BABEL AFIAL

Aspectos de Filoloxía Inglesa e Alemá (2024)

33

Universida de Vigo

Servizo de Publicacións

BABEL

AFIAL

COMITÉ EDITORIAL
Jorge Figueroa Dorrego (U. Vigo)
Martín Urdiales Shaw (U. Vigo)
Esperanza Rama Martínez (U. Vigo)
Rosalía Rodríguez Vázquez (U. Vigo)

COMITÉ DE REDACIÓN
Carlos Acuña Fariña (U. Santiago de Compostela)
Teresa Caneda Cabrera (U. Vigo)
Rui Carvalho Homem (U. Porto)
Helena Cortés Gabaudán (U. Vigo)
Belén Martín Lucas (U. Vigo)
Javier Pérez Guerra (U. Vigo)

CONSELLO ASESOR
Antonio Ballesteros González (UNED Madrid)
Gerd Bayer (Friedrich-Alexander U., Erlangen)
Alexander Bergs (U. Osnabrück)
Marta Cerezo Moreno (UNED Madrid)
José Luis Chamosa González (U. León)
Pilar Cuder Domínguez (U. Huelva)
Juan Antonio Cutillas Espinosa (U. Murcia)
Celestino Deleyto Alcalá (U. Zaragoza)
Mª José Domínguez Vázquez (U. Santiago de Compostela)
Neus Figueras Casanovas (Generalitat de Catalunya)
Ariela Freedman (Concordia U.)
Pilar García Mayo (U. País Vasco)
Francisco Garrudo Carabias (U. Sevilla)
Constante González Groba (U. Santiago de Compostela)
Juan Manuel Hernández Campoy (U. Murcia)
Hadrian Lankiewicz (U. Gdansk)
Guyonne Leduc (U. Lille)
Adrian Leeman (U. Lancaster)
Mª José López Couso (U. Santiago de Compostela)
María Jesús Lorenzo Modia (U. Coruña)
Manuel Maldonado Alemán (U. Sevilla)
Maria McGarrity (Long Island U.)
Lachlan Mackenzie (U.V. Amsterdam)
Meike Meliss, (U. Santiago de Compostela)
Victor Millet Schröder (U. Santiago de Compostela)
Marita Nadal Blasco (U. Zaragoza)
Manuela Palacios González (U. Santiago de Compostela)
Margarete Rubik (U. Viena)
Begoña Simal González (U. Coruña)
Sherry Simon (Concordia U.)
Jennifer Smith (U. Glasgow)
Susan Zlotnick (Vassar College)

Babel-AFIAL
Nº 33, Ano 2024

EDITA
Servizo de Publicacións da Universidade de Vigo
Campus Universitario - 36310 Vigo, España

MAQUETA: Andavira Editora

ISSN 1132-7332 – ISNN 2660-4906
DEP. LEGAL PO 603-02

© Servizo de Publicacións da Universidade de Vigo, 2024

Índice / Contents / Inhaltsverzeichnis

Artigos / Artículos / Articles / Artikel

'Forever young': The eternal child archetype in the post-apocalyptic world of Gary Shteyngart's *Super Sad True Love Story* (2010).
David Brandt Ablanedo (MA graduate - U. Vigo) ------------------------------- 7

Early Modern Spanish and Portuguese Material Culture in the Works of James Shirley (1596-1666).
Eroulla Demetriou & Luciano García (U. Jaén)---------------------------------- 27

An Approach to Transtextuality in Kate Morton's *The Forgotten Garden*: Traces of Victorian Novels, Gothic Fiction, Fairy Tales, and Classical Myths.
Marta Miquel-Baldellou (U. Lleida)-- 55

Victorian Women in Gaskell's Gothic Tales: A Study on "Lois the Witch," "The Grey Woman" and "The Old Nurse's Story."
Blanca Puchol Vázquez (U. Complutense de Madrid)---------------------------- 79

Natural Imagery in Margaret Atwood's Recent Poetry.
Pilar Sánchez Calle (U. Jaén)-- 101

Recensións / Reseñas / Reviews / Rezensionen

Llàcer, Eusebio V. *El placer estético del terror: tres cuentos de Edgar Allan Poe*. Publicacions de la Universitat de València, 2022, 180 páginas.
Juan José Calvo García de Leonardo (U. València) ------------------------------ 127

Beaumont, Francis y John Fletcher. *El necio (The Coxcomb)*. Traducción, introducción y notas de Francisco J. Borge, Luna de Abajo, 2023, 176 páginas.
José Montero Reguera (U. Vigo) -- 133

Mocanu-Florea, Vasilica. *Language Learning in Study Abroad: Social, Cultural, and Identity-Related Factors. Erasmus Students in Northern, Southern, and Eastern-European English as Lingua Franca Contexts*. Publicacions de la Universitat de València, 2023, 219 pages.
Sofía Peña Fernández (U. Salamanca) -- 139

Rodríguez Salas, Gerardo. *Vivir sola es morir: El modernismo comunitario de Katherine Mansfield*. Editorial Comares, 2023, 104 pages.
Antía Román Sotelo (U. Santiago de Compostela)------------------------------- 145

Mirrlees, Hope. *París. Un Poema,* edición y traducción de María Isabel Porcel García, Cátedra (Letras Universales), 2022, 152 páginas.
María Isabel Romero-Pérez (U. Granada) -------------------------------------- 153

Artigos / Artículos
Articles / Artikel

'Forever young': The eternal child archetype in the post-apocalyptic world of Gary Shteyngart's *Super Sad True Love Story* (2010)

David Brandt Ablanedo (davidbrandtablanedoo@gmail.com)
M.A. Graduate, University of Vigo

Abstract: Using Jungian psychologist Marie-Louise von Franz's *The Problem of the Puer Aeternus* (2000) as a theoretical framework, the present article discusses the characters and the apocalyptic world of Gary Shteyngart's *Super Sad True Love Story* (2010) through the perspective of the archetype of the eternal child. The discussion focuses on the main characters' quest for immortality, the visibility of the individual among the masses, and the dangers of a cold, detached *Weltanschauung* in contemporary society. Additionally, it foregrounds interpretations of character behaviours, such as their infantile reactions to events and their relationships, which are presented in relation to the respective Jungian archetype.
Keywords: infantilism, Marie-Louise von Franz, Jungian archetype, apocalyptic literature, Gary Shteyngart.

'Eternamente joven': el arquetipo del niño eterno en el mundo postapocalíptico de *Super Sad True Love Story* (2010) de Gary Shteyngart

Resumen: Utilizando como marco teórico el estudio *The Problem of the Puer Aeternus* (2000) de la psicóloga junguiana Marie-Louise von Franz, este artículo analiza los personajes y el mundo apocalíptico de *Super Sad True Love Story* (2010) de Gary Shteyngart a través de la perspectiva del arquetipo del niño eterno. El análisis se centra en la búsqueda de la inmortalidad de los personajes principales, la (in)visibilidad del individuo entre las masas, y los riesgos de una *Weltanschauung* fría y distante en la sociedad contemporánea. Además, se subraya cómo los comportamientos de los personajes, en sus reacciones infantiles a los eventos y en sus relaciones interpersonales, ejemplifican el arquetipo junguiano.
Palabras clave: infantilismo, Marie-Louise von Franz, arquetipo junguiano, literatura apocalíptica, Gary Shteyngart.

1. Introduction

From its beginnings in New England Puritanism, its apogee with Cold War nuclear tensions, and its relevance to twenty-first-century existential threats, apocalypse is, in Hay's words, "the oneiric foundation upon which American realities have been built" and the locus of humanity's "apocalyptic anxieties" (Hay 4-5). Haunted by apocalyptic media's suggestion that apocalypse is not a distant hypothesis but a present, lived environment (Hay 9), we have been brought to an extreme

situation which may—true to the etymology of *apocalypse*—grant us a *revelation*, for "apocalypse [...] inspires transformation" and rebirth (Hay 6, 12). But while some apocalyptic stories use this revelation to celebrate human resilience and solidarity, others tell of inglorious descents into hopeless stagnation.

Taking John R. May's view that apocalypse "is a response to cultural crisis" (Foertsch 178) and Jane Fisher's assertion that the rhetorical form of the apocalyptic genre can bring awareness to how damaging current and future social problems can be (148), one can examine the apocalyptic future of Gary Shteyngart's *Super Sad True Love Story* (2010) not just as a national catastrophe, but as "a metaphor for personal pain/disaster" (Hicks 216). Within its apocalyptic vision of U.S. governmental and societal upheaval, the novel foregrounds a story of a personal apocalypse and what critic Irene Visser terms "cultural erosion" (311); of an arrested psychological development; of people taken by vast illusions, emerging from them only to sink back into unconsciousness. Within the novel's world and characters, there arises a pattern of thought and discourse corresponding to the Jungian archetype of the eternal child which, when examined in its various manifestations, can help to expound on this novel's apocalyptic vision of the future from the perspective of Jungian psychoanalysis. By tracing how *Super Sad True Love Story*'s characters and their behaviours correspond to the characteristics, symbolic analyses, and professional experiences presented by psychologist Marie-Louise von Franz's theoretical framework *The Problem of the Puer Aeternus* (2000), this article aims to illustrate a world beset by problems like the callousness of modern business culture and police states, concerns with the individual as a statistical figure, the discourse accompanying the futile grasping for immortality and godhood, and how they all relate to the psychology of the *puer aeternus*.

2. The psychology of the *puer aeternus*

Carl Jung's theory of the collective unconscious delineates innate patterns of behaviour, thought, and symbology called archetypes, which have loomed large in humanity's collective psyche since prehistory and inform an individual's thoughts, emotions, and actions (Main, "Carl Jung's Archetypes"). In *The Problem of the Puer Aeternus* (2000), Jungian psychologist and scholar Marie-Louise von Franz describes the

eternal youth archetype, or *puer aeternus*, which she noted as becoming increasingly common by the original lectures' presentations in the late 1950s (Franz 1-4). Taking after her insights, the American poet and essayist Robert Bly identifies the figure of the *puer* and its presence in Western society in *Iron John: A Book About Men* (1990) as stemming from the Industrial Revolution, reactions to World War II, and other twentieth-century conflicts like the Vietnam War (2). Having worked with various such youngsters, Bly affirms that society knows nothing about how to produce men: "we let it all happen unconsciously while we look away to Wall Street and hope for the best" (180).

On the road to adulthood, the young individual—filled with that vigour and potentiality often ascribed to the divine—accumulates wounds that damage self-esteem, curb enthusiasm, and especially hurt feelings of greatness, for these wounds render "our condition [...] difficult to reconcile with our fantasy of princehood [and our] Infantile Grandiosity" (Bly 33). These wounds are often transferred unconsciously into adult life and lead to suffering but can be healed through personal effort or a mentor figure, for Bly believes that the latter's knowledge of stories within mythological and social systems can lead us intelligently and meaningfully into and through that suffering (226). However, without a mentor figure, a young man may become distracted by defective myths, popular culture's worn-out images of masculinity (Bly ix), and rapidly changing technologies and media, thus "[achieving spirit] at the expense of […] their own grounding in masculine life" (Bly 59). For the *puer aeternus*, responding to that archetype is not abnormal yet, despite their freeness and their ecological superiority to their predecessors, Bly stresses these "soft [males]" are miserable and lacking in energy: "life-preserving but not exactly life-giving" (58, 2-3).

Franz describes the characteristics of the *puer*'s neurosis as stemming from their aversion to the adult world (14), hence their inability to find a satisfactory compromise between a vibrant fantasy life and the mundane reality of adulthood. He is puzzled by how to accomplish this without losing the totalising freedom afforded by his childhood creativity and illusions, without sinking into disappointed cynicism (Franz 58, 35). By dithering between both extremes, the realisation that would allow him to "[grow] into the reality of things—[meaning] dis*illusion*ment" (Franz 35, emphasis mine) presents a great difficulty, which leads the *puer* to

play a dirty trick on himself in which he renders that essential realisation into a mere "intellectual idea" (Franz 43). He is cognisant of the problem but does nothing. In receding into their childlike curiosity and creativity (Franz 43), the *puer*'s cynicism, tendency to live detachedly, and inherent impatience emerge. This eventually contributes to what psychologist Dr. Dan Kiley calls the "unrealistic ego trip" that leads the *puer* to magical thinking and to follow their fantasies (Kiley xvi). When confronted by the tensions of daily life, his "weak personality"—a physical, not moral criticism—will squirm and take a "short-cut reaction," a mentality that manifests itself as an aversion to monotonous, disciplined work (Franz 45, 47).

Franz argues that avoiding adult responsibilities leads the *puer* to believe adulthood as hollow and meaningless (16), leading to a statistical outlook that relativises experience and damages both their own uniqueness and individuation, defined in Jungian terms as the realisation of one's potential, identity, and purpose. Citing the French writer Gérard de Nerval's "half-truth" problem that the woman he loved was both one-of-a-kind and one among thousands (Franz 92), Franz notes that by accepting a "falsified image of reality [based] on [average] probability," one ignores the unique irregularity of experience and is overwhelmed by life's mundanity and the perceived banality of the crowd (91). In this intellectual analysis, one must invest one's relationships, deeds, and one's very life with a determinately sure value by "allowing feeling its own place," thus rendering them unique and meaningful. Otherwise, a life viewed through a purely statistical lens is devoid of feeling (Franz 93) and marks the beginning of much suffering.

