a foundational idea. Most scholars state that such model is based on native speaker (henceforth NS) varieties such as AmE or BrE. They add that, as a result, attitudes towards a CE variety are negative, speakers see their own accents as insufficiently good and they struggle with their language identity. The chapters share similar methodologies, such as focused interviews, questionnaires and matched-guise tests. Deyuan He's study uses a mixed method of a matched-guise test and a focused interview with a smaller group of the initial participants. He elicits responses about CE accents and the NS teaching model in China from a wide group of students and their

teachers from four universities. In the matched-guise test, subjects are asked to rate with a 5-point Likert scale the degree to which an accented voice matched one of sixteen traits. Despite the skewed proportion between fourteen positive and two negative traits, the expected outcome seems not to have been affected, although a more balanced distribution may have rendered different results. Overall, subjects tend to associate positive ideas with a near-native accent followed closely in ratings by CE and in turn, CE slightly surpassed in punctuation in the negative traits. As for the focused interviews, they centre around the ELT model in China and it is concluded that most of the interviewees prefer a mixed model with proper codification of CE features taught by local teachers and qualified NS. Such perception and ideas also appear in the results of the questionnaire and interviews carried out by Fang in the next chapter. The scope is narrower as the respondents are students from one university in China. They rate their attitudes towards their own English accent, which shows that they feel unsatisfied as most strived for a native or near-native accent and few prefer to achieve intelligibility. This brings about a question of identity that is marginally mentioned in this study. Many subjects want to sound native but at the same time they do not want to lose their identity as Chinese speakers. Moreover, the majority think that having both local and native teachers is the optimal option. It would be interesting to study further such dichotomies so as to observe how their perceptions evolve.

Since the focus of Part III is the ELT classroom, Joel Heng Hartse also studies English language teachers' acceptability judgements. He evaluates seven essays written by university students taken from the Written English Corpus of Chinese Learners. The researcher considers that there are two main categories of judgement: semantic and syntactic. Whereas semantic elements such as borrowings and loan translations are understood as idiosyncrasies of CE by most, semantic shifts in expressions such as "the alarm clock is open" instead of "on" are widely rejected. Besides, many parts marked as "unacceptable" are considered syntactic features of spoken CE. Some of the teachers, who come from different career and national backgrounds, are later interviewed and those who are NS seem to hold more biased views about specific loan expressions. In its conclusions, the study argues that those judgements of CE features as

mistakes could be due to CE not being fully nativised in China and not being widely recognised as a variety. Although this chapter does not draw explicit conclusions about a change in the ELT model, it shows that both local and native perspectives from teachers could complete each other in the classroom. Such attitudes are more clearly reflected in the fourth chapter, by Marlina, who gathers classroom observations, interviews and students' writings of four graduate English language student-teachers. The subjects consider the NS model to be disempowering towards Chinese identities and advocate for the destigmatisation of CE in Chinese classrooms. Despite it being a rather simple study in its scope, it provides a sample of the shift in perspective that is happening among English language teachers in China and opens the possibility of researching the topic further. In closing the chapter, the author suggests changes in the theory and practice of teaching Chinese English, as well as different requirements for hiring English teachers and involving parents in language education.

Finally, the last chapter in Part III functions as an overview of the main topic of the previous four and presents the status of CE across most linguistic research fields. It also informs readers about what is happening in the four main functional areas of language and focuses those on the context of World Englishes and, especially, in the Chinese context. Within that context the ELT polymodel in China seems to be the most appropriate one according to Qing Ma and Zhichang Xu, who tie it all with the slow process of nativisation of English in China.

In Part IV, the editors include two complementary articles on broader topics: the first one that deals with cultural conceptualisations from the perspective of cultural linguistics, while the second one that deals with the negotiation of identity through English as a second language. In the first one, Xu and Farzad Sharifian explain that there are not many studies of this kind, especially from a CE research standpoint. They use several sources of data such as newspapers, online media and government articles, literary works, textbooks and three interviews with CE speakers. The examples found in the data are classified into four core categories within the cultural conceptualisations framework. There are cultural schemas, cultural

categories, cultural metaphors and cultural blends. The researchers imply that teaching cultural aspects of language in the ELT classroom would help students become more aware and appreciative of their own variety as culturally significant and reflective of their identity as speakers of CE. Despite its limitations, it presents an innovative study that could become a trailblazer in the research of CE culture and open the conversation about a shift in perspectives in ELT. The chapter by Fong delves into how CE student-speakers negotiate their own national identity as Chinese in the context of globalisation. Such background is explained through the history of English in China and the concept of *Chinese essence*. This strong Chinese national identity is challenged by the incoming cultural knowledge that is acquired while people are learning English. The participants are asked eleven questions regarding this but only responses to three are presented. From their answers, Fong gathers that they view English as a tool to obtain better job opportunities and, consequently, more economic growth. Respondents also perceive themselves as global citizens since they can communicate through English with non-Chinese people. This leads the author to conclude that learning English is not seen as a threat to Chinese identity but rather has become part of that *essence*. It would be interesting to do follow-up interviews with the students so as to see how their perspectives evolve.

The last part of the volume comprises two chapters which fit perfectly together in summarising and closing the book's main arguments. The first one, by Xu, is a great in-depth summary of the research that has been written in Chinese about CE which helps those who do not understand Chinese to obtain a clearer picture on the topic. In order to do this, the author selects 100 articles published between 1980 and 2013 that he considers to be representative. A notable portion of the chapter is devoted to explaining the three to four different periods in which most scholars divide the history of CE research since its beginnings in the 1960s. In turn, such stages coincide in some areas with past themes that dominated the field such as the existence of CE, its name, its definition and its features. It also includes two subsections on attitudes towards CE and its implications for ELT that could be complementary. The information presented in the chapter could be regarded as an appropriate complement to the introduction, especially if the reader wishes to

dive deeper into the topic beforehand. Conversely, Andy Kirkpatrick's chapter is presented as an outline of the future of the field where each section tackles on one of the fields of research within the book, i.e. phonology, morphosyntax, linguistic attitudes, cultural conceptualisations, rhetoric and identities. Thus, the author simultaneously navigates through each topic and explains in broad terms to where those ideas could be carried. He states that more research into the intelligibility of CE is necessary and that it is important to investigate stakeholders' attitudes towards CE including people with more diverse backgrounds. Consequently, the researcher suggests that updated corpora-based studies are needed and that perhaps the core of future investigations lies in the practical use of CE as it is becoming part of that *Chinese essence*. Therefore, these two chapters act as a look at both the past and the future of CE research. They also work together as the conclusions to the previous fifteen chapters in the book and offer an overview on the research on CE and its future in ELT.

Works cited

Ao, Ran, and Ee Ling Low. "Exploring Pronunciation Features of Yunnan English." *English Today*, vol. 28, no. 3, 2012, pp. 27–33, https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266078412000284.

Biber, Douglas, et al. *Longman Student Grammar of Spoken and Written English*. Harlow, Essex, Longman, 1999.

Moyer, Alene. *Foreign Accent: The Phenomenon of Non-Native Speech*. Cambridge UP, 2013.

Quirk, Randolph, et al. *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. Longman Group Limited, 1985.

Xia, Lixin, et al. "The Corpora of China English: Implications for an EFL Dictionary for Chinese Learners of English." *Lexikos*, vol. 26, 2016, pp. 416–435, www.ajol.info/index.php/lex/article/view/149526/139029. Accessed 4 Jan. 2021.

Martínez García, Ana Belén. *New Forms of Self-Narration: Young Women, Life Writing and Human Rights*. Palgrave Macmillan. 2020, 151 pages.

Silvia Pellicer-Ortín (spellice@unizar.es)
Universidad de Zaragoza

A proliferation of life writing in its different manifestations, accompanied by a growing academic interest in autobiography, is so unquestionable that memoir seems to have "become the genre" in the "period around the turn of the millennium" (Gilmore, *Limits of Autobiography* 1). The turn of the twentieth century has been described as a "post-autobiographical era" (Light 765); the time when the boundaries between fiction and reality have become blurry and the re-construction of traumatised individual and collective identities has led to the emergence of innovative and liminal autobiographical practices. Ana Belén Martínez García's monograph *New Forms of Self-Narration: Young Women, Life Writing and Human Rights* (2020) appears as a timely and illuminating response to this phenomenon, but it goes a step further in the sense of considering the impact that the digital world has in today's autobiographical genres. In keeping with seminal works in the field of contemporary autobiography, the volume is framed within the specialised collection of Palgrave Studies in Life Writing whose main aim is to respond to the global impact of life writing and look for contributions dealing with non-traditional contexts. Accordingly, Martínez García explores six life-writing projects of contemporary female icons of human rights activism from the Global South, which explains why current discourse on youth activism reverberates throughout the book (Hesford, Douglas, "Ethical Dialogues," and Maguire). Moreover, the case studies analysed share some features that justify their joint analysis: i) all these life writings deploy similar strategic narrative devices; ii) English is the vehicle to reach audiences worldwide; iii) they imply online and offline writing processes; iv) they promote empathy as a means to generate social awareness; v) they provide these activists with a sense of agency; and vi) these girls act as symbols of the human rights movements that they represent – universal education for girls (Malala Yousafazi), North Korean rights (Hyeonseo Lee and Yeonmi Park), the rights of Syrian war refugees (Bana Alabed and Nujeen Mustafa),

disabled rights (Nujeen Mustafa), and human trafficking (Yeonmi Park and Nadia Murad).

In agreement with current research in the fields of narrative ethics and vulnerability studies, the "Introduction: Life Writing, Human Rights, and Young Women" reasonably draws on the relevance of new forms of communication in the construction of both the autobiographical self and the process of witnessing as well as on the vital appeal to empathy and vulnerability when writing and decoding these works. *New Forms of Self-Narration* relies on very up-to-date life-writing theories (Schaffer and Smith, and Douglas) which concentrate on the contradictory nature of these narratives. Although they can actively fight for social justice, we should be attentive to the reductionist and neoliberal attempts at homogenizing these testimonies. Martínez García admits that dealing with extremely mediatised texts may be a disadvantage in her study (6). Therefore, she evokes Dominick LaCapra, Martha Nussbaum, and Suzanne Keen in order to suggest that these autobiographical texts should promote a kind of empathy which does not seek the reader to appropriate or over-identify with the other's pain, what LaCapra has defined as "empathic unsettlement" (41). Martínez García also focuses on the two main narrative mechanisms identified in these young activists' projects as key promoters of empathy in their readers/audience – "ambassadorial" and "broadcast strategic empathy" –, thus knowingly relying on Keen's theories about "strategic narrative empathy" applied to life writing. However, a more comprehensive background of the history of autobiography as a genre and the wide range of contemporary autobiographical sub-genres together with some references to indispensable theories in the field, such as Philippe Lejeune's autobiographical pact, would have enriched the author's initial arguments.

Chapter 2, entitled "Malala Yousafazi: Fighting for Girls' Rights via Collaboration and Co-Construction," analyses the vast online and offline life-writing project of Nobel Peace Prize winner (2014) Malala Yousafazi, which has turned her into a renowned activist for the rights of Pakistani girls and the universal girls' access to education. Martínez García calls forth some recent theories in the field of narrative communication about the co-constructed act of writing and reading

(Dawson, and Phelan) when she emphasises that Malala's life writing has a strong collaborative dimension. Yet the author asserts that her voice emerges as trustworthy thanks to the particular process of "co-construction" featuring humanitarian life-writing projects like this (Gilmore, *Tainted Witness*) and the powerful deployment of discursive strategies aimed at generating empathy. Echoing the second-wave feminist motto "the personal is political," Martínez García claims that Malala succeeds in combining the collective and the singular in her self-representation, which has led to the ethical engagement needed for her cause to become global.

The next two chapters approach two North Korean activists who were born in the same village; nevertheless, Chapter 3, "Hyeonseo Lee: Seeking Justice for the North Korean People on Ted.com," and Chapter 4, "Yeonmi Park: North Korean Activist and Instagram Celebrity," display remarkable differences. Hyeonseo Lee, born in 1980, is the oldest of all the young women in this book. She left the country at 17 but it took her ten years to arrive in South Korea. Although she is older, her multimodal interventions encourage the readers/audience to think of her memories as those of a girl, which favours the mechanisms of "strategic narrative empathy" and the image of vulnerability sought by these projects. Understanding Lee's texts as "counter-histories" (Schaffer and Smith 17) that denounce both the indoctrination that she suffered in her country and the human trafficking she could escape in China, Martínez García wisely revisits the intertwining of the individual and collective dimensions of her autobiographical "I". Park, born in 1993, experienced first-hand the North Korean Famine in the 1990s as well as the violation of her human rights when she became a sexual slave as a teenager. In keeping with those well-known theories in the field of Trauma and Memory Studies about the healing role of talking and writing about traumatic experiences (Laub and Podell, Caruth, and LaCapra), Park's memoir *In Order to Live* (2015) depicts her as a victim who wants to redefine herself as a survivor by using writing as a mechanism to work through her traumas. This process has been described by Henke as "scriptotheraphy" (xii-xiii), and it could be identified in the other five life-writing projects comprised in *New Forms of Self Narration*. It is at this point that Martínez García brings to the fore some controversial issues surrounding the genre of first-person testimony, since Park's

narration has been criticised for some inconsistencies, its emotional language and her sensationalist agenda. In reality, I believe these controversial aspects should be further analysed in all the texts included in this book as most of them have been blamed for similar flaws.