Habitual, statistical thinking exacerbates the "anxiety [and] rivalry [of] contemporary business life" (Bly 33) and feeds the *puer*'s fear of becoming assimilated into the crowd—to be a sheep, a symbol of blind faith in authority. Although ingrained in Christian tradition and embedded into political systems (Franz 40), Franz emphasises that part of the cure for *puer* mentality is this collective adaptation, to "accept being just somebody" who isn't special (42). However, the *puer*'s loathing of collectivity instead leads him to entertain false pretensions about himself, thereby becoming "collectivised from within" (Franz 125). Within corporate-dominated modernity, being treated as a mere numerical figure worsens the "overwhelming power of the State [and]

the devaluation of the individual" that make us feel like sheep (Franz 28). Thus, the *puer* clings to his identification with that one rare, sensitive, artistic, misunderstood soul among the mundane, unconscious masses, which keeps him from achieving a solid sense of humanity and renders him a mere copy of the *puer* archetype (Franz 125).

Bly observes that the *puer*'s false pretensions prevent him from experiencing humility and thus, like a child-god, he will "[identify] with all in him that can fly" (81-3) and keep his overblown grandiosity, which is alternatively symbolised by the figure of Peter Pan (Kiley 22). This inability to commit and his shielding himself with a comfortably self-important image characterises the *puer*'s "religious megalomania" (Franz 40) and leads him to lose his individuality as he further identifies with and embodies the divine youth (see Franz 2, 126, 140)

The *puer* squirms at the necessity of work and the impossibility of always doing what one wants in life, for reality disappoints before the product of his fantasies (Franz 160). This inflames his aversion to accepting himself as he is and his refusal to live in the present moment (Franz 135), leading to further destructive qualities like a haughty arrogance, an entry into a "savage mode" that does harm to others and themselves (Bly x), a need to obscure his sadness behind a fun-loving facade (Kiley 4), and a willingness to examine himself only to "exercise power over others"—a childish, egotistical trick (Franz 232).

Franz begins her discussion of the *puer*'s childishness, which originates from his perfect, nigh-deific image of the mother which he seeks in all women (1). In a further connection to the unreal, the *puer* will fantasise love affairs in excruciating detail while dismissing the present, lived experience, instead pining for the arrival of a perfect woman that will fulfil his needs, as she goes on to argue (153). At the same time, the guarantee of a mother's love leads the *puer* to take this and other kinds of love for granted, thus never learning how to correspond (Kiley xvi). Franz finds that he yields too easily and rarely stands up for himself in his relationships, and then suddenly—perhaps disappointed that the object of his fascination is totally ordinary (2) and thus just another statistic—leaves his partner (49), callously dismissing the entire experience (210). If he judges a woman in this way, her image becomes that of "a romantic goddess [and] a statue that is no longer alive" (Franz 91).

The *puer*'s "childish greed" awakens as he attempts to cause the positive feelings elicited by his past experiences and relationships to repeat, rather than forgetting them to focus on the present moment. Like an artist obsessed with a prior success, he succumbs to the pull of death and unconsciousness, contradicting life itself (Franz 115). This makes the *puer* a poor romantic partner, for he hovers between "passivity, naïveté, and numbness" (Bly 60, 62). He lacks what James Hillman calls the "natural brutality" (quoted in Bly 66) and honesty essential to functional relationships but, most of all, the *puer* fears being unable to escape a situation (Franz 2), hence why his fallibility and mortality are so frightening to him. To accept life is to accept death, but the *puer*, consumed by his identification with the immortal, recoils from "disillusion, stagnation and death" and holds life at arm's length to lessen disappointment and suffering (Franz 164, 168).

Here, then, is the crux of the *puer aeternus*'s neurosis, the culmination of the above behaviours, and the ultimate manifestation of the *puer*'s symbolic marriage to the unreal. This is what H. G. Baynes refers to as the "provisional life," an imaginary attitude to reality rooted not in the present but in the belief that true, lived reality will arrive in the future (quoted in Franz 2). Like the jaws of a great beast, the provisional life is the "[backwards-looking], regressive aspect of the unconscious" that devours one's personal development (Franz 15). The *puer*'s vivid fantasy life interferes with his ability to accept lived reality and turns people and experiences into mere placeholders bereft of his emotional investment (Franz 2). He thus feels cut off from life due to being unable to achieve what he wants, but cannot relinquish those unlived fantasies and unfulfilled possibilities, for it would narrow his life's paths. Intertwined with his expectations of future success is his belief in the "time illusion" (Franz 63), in which the plenitude of time excuses one from ambition and proactive action. Awakened from this comfortable stagnation, he hastily initiates his pursuits, suffers a nervous breakdown or, worse, experiences an *enantiodromia*, an extreme and sudden shift into an opposite psychological state where one drops off into cynical, disappointed banality that dismisses life-giving idealism, romance, and creativity as youthful distractions. By taking this intellectual shortcut, the *puer* lives a life spent scowling at the "same human dirt" and "just [existing], [curled up] in" mundanity (Franz 167-8). Life eventually catches up to these individuals who, in veiling themselves with detached

innocence, descend into a melancholic, even suicidal spiral. This depressive "nothing but" attitude (Franz 86, 89) isolates the *puer* from reality, for his pursuit of a purely objective existence renders him a mere consciousness trapped in a shell untouched by reality and divorced from the present. Cut off from life by an emotional membrane, the *puer* may hide his constant irritation and his sensitivity not just by assuming a mask of unfeeling chauvinism (Kiley 11), but by disregarding all experience through the morbid intellectual reflection of its inevitable end. Always aware of life's ephemerality, he is primed for disappointment before it happens and never immerses himself in it: "For anyone stuck in that situation, life no longer has any meaning" (Franz 36 and 6, 58-60, 62-5, 86-89, 112, 122, 154-5, 167-8 and 174).

3. The *puer aeternus* in Shteyngart's *Super Sad True Love Story*

The apocalyptic vision in Gary Shteyngart's *Super Sad True Love Story* is set in a time of "the utmost collective despair, aimlessness, and disorientation" (Franz 187). Having economically decoupled from the Chinese and the Europeans, this future America is nursing wounds gained in a catastrophic war with Venezuela (Shteyngart 11) and brutally suppresses armed protests held by its unpaid and neglected soldiers (Shteyngart 100). American citizens live under the constant scrutiny of Credit Poles—which publicly broadcast their credit ratings—the omniscient GlobalTeens network, and each other with the aid of their äppäräti, all-purpose handheld devices akin to smartphones that collect and openly distribute personal data to feed algorithms and programs that invade and dominate human interaction. There are whispers of mass deportations of "immigrants with weak Credit" (Shteyngart 11), and as the Bipartisan government's economic stimulus packages fail, many Americans slowly realise that they will become unemployed and discarded like trash (Shteyngart 86, 87). Later, anarchy erupts as the government collapses and is replaced by the Staatling-Wapachung Corporation, which plans to "divide the country into concessions, and hand them over to the sovereign wealth funds" (Shteyngart 257). As America becomes a volatile police state (Shteyngart 179) that rounds up and shoots its Low Net Worth Individuals (LNWIs) to avoid embarrassment before its Chinese creditors, American peoples exude an end-of-days "*tiredness* of failure […] imposed on a country that believed

only in its opposite" (Shteyngart 106, 130). Yet accompanying *Super Sad True Love Story*'s setting of cultural and national dissolution is a tale of "personal decline" (Shteyngart 85). Its main actors, Lenny Abramov, Eunice Park, and Joshie Goldman—all three *pueri aeterni* to an extent—are, in critic Jacqueline Foertsch's terms, "the true horror and despair of this dystopia," for their quests trace not only the fall of a nation but, and this is especially true for Lenny, the course of "an existential hero facing his own private annihilation" (Foertsch 176-7).

The novel, concerned as it is with "big" data, information technology, and its characters' places within a highly neoliberal environment, portrays a world dominated by statistical thinking, where the individual is insignificant as an individual, as a citizen, or as a human being. Most individuals exude a palpable anxiety for a person's visibility in the face of social upheaval, these being middle- and working-class Americans slated for forcible eviction as part of "Harm Reduction" (Shteyngart 95) or following the Rupture as Staatling-Wapachung usurps the Bipartisan government, when it becomes evident that "'No one care [sic] about the sick or the old anymore'" (Shteyngart 291).

The cold, callous attitude that reduces life and people to a merely numerical value is epitomised by the company's CEO Joshie Goldman in his appraisal of the chaos following the Rupture: "[This] is going to be good for us in the long run. This is a controlled demise for the country, a planned bankruptcy. Liquidate labor, liquidate stocks, liquidate everything but real estate" (Shteyngart 256). This dismissal of the intricacies of human suffering, as people are merely "labor" to Joshie (Shteyngart 256), points to a dangerous mentality that emerges from statistical thinking which the English philosopher Alan Watts coined "the great 19th-century put-down of man" (Watts, "Power of Space"). Its supporters describe complex phenomena via their most simple constituents in order to belittle them, and thus make themselves appear as hard-headed realists (Watts, "Tao of Philosophy"). Watts highlights the dangers of this linguistic and intellectual trick at a political level—"Untrammeled violence, police states, and [a] shocking disregard for human existence"—because it enables one to do great violence to those deemed inferior (Watts, "Power of Space"). This disturbing puerile attitude pervades most of the characters' discourses throughout the novel. In the wake of the Bipartisan shooting of

LNWIs in Central Park, Joshie half-heartedly laments the bloodshed as he instals himself on his dais, but then voices his concerns on the loss of "prestige for the country, [tourist yuan and] face for our leadership," (Shteyngart 180) revealing his true colours. Howard Shu, Lenny's colleague and one of the superiors at Staatling-Wapachung, calls the Rupture "a realignment. [...] Just […] some war games" (Shteyngart 213), while Joshie, moments after fighting erupts in the streets, excitedly celebrates how fortunate and blessed the company is (Shteyngart 241).

In the context of 1930s Germany, the characteristic false veneer of the *puer*'s sentimentality is replaced by a brutality epitomised by Nazi politician Hermann Göring, whom Franz mentions would alternate between ruthlessly ordering the deaths of hundreds and crying at the death of his pet bird (Franz 7). Echoing that manic extreme, Joshie's own cruelty is reflected in his branding the poor as "riffraff with no Credit," his disdain for the media profession, and his rationalization of the latter's deaths upon the ferry: "This town's not for everyone. We have to be competitive. That means doing more with less" (Shteyngart 257). Joshie chillingly uses this euphemistic, statistical language reminiscent of Nazi jargon, which punctuates the callousness inherent to his mindset.

Just as the *puer* encounters difficulty in reconciling reality with fantasy, *Super Sad True Love Story*'s "post-literate [...] *visual* age" (Shteyngart 277) raises concerns on the invasiveness of the äppärät and its fantastical, ephemeral, and endless "contacts, data, pictures, projections, maps, incomes, sound, fury" (Shteyngart 6). It has radically altered human life both linguistically, as with Noah's vulgar, primitive, and obnoxiously masculinist conversations with Lenny and Vishnu, and socially, reducing it to algorithms and social compatibility scores (Shteyngart 86; 89).

A world peopled by individuals with short attention spans who "just aren't meant to read anymore" (Shteyngart 276-7) points not only to that characteristic puerile impatience but—given their marked rejection of traditional, non-digital media—lend GlobalTeens, the äppäräti, and their constant data streams an illusory quality. These devices and services are all-encompassing yet never produce meaningful narratives—just vast quantities of hollow data—and, like soap bubbles, can burst when

they touch reality, thus breaking the comforting illusion (Franz 162). When GlobalTeens goes offline, the consequences are tragic:

> Four young people committed suicide [...] they couldn't see a future without their äppäräti. [. . .] [One] 'reached out to life,' but found there were only 'walls and thoughts and faces,' which weren't enough. He needed to be ranked, to know his place in the world. (Shteyngart 270)

The ephemeral data and the fantasies of the digital world that define these characters' lives are more real than material reality and, when removed—like a drug-related withdrawal—can lead into a depressive, spiralling fall into banality and death.

Fantasies are especially prevalent for Lenny Abramov, the novel's narrative voice. His constant retreats from the immediate reality of the scenes he describes function as narrative reframings, lending him a provisionality that reveals a disconnect from the here-and-now, a further descent into ephemeral fantasy and an intellectual distancing from meaningful experience. One significant example is Lenny's intercourse with Eunice, where he can see himself from outside, "With my bald spot and, beneath that, the thick tendrils of Eunice's mane" (Shteyngart 168). This narrative provisionality appears at the Rupture's beginning, during the excitement of what Lenny calls being "in the middle of the movie" (Shteyngart 238), a distancing from reality that stands out in this epistolary novel, itself a reframing.

Lenny's fantasising also recalls that manipulative, compassionless *puer* coldness through his designs for his future relationship with Eunice and also, crucially, with "[baiting] her to New York," and making her his wife for eternity (Shteyngart 25). He is quick to a silent, vindictive anger, for when he sees a vulnerable Eunice post-Rupture, he bars himself from pitying her traumatised, nigh-comatose state, rationalizes the moment, and even stokes his own anger by recalling prior slights so as to spur himself into abandoning the weighty burden of "this eighty-six-pound albatross" (Shteyngart 260). These narrative asides sometimes border on the perverse as they ignite erotic fantasies of Eunice in public places, even detailing how these lewd episodes would elevate him to a higher social standing among the hypothetical onlookers.