The two following chapters address the life-writing projects of young girls writing from and about the Syrian conflict. In Chapter 5, entitled "Bana Alabed: From Twitter War Child to Peace Icon," Bana Alabed's life-writing practices, mainly targeted at criticising the international community's indifference about the Syrian conflict, are studied by paying attention to the fact that she was only seven when the tweets that she posted from the conflict in Aleppo became famous all around the world. Bana became a symbol of a community of oppressed people by displaying a very violent oratory for such a young girl. In fact, her tweets were strongly mediated by her mother, which is read as another example of a "co-constructed I". Chapter 6, "Nujeen Mustafa: Syrian Refugee Defying Labels on TEDx," addresses the case of Nujeen Mustafa, who was 16 years old when she ran away from Syria with her sister pushing her wheelchair. Both her plight for the rights of refugees and disabled people have turned her into an icon. Again, the figure of the girl survivor is exploited in the revised version of her memoir *The Girl from Aleppo* (2017) which, by beginning with her crossing the Mediterranean, turns this episode into the centre of her life story. Here, Martínez García explores a question that may have already crossed the readers' minds: Can we say that these texts are merely mediatised by transnational agencies, social platforms and publishing houses or should we say that all these agents have commodified them? I believe that this is the central dilemma at the heart of all the study cases in this book, and thus it would deserve a further critical insight. According to Martínez García, the exhaustive reporting of Nujeen's journey, for instance, implies the dangerous "commodification of sensationalized life narratives by Arab and Muslim women" (98); however, the author appreciates the transnational interest in these texts because it demonstrates that they are intrinsic to our contemporary culture.

Chapter 7, "Nadia Murad: Yazidi Survivor's Written vs. Audiovisual Testimony," deals with another Nobel Peace Prize winner, Nadia Murad (2018). Nadia was born in Iraq (1993) and she lost most of her

Yazidi relatives at the hands of ISIS. She managed to escape captivity and sexual slavery in 2014 and, thanks to the support of famous lawyer Amal Clooney, she has offered public testimony on her community's behalf since then. As has been examined in the previous examples, the description of the traumatic events that she experienced during her imprisonment is the focus of her activism, yet there is something different in her choice of language. She uses an interpreter in her public speeches, understood as a strategy to develop the audience's empathy and restate the value of her Yazidi culture, whereas her writing takes place in English, pointing at her dual activist identity.

Overall, if there is an aim in which Martínez García's book is successful is that of analysing the discursive strategies present in these life-writing projects and understanding them as active promoters of narrative empathy. All these texts make use of a rhetorical repetition of short phrases and a wide display of rhetorical questions along with an empathic style appealing to universal emotions; they include photographs and paratextual connections that increase the emotional bonding with the audience; they display the shifting perspective between the first-person singular and plural to involve the readers/audience in the act of witnessing; and they illustrate the exclusive use of the first name of the activists as a way of branding themselves. Furthermore, even if these autobiographical projects have been the object of the doubts which often accompany women's testimonies (Gilmore, *Tainted Witness)*, and admitting that they result from a process of co-construction in which the media and UN agencies' role is fundamental, the main message behind this book is that these stories have a great potential in promoting global empathy. Thus, the "Conclusion: Victim Girls Becoming Activist Women" highlights the ethical issues that these viral autobiographies arise and acknowledges that the analysis of these texts does not provide a fully optimistic view of digital life-writing projects, whereas the possibilities that these performances offer for the development of new autobiographical practices should be recognised. To conclude, we cannot but congratulate Martínez García on her final invitation, addressed to the scholarly community, to enrich the discussion within the interdisciplinary fields of human rights activism, gender studies and contemporary life writing, which she has succeeded in assembling in *New Forms of Self Narration*.

Works Cited

Caruth, Cathy. *Trauma: Explorations in Memory*, Johns Hopkins University Press, 1995.

Dawson, Paul. *The Return of the Omniscient Narrator: Authorship and Authority in Twenty-First Century Fiction*, The Ohio State University Press, 2013.

Douglas, Kate. *Contesting Childhood: Autobiography, Trauma and Memory*, Rutgers University Press, 2010.

—. "Ethical Dialogues: Youth, Memoir and Trauma." *a/b: Auto/Biography Studies*, vol. 30, n. 2, 2015, pp. 271-288.

Gilmore, Leigh. *The Limits of Autobiography: Trauma and Testimony*, Cornell University Press, 2001.

—. *Tainted Witness: Why We Doubt What Women Say About Their Lives*, Columbia University Press, 2017.

Henke, Suzette A. *Shattered Subjects: Trauma and Testimony in Women's Life-Writing*, Macmillan, 1998.

Hesford, Wendy S. *Spectacular Rhetorics: Human Rights Visions, Recognitions, Feminisms*, Duke University Press, 2011.

Keen, Suzanne. "Life Writing and the Empathetic Circle." *Concentric: Literary and Cultural Studies*, vol. 42, n. 2, 2016, pp. 9-26.

LaCapra, Dominick. *Writing History, Writing Trauma*, Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001.

Laub, Dori and Daniel Podell. "Art and Trauma." *International Journal of Psychonalysis*, vol. 76, n. 5, 1995, pp. 991-1005.

Lejeune, Philippe. "The Autobiographical Pact." *On Autobiography*, edited by P. J. Eakin, University of Minnesota Press, 1989 (1974), pp. 3-30.

Light, Alison. "Writing Lives." *The Cambridge History of Twentieth Century Literature, vol. 1*, edited by L. Marcus and P. Nicholls, Cambridge University Press, 2004, pp. 751-767.

Maguire, Emma. *Girls, Autobiography, Media Gender and Self-Mediation in Digital Economies*, Palgrave Macmillan, 2018.

Nussbaum, Martha. *Not for Profit: Why Democracy Needs the Humanities*, Princeton University Press, 2012.

Phelan, James C. *Somebody Telling Somebody Else: A Rhetorical Poetics of Narrative*, The Ohio State University Press, 2017.

Schaffer, Kay, and Sidonie Smith. *Human Rights and Narrated Lives: The Ethics of Recognition*, Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.

Rao, Rajiv, editor. *Spanish Phonetics and Phonology in Contact: Studies from Africa, the Americas, and Spain*. John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2020. 452 pages.

Yazmin Lisseth Pinto Sánchez (yazmin.pinto.sanchez@uvigo.es)
Universidade de Vigo

Edited by Rajiv Rao, this volume deals with the study of the different varieties of Spanish as spoken in Africa, South America, Central America, Spain, and the Spanish Caribbean, paying particular attention to the phonetics, phonology, and language contact situations regarding those varieties. The book comprises fifteen chapters divided into three geography-based parts. Part 1 covers Africa, Part II targets America, and Part III focuses on Spain.

The volume opens with an introduction by Rajiv Rao and Sandro Sessarego, which provides a framework for the subsequent fifteen chapters.

Part I comprises only one chapter, written by John M. Lipski. The chapter addresses a specific phonological phenomenon observed in Equatorial Guinean Spanish. As Lipski indicates, in Equatorial Guinea a significant proportion of the population are proficient in Spanish, as the education system in this country establishes Spanish as the region's metropolitan language. In spite of this, many speakers do not fully acquire the phonological system of standard Spanish and show what could be seen as the result of a transfer phenomenon from their native tongue(s) to Spanish. More specifically, the study analyzes the merge of phonemes /d/ and /r/ in a group of those Afro-Hispanic speakers.

Part II focuses on analyzing the Spanish spoken in the Americas and comprises ten chapters. Chapter 2, by Jim Michnowicz and Alex Hyler, presents an updated analysis about sociolinguistic change in YS (see Labov), which is intimately connected with local indigenous languages. More specifically, the chapter deals with the transformation that Yucatan Spanish (YS) speech rhythm is undergoing. In order to determine the extent to which this phenomenon is observable, the authors use four rhythm metrics,

namely %V, △C, VnPVI, and CrPVI. The chapter explores the progress of YS rhythm by looking into segmental variables (see Michnowicz), and demonstrates that Yucatecos are standardizing their rhythm and prefer pan-Hispanic instead of regional rhythmic characteristics.

The third chapter, by Brandon O. Baird, analyzes the Spanish vowels of monolingual Guatemalan speakers and bilinguals from two K'ichee' dialects. The results reveal that vowel spaces are different in the monolingual and bilingual acoustic locations of their vowel categories, and that there exists some degree of acoustic variation among Spanish high point vowels /i, u/ in Zunil and Cantel Spanish dialects.

Chapter 4, by Whitney Chappell, presents the different situations found along the Atlantic Coast of Nicaragua and other colonized regions in Latin America. Overall, Spanish is spoken by the Atlantic coast communities despite the different dialects that co-exist together with Spanish. A series of interviews with monolingual Spanish speakers presented with 50 tokens of intervocalic /d/ are shown. The results prove that the new linguistic influences have not erased the variation between early bilingual encounters and contemporary contact situations in this region.

In chapter 5, Jesse Stewart analyses the situation of Ecuadorian Spanish and Northern Andean varieties, exploring six speech Andean communities. Specifically, eighty-three monolingual and bilingual participants are involved in the study. The segments on which the study focuses include the liquid Spanish phonemes /r/, /ɾ/, /ʎ/, and /j/ and the connection with two fricative realizations of those phonemes, [ʐ, ʒ], retroflex and postalveolar, which are used by these communities. The study reveals that Spanish speakers in this area usually utter the /r/ phoneme as /ʐ/ and, more generally, that Quichua has influenced Spanish especially in the Northern Andean Ecuadorian communities.

The acquisition of intervocalic stop consonants in Spanish bilinguals from Peru is analyzed in Chapter 6, written by Nicholas Henriksen, Stephen Fafulas, and Erin O'Rourke. The interviews conducted with twenty Spanish monolinguals and Yagua-Spanish

bilinguals reveal that Iquitos speakers of Peruvian Amazonian Spanish produce the most Spanish-like patterns of lenient /p, t, k, b, d, g/. On the other hand, the results also show a lesser degree of lenition of stops in Yagua-Spanish bilingual speakers in comparison to Spanish monolinguals.

Chapter 7, by Jose Alberto Elias-Ulloa, deals with Shipibo-Konibo, a Spanish variant from the Ucayali region in Peru. After analyzing the Spanish speakers and how close each type of L2 Spanish is to L1 Spanish, some characteristics from /r/ (realized as a thrill and as a tap) in Shipibo-Konibo Spanish are presented. The chapter emphasizes the importance of linguistic studies that analyze the language of rural South American populations, which show a notable Amazonian influence. In the authors' view, this type of work is necessary in order to gather more details about the linguistic characteristics of Spanish in under-researched linguistic contexts.

Afro-Peruvian Spanish (APS) intonation is analyzed in Chapter 8, authored by Brianna Butera, Rajiv Rao and Sandro Sessarego. This research work was developed conducting sixty interviews with APS speakers from some Peruvian communities. Findings indicate that APS does not keep the declarative intonation patterns of standard Spanish. It has lower rates of downstepping, systematic peak synchronization at the word level (both in nuclear and prenuclear positions), and L-boundary tones at the intermediate phrases edges (rather than H- configurations). These findings are interpreted as a consequence of contact-induced transition, which resulted in the APS grammar's reduction of Spanish phonological targets and to a later reorganization of prosodic framework.

Chapter 9, by Shaw N. Gynan and Ernesto Luís López Almada, analyzes the glottal stop in Guarani and Paraguayan Spanish. The study analyzes the use of [ʔ] in Paraguay through its distribution among four phonetic settings: word internal (Guarani), phrase-initial, synalepha (Guarani and Spanish), and linking (Spanish). The findings indicate that [ʔ] in Spanish is the consequence of integration rather than transfer.

The Portuguese influence on Border Uruguayan in the

acoustically gradient of intervocalic /d/ is explored by Mark Waltermire and Michael Gradoville in Chapter 10. The results were obtained through some interviews, which show that the age and sex of the participants provide a valid social variable in the sense that they have an impact on the results themselves. The language preference might also be an essential variable and suggest that it be investigated in future studies.

Chapter 11, by Brandon M.A. Rogers, examines the influence of the Mapudungun unique intonation plateau pattern in Chilean Spanish, focusing on the similar prosodic behavior shown by both languages. The results show that the two languages have influenced each other, which is not surprising, as it is widely accepted that Mapadungun has contributed to Chilean's lexicon (e.g., Salas; Zúñiga; Smeets). This study suggests the possibility of Mapadungun having a more significant role in influencing Chilean Spanish than previously stated.

Part III focuses on Spain. In Chapter 12, Xosé Luís Regueira and Elisa Fernández Rei analyze the sound and intonation system of Spanish in Galicia. The study shows that a bilingual speaker with Spanish dominance displays two different vowel systems, one for Galician and the other one for Spanish, where high-mid and low-mid vowels are not differentiated. The most urban Spanish speakers display the lowest degree of differentiation for mid vowels, while the Spanish speakers from medium-size towns display a greater degree of differentiation.

The objective of Chapter 13, by Sonia Barnes, is to examine the phonetic outcomes of the contact-induced alternation between Asturian /u/ and Spanish /o/ in word-final position. The data for this study were collected from twelve speakers of Asturian Spanish from Gijón. The results reflect that women keep a more significant distinction between /o/ and /u/ in word-internal position, while men are more likely to merge the two back vowels word-internally.