Lenny's relationship with Eunice is defined by a characteristic, yielding naïveté resulting from him shelving his demands, needs, and dignity, suggestive of that typical *puer* weakness of personality. He exalts Eunice to the mother-figure's overblown, messianic proportions by claiming that she is his *raison d'être* (Shteyngart 5), yet he realises with fear that he could never leave her side, declaring that he can tolerate her abuse because he was habituated to her anxious, angry outbursts (Shteyngart 165). One's early relationship to their parents informs their later relationships, which here suggests a childhood wound that Lenny has ignored and let fester into a tolerance for that toxic, "infantile moodiness" that nevertheless attracts men like Lenny, who view it as catharsis by proxy (Franz 71). In preferring to maintain the relationship, he reinforces the yielding "good boy" (Franz 183) mentality and entertains hypothetical scenarios where he grovels before Eunice out of a twisted moral generosity, forgiving all transgressions (Shteyngart 311).

In a symbolic parallel to Saint-Exupéry's *The Little Prince*, Lenny projects his *puer* condition onto the elephant at the Bronx Zoo which, like him, is "at the middle of his lifespan, [lonely and] removed from his compatriots and from the possibility of love" (Shteyngart 119-20). He compares the animal's state to his condition as an Ashkenazi Jew, recalling core elements of the neurosis: "Mother, aloneness, entrapment, extinction" (Shteyngart 120). But like Saint-Exupéry's elephant swallowed by the snake, Lenny gains no epiphany regarding his state as a *puer*, and remains trapped in its stagnant, unconscious aspect (Franz 27). The elephant—in Franz's terms, a symbol of the ideal adult (16)—and its immobility in physical space and life therefore mirrors Lenny's own psychological paralysis.

Central to *Super Sad True Love Story* is the quest for immortality and the characters' fear of death, heralded by the title of Chapter One, "DO NOT GO GENTLE," a reference to Dylan Thomas's eponymous poem on resisting death. Lenny believes his desire for immortality stemmed from a passage from Milan Kundera's *The Unbearable Lightness of Being* which asserts the insufficiency of living just one life. This recalls the *puer*'s rejection of death and a separation from reality where nothing feels real, a sentiment echoed by Joshie: "Eternal life is the only life that matters. All else is just a moth circling the light." The ensuing feeling of being forsaken to nonexistence (Shteyngart 275) explains Joshie's

callous treatment of the "Low Net Worth Individuals," for it "is not unrelated [...] to [the feeling that the individual] doesn't matter, [a] reaction against the philosophy of life in which an individual [matters] too much in the wrong way" (Watts, "Power of Space").

Thus, Post-Human Services's quest for immortality can be examined via the *puer*'s identification with the divine, for posthumanism concerns the transformation of the subject into the divinity it would replace (Taylor 317). Where Joshie assumes this ideology through evolutionary terms—"You remind them of death [...] of a different, earlier version of our species" (Shteyngart 67)—Lenny's opening passage is saturated with divine pretension and the vague promise of a god-like status where he derides the pleasures of life as laughably primitive and assumes an infantility and naïveté befitting a self-proclaimed child god: "I will be the first to partake of [immortality]. I just have to be good and I have to believe in myself" (Shteyngart 5-6). The immortality programme can also be read as a stand-in for the coping mechanism of group identity that the *puer*—consumed by the need to be rescued from loneliness and the insecurity of his worldview—often turns to (Kiley 28-9), echoing Lenny's desire to deepen his standing in Post-Human Services and reap its rewards.

In a society that strives for god-like youth while the natural suffering and pain of life is invisibilised (Bly 81), there is also a rampant fear of death and ageing, hence Lenny's lamentations of the hardships posed by adulthood in such a world (Shteyngart 26). Lenny may be voicing how out-of-place he feels as a member of the previous generation or, alternatively, refer to his naïve, childish views on mortality. But while Lenny "[fears] the old people [and] their mortality" (Shteyngart 273) and recoils from artistic portrayals of death, Joshie condemns the old and infirm to be discarded at an abandoned site, claiming that he "can't exactly keep over a hundred unneeded people in New York" (Shteyngart 302).

Lenny's desire for youth and immortality characterises his discourse with a constant, near-pathological awareness of the transitoriness of time and the certainty of death. His desire for immortality is spurred by his fear of nullification, for he describes himself as living in "death's anteroom" and "barely [able] stand the light and heat of his brief sojourn on earth" (Shteyngart 25). His negation of death and non-

existence mirrors Peter Pan's own "militant refusal" to grow up, for they both inhabit that liminal space between "the man"—in Lenny's case, the mortal—"[they] didn't want to become, and the [boys] they could no longer be" (Kiley 23). Lenny's existential fear is reaffirmed as he reminisces that he could never reconcile with the certainty of death because it destroys his capacity to enjoy the present, thus encouraging a provisional life. Meanwhile, Joshie's first awareness of mortality is inspired by science-fiction works like *Logan's Run* and *Soylent Green*, which feature themes of *puer*-like renewal, thus marking his future obsession.

Although Lenny's opening proclamation casts his search for immortality as a way to escape the nullification destined for others, it is later justified on more democratic grounds. Because of the eventual loss of the self and its attendant emotions and desires, immortality means the "selfishness [of *my*] *generation's* belief that each one of us matters" (Shteyngart 70-1, emphasis mine). This existential fear of being forgotten and condemned to insignificance pervades much of his discourse and informs many rationalizations following traumatic events in the novel. The brief empathy and fear that he feels for the "Low Net Worth Individuals" shot in Central Park "was replaced by a different knowledge [...] that it wouldn't happen to us. [...] That these bullets would discriminate" (Shteyngart 157). These soothing lies are soon challenged by rapid societal change, both at the corporate level through Lenny's outrage at his perceived in-group becoming less exclusive and on the level of status and privilege, as Staatling-Wapachung's harsh working conditions for surviving citizens sets off Lenny's anxiety for the continued safety and comfort of people in his position. Lenny is later absorbed into the crowd, noting "the hipsterish [component's]" distance "from the blacks," but resignedly admitting that "it didn't matter [...]. We were finally one. We were all condemned" (Shteyngart 246). Joshie, meanwhile, never has this realisation that would dismantle his puerile pretensions and self-righteousness, demanding that Eunice devote herself to him and treat him as he sees fit (Shteyngart 303). Joshie feels threatened by a Eunice who dares to be independent from him, and thus projects his insecurities by rejecting a relationship on equal footing—a sign of the chauvinism that can sometimes accompany the *puer*'s neurosis. (Kiley 12, 31).

Within *puer* psychology, *Super Sad True Love Story* portrays what happens when the *feeling function*—that conscious process that invests our experiences with and assesses their personal value—is repressed at the societal and personal levels (Franz 237). Joshie's contempt for the humanities that he deems worthless and part of the "Fallacy of Merely Existing" (Shteyngart 67) he so reviles exemplifies what happens when apathetic, statistical thinking runs rampant. When it is devoid of love for humanity and its irregularities, society's veneers of rationality and good will struggle to hide a festering, "old animal ape-circus" that surfaces in times of political uproar (Franz 237). The novel bears out a development of this kind in the brutal treatment of the elderly and the destruction of the ferries, implied to be orchestrated by Joshie, the *puer*-turned-tyrannical enforcer (Franz 173).

On the personal level, the repression of the feeling function, which severs one from the present moment (Franz 97), can lead one to take destructive intellectual shortcuts to explain trauma away rather than facing it. When Eunice writes to herself before deciding to have an affair with Joshie, she justifies not seeking happiness by citing Freud's suggestion to convert personal misery into "common unhappiness" (Shteyngart 297). Eunice's assimilation of this unfeeling Freudian viewpoint thus completes the "intellectual trick" that closes her off to unknown possibilities or interpretations. In precisely defining her bleak, inflexible outlook on life, she creates an intellectual cage in which to comfortably trap herself in and excuse herself from further doubt and introspection.

From there, Eunice experiences an *enantiodromia* from an idealism and activism concerning her sister and ex-National Guardsman David into a cruel, compassionless, and disillusioned pragmatism eerily resembling Joshie's. Her cold rationality represents a switch from a catatonic, paralysing fear for her loved ones and her country to another, equal form of madness (Franz 266) as she assuredly and without compassion dismisses the cruelty and apathy of the upper classes to which she now belongs (Shteyngart 314). This oscillation from one extreme to another without a reasonable middle ground is typical of the *puer* and conforms to the tragedy of the novel: both Lenny and Eunice reach an extreme, yet drop off into unexamined banality. Eunice is marked by her weak personality's identification with generational collectivity (Franz

173) as she accepts the righteous punishment of growing older while Joshie's treatment allows him to become younger. She further resembles Joshie through her "making the most out of the least" (Shteyngart 311), a wording that becomes sinister when juxtaposed with Joshie's own reasonings on the deaths of the media people aboard the ferry. Her friendly mask now hides "her usual face [of] grave and unmitigated displeasure" (Shteyngart 315). Lenny's disillusionment, meanwhile, negates his proclamation at the novel's beginning by stating its antithesis: "Today I've made a major decision: *I am going to die*. Nothing of my personality will remain. The light switch will be turned off. My life, my entirety, will be lost forever. I will be nullified" (Shteyngart 304). He appears to accept death superficially, but his resignation carries little enthusiasm for the present and instead seems to illustrate a lament for his inability to affect positive change in the world. It then metastasises into an unconscious gravitation to the deathly, unconscious banality (Franz 115) of old habits, as suggested by the pathetic fallacy of the grain fields "arrested by winter, [dreaming] of a new life," which again recalls the *puer*'s desire to escape the present by indulging in fantasies of a tomorrow that never comes. The depressing finality of "For a while at least, no one said anything, and I was blessed with what I needed the most. Their silence, black and complete" (Shteyngart 331) alludes to the thwarting of the maturational process and the loss of the wisdom that the *puer* desperately needs, and heralds a retreat into a state where the flow of life stops altogether.

4. Conclusions

Echoing their inability to prevent or act against the crumbling fabric of their society, the characters in *Super Sad True Love Story* are fated to become passive, impotent witnesses to their country's decay as they themselves become stuck in the destructive psychological mire of the *puer* mindset. In Lenny's case, this is epitomised by the partial awakening of his fear of death that is nonetheless punctuated by a final, paralytic surrender, thus reiterating the *puer*'s concern on the inseparability of pleasure and life from pain and disappointment.

The narrative strategy of paralleling physical and institutional destruction with the psychological stagnation corresponding to the *puer* archetype enhances the novel's apocalyptic vision of the future.

Shteyngart's raising of issues regarding the damage caused by late capitalism's blatant disregard for people and the environment, the invasiveness of technology and its relationship to mass surveillance and police states, together with the key enabling of puerile responses to the fear of death through dysfunctional immortality programmes, represents the nullification of the potentially transformative quality of apocalyptic events by depicting the *puer*'s arrested development as widespread and deeply embedded in society. Shteyngart proposes that these issues are linked to our contemporary first world society's inability to properly raise children—specifically, boys—into adulthood, and that our social and technological systems merely exacerbate the problem. This is demonstrated by how the fear of death and the obsessive clinging to youthfulness leads to a demonisation of the elderly and the infirm, which emerges as Lenny's disgust at helping the old widows of his apartment complex, and their cruel and callous deportation to abandoned housing. This puerile negation of the natural processes of ageing and death leads not only to the effacement of Lenny's present moment by his knowledge of the certainty of death, but also to the quest for its complete abolishment. This panicked pursuit becomes a business at Post-Human Services where, in a cruel twist, years are added to a life that is lifeless and unreal. Lenny and Joshie entertain fantasies that neglect the present and look to a future where their problems are solved, and they are elevated to fully realised, god-like individuals that rise above the masses, and so ward off the existential dread of living in a world where one's existence can be reduced to the binary language of ones and zeroes. This fervently convulsive reaction to technological advances in instant communication and globalised interconnectivity exacerbates the *puer* mentality, for the novel suggests that when our lives are dominated by statistics, we become cold, callous pragmatists, devoid of empathy and capable of inflicting vast horrors upon our fellow humans. In this state, one loses touch with and deprioritises reality in favour of digital worlds that feel increasingly real. As the line between reality and illusion blurs, we see—as per Lenny's writings—a tendency towards naïveté and impermanency that points to an ungrounded, indifferent, alienated personality that struggles to form genuine attachments with people and is politically uninvolved, thereby inviting more dangerous personalities to take charge. Rather than confronting adversity, this individual represses and shelves away personal pain, lives in a continually depressed state and, as with Eunice, fetishises that suffering.

When contextualised with Shteyngart's apocalyptic concerns, the framework of the Jungian eternal child archetype leads to the equation of the *puer aeternus*'s damaging behaviours with societal disaster. This could supplement trauma studies as a subsidiary perspective for narratives concerning globalisation, advancing technologies, and their relation to the individual across generations. Rather than what would traditionally be referred to as a "traumatic" event, the neurosis of the *puer aeternus* is unrelated to a specific historical event that carries ethnic or strictly genealogical significance and is instead more akin to a psychological reaction to the cumulative effects of massive and rapid cultural and social upheaval that is nonetheless "unconsciously transmitted through the generations," as Claire Stocks states (79). Despite this relative detachedness from traumatic events, future avenues for research in this field might scrutinise the characteristics of the *puer* condition as accompanying additional literary representations of traumatic events and describe their interactions in various contexts, or else further document how the *puer* neurosis disrupts one's "psychic life" (Stocks 79). As a relatively modern psychological phenomenon, the *puer*'s influence on society is not yet fully understood. As our understanding of the human mind improves, apocalyptic representations such as Shteyngart's should encourage us to, in the style of Franz and Jung's frameworks, look inward to recognise these psychological patterns in ourselves and society.