In Chapter 14, Justin Davidson investigates the socio-phonetic variation in the alveolar lateral /l/ in Catalan and Spanish. This research work measures the degree of lateral velarization in this

contact setting. The results conclude that Catalan exhibits a single lateral that is darker compared to those in Spanish from Madrid and Central Castilian Spanish. These findings are inconsistent with the notions of an assimilated or merged lateral category (see Flege) across Catalan-Spanish.

Finally, Christoph Gabriel, Jonas Grünke and Elena Kireva are the authors of Chapter 15, which delves into the influence and linguistic changes present in the population of Olivenza as an effect of Portuguese-Spanish bilingualism. The analysis of aspects such as rhythm and intonation, among others, allow the researchers to identify that Olivenza Spanish (OS) and Olivenza Portuguese (OP) show some similar prosodic patterns, as in final syllable elongation in interrogative structures. The results support the interpretation of OS as the product of two processes: first, L1 transition during the process of L2 acquisition by the inhabitants of Olivenza after its absorption into Spain in 1801, and second, the eventual fusion of the local dialect with the dominant variety, Castilian Spanish.

Overall, this volume provides a significantly rich characterization of the phonology and phonetics of the different varieties of Spanish spoken throughout the world and how those varieties interact with other languages. Part I demonstrates that dialects can modify the official languages in many communities. Some chapters in Part II address Spanish phonological components through empirical/structured data collection analyzed according to its influence. Part III shows that that even in the areas where Spanish is the official language, the phonological characteristics of other languages spoken in the different territories make a difference in the language.

As a last observation, the volume excludes studies from a good number of countries, such as the United States, where the Spanish-speaking population is indeed very large. In spite of this, the volume succeeds at presenting a fairly overarching view of the phonological and phonetic phenomena that Spanish is going through all around the world. The volume will be of utmost interest for any person that aims at finding out more about the richness of a language that is at least as varied as the populations that speak it.

Works cited

Flege, James E. "Interactions between the native and second-language phonetic systems." *An Integrated View of Language Development: Papers in Honor of Henning Wode*, edited by Petra Burmeister, Thorsten Piske, and Andreas Rohde, Wissenschaftlicher Verlag, 2002, pp. 217-244.

—-. "Language contact in bilingualism: Phonetic system interactions." *Laboratory Phonology* 9, edited by Jennifer Cole and José Ignacio Hualde, Mouton de Gruyter. 2007, pp. 353–382.

Lavob, William. *Principles of Linguistic Change, Vol. I: Internal factors*, Blackwell, 1994.

Michnowicz, Jim. "Maya-Spanish contact in Yucatan, Mexico: Context and Sociolinguistic Implications." *New perspectives on Hispanic contact linguistics in the Americas*, edited by Sandro Sessarego and Melvin González Rivera, Vervuert/ Iberoamericana, 2015, 21-42.

Salas, Adalberto. *El Mapuche o Araucano: Fonología, gramática y antología de cuentos*. Editorial Mapfre. 1992.

Smeets, Ineke. *A Grammar of Mapuche*. Mouton de Gruyter. 2008.

Zúñiga, Fernando. *Mapudungun: El habla mapuche*. Centro de Estudios Públicos. 2006.

Renée Fox, Mike Cronin and Brian Ó Conchubhair, editors. *Routledge International Handbook of Irish Studies*. Routledge, 2021. 502 pages.

Iria Seijas-Pérez (iria.seijas@uvigo.es)
Universidade de Vigo

The *Routledge International Handbook of Irish Studies*, edited by Renée Fox, Mike Cronin and Brian Ó Conchubhair, takes the 2008 financial crisis as a starting point to examine the subsequent changes in post-Celtic Tiger Ireland as well as the evolution of the various disciplinary approaches to Irish Studies since the economic crash. Divided into seven parts that cover a variety of subject areas, the chapters in this volume offer a thorough analysis of the different ways in which the academic discipline of Irish Studies has responded to the political, economic, cultural, and social events that have transformed Irish society and the academic approaches aimed at understanding Ireland.

The first part of the book, entitled "Overview", comprises three chapters. The first one highlights the major cultural, political and social changes that Ireland has experienced ever since the 2008 recession occurred. The editors of the volume, who are also the authors of this first chapter, explain how the *Handbook* aims "to consider how, why, and to what ends Irish Studies has changed in the years since the economic downturn" (8) and how, through the exploration of different fields, scholars are in a good position to observe the various ways in which Irish Studies might be re-examined in the twenty-first century. The second chapter focuses on the evolution of Irish Studies in the United States, from the Celtic Studies boom of the 1900-30s to the more recent feminist and postcolonial theoretical approaches. John Waters explores, among other aspects, the development of the first Irish Studies Centres, study programmes, and Irish Studies journals in the US, and leaves open the question how the academic study of Ireland in America will continue to unfold. To close the section, Michael Cronin's chapter focuses on the writings on Irish culture by non-Anglophone scholars and their impact outside English-speaking territories. Cronin acknowledges the strong international reputation of Irish literature developed thanks to the translation of Irish literary works; he also examines the increasing

variety of language communities in Ireland, which has caused the Anglocentric dominance of Irish Studies to become untenable, since "English or Irish alone are no longer adequate to capture the multiplicity of lived experiences on the island of Ireland" (38).

The second part, "Historicizing Ireland", focuses on some general trends in recent Irish history and on the understanding of Irish history itself as a force shaped by contemporary events. Chapter 4 analyses the value of the work of antiquarians. Guy Beiner argues for the use of antiquarian memory through a review of the influence of landmark antiquarian works, such as Post-Union ethnographic travel writing, and their contributions to the study of history and writing about Ireland. The fifth chapter examines how the writing of Irish history has developed since the 2008 economic downturn, as Timothy G. McMahon argues that the recent change in perspective towards Irish history and the availability of new materials of Irish life have led to an extensive understanding of history and a deeper comprehension of memory and the past. Kelly Fitzgerald's chapter moves towards folklore studies as she examines how the access to folklore collections and recordings of oral histories as well as the new possibilities for their digitalization have mobilised a further form of history and regenerated an interest on such materials. In the seventh chapter, Brian Ó Conchubhair focuses on the political domination of the Irish language over the past two decades. He argues that "Irish is not dying, it is being abandoned" (84) as he looks at the survival of the Irish language in the Gaeltacht areas, examines the policies and initiatives implemented to preserve the language, and studies the position of Irish language in Northern Ireland and how it might be affected by Brexit. Eoin O'Malley's chapter argues that the changes, successes and failures that took place during what he names the period of Great Normalization "can be attributed to political decisions made in Ireland, and specifically the political and economic context in which decisions were made" (97). Focusing on the 2008 economic crisis, O'Malley examines the subsequent political and economic reactions as well as the impact of the crash on the make-up of the Irish population, their attitudes, and their opinions. The final chapter in this section studies how divisions in Northern Ireland have evolved since the signing of the Belfast Agreement in 1998, and the changes that the Northern Irish society has experienced. As Dominic Bryan

and Gordon Gillespie consider both the remaining areas of division and the shared spaces that have developed in recent years, they argue how identity politics and the region's conflicting past, still have an impact on the society of Northern Ireland.

The third part, entitled "Global Ireland", deals with Ireland's global engagement in the world. Mike Cronin's opening chapter explores the strengthening of ties with the Irish diaspora after the 2008 crash. The author argues that through technology and the building of diasporic networks, different events and strategies helped reach a wide global audience that brought the diaspora closer to Ireland; similarly, they brought attention to the country as a place to invest, in an attempt to help Ireland out of its economic recession. In the following chapter, Liam Kennedy analyses different research approaches, including online surveys and field interviews in Chicago and New York, to explore why and in which ways contemporary Irish-American ethnicity persists, in order to explore how Irishness has remained an identity marker in the US. In her chapter, Mary J. Hickman turns to the Irish in Britain. She argues that "Irish experiences and identities in Britain (and especially England) cannot be understood outside of the parameter of specific nationalizing strategies" (150), and delves into the strategies and processes that were relevant to Irish migrants in Britain. In chapter 13, Diane Negra and Anthony P. McIntyre analyse two case studies, namely the post-crash Irish banking sector and property market, and the figure of former Taoiseach Leo Varadkar as a public embodiment of the confluence of corporate and civil citizenship. They argue that post-Celtic Tiger Ireland corporate interests have taken priority over social and individual concerns, but conclude that the 2020 February election results could perhaps be indicative of an emerging political and ideological recalibration in the country. The fourteenth chapter turns its attention to Irish economic relations with both the UK and the European Union. Martina Lawless examines the impact that Brexit could have on Ireland and the cross-border connections—where economic, political and peace risks are intertwined—since, although there has been a decline in economic links with the UK, "the two countries remain closely connected" (179). The last chapter focuses on the process that led Ireland, and especially Dublin, to become a centre for high-tech companies. Kylie Jarrett explores the main policy

decisions that shaped the emergence of the digital media sector in the country and its economic and social impact, and critiques the effects of this sudden change with reference to ongoing socioeconomic crises.

The fourth part, "Identities", looks at the social, cultural, and political changes that Ireland has experienced since 2008 and how these have expanded the understanding of Irish identity. Lucy Michael's chapter examines the context of immigration and citizenship in Ireland in recent years, particularly after the 2004 Irish Citizenship Referendum, commenting on impact of such referendum and on the experiences of migrants of different origins in the areas of work, housing, education, civic and political participation, as well as with regards to gender, hate crime and policing, and anti-immigrant politics. In the following chapter, Sarah L. Townsend looks at the case of the traditionally Irish neighbourhood of Corktown in Detroit. Townsend explores contemporary Irish multiculturalism with reference to the interconnections between race, urban renewal and upward mobility in mid-twentieth century Corktown, and compares the changes in that neighbourhood with the transformation of Parnell Street in Dublin during the Celtic Tiger years. In her chapter, Claire Bracken analyses gender scholarship in Irish Studies between 2008 and 2020, focusing particularly on what Gerardine Meaney has termed "new Irish cultural studies" (xi). Bracken examines recent developments in feminist and gender research as well as in immigration and race analysis within Irish Studies, and argues that these post-Celtic Tiger and post-2008 trends in publications about gender studies mark "gender scholarship of the period as being imbued by a new materialist turn" (230). Chapter 19 turns to a redefinition of Irish Queer Studies as a result of the 2008 recession. Ed Madden examines what "queer" means in contemporary Ireland, both beyond sexuality and as an antinormative cultural and political projects, and examines Annemarie Ní Churreáin's lesbian marriage poems "Weir View" and "Florida Wedding" and Sarah Devereux's Anus Plate saucer to illustrate the intricate relations between cultural norms and sexual identity. Oliver P. Rafferty closes this section exploring how the transformation in Ireland's relationship with Catholicism has affected the study of Catholicism in Irish Studies. Rafferty analyses the area of sexual politics and feminism, the scandals

of child abuse, and the role of the Church in the Northern Ireland Troubles to explore the meaning of Irish Catholic identity in a century where "Catholicism as an institutional influence on Irish life appears to be at an end" (260).

The fifth part of the volume, "Culture", discusses a broad range of Irish cultural categories. Renée Fox goes back to the nineteenth century to question the critical frameworks of Irish Studies and to propose a reevaluation of the canons, genres, and narratives that conform Irish literary history. Fox explores three contemporary novels, Tana French's *The Likeness*, Emma Donoghue's *The Wonder* and Joseph O'Connor's *Shadowplay*, to argue how these works both expand Irish literary canons and transform nineteenth-century Irish literature and history by questioning reading practices and literary presumptions. Eric Falci's chapter analyses Eiléan Ní Chuilleanáin's poem *The Girl Who Married the Reindeer* as an example of how Irish contemporary poets have been experimenting with different narrative modes outside of the lyrical and male tradition where Irish poetry has been widely positioned, and to promote this new dynamic experimental poetry scene and the prominence of women poets. In the following chapter, Laura Farrell-Wortman discusses how Irish theatre, affected by the 2008 crisis, moved from a primacy of the playwright to a rise of the "theatre-maker" and how new techniques promoted a wider frame for issues of identity in Irish theatre, comprising queer and intersectional identities and acknowledging the gendered aspects of the industry. In her chapter, Kelly Sullivan discusses some of the main exhibits and works of visual artists produced in post-Celtic Tiger Ireland. She suggests the existence of a recent tendency in the engagement with material culture and determines how this trend "allows groundbreaking reorientations around what it means to be Irish or to engage with the Irish nation as subject and object" (312), encouraging the scholars working in the field of Irish Studies to devote their research to the study of material culture. Chapter 25 provides a review of music scholarship from post-Celtic Tiger until the present day. Méabh Ní Fhuartháin examines the 2016 "Mise Éire" performance as part of the Decade of Centenaries programme and argues that Mac Piarais's poem has become a cultural container of identity and (re)imaginations of nationhood that moves between cultural platforms in a continuous process of re-signification. In the

closing chapter, Paul Rouse explores how different sports areas have developed as markers of Irish identity and the complicated distinction between the concepts of "national" and "international" in Irish sport. Moreover, he also examines the low level of engagement in physical activity on the part of the Irish population and the increase of online gambling in the post-Celtic Tiger years.