Notes

[1] Franz draws here from Erich Fromm's *Zum Gefühl der Ohnmacht* (The Feeling of Being Incapable of Doing Anything).

[2] The novel's narrative form, which is temporally displaced from the here-and-now, more effectively represents how this provisionality affects one's perception of reality than the more traditional third-person, limited perspective. Combined with Lenny's provisional asides, the resulting narrative 'telescoping' causes the immediate reality of the novel to recede from the reader, echoing the *puer*'s intellectual isolation from lived experience.

[3] Michael Anderson's science fiction film *Logan's Run* (1976) and Richard Fleischer's film *Soylent Green* (1973) portray dystopias which commonly envision the wilful termination of human life to prevent overpopulation or solve a food crisis, respectively.

Works Cited

Bly, Robert. *Iron John: A Book About Men*. Addison Wesley, 1990.

Fisher, Jane. "Apocalyptic Form in the American Fin de Siècle." Hay, pp. 147-160.

Foertsch, Jacqueline. "Mutually Assured Destruction in Cold War/Postwar America." Hay, pp. 175-186.

Franz, Marie-Louise von. *The Problem of the Puer Aeternus*, edited by Daryl Sharp. 3rd ed. Inner City Books, 2000.

Fromm, Erich. "Zum Gefühl der Ohnmacht." *Zeitschrift für Sozialforschung* vol. 6, no. 1, 1937, pp. 95-118. doi: https://doi.org/10.5840/zfs193761136.

Hay, John. "Introduction: The United States of Apocalypse." Hay, pp. 1-14.

-----, editor. *Apocalypse in American Literature and Culture*. Cambridge UP, 2020.

Hicks, Heather J. "Disaster Response in Post-2000 American Apocalyptic Fiction." Hay, pp. 212-224.

Kiley, Dan. *The Peter Pan Syndrome: Men Who Have Never Grown Up*. Dodd, Mead & Company, 1983.

Kundera, Milan. *The Unbearable Lightness of Being*. 1st Perennial Classics ed. Harper Perennial, 1999.

Logan's Run. Directed by Michael Anderson, performances by Michael York, Jenny Agutter, Richard Jordan and Roscoe Lee Browne, Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer, 1976.

Main, Paul. "Carl Jung's Archetypes". *Structural Learning*. 30 Mar. 2023. 8. Sept. 2023. <https://www.structural-learning.com/post/carl-jungs-archetypes>.

Shteyngart, Gary. *Super Sad True Love Story: A Novel.* Random House, 2010.

Soylent Green. Directed by Richard Fleischer, performances by Charlton Heston, Leigh Taylor-Young, Chuck Connors and Joseph Cotten, Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer, 1973.

Stocks, Claire. "Trauma theory and the singular self: rethinking extreme experiences in the light of cross-cultural identity," *Textual Practice* vol. 21, no.1, 2007, pp. 71-92. doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/09502360601156971

Taylor, Matthew A. "Posthuman Postapocalypse." Hay, pp. 317-327.

Thomas, Dylan. "Do not go gentle into that good night." *Death, Dying and Bereavement*, edited by Donna Dickenson, Malcolm Johnson and Jeanne Samson Katz. 2nd ed. SAGE Publications, 2000, p. 69.

Visser, Irene. "Apocalyptic Trauma and the Politics of Mourning a World." Hay, 2020, pp. 304-316.

Watts, Alan Wilson. "Power of Space." *Alan Watts Organization*, 31 Oct. 2022. 17 June 2023 <https://alanwatts.org/transcripts/power-of-space/#:~:text=This%20is%20the%20great,only%20wretched%20little%20bacteria.>.

Watts, Alan Wilson. "The Tao of Philosophy (Part 4)." *Alan Watts Organization*, 31 Oct. 2022. 6 July 2023. <https://alanwatts.org/transcripts/the-tao-of-philosophy-4/#:~:text=And%20that%E2%80%99s%20an,the%20intellectual%20world.>.

Received / Recibido: 6/5/2024 *Accepted / Aceptado: 24/9/2024*

Early Modern Spanish and Portuguese Material Culture in the Works of James Shirley (1596-1666)

Eroulla Demetriou (eroulla@ujaen.es) / Luciano García (lugarcia@ujaen.es)
Universidad de Jaén

Abstract: The international dominance of the Habsburg Empire (which from 1581 until 1640 included Spain and Portugal) fostered the expansion of both the material and symbolic culture of the Iberian Peninsula in Europe and more specifically in England. This article sets out to broach the nature and extent of the presence of that material culture in the work of James Shirley, whose literary debt to Spain is one of the most conspicuous of the Jacobean-Caroline period and constituted a touchstone for the penetration of Spanish literature and Iberian culture into Early Modern English society. Moreover, since the socio-textual relationships concerning material culture in literary texts between Early Modern Spain and England have not been analysed extensively, except in the case of Shakespeare (Duque 1981 and 1991), the analysis of the Shirleian opus presents a privileged vantage point from which to obtain an overview of how diverse material elements of Spanish culture had penetrated into English life and how this was reflected in the literary works of the time.
Keywords: James Shirley, Early Modern Spain and England, material culture, Spanish and Portuguese cultural influence.

Cultura material española y portuguesa del periodo moderno temprano en las obras de James Shirley (1596-1666)

Resumen: El dominio en el tablero internacional del Imperio Habsburgo (que desde 1581 hasta 1640 incluyó a España y Portugal) fomentó la expansión de la cultura tanto material como simbólica de la Península Ibérica en Europa y más específicamente en Inglaterra. Este artículo se propone abordar la naturaleza y el alcance de la presencia de esa cultura material en la obra de James Shirley, cuya deuda literaria española es una de las más conspicuas del período jacobeo-carolino y piedra de toque de la penetración de la literatura y cultura ibéricas en la Inglaterra del periodo moderno temprano. Además, dado que las relaciones socio-textuales relativas a la cultura material en los textos literarios entre la España e Inglaterra de esa época no han sido analizadas extensamente, excepto en el caso de Shakespeare (Duque 1981 y 1991), el análisis de la obra shirleiana presenta un punto de vista privilegiado desde el que obtener una visión general de la penetración de estos elementos materiales en la vida inglesa plasmada en las obras literarias de la época.
Palabras clave: James Shirley, Periodo Moderno Temprano en España e Inglaterra; cultura material, influencia cultural española y portuguesa.

1. Introduction

The Habsburg Empire's international influence, encompassing Spain and Portugal from 1581 to 1640, greatly contributed to the spread of Iberian culture across Europe, notably impacting England. In this country the Spanish influence was transmitted through a remarkable

number of translators, pamphleteers, Hispanists, and Hispanophiles who kept England in contact with Spanish politics, society, art and literature (Underhill; Forsythe, 10-11; Ungerer, Anglo-Spanish Relations, and "Printing of Spanish Books"; García García, Presencia textual de España 99-151). In this context, the work of James Shirley, who has been aptly called "the last of a great race" (Lamb 207) and "the last legitimate descendant of Shakspeare (sic)" (Anonymous 48-49), stands out as a key figure in the textual presence of Spain. Chronologically speaking, he follows but greatly surpasses Beaumont and Fletcher in his Spanish affiliation and he precedes and overshadows the Restoration playwrights among whom the Spanish presence is noticeable to a greater or lesser extent: John Dryden, George Digby, William Wycherley, Aphra Behn, Thomas St. Serf, John Crowne, Sir Samuel Tuke, John Leanerd, John Davies, and Colley Cibber. Moreover, Shirley himself offers a privileged position from which to determine the influence of Spain in England due to his crucial historical, sociological, and literary presence coinciding with the rise and decline of the power of the Habsburg Empire in Europe. Therefore, this study aims to explore the presence of Spanish and Portuguese cultural artifacts in the works of James Shirley, whose indebtedness to Spain is the most prominent one during the Jacobean-Caroline era. Shirley's writings serve thus as a key reference point for understanding the integration of Spanish literature and Iberian culture into English society at a critical time in history. What is more, given the limited analysis lent by contemporary criticism to socio-textual relationships regarding material culture in Early Modern English literature, except for Shakespeare, examining Shirley's works provides a unique opportunity to grasp how various aspects of Spanish culture influenced English life and literature during this period.

Finally, it is necessary to add that we are aware that the distinction between material and spiritual culture is often unclear and frequently overlaps.[1] Therefore, we have considered material culture as "the sum or inventory of the technology and material artefacts of a human group, including those elements related to subsistence activities as well as those which are produced for ornamental, artistic or ritual purposes" (Seymour-Smith 183). This analysis will consequently include the presence of such products and artifacts which pertain to culinary culture, coins, fashion, and the military and urban space.

2. Culinary culture

Spanish produce and goods aided in the renewal of English culinary culture which took place during the mid-sixteenth century onwards (Thirks 97-125), contributing not only to the Epicurean delights mentioned below but to other recipes and ingredients such as confectionery, sugar, sauces, potatoes, vegetables, fruits, and chocolate (though the latter rather belatedly in the seventeenth century). Shirley's appreciation of Spanish food is patent in his references to Spanish wines and several kinds of dishes which are always presented in a positive way (except for the Spanish figs), whether he was dealing with such *regallias* (*regalias*) as an *olla podrida*, a *carbonado*, or an *oringado,* as will be explained.

2.1. Wine: sack, canary and malmsey

The Elizabethans' fondness for wine was proverbial. "Holinshed, writing in the 1570s thought the English had the greatest array of any country even though they produced none themselves" (Thirsk 310). Continental wines such as *Madeira*, *Rhenish*, *Alicant* and *Gascon* were common. Spanish wines, however, won hands down. Pedro Duque in his 1981 article "Shakespeare y el vino español" reveals up to five kinds of Spanish wines mentioned by Shakespeare: *charneco*, *malvasia*, *bastard*, *canary* and *sack*. Campillo Arnaiz (2017) clarifies that the most popular of them, *sack*, comprised a great variety of white wines coming from the Iberian Peninsula (according to Gervase Markham, from places as dissimilar as Galicia, Portugal, or Málaga) or off the peninsula, from the Canary Islands, and presenting diverse degrees of quality, the best of them being the sack coming from Jerez de la Frontera, sometimes specified as sherry sack.[2] The second in importance was Canary (sometimes equalled to *sack*), which was clearly produced in the Canary Islands. As regards non-Spanish wines, James Shirley mentions only the French *claret*, the Mediterranean *malmsey* and a general "Greek wine" (twice). In comparison, Shirley is much more assiduous in mentioning three types of Spanish wines.

Sack is the wine that appears most frequently in Shirley's work. Up to 35 times. It is impossible to present here all the shades of meaning with which the wine is endowed, but apparently, as inferred from

The Witty Fair One (III,iv,319) and from *Changes or Love in a Maze* (2,II,ii,298), it appears to be an excellent antidepressant against love's melancholy or against suicidal impulses in *Cupid and Death* (scene 6, p. 354, appearing twice).[3]

Canary appears five times in three plays (*The Witty Fair One*, *1*,ll,ii,297, *The Wedding*, *1*,II,iii,392, and *Love's Cruelty*, *2*,I,ii.208) and twice in the poem "Upon the Princes Birth," celebrating the birth of the royal heir, the future James II (*6*,425). The word is also mentioned twice in *The Ball* (*3*,III.iii.46 and *3*,III.iv.54). It is interesting to notice that it appears as *canary sack* in *The Witty Fair One*, *The Wedding* and the aforementioned poem "Upon the Princes Birth", which proves, as Campillo Arnaiz has advanced, that sack, except when pre-modified, was a general term for white wine coming from any part of the Iberian Peninsula or the Canary Islands. However, experts in nutrition had detected as early as 1620 that to take Canary for sack was a common error of laymen. Thus, Tobias Venner wrote in *Via Recta ad Vitam Longam*:

> Canary wine, which beareth the name of the Island from whence it is brought, is of some termed a Sacke, with the adiunct, sweete, but yet very improperly, for it differeth not only from Sacke in sweetnesse and pleasantnesse of taste, but also in colour and consistence; for it is not so white in colour as Sacke, not so thin in substance. (Venner 24)

As was customary at the time, Shirley makes a pun with the alternative meaning of the term *Canary* as a kind of lively dance:

> *Loddam.* They say that canary sack must dance again
> to the apothecaries, and be sold for physic in hum-
> glasses and thimbles; that the Spar-water / must be
> transported hither and be drunk instead of French
> wine... (*The Wedding*, *1,*II,iii.392-393)[4]

As can be seen, the healthy qualities of Canary sack are highly praised by the fat gentleman called Loddam to the detriment of French wines.