The sixth section, entitled "Theorizing", introduces a range of theoretical perspectives that are beginning to emerge in Irish Studies. In the opening chapter, Nessa Cronin proposes that *environmentalities* are a key issue in the current climate crisis, and examines the relationship between capital, climate and culture through a variety of ecocritical works that represent or discuss such *environmentalities* in twenty-first century Ireland. Cronin proposes a re-configuration in the relation between people and the planet and brings forward a variety of areas that could be further examined in relation to the present ecological crisis. In her chapter, Maureen O'Connor reviews the works that have contributed to the emerging field of Animal Studies in intersection with other areas such as gender studies, queer theory and ecocriticism as well as feminist scholarship, and argues that the inclusion of Animal Studies within Irish Studies provides "opportunities to rediscover and reevaluate Irish cultural productions, old and new" (367). In the following chapter, Elizabeth Grubgeld discusses how recent Irish scholarship in the fields of the arts and the humanities has begun to consider questions of disability in both literature and the arts. Grubgeld provides a brief account of the different ways that Disability Studies have entered discussions of Irish literature and examines the new notions of form and language in the work of Christopher Nolan to illustrate how this area of study enables a more extensive reading of literary texts. Emma Radley's chapter on Irish film and media studies explores how the years after the Celtic Tiger framed this area of study into more transnational discourses. Radley examines how areas of ecocriticism, industry studies, mediated identities, media activism and memory studies have developed within the field of Irish film studies in particular and Irish Studies in general. The last chapter encompasses a comprehensive study of Donal Ryan's 2012 novel *The Spinning Heart*, set in the aftermath of the economic crash. Through a psychoanalytical examination, Seán Kennedy argues that the novel does not actually

reveal anything in relation to the economic downturn itself and discusses how this avoidance to criticise Irish involvement in a neoliberal capitalist economy, which led to the crisis, is portrayed in the novel by rooting the trauma of the crash in an old-time crisis of shame from Irish masculinity and misogyny.

The last part in the volume, "Legacy", while acknowledging its past, focuses on contemporary Ireland and its imagined futures. Kathleen Costello-Sullivan examines the shift in engagement from representations of trauma after the 2008 economic crisis to a focus on paths to recovery. Costello-Sullivan produces an extensive analysis of Anne Enright's 2015 novel *The Green Road* in order to argue how the narrative of recuperation of the parental body, a trend in twenty-first century Irish literature towards narratives of recovery, both recognises the legacy of the traumatised body and provides a space for this parental body and the history it embodies. In their chapter, Margot Gayle Backus and Joseph Valente analyse Sebastian Barry's 2008 novel *The Secret Scripture* to argue that the traumas experienced by individual psyches are also socio-political traumas, and that the active repression of sexuality from the Irish State developed into an erotisation of the punishments for sexuality. The following chapter explores how contemporary Irish writing is contesting "ageist social assumptions by foregrounding the subjective, embodied experience of ageing" (435). Margaret O'Neill and Michaela Schrage-Früh analyse a number of works where Irish authors centralise the theme of ageing in order to show how social forces influence the way that the body is understood and managed, and examine how these works serve to both reclaim middle age and reimagine old age. Brian Ward's chapter on Irish architecture focuses on how architectural practices have changed since the era of the Celtic Tiger until recent years due to the different economic, social and cultural narratives that were brought by the 2008 economic crisis. Ward explores different representations of Irish architecture and discusses the rise of a post-Celtic Tiger mode of architecture; he argues that, after the crisis, this could be reimagined as a more socially-engaged subject. In his chapter, Mike Cronin explores how the Decade of the Centenaries brought forward the possibility "to celebrate and commemorate almost every strand of political thought, ideological standpoint, and diverse experience of warfare that the island has witnessed in the modern period" (463).

Cronin discusses its focus on Easter 1916 and how its commemoration was used to appeal to and distract a nation emerging from economic austerity, leaving scholarly and artistic works to explore any alternative perspectives of history. The closing chapter of the section and the volume as a whole turns to a more recent event, namely the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic. Malcolm Sen explores how cultural and literary studies might respond to the current coronavirus crisis as he discusses different concerns, such as the climate crisis and systemic racism, while he argues the importance of humanist work on COVID-19 to confront sociocultural and biopolitical factors resulting from the pandemic.

To conclude, the *Routledge International Handbook of Irish Studies* constitutes a very comprehensive volume that explores a broad variety of study areas within Irish Studies and how these have evolved in the post-Celtic Tiger period. This volume, attending to the changes that Ireland has experienced in its social, economic, cultural and political spheres due to the 2008 economic downturn, provides valuable insights into different fields of study that appeal to a wide range of scholars and students not only within the field of Irish Studies but also within other disciplines such as history, economics, sociology, political sciences, cultural studies and literature. The essays that Fox, Cronin and Ó Conchubhair have skilfully brought together are well-researched and have a clear focus on the broad topics that they cover. Moreover, they are informative regarding the current interests of Irish Studies and the state of affairs in contemporary Ireland. Focusing on many different disciplines, the authors that have contributed to this volume offer an all-encompassing analysis of how Irish Studies have developed, giving way to the examination of new and alternative perspectives as well as to the exploration of a variety of areas of interest that are beginning to emerge. To sum up, the *Routledge International Handbook of Irish Studies* is a highly recommended reading for researchers as well as anyone interested in Irish Studies and how they continue to be re-evaluated in the twenty-first century.

Works Cited

Meany, Gerardine. *Gender, Ireland and Cultural Change*, Routledge, 2010.

Correoso-Rodenas, José Manuel, editor. 2020. *Teaching Language and Literature On and Off-Canon*. IGI Global, 2020. 370 pages.

Dimitrios Tsokanos (Dimitrios.tsokanos@loucoll.ac.uk)
Loughborough College

Teaching Language and Literature On and Off-Canon aims to examine literature as one the "key manifestations through which language is expressed" (p. xviii). In the Preface, the editor advances the volume's double purpose, namely "to continue expanding the canon of literacy acquisition through the usage of literature", and to be a "medium for minority languages and literatures' scholars to show their work" (p. xviii). Furthermore, he clarifies that the aim of the volume does not include exposing the entirety of approaches to teaching and learning languages through literature. The volume is divided in three sections, each of which brilliantly covers the teaching of widely taught languages, the teaching of minority languages, and the teaching of literature written in those languages. The design of the book is coherent and transparent.

The first section, "Teaching of Languages on Canon", commences the analysis of various approaches and authentic resources that contribute to the process of language teaching. María Victoria Guadamillas Gómez's chapter opens the section by building on the analysis of fictional elements and their connections with gender stereotypes in EFL learners' productions. The analysis focuses on short biographies written by pre-service infant and primary school teachers about fictional women in history. Her project pays close attention to the validity of the stories and the main characters while "considering the importance of gender awareness in educational settings" (p. 3). After carefully reflecting upon the different issues regarding collaborative and fictional writing in EFL contexts, Guadamilla Gomez's study does indeed provide "a new insight into gender training at the university level and in the area of foreign language" while also proposing original ways to introduce micro-narratives as means to promote reading and writing (p. 11). In the same vein, Azlin Zaiti Zainal's contribution in Chapter Two purports to analyze how to integrate authentic resources in teaching language in literary texts, meaning texts, activities and other sources that were not originally created to be part of the teaching process. Zainal presents

two activities designed for a group of undergraduates with the aim of collecting data on their experiences. Her conclusions convince us that these activities do help learners, and that the incorporation of authentic resources in such manner is a valid way for instructors to address limitations within classroom teaching and learning. She also supports that "it is vital for both educator and student to get more in depth in sociocultural contexts" to obtain the maximum benefits from teaching and learning accordingly (p. 26). The third chapter of this section is Hannah Grace Morrison's outstanding attempt to explain how culture "is an essential and challenging part of teaching a second language" (p. 29). Morrison considers how poetry is potentially the most adequate way to analyze both language and cultural artifact. By focusing on the use of Spanish poetry in a basic level Spanish classroom, she does indeed expose "an important tool that should be found in the language learning backyard shed" while preparing any Spanish-learning class (p. 42). The fourth chapter is Benoit Filhol's interesting effort to demonstrate the project and action-oriented approach to submerge literature in reality in foreign language teaching. Filhol concentrates on the case of French in his attempt to explore the latest teaching developments in order to advance "on the theoretical reflection about the articulation of the action-oriented approach and literature teaching through project-based teaching method" (p. 44). By delving into the background theories of literature, the types of projects and their structure, Filhol argues that "the teacher must avoid at all costs falling into this utilitarian and instrumental drift that the teaching of literature through the action-based approach" could entail if all the dimensions of literature are not present in the teaching practice (p. 56). Enrique Javier Vercher García's ensuing chapter examines the teaching of Russian as a foreign language through literature. Vercher García examines theoretical and practical issues in the use of literature in teaching Russian particularly to Spanish-speaking students. After compellingly addressing issues of general didactic theory and presenting the characteristics and the benefits of employing literary texts in the teaching of Russian, he analyzes factors that influence the selection of an appropriate literary text for that purpose. He concludes by offering a large quantity and variety of relevant literature while also admitting that his work is "open for future in-depth analysis of the different issues it addresses" (p. 79). The final chapter of the first

section is Lidia Fernández Fonfría's unique approach to literary resources in the teaching of Arabic in Spain. Her work carefully gives an overview of the teaching of Arabic as a foreign language in Spain in recent years. Having discussed methodologies and resources that are available, she carries out a comparative analysis of "My Life on Planet Mars" and "A Year in Tangier" and she establishes that "Spain is still falling behind" in the use of graded and adapted readings in class while also pointing towards the adequacy of these two works "meet the requirements and conditions necessary" for the teaching of Arabic in Spain (p. 114).

Section Two delves into the teaching of languages off canon. Alvaro Trigo Maldonado commences it with his approach to the use of literature in the Korean language class. His work briefly explores the reasons behind the emerging importance of Korean and he links this to the growing interest in learning this language. He continues to examine a series of crucially relevant sources dealing with Korean literature while also proposing new ideas on "how to improve the current situation regarding literature acquisition by the students" (p. 140). In Chapter Eight, Eric Hoekstra and Gerbrich de Jong draw the reader's attention towards Frisian literature in education. Their rather interesting study discusses the extent to which this minority language is taught in schools as they attempt to systematically approach the position of literature in all levels of education. Their attention particularly falls upon the "problems" that a minority language faces in legislature and society in an effort to assist the authorities "in this process of rethinking the goals" of education (p. 156). In Chapter Nine, Mónica Durán Mañas's presents a convincing "didactic proposal for the teaching of Ancient Greek language and literature under an innovative and interdisciplinary approach" (p. 162). Having given an overview of ancient Greek teaching throughout the past centuries and up until today, Durán Mañas corroborates a "mixed method" of teaching, one that uses "collaborative and interdisciplinary approaches" to teach a variety of learners. Chapter Ten is Rocío Martínez-Prieto and Marina Diaz-Marcos's exploration of using literature to teach Latin. Their study argues that "literary texts are an essential resource" to familiarize students with Latin while also pointing towards the need to "deeply renovate the teaching of Latin with new methods" (p. 190). In Chapter Eleven, Vega María García

González studies teaching by means of exploring corpora in higher education. García González focuses on late Easter Aramaic (Syrian) in an effort to give an overview of its teaching at the University of Salamanca while also urging educators to take advantage "of the opportunities afforded by technological progress" (p. 207). Chapter Twelve analyzes the Israeli university-level approach to Judezmo, a traditional language of Sephardic Jews. David Monson Bunis focuses on the challenges of teaching Judezmo and carefully offers suggestions to learners who wish to cover gaps in their lexical knowledge.

The final section of the volume centers upon the teaching of literature. José Manuel Correoso-Rodenas commences the section with his study on the teaching of Native American literature to Spanish students. He explains his own experience with students of the College of Humanities of Albacete through which they were acquainted with Native American Literature while also enhancing their knowledge on the American literary canon. His study assesses that the teaching had "a positive effect on the students" and provides very useful graphs that allow for further interpretations of the benefits of such teaching (p. 234). Chapter Fourteen is Santiago Sevilla Vallejo's inquiry on how language is used to express strong feelings, reflections and attitudes by examining *The Martian Chronicles* by Ray Bradbury. More to the point, Sevilla Vallejo revisits critiques on the lack of identity in our society while proposing the application of Bradbury's text in a classroom to address students' reflections about identity. In Chapter Fifteen, Margarita Rigal-Aragón offers an exquisite demonstration of a teaching-learning experience carried out over a period of more than 15 academic years. Rigal-Aragón explores the impact that major authors such as Edgar Allan Poe, Aesop, Shakespeare and Sophocles had on learners who were carefully and chronologically introduced to the first pieces of ratiocination. She also provides useful tables which help us further understand the learners' experience through the literary journey from ancient to modern times while urging professors to "open new possibilities" to modern learners (p. 282). Chapter Sixteen is Alejandro Jaquero-Esparcia's convincing inquiry on the utility of the digital context in the use of artistic literature. Finally, Chapter Seventeen concludes the volume through Daniele Arciello's informative exploration of the early works of Italo Calvino and their usefulness in teaching Italian literature and culture.

Teaching Language and Literature On and Off-Canon is a remarkable and overall invigorating volume that indeed fulfils its purpose. It faithfully expands the canon of literacy acquisition through literature and it is a useful medium for scholars who wish to explore the teaching of minority languages and literatures. Moreover, it is a thematically sound book whose scope is ample enough to cover a wide range of aspects that would interest scholars of various literary fields. The essays that compose this volume are indeed critically up-to-date and follow a consistently thorough and innovative approach to the teaching and learning of several languages and literatures, therefore creating a unique volume that should interest both learners and educators.

Artigos / Artículos / Articles / Artikel

Recensións / Reseñas / Reviews / Rezensionen

eISSN 2660 - 4906
ISSN 1132-7332

Universidade Vigo