Besides, our playwright also relates sack to the Canary Islands as both the wine and the islands are suggestive of warmth and good cheer:

> *Clariana*. Excuse me, sir. I would not have my name be the toast for every cup of sack you drink; you wild gallants have no mercy upon gentlewomen, when you are warm i' the Canaries. (*Love's Cruelty*, 2,I,ii.208)

> *Lacy*. No remedy; here's a lady longs for one vagary.— Fill a bowl of sack, and then to the Canaries. (*Hyde Park*, 2,II,ii,478)

In the poem "Upon the Princes Birth", Shirley mentions Málaga (*Malago*) as a place from which wine is imported, and refers to another kind of wine, the *Charnico*. According to the Oxford English Dictionary (*OED*), this wine, which appears, among others, in the works of Shakespeare (*2 Henry VI*), is defined as a kind of wine. Robinson (162) adds that it was a white wine probably fortified and popular in England during the 16th and 17th centuries. It was possibly the ancestor of the modern Portuguese protected designation of origin Bucellas. During Elizabethan times this wine was denominated *Charnico* or *Charnaco* on account of Charneco, a local village in the Bucelas region (Robinson 112 and 162).

There is only one mention of malmsey. It appears as *malmesey* in *The Witty Fair One* (*1*,II.ii.297). For Leal Cruz *malmsey* or *malvasía* is, for the most part, Canary. He thinks the same about sack, but here we agree more with Campillo Arnaiz and consider that sack was a generic term for an imported white wine coming from either the peninsula or the Canaries. As for malmsey, the general definition in the *OED* states that it was:

> A strong sweet wine, originally the product of the district of Monemvasia (Napoli di Malvasia) in the Peloponnese, Greece, later also from other parts of the Mediterranean, the Azores, the Canaries, Madeira, and elsewhere. Now esp.: a similar fortified wine from these places (esp. Madeira).

Shirley does not seem to appreciate the smell of this wine much, as we see when he says through one of his characters in *The Witty Fair One*:

> *Brain.* I was never yet cozened in my life, and if I pawn my brains for a bottle of sack or claret, may my nose, as a brand for my negligence, carry everlasting malmsey in it. (*1*,II.ii.297)

Finally, the superiority of the Spanish wines is confirmed in a brief passage in *Honoria and Mammon*:

> *2 Serjeant*. This is Spanish. [*Drinks*]
> *Serjeant*. Draw home your arrow to the head, my centaur.
> *1 Soldier*. Mine is French wine.
> *3 Soldier*. You must take your chance;
> The yeoman of the wine-cellar did not
> Provide them for our palate.
> *2 Soldier*. *Supernaculum*! See there lies Spain already; now would I fight—
> *Serjeant*. Drink, thou mean'st
> *2 Soldier*. With any king in Europe. (*6*,V.i.68)

Moreover Canary seems to be a delicacy fit for a present, as implied in the following passage in *The Ball*:

> *Freshwater*. Not an Englishman, I warrant you,
> One that can please the ladies every way;
> You shall not sit with him all day for shadows.
> He has *regallias*, and can present you with
> Suckets of fourteen-pence a pound, *Canary*,
> Prunellas, Venice glasses, Parmesan
> Sugars, Bologna sausages, all from Antwerp;
> But he will make *ollepodredos* most incomparably.
> (*3*.III,iii,45-46)

Regallias is the early edition spelling for *regalios*. According to the *OED*, *regalio* is a word "[o]f multiple origins. Partly a borrowing from Italian. Partly a borrowing from Spanish." It means "[a] present, esp. of choice food or drink; a lavish meal or entertainment. Also figurative." It is possibly an indication of the proverbial lavishness of the Spaniards. The connection between *Canary* and *olla podrida* points to the consideration of Canary as a real luxury.

2.2. Ollepodredos, olio

Olla podrida was an undoubtedly Spanish meal, possibly the much richer ancestor of the modern *cocido*. It appears in several cookbooks of the period and in literary works sometimes with the name *olio*. The book

of recipes by Gervase Markham, *The English Housewife* (1615), lists this dish with a lengthy list of ingredients, including "potato roots," which shows that about 1615 this tuber was known to Spanish and English kitchens.

As shown in the excerpt above, this dish was considered a *regalia*. We find the word for this dish again in *The Royal Master* under its shorter denomination:

> *Bombo.* If there be a superfluous pheasant, it
> Will quell my hunger for a time. I hear
> Intelligence of an *olio* [...] (*4*,II.i.122)

2.3. Fico, Spanish figs

Shirley mentions both *fico* and *Spanish fig*. According to the OED, the term *fico* is a borrowing from Italian and its earliest extant apparition dates back to 1577; *fig*, however, stems from French and is documented as early as 1225 (*OED*). Both *fico* and *fig* have two meanings as related to Shirley. On the one hand, it stands for "anything small, valueless, or contemptible" and commonly appears in the locution *(a) fig for*. Shirley used *fico* twice in this sense in *Honoria and Mammon* ("a *sico* [sic] for the devil," *6*,II.i.25 and *6*,IV.iii.64, "fico for Writs and mouse-traps"). Undoubtedly, he was following the widespread and naturalized use of the terms recorded in the *OED* as many other Elizabethan authors did. In *The Maid's Revenge* (*1*,I.ii.114, "I care not a Spanish fig what you count me"), the word, although completely anglicized, clearly reveals a connection with the mental representation of figs as something characteristically Spanish. A possible conclusion is that Shirley is perhaps conflating the sense of "anything valueless" with the second meaning which will now be explained.

Indeed, on the other hand, the mental representation of figs may well be xenophobically related to the stock representation of the Mediterranean villain. As defined in the *OED*, a fig was used to mean "[a] poisoned fig used as a secret way of destroying an obnoxious person. Often *fig of Spain, Spanish fig, Italian fig*." There are indeed in the *OED* several instances of collocations with *Spanish* and less frequently with *Italian*. So, as often Italian and Spanish terms can sometimes be mixed up and undistinguishable in Early Modern English texts, we can presume

with some degree of confidence that the ideational representation goes back mostly to the Iberian Peninsula, especially since there is evidence that the English consumed figs, most likely dried and as an exotic fruit, imported from Portugal as early as the fourteenth century (Thirsk 10 and 21). However, there is no reference at all to the culinary value of figs in Shirley's works.

Not surprisingly therefore, this second ominous sense is the one employed in the Spanish setting of *The Brothers* in which Alberto momentarily muses on the idea of poisoning Count Don Pedro:

> *Alberto.* There, there's the mischief; I must poison him;
> One *fig* sends him [Don Pedro] to Erebus.
> (*1*,III.ii.231)

The same happens, this time in a Portuguese setting, in *The Court Secret*, where Duke Mendoza speculates on getting rid of a problematic servant:

> *Mendoza*. [...] This servant, whom
> I dare not much displease, is all the witness
> Survives, sworn with the rest to secrecy;
> [...] yet I am
> Not safe to be at his devotion:
> I could soon purge him with a *fig*; but that's
> Not honest. (*5*,I.i.437)

In the same play, when Pedro suggests that his master allow him to seduce his daughter to put his master's loyalty to the test, the latter draws a dagger to punish Pedro's audacity and the servant ironically reminds him that he already knows of his intentions of getting rid of him more than once with the infamous Italian salad or the Spanish fig:

> *Pedro.* I told you this afore; but do not do't, sir, now
> I rather look for it in the next sallad,
> Or in my morning's draught: there's spice in your
> closet;
> Or we have Spanish *figs*. (*5*,IV.i.483)

Furthermore, in *The Maid's Revenge* (again in Portugal), Signior Sharkino, a kind of apothecary, puts "the Spanish fig" at the same

level of poisonous efficiency as Italian salads. Here he is responding to Catalina's maid, Ansilva, whom her mistress has sent to buy poison to supposedly kill a rat:

> *Sharkino.* A rat, give him his bane, would you destroy a
> City, I have *probatums* of Italian sallads, and our own
> country figs shall do it rarely.—
> (*1*,III.ii.141)

2.4. Carbonado

Another term appearing in Shirley's works is *carbonado*. This is an English word of Spanish origin and probably applied to a dish similar to what in Spanish is called *carbonada*. The *OED* defines it as "[a] piece of fish, flesh, or fowl, scored across and grilled or broiled upon the coals". Its first record appears in 1586 in Marlowe's *Tamburlaine*, where it was used as a verb, meaning "to make a carbonado." In *Love Tricks*, Orlando Furioso, a madman who takes part in the passage "The School of Complement," characteristically repeats the phrase "I will *carbonado* thee" (III,v.47, 52), and this is later echoed by another character, Bubulcus (III,v.59).

2.5 Oringado

Finally, we find a delicacy of the time: the *oringado* or *orangeado*, which the *OED* etymologically explains as "Formed within English, by derivation" *orange* plus *-ado* suffix. It is defined as "candied orange-peel." To our mind the suffix *-ado* betrays its Spanish origin and must be related to the influence of Spanish confectionery and the considerable import of oranges, such as the bitter ones from Seville which "continue to be indispensable in our marmalade to this day" (Thirsk 298).

Precisely one of the quotes that the English dictionary gives is the one that we have found in *The Lady of Pleasure*:

> *Steward.* What an unlucky memory I have!
> The gallant that still danceth in the street,
> And wears a gross of ribbon in his hat;
> That carries *oringado* in his pocket [...]. (*4*,I.i.12)

3. Coins

As is well known, the preponderance of Spanish currency, particularly silver coins, played a pivotal role in shaping global trade and finance of the Western World. As a major colonial power which exploited precious metals in the Americas, Spain minted a mass of coins which were greedily ambitioned by merchants and bankers all around Europe. Thus, it is only natural that the following coins found ample mention not only in Shirley but in any of his contemporaries.

3.1. Doblon

Naturally, in any list of Spanish items that circulated in foreign lands, the allusion to coins cannot be missing. The mythical gold doubloon appears in *The Brothers*:

> *Luys.* [*to his sister Jacinta*] [...] You are my father's darling,
> and command
> His yellow ingots; t'other *doblon d'oro*. (*1*,II.i.209)

3.2. Maravides, marvedie, ducats / duckets

The *maravedí* and the *ducado* ("ducat") were also well-known coins in England and with a defined exchange value:

> *Carlos.* [...] Yet were Albero's state ten *maravides*
> Above Ramyres, I should prefer him first.
> Fame is an empty noise, virtue a word
> There's not a Jew will lend two ducats on—
> (*The Brothers*, *1*,I.i.200)

An annual pension of six thousand ducats, together with an inheritance from his grandmother, constitute the attractive fortune which Luys wishes to assert when talking about the engagement between his sister Jacinta and his friend Alberto:

> *Luys.* Six thousand *ducats*, sir, per annum, clear
> In his possession, beside
> The legacy of a grannam when she dies. (*1*,I.i.197)

Ducats and *marvedies* also appear six times in another work with an Iberian setting: *The Court Secret* (*ducats*: *5*,I.i.432 and 438; *5*,II.ii.452; *5*,IV.i.482; *5*,V.iii.509; *ducats* and *marvedie* on *5*,I.i.439). Fifteen thousand *duckets* is the amount that Roderigo, the scheming brother of the king of Spain, demands from Piracquo as payment for his intercession to obtain a royal pardon. The *marvedies* appear twice in the context of rhetorical bets: in the first occurrence, Piracquo challenges Roderigo that he will not pay him in any way, neither the ducats he asks for, nor a single *marvedie*:

> *Piracquo.* And will wager, if your grace please,
> The t'other fifty thousand ducats, sir,
> That I'll not pay you a *marvedie*. (*5*,I.i.439)

In the second occurrence, Pedro puts his master, Duke Mendoza, to the test, pretending that he wants to marry his daughter in return for not revealing the terrible secret he knows about him. The servant, when his master wants to know what he is asking for in return to keeping the secret, begins by betting a pistol against a *maravide* that he will enrage him upon hearing the mere proposal:

> *Pedro.* All? a pistole to a *maravide* you draw
> Your rapier presently upon me; and
> If I name but the party, will not have
> The patience to foin, but tilt it at me. (*5*,IV.i.482)

4. Spanish Fashion

Spanish fashion enjoyed a high reputation at the time and was frequently imitated in the rest of Europe, especially by the elite, although for Shirley's time it was on the decline.[5]

4.1. Spanish garbe

In *The Humorous Courtier*, Depazzi allegedly praises the good taste of the pedant Volterre for dressing in the Spanish fashion:

> *Depazzi.* […] Signiour, I must doe you justice; the Court
> Speakes you most accurate, ith' *Spanish garbe*.
> (Morillo ed. IV.ii.152, ll. 39-40; see also *4*,I.ii.587)

4.2. Spanish cape

As for the suggestion that the wearing of a cape in an elegant way was patrimony of the Spaniards, there is a humorous reference in *The Witty Fair One* when the tutor of the young girl Treedle tries to convince her of the advisability of visiting other countries to learn the elegant manners of the moment:

> *Treedle.* [...] let your judgment reflect, upon a serious consideration, who teaches you the mimic posture of your body [...] Are not Italian heads, Spanish shoulders, Dutch bellies, and French legs, the only notions of your reformed English gentlemen? (1.II.i. 294)

In *The Lady of Pleasure* we can witness Littleworth's instruction to Frederick, Lady Aretina's nephew, on fashionable French dressing to the detriment of the declining Spanish fashion concerning capes:[6]

> Your doublet and your breeches must be allow'd
> No private meeting here, your cloak's too long,
> It reaches to your buttock, and doth smell
> Too much of *Spanish gravity*, the fashion
> Is to wear nothing but a *cape*, a coat
> May be allow'd a covering for one elbow,
> And some to avoid the trouble, choose to walk
> *In quirpo* thus. (*4,*IV.ii.67)

4.3. In quirpo

As shown in the preceding quote, going out *in cuerpo* or *in querpo*, i.e., "without a cape, overcoat or other outer coat" (in the Diccionario de la Real Academia Española [*DRAE*]: "sin prenda de abrigo exterior") was common for Spaniards. We have found examples of the Spanish expression in various scenic annotations in Tirso de Molina's *La república al revés*, I,xii and *Escarmiento para el cuerdo* I,i and also in Lope de Vega's *El villano en su rincón*, II.148 ("Sale el REY, en cuerpo"). In England, Minshew in *The Guide into Tongues* (1617) already mentions the phrase "andar en cuerpo", anglicized as "to go in hose and doublet without a cloake" (*OED*). For Gosse (1888, 323), in his edition of *The Lady of*

Pleasure, it is synonymous with walking "stripped of the upper garment." Another instance is found in *The Opportunity* when two servants are conversing:

> *Ascanio.* Your grace will be a Hercules.
> *Pimponio.* I will, and thou shalt be captain of the pigmies under me. This room's too narrow, beat down the walls on both sides, advance your lights, and call the country in; if there be a tailor amongst them he shall first take measure of my highness, for I must not longer [sic] walk *in quirpo*. (3.II.i.392)

In *The Gamester* we find *in quirpo* once more:

> *Mistress Wilding.* 'Cause I have met him with a turban once
> If I mistake not, (but his linen was not
> So handsome altogether as the Turk's)
> *In quirpo*, with a crab-tree cudgel too,
> Walking, and canting broken Dutch for farthings.
> (*3,*III.iii.236)

As can be seen, the serious and ornate Spanish fashion was giving way to a lighter French one while the Spanish phrase *in cuerpo* was still in use.

4.4. Quellios (cuellos)

According to the OED, a *quellio* is a Spanish ruff. It seems to refer to the so-called *cuellos a la valona* or *golilla* which Philip IV had imposed to replace the popular *lechugilla* or *gorguera* (Aileen Ribeiro II.331 and Guarino I.243) and which, consequently, also became popular in England. Thus, the word *quellios* (or *quellio ruff*, see Massinger, *The City Madam* IV.iv) made its way into *The Triumph of Peace*. Opportunity, a character, true to its allegorical meaning, says of the vacuous courtiers:

> I ha[ve] seen
> Dainty devices in this kind, baboons
> In *quellios*, and so forth. (*6,* page 271)

4.5. Chopinoes

Spanish *chapines* were well-known in England from the time of the arrival of Catherine of Aragon in England in 1501 (Hayward 18-19, Earenfight 293-302, and Kipling 32). This word, today normalized in the *OED* as *chopine* or *chopin*, appears with the spellings indicated above. The writers of the early seventeenth century insistently treat the origin of these shoes as Italian, even writing *cioppino* and *cioppini*, and associate it with Venice, where they may have been fashionable, despite the fact that there is no documented evidence of the term's use in Italian dictionaries. It also appears related to Spain (*EEBO*). The truth is that the shoes and word originated in Spain, though they were adopted first by Venetian and then by French women (De Mello 11, 66, 75, 107-113; Classe). Shakespeare uses *chopine* in *Hamlet*, II.ii.423. As for Shirley, he uses it in *The Ball* in a very interesting passage where Freshwater, the presumptuous traveller who has made the "grand tour" of the continent, is informing the dance master Monsieur Le Frisk about Venetian fashions:

> *Freshwater.* That's all
> I can inform you of their dance in Italy;
> Marry, that very morning I left Venice,
> I had intelligence of a new device.
>
> *Monsieur Le Frisk.* For the dance, monsieur?
>
> *Freshwater.* Si, signor. I know not
> What countryman invented ['em], but they say
> There be *chopinoes* made with such rare art
> That, worn by a lady when she means to dance,
> Shall, with their very motion, sound forth music,
> And by a secret sympathy, with their tread
> Strike any tune that, without other instrument,
> Their feet doth dance and play. (*3*,I.10-11)

Indeed, this passage supports the connection of the term with Venice, the spelling it uses ("chopino") is halfway between Italian and Spanish and the allusion "What countryman invented ['em]" evince the mixed genealogy of the shoes.

4.6. Spanish gloves

Scented gloves were a common and widespread article of clothing in Early Modern Europe. Although the fashion started in Italy and they were produced both in Spain and Portugal, as well as in France and Italy, the Spaniards elevated this fashion to new heights. Indeed, their finely perfumed gloves were an object highly appreciated by the rich and the nobility not only for their usefulness but also for accomplishing social and symbolic functions.[7]

There is an allusion to the preference for Spanish perfume to scented gloves in *Hyde Park*. When Julietta, Carol and Mistress Bonavent bet on the horse races to be held in Hyde Park, Mistress Carol pits a pair of silk stockings against a pair of scented gloves offered by Julietta. Mrs. Carol is careful to insist that the perfume be Spanish, and Julietta that the stockings be scarlet:

> *Julietta.* Shall we venture nothing o' the horses?
> What odds against my lord!
> *Mis. Carol.* Silk stockings.
> *Julietta.* To a pair of perfumed gloves? I take it.
> *Mis. Carol.* Done!
> *Mis. Bonavent.* And I as much.
> *Julietta.* Done, with you both!
> *Mis. Carol.* I'll have 'em *Spanish sent*.
> *Julietta.* The stockings shall be scarlete; if you choose
> Your scent, I'll choose my colour. (*2*,IV.iii.518)

4.7. Calli-mancho and perpetuana

In *The Wedding* we find a hodgepodge of commonplace expressions, fabric names and pseudo-words derived from French, Spanish and Welsh. When Justice Landby questions the insane Loddam about his alleged knowledge of various modern languages, Loddam answers as follows:

> *Loddam.* Troth, I have such a confusion of languages in
> my head, you must even take them as they come.

Justice Landby. You may speak that more exactly— *Hablar spagnol, senor*?
Loddam. *Serge-dubois*, *Calli-mancho*, *et Perpetuana*.

Justice Landby. There's stuff, indeed;[8] since you are so perfect, I'll trust you for the rest. (1.III,ii.407-408)

The sequence "Serge-dubois, Calli-mancho, et Perpetuana," is a juxtaposition of different types of fabrics. No doubt *serge-dubois* (literal meaning: "fabric of the forest") reveals a French etymology, but *calli-mancho* and *perpetuana* may well come from the Spanish and Portuguese, respectively. The first term, today normalized as *calamanco* or *calimanco*, is tagged in the *OED* as of uncertain origin. The cognate words in other languages (Spanish and Portuguese are ignored) show little similarity in their spelling and pronunciation and, though the burgeoning textile industry during the period had moved to the Netherlands, Germany and England to the detriment of Spain or Portugal (Guarinos 242, Phillips "Spanish Wool Trade" 202-206, and *Spain's Golden Fleece* 775-776 and 789) and though the form suggests connection with the medieval Latin *camelaucus*, the English dictionary recognizes that evidence of connection is wanting. For us a more likely connection would be the derivation in *-anco,* which is a typical calque from Spanish suffixes. Furthermore, the article for the *Wikipedia* in English states that "[the] name comes from a Spanish term for worsted wool" (though unfortunately there are no further references) and the Spanish definition of *calamaco* as "[t]ela de lana delgada y angosta, que viene de Portugal y otras partes, la qual tiene un torcidillo como gerga, y es a modo de droguete o especie de él," appeared in *the Diccionario de Autoridades* in 1726.

As regards *perpetuana*, the OED states that it is "[a]pparently formed within English, by derivation." However, the Spanish *perpetuán* and most likely the Portuguese *perpetuana* (17th century) seem more convincing derivatives, above all taking into account that the *OED* itself gives us the clue when inviting the reader to compare "French *perpétuane* thick, durable cloth made in Portugal and England (1694)." We must also take into account that Portugal was still an important textile centre, although a waning one due to Dutch and English competition.

4.8. Muger umbrada

In a passage of *The Humorous Courtier*, Volterre gives his own explanation to the Duchess as to what the cause of Orseollo's (apparent) misogyny is. He shows himself as a pedant in languages when discussing women of different nationalities:

> *Volterre.* Ile shew your highness the reall cause, why
> He hates all women [...]
> He nere converst with an Italian
> Bona Roba, a plumpe Lady, that fils
> Her gowne, or with a French Brunette,
> A Spanish Muger umbrada, or a
> Germane Yefrow, the Dutch. --
> (Morillo ed. II,ii.123. ll. 281-291;
> see also *4*,II.ii.557 Underlying by Morillo)

In this catalogue of female types of Europe *Muger umbrada* stands out as the Spanish expression to characterize Spanish ladies. There is a clear stereotypical sartorial implication of the locution. Thus, Morillo suggests that *Muger umbrada* stands for "shady woman" or perhaps "worldly woman." To us the correct interpretation is most likely the first one. The cliché of veiled Spanish ladies was already much of a commonplace at the time and continued to be well into the Restoration. It would refer to the *tapadas* or veiled Spanish ladies, as known from Spanish *comedias* and the reports of foreign travellers to the Peninsula.

4.9. Mustachios

An allusion to the masculine attire is given by the term *mustachios*, which, as the *OED* reminds us, stems from "multiple origins. Partly a borrowing from Spanish. Partly a borrowing from Italian", its etymology, according to the *OED*, being Spanish *mostazo* and Italian *mostaccio*. In its plural form the word means either "1.a. A visible growth of hair on a man's upper lip; a moustache, (now) esp. one which is large and luxuriant" or "[a] growth of hair on either side of a man's upper lip, forming one half of a moustache" (*OED*). It differentiates itself from the *moustache*, the etymological ancestor of the modern English word,[9] which, admittedly, is a borrowing from French. The word appears in *The Gamester,* when

Mistress Wilding's page, disguised as Ancient Petarre, brags at Young Barnacles' expense. The spelling and the swaggering tone reminds us clearly of the Spanish braggart, although the passage is obscure and may perhaps be a figurative reference to some kind of firearm:

> *Page.* [...] vanish immediately! or I will shoot death
> from my *Mustachios*, and kill thee like a porcupine.
> (*3*,IV.i.247)

4.10. Tooth-picks

The excerpt from the *Humorous Courtier* (Shirley-Morillo IV.ii.152) that we have quoted above continues with the reply of Volterre as follows:

> *Volterre.* The Spaniard (signiour) reserves all passion,
> To express his feeling in occurences
> Of state, when in discourse, *his Tooth-picke* still
> *Reaches out a Tooth-picke.*
> Is his parinthasis: which he doth manage
> Subtly thus - [10]
> (Shirley-Morillo IV.ii.152, ll. 41-44; see also *4*,I.ii.587)

It seems from this quote that the toothpick was at the time "the 'statesman's' staff of office" (Morillo, 190),[11] a status symbol of judicious or influential personages, a sign of serious reflection on capital matters, especially as attributed to the Spaniards or perhaps more truly to the Portuguese, since toothpicks were being mass produced since the sixteenth century by the nuns of the Mosteiro de Lorvão in Coimbra, Portugal, considered at the time as the world's capital of the toothpick industry (Petrosky 42-46).

5. The Military

Shirley was appreciative of the figure of the soldier. Furthermore, the domain of the military being one of the most active fields of translation activity by which the English tried to catch up with Spain,[12] it is not surprising that lexical elements having to do with this field of human activity appear in Shirley's work with a certain assiduity.

5.1. Soldade

This is the spelling in Shirley. It is an anglicized form of *soldado*, derived from Spanish or Portuguese, which, however, appears mostly in this spelling in the English texts of the time as recorded in *EBOO*. Again, the only examples listed in the *OED* come from Shirley's *The Example* (*3*,III.i.321) and *The Doubtful Heir* (*4*,V,iii.347: *soldades*). We have found several more examples in *The Politician* (*5*,III.i.124) and in the original Spanish spelling in *The Young Admiral* (*3*,V.iv.180).

5.2. Hand granado

"An explosive missile, smaller than a bombshell, thrown by hand" (*OED*). This term can be read in *Honoria and Mammon*:

> *Dash.* [...] Heaven protect *my pia mater*!
> I did but peep out of the garret, and
> One solder swore a huge *granado* at me. (*6*,IV.iii.63)
>
> *Serjeant.* [*pointing at a bottle of wine*] Are not these
> pretty *hand granado's*, gentlemen? (*6*,V.i.68)

Although the modern orthography is *hand grenade* and the etymology is no doubt French, the endings *-o*, *-oes* and the fact that many contemporary spellings of the city of Granada and of Fray Luis de Granada's surname was Granado(es) hints at a Spanish cognate which was frequent at the time as a consequence of the influx of Spanish texts on military art.

5.3. Murrian (morrión)

An allusion to a Spanish soldier's helmet is made by the fool Didimo (*The Young Admiral*) in his excitement, when he has been tricked into believing that he is invulnerable to bullets:

> *Didimo.* Thy whole body, triumphant, my Rosicleer, and
> live to make nations stand a tiptoe to hear thy brave
> adventures; thy head shall be enchanted, and have a
> proof beyond thy musty *murrian* [...] (*3*,III.i.128).

5.4. Toledos and bilbos

Two types of swords are mentioned in Shirley's dramatic work: *toledos* and *bilbos*. They refer to the excellent steel and manufacturing with which the swords of these two cities were made. *Toledo* appears in two works:

> *Sforza. Safe, armies, guard!*— Berinthia, you're a lady, but
> I mean not to court you.— Guard, quotha! here is a
> *Toledo* and an old arm,...
> (*The Maid's Revenge*, *1,*IV.i.157)
> *Re-enter don Pedro*]
> *Pedro.* The storm is over, sure; I hear no noise.
> *Toledos* are asleep.—Jacinta! I found my love [here]?
> (*The Brothers* (*1,*V.iii.269)

In *A Contention for Honour and Riches* an allusion is made to a sword from Bilbao, which though less widespread than *toledoes,* was also a metonymy of an excellent sword:

> *Riches*. [...] you wear a gown,
> Emblem of peace; will you defile your gravity
> With basket-hilt and *bilboe*. (*6,*iii.309)

6. Urban Space: *Plassa* (plaça, plaza)

As regards the landscape, only a very popular element of the urban space appears, specifically concerning Shirley's most Spanish play, *The Brothers*:

> *Carlos.* [...] and the free access you've had to
> My house (which still is open to wise guests),
> Betray me, or my daughter, to the mirth
> And talk of men i' the *plassa*. (*1,*I.i.194)

The concept and the word were known from as early as 1599 in travelogues (Hakluyt's *The Principal Navigations, Voyages and Discoveries of the English Nation*) and translations (James Mabbe's *The Rogue: or The Life of Guzman de Alfarache*) to refer to specific squares either in the Peninsula or in America, but its first literary appearance with a general

meaning of the word and with the present standardized spelling with *-ss-* is Shirley's.

7. Conclusion

James Shirley is undoubtedly the pre-Restauration author most clearly bound to Spain. This can be seen from both a literary perspective as the textual proof by the trickle of critical works starting with Stiefel in 1890 show, and from a cultural one through the many elements of symbolic culture present in his dramatic and poetical output. His biography is also bound to the circle of Hispanophiles and Catholics frequenting the Court and Queen Henrietta Maria's French entourage, including Endymion Porter, Thomas Stanley, Sir Kenelm Digby, and the Earl of Newcastle, among others. It is probably from them that Shirley took notice of Spanish things, pieces of language and plots. It has even been suggested that he may have visited the Continent for a short while. As for his knowledge of Spanish, it is inferior to his French, with which he mixed it up.[13]

Considering all the above, the present analysis suggests that, through the items presented here, Shirley does prove to be particularly distinctive or knowledgeable about Spanish material culture in comparison to other contemporary authors. Thus, most of the items included in this article can also be found in works by Shakespeare, Ben Jonson, or Beaumont-Fletcher, as a cursory but careful search in the EEBO shows.[14] Indeed, Shirley's knowledge of the items analysed was average or even under average in comparison with Shakespeare, Beaumont-Fletcher, Jonson, and unspecific texts which mention *sack*,[15] *canary* (8-4-3-489 mentions in EBBO respectively), *malmsey* (1-1-2-10-349), *fico* (2-0-1-5-61), *ollepodredos / olio* (2-2-2-0-30), *carbonado* (1-4-1-1-93), *ducats* (7-1-2-45-570), *in quirpo* (3-9-6-0-52), *chopinoes* (1-0-1-1-33), *Spanish gloves* (1-1-1-3-23), *mustachios* (1-0-2-2-39), *tooth-pick* (3-0-2-3-42), *murrian* (1-0-0-2-92), *toledos* (2-0-7-3-20), and *bilbos* (1-0-1-5-60). He was, however, slightly above average in his comprehension of the words *soldade(s)* (4-1-2-0-42), *perpetuana* (1-0-1-0-29); and overtly above average in his understanding of the terms *regallias* (1-0-0-0-13), *oringado* (1-0-0-0-3), *doblon* (*d'oro*) (1-0-0-0-4), *maravides / marvedie* (2-0-0-0-13), *Spanish garbe* (1-0-0-0-6), *Spanish cape* (2-0-0-0-10), *quellios* (1-0-0-0-2), *calli-mancho* (1-0-0-0-1), *muger umbrada* (1-0-0-0-1), *hand granado(es)* (2-0-

0-0-18), and *plassa* (1-0-0-0-10), considering that there are no examples of their use by all the other playwrights. Especially conspicuous terms are *calli-mancho* and *muger umbrada*, since Shirley's appear to be the only instance recorded in the whole search.

The association of certain rarely occurring terms with plays set in the Iberian Peninsula (*doblon* in *The Brothers* and *The Court Secret*; *plassa* in *The Brothers*) may account for the singularity of these items as well as their belated production. But this is not a general rule, since the plays with these last two more exceptional terms, *The Wedding* for *calli-mancho* and *The Humorous Courtier* for *muger umbrada,* are dated 1627 and 1631, respectively. However, whilst there are clear precedents and later use of the term *calli-mancho*, *muger umbrada* is the only case possibly registered in the English language of this Spanish phrase and hints at an early connection of Shirley with Iberian culture.

As regards the attitude of Shirley towards Spanish material culture, we can say that it is ambivalent depending on its dramatic use. Thus, the items of Spanish fashion are used both to reflect outmodedness to the advantage of the new French one and as an index of the ridiculous pedantry of Shirley's fops. These fops are likewise ridiculed through their affected use of both French and Spanish. Toothpicks are also used to present the prototype of the Spaniards as reserved and Machiavellian. Wine and food, however, are contemplated in a positive view underscoring their excellence and daintiness, the only exception being the occasional submission to the cliché of the Spanish or Italian figs. Coins, of course, reflect the strength of the Spanish currency (sometimes supplemented with references to America or Peru) in the European monetary system. And as for the military, it is linked to the still high reputation of Spanish arms and the aristocratic bias of Shirley.

Our final conclusion is that, if individually considered, these elements of Spanish material culture do not make of Shirley a distinct Hispanophile. However, their joint use in his works set him apart as clearly connected to Spanish culture, as shown through a consistent ampleness of symbolic elements, the proven influence of Spanish sources in his work and his otherwise general, though nuanced, empathy towards all things Spanish.

Notes

[1] As stated by Tilley, "[s]uch an intellectual field of study is inevitably eclectic: relatively unbounded and unconstrained, fluid, dispersed and anarchic rather than constricted" (Tilley 1). For further definitions, and an extensive summary of the concept and problems concerning material culture, see Tilley et al. (1-4), Morphy (453-456), Parezo (747-752) and Ralph M. Besse Library.

[2] For the continuity of the wine trade by the English merchants, either under a false identity or as a clandestine activity, see Monterrey (135-137).

[3] The other occurrences of *sack* in Shirley's plays not mentioned above or below are *The Brothers*, 1,V,iii,264; *Changes or Love in a Maze*, 2,I,ii,283, 2,ll,ii,298, 2,III,i,308, 2,IV,ii,333; *Hyde Park*, 2,III,i,501, 2,IV,iii,516; *The Gamester*, 3,I,i,198; *The Example*, 3,ll,i,290, 3,II,i,302; *The Lady of Pleasure*, 4,I,i,15, 4,I,i,16, 4,I,ii,20, 4,II,i,29, 4,III,ii,59, 4,IV,i.66, 4,V,i,83, 4,I,i,89; *The Royal Master*, 4,III,iii,146; *The Constant Maid*, 4,II.i,462, 4,II.i,465 (twice), 4,II.i,466, 4,IV,iii,504, 4,V,ii,515; *The Court Secret*, 5,V,i,49; *A Contention for Honour and Riches*, 6, p. 295.

[4] Except when otherwise indicated, all the quotes from the works of Shirley refer to the Gifford and Dyce 1833 edition with the following nomenclature Volume, Act, Scene, Page(s). However, all the terms indicating Spanish material culture have been inserted both in headings and in the quotes with the original spelling (except for capitalization) from the earliest editions of Shirley's works.

[5] For the influence of Spanish fashion in France, Italy, The Netherlands, Central Europe, and Sweden, see the indispensable *Vestir a la española en las cortes europeas (siglos XVI y XVII)*. As far as England is concerned, see Maria Hayward (11-36), Lesley Ellis Miller (293-315), and Aileen Ribeiro (317-339) in volume II.

[6] For the subsiding Spanish fashion of black and austere dressing and its replacement in the English taste for the lighter, more colourful and easy-going French fashion, see Aileen Ribeiro (332-333), who quotes this very passage of *The Lady of Pleasure*.

[7] For a complete account see Beck (especially Chapters V and XII), Smith, and Colomer and Delgado Vols. I and II (*passim*).

[8] Justice Landby's response could not be more appropriate, as it is relevant in each of the three possible senses of the word "stuff": 1. matter of thought; 2. textile fabric; 3. worthless ideas, discourse, or

writing; nonsense, rubbish (*OED*). On the other hand, the pun on "calli-mancho" refers to sense 2a of the word *calamanco* in the *OED* as "language", providing a quote from John Lyly in *Midas* (1592): "Doest thou not understand their [huntsmen's] language? *Min*. Not I! *Pet*. Tis the best calamance in the world, as easily deciphered as the characters in a nutmeg" (*OED*). As early as 1608 the word was related with Spaniards as the famous sentence recorded in the *OED* of Thomas Dekker and John Webster, shows: "A Spaniard is a Camocho, a Callimanco, nay which is worse, a Dondego..."

[9] Some etymological dictionaries acknowledged, however, that the modern word, as introduced in the 1550s, had either the Italian *mostacchi* or the Spanish *mostacho* as their ancestor (*Online Etymology Dictionary*).

[10] Here follows a string of broken Spanish: "Par les santos sennor – / Lo conosco por cierto -- / porque es Trabajo (con licenzia di vuestra alteza) / Habla muchas palabras -- no puedo en veridad --"

[11] Shirley mentions toothpicks in three more plays with a non-Spanish connection: *The Grateful Servant*, 2.III.i.43, *The Ball*, 3.I.i.10, and *The Constant Maid*, 4.III.ii.483, all instances denoting stately countenance.

[12] For the translative interest of the English for the military lore of Spaniards and their conquest of America, see the translation of Spanish (and Portuguese) books of military treatises such as those by Francisco de la Vega, Sancho de Londoño, Gutiérrez de la Vega, Bernardino de Mendoza, Francisco de Valdés, and Lopes de Castanheda, see Brown (lxi-lxviii), Ungerer (*Anglo-Spanish Relations*, Part II, Section I, 60-67), and incidentally Fuchs (16-26).

[13] For the textual presence of Spain in the works of James Shirley, see Stiefel ("Die Nachahmung spanischer Komödien" and "Die Nachahmung spanischer Komödien III"), Bas (113-164), and García García (*Presencia textual de España*, "The Motif of the Reluctance," "A Caroline View," and "*The Royal Master*"). For a brief summary of Shirley's unlikely sojourn in Spain, see García García (*Presencia textual de España* 166). About Shirley's hispanophile circle, including Thomas Stanley and Endymion Porter, see Burner.

[14] This comparison among dramatists and the unspecific texts is restricted to the period between 1562-1666. Variants in spelling have been duly taken into account.

[15] There are so many references in English literature of the period of the time that it seems unnecessary to compare Shirley's occurrences (35) with other playwrights.

Works Cited

Anonymous. "The Dramatic Works and Poems of James Shirley." *The Quarterly Review*, vol. 49, 1833, pp. 1-29.

Bas, Georges. *James Shirley, 1596-1666: dramaturge caroléen*. Lille. PhD thesis, Université de Paris, 1973.

Beck, S. William. *Gloves. Their Annals and Associations. A Chapter of Trade and Social History*. Hamilton, Adams & Co., 1883.

Brown, Paul. *An Edition of Don Bernardino de Mendoza's Theorique and practice of warre: Sir Edward Hoby's 1597 Translation*. PhD diss., Arizona State University, 1974.

Burner, S. A. *James Shirley: A Study of Literary Coteries and Patronage in Seventeenth-Century England*. UP of America, 1988.

Campillo Arnaiz, Laura. "La traducción histórica de los vinos españoles en las obras de Shakespeare." *1611, Revista de historia de la traducción*, vol. 11, 2017. http://www.traduccionliteraria.org/1611/art/campillo.htm. Accessed 5th May 2024.

Colomer, José Luis, and Amalia Descalzo, editors. *Vestir a la española en las cortes europeas (siglos XVI y XVII)*, 2 vols. Centro de Estudios Europa Hispánica (CEEH), 2014.

Classe, Francis. "Chapines." *Chopine, Zoccolo, and Other Raised and High Heel Construction*. Blogspot https://aands.org/raisedheels/Heeldoc/written.php. Accessed 8th May 2024.

DeMello, Margo. *Feet and Footwear: A Cultural Encyclopedia*. Bloomsbury Academic, 2009.

Diccionario de Autoridades. Real Academia Española. 1726-1739. https://apps2.rae.es/DA.html. Accessed 5th May 2024.

DRAE: *Diccionario de la Real Academia, edición del Tricentenario en línea. Edición 2023*. https://dle.rae.es/diccionario. Accessed 5th May 2024.

Duque, Pedro Juan. "Shakespeare y el vino español." *Arbor, Revista General de Investigación y Cultura*, vol. 425, 1981, pp. 109-120.

Duque, Pedro Juan. *España en Shakespeare*. Departamento de Publicaciones de la Universidad de Deusto / Universidad de León, 1991.

EEBO: Early English Books Online. https://www.proquest.com/eebo/literature/fromDatabasesLayer?accountid=14555&accountid=14555. Accessed 5th May 2024.

Earenfight, Theresa. "The Shoes of an Infanta: Bringing the Sensuous, Not Sensible, "Spanish Style" of Catherine of Aragon to Tudor England." *Moving Women Moving Objects (400–1500)*, edited by Tracy Chapman Hamilton and Mariah Proctor-Tiffany, Brill, 2019, pp. 293-317.

Forsythe, Robert Stanley. *The Relation of Shirley's Plays to the Elizabethan Drama*. Columbia University Studies in English and Comparative Literature, 1914.

Fuchs, Barbara. *The Poetics of Piracy: Emulating Spain in English Literature*. U Pennsylvania P, 2013.

García García, Luciano. *Presencia textual de España y de la literatura española en la obra dramática de James Shirley (1596-1666)*, 1998. PhD thesis, Universidad de Jáen, 1998. Available at RUJA: Repositorio Institucional de Producción Científica.

García García, Luciano. "The Motif of the Reluctance to See the King in Lope de Vega's *El villano en su rincón* and James Shirley's *The Royal Master*". *The Review of English Studies*, vol. 54, 2003, pp. 365-385.

García García, Luciano. "A Caroline View of Spaniards and Portuguese on the Stage: The Dramatic Representation of Iberia in James Shirley (1596-1666)." *Revista Canaria de Estudios Ingleses*, vol. 54, 2007, pp. 37-53.

García García, Luciano. "*The Royal Master* and *El villano en su rincón* Revisited: More than the Motif of the Reluctance to See the King." *Miscelánea: A Journal of English and American Studies*, vol. 68, 2023, pp. 105-122.

Gifford, William and Alexander Dyce. *The Dramatic Works and Poems of James Shirley*, with notes by William Gifford, Esq. and additional notes account of Shirley and his writings by the Rev. Alexander Dyce, 6 vols. John Murray, 1833.

Gosse, Edmund. *The Best Plays of the Old Dramatist. James Shirley*. Vizetelly & Co., 1888.

Guarino, Gabriel. "Modas españolas y leyes suntuarias en la Italia de los Austrias." *Vestir a la española en las cortes europeas (siglos XVI y XVII)*, edited by José Luis Colomer and Amalia Descalzo, vol. I, 2014, pp. 233-250.

Hayward, Maria. "¿Infanta española o reina de Inglaterra? Imagen, identidad e influencia de Catalina de Aragón en las cortes de Enrique VII y Enrique VIII." *Vestir a la española en las cortes*

europeas (siglos XVI y XVII), edited by José Luis Colomer and Amalia Descalzo, vol. II, 2014, pp. 11-36.

Kipling, Gordon, editor. *The Receyt of the Ladye Kateryne*. Oxford UP, 1990.

Lamb, Charles. *Specimens of the English Dramatic Poets, who Lived about the Time of Shakespeare*. John Putnam, 1851.

Leal Cruz, Pedro Nolasco. "El término Canary en inglés. Análisis del uso de Canary, sack y malmsey en William Shakespeare." *Anuario de estudios atlánticos*, no. 61, 2015, pp. 1-12.

Markham, Gervase. *The English Housewife*, edited by M. Best. McGill-Queen's UP, 1986 (1615).

Miller, Lesley Ellis. "Un ilustre caballero inglés vestido a la española: la visita del príncipe de Gales a Madrid en 1623." *Vestir a la española en las cortes europeas (siglos XVI y XVII)*, edited by José Luis Colomer and Amalia Descalzo, vol. II, 2014, pp. 293-315.

Monterrey Rodríguez, José Tomás. "Thomas Lodge's Rosalynde and the Canary Islands." *Yearbook of the Spanish and Portuguese Society for English Renaissance Studies*, vol. 17, 2007, pp. 131-142.

OED. *Oxford English Dictionary*, s.v. March 2024, https://doi.org/10.1093/OED/8024681020. Accessed 5th May 2024.

Morillo, Marvin, editor. *James Shirley's The Humorous Courtier.* Garland Publishing Inc. Annotated edition, 1979.

Morphy, Howard. "Material Culture." *Routledge Encyclopedia of Social and Cultural Anthropology*, edited by Alan J. Barnard and Jonathan Spencer, Routledge, 2010, 2nd edition, 453-456.

Parezo, Nancy J. "Material Culture." *Encyclopedia of Cultural Anthropology*, edited by David Levinson and Melvin Ember, vol. 3. Henry Holt and Company, 1996, 747-752.

Petrosky Henry. *The Toothpick. Technology and Culture*. Vintage Books, 2007.

Phillips, Carla Rahn. "The Spanish Wool Trade, 1500-1780." *The Journal of Economic History*, vol. 42, no. 4, 1982, pp. 775-795.

Phillips, Carla Rahn. *Spain's Golden Fleece: Wool Production and the Wool Trade from the Middle Ages to the Nineteenth Century*. Johns Hopkins UP, 1997.

Ralph M. Besse Library. https://libraryguides.ursuline.edu/material. Accessed 13th April 2024.

Ribeiro, Aileen. "Una historia de orgullo y prejuicio: percepciones de España y del traje español en la Inglaterra del siglo XVII." *Vestir a*

la española en las cortes europeas (siglos XVI y XVII), edited by José Luis Colomer and Amalia Descalzo, vol. II, 2014, pp. 317-319.

Robinson, Jancin, editor. *The Oxford Companion to Wine*. Oxford UP, 2015, 4th edition (first edition 1995).

Seymour-Smith, Charlotte. *Macmillan Dictionary of Anthropology*. Macmillan Press, 1986.

Stiefel, Arthur Ludwig. "Die Nachahmung spanischer Komödien in England unter der ersten Stuarts." *Romanische Forschungen*, vol. 5, 1890, pp. 193-220.

Stiefel, Arthur Ludwig. "Die Nachahmung spanischer Komödien in England unter der ersten Stuarts III". *Archiv für das Studium der Neueren Sprachen*, vol. 61, CXIX Band, 1907, pp. 309-350.

Thirsk, Joan. *Food in Early Modern England: Phases, Fads and Fashions 1500-1760*. Hambledon Continuum, 2007.

Tilley, Chris, Webb Keane, Susanne Kuechler, Mike Rowlands, and Patricia Spyer. *Handbook of Material Culture*. SAGE Publications Ltd., 2006.

Underhill, John Garrett. *Spanish Literature in the England of the Tudors*. Macmillan, 1899.

Ungerer, Gustav. *Anglo-Spanish Relations in Tudor Literature*. AMS, 1972 (Reprint of the original 1956, Bern: Francke edition).

Ungerer, Gustav. "The Printing of Spanish Books in Elizabethan England." *The Library*, vol. 20, no. 3, 1965, pp. 177-229.

Venner, Tobias. *Via Recta ad Vitam Longam... As Also an Accurate Treatise Concerning Tobacco*. Henry Hood, 1620.

Received / Recibido: 22/1/2024 *Accepted / Aceptado: 2/7/2024*

An Approach to Transtextuality in Kate Morton's *The Forgotten Garden*: Traces of Victorian Novels, Gothic Fiction, Fairy Tales, and Classical Myths

Marta Miquel-Baldellou (marta.miquel@udl.cat)
Universitat de Lleida

Abstract: Drawing on Gérard Genette's inclusive notion of transtextuality—which comprises typologies like intertextuality, architextuality, metatextuality, and hypertextuality—this article approaches Kate Morton's novel *The Forgotten Garden* (2008) as illustrative of different instances of these textual connections. In particular, as an author, Morton has acknowledged that Victorian novels and Gothic narratives, along with fairy tales and classical myths, have exerted significant influence on her works. Insofar as Morton's novels display postmodern features as neo-Victorian Gothic textualities, which aim to revisit and portray the past from a contemporary perspective, this article will identify and analyse instances of transtextuality and its different variants in Morton's novel with regard to the aforementioned four genres in order to prove how the author often resorts to them to create her novels, which become paradigmatic of the notion of transtextuality.
Keywords: transtextuality, postmodernism, neo-Victorianism, comparative literature, metafiction.

Una aproximación a la transtextualidad en *El jardín olvidado* de Kate Morton: rastros de novelas victorianas, ficción gótica, cuentos de hadas y mitos clásicos

Resumen: En base a la noción inclusiva de transtextualidad de Gérard Genette—que comprende tipologías como intertextualidad, architextualidad, metatextualidad e hipertextualidad—este artículo se aproxima a la novela *El jardín olvidado* (2008) de Kate Morton como ilustrativa de diferentes muestras de estas conexiones textuales. En concreto, como autora, Morton ha reconocido que la novela victoriana y las narraciones góticas, junto con los cuentos infantiles y los mitos clásicos, han ejercido una influencia significativa en su obra. Puesto que las novelas de Morton muestran características posmodernas como textualidades góticas neovictorianas, que pretenden revisitar y transformar el pasado desde una perspectiva contemporánea, este artículo identificará y analizará muestras de transtextualidad y sus diferentes variantes en la novela de Morton con relación a los cuatro géneros mencionados, para probar que la autora a menudo recurre a ellos para crear sus obras, las cuales resultan paradigmáticas de la noción de transtextualidad.
Palabras clave: transtextualidad, posmodernismo, neovictorianismo, literatura comparada, metaficción.

1. Introduction

Upon the publication of her second novel *The Forgotten Garden* (2008), Kate Morton already put forward some of the influences that

inspired her to write the book. In an interview, she unveiled that one of the main female characters in the narrative is a Victorian woman writer of fairy tales, that the plot is suffused with dark secrets and uncanny mysteries, and that it is a story that conveys the origins of identity through a journey of self-discovery, thus evoking classical myths (Book Browsers, n.p.). Besides, when she refers to the kind of novels that she usually writes, in the same interview, Morton acknowledges that her books "have similarities to Victorian novels," she reveals her fondness for collecting "illustrations from children's picture books," she admits the fact that she has "always loved Gothic novels," and she also refers to her "long, multilayered novels […] set partly […] in the past, with secrets and mysteries at their core," which often acquire mythical dimensions. As a result of these diverse influences, Morton finally claims that she resorts to such an "eclectic mix of ideas" that she is not exactly sure what genre she writes. In this respect, Ana-Maria Parasca aptly argues that "Morton's writings play on circularity, blanks and fragmentation, in such a way that assembling all pieces together will not only reveal some secrets but will also find the way out of the labyrinth" (245). As a case in point, Morton's novel *The Forgotten Garden* is illustrative of an amalgamation of textual references which is also reflected in its multifaceted narratives involving three main female characters within the same family.

As its plot unfolds, Morton's novel revolves around Nell, an older woman from Brisbane, Australia, who was adopted in 1913, when she was four years of age. In 1975, following her father's death, Nell discovers that her origins are related to a fairytale book written by the Victorian author Eliza Makepeace, which urges Nell to travel to Tregenna, in Cornwall, although her quest is interrupted when she must take care of her granddaughter Cassandra. In 2005, after Nell's death, Cassandra decides to follow in her grandmother's footsteps and travel to Cornwall to unravel her family origins. Accordingly, Morton's novel evokes the Victorian past, since, on her grandmother's death, Cassandra comes into an unexpected inheritance, Cliff Cottage, which is located on the Cornish coast and leads her to retrieve her family origins, discovering ultimately that they are deeply rooted in Victorian England. Cassandra's inheritance also comprises her great-grandmother Eliza Makepeace's book of fairy tales, as she became a renowned writer of children's stories. Besides, as Nell and Cassandra retrace their past, they

must recollect the dark secrets befalling Eliza's relatives, involving the doomed Mountrachet family, who dwelled in the Blackhurst Manor, thus disentangling a Gothic narrative full of uncanny mysteries. Finally, as Cassandra discovers that her grandmother Nell had been abandoned on a ship heading for Australia and that her true origins were revealed to her on her twenty-first birthday, Nell's journey of self-discovery is also evocative of passages in classical myths. It can thus be argued that Morton's novel *The Forgotten Garden* arises as a transtextual novel, since it presents different degrees of transtextuality or textual transcendence, to use Gérard Genette's term, with Victorian novels, Gothic fiction, fairy tales, and classical myths.

Drawing on Mikhail Bakhtin's notions of dialogism, Julia Kristeva considers the concept of intertextuality as "a mosaic of quotations," claiming that "any text is the absorption and transformation of another" (37). Subsequently, Genette draws on Kristeva's notion of intertextuality to envision it within the more inclusive concept of transtextuality, and instead, he focuses on intertextuality to refer to allusions from one text to another. In comparison, drawing on Genette's broad notion of transtextuality—which involves "all that sets the text in a relationship, whether obvious or concealed, with other texts" (*The Architext* 83)—Morton's novel presents pervasive transtextual analogies concerning narratological features with diverse narratives. In relation to some Victorian textualities, Morton's novel displays a series of intertextualities, which consist of echoes, quotations, allusions, and parallelisms with Victorian texts. Besides, drawing on Genette's notion of architextuality, which involves the presence of features that lead to the designation of a text as belonging to a particular genre, Morton's novel encompasses as series of traits that typify it as a Gothic narrative. Genette's categorisation of transtextuality also comprises the notion of metatextuality, which involves making critical commentaries on previous textualities and displaying self-reflexive qualities, as also happens in Morton's novel, in which one of the protagonists is a teller of fairy tales whose plots find reflection in her life and reveal evocative parallelisms with classic children's stories. Additionally, Genette also refers to the concept of hypertextuality in his classification of different variants of transtextuality, stating that hypertextuality may be defined as "any relationship uniting a text" known as hypertext "to an earlier text" identified as hypotext (*Palimpsests* 5). In Morton's

novel, given its multilayered plots and journeys of self-discovery, there are also passages that bear resemblance with classical myths, which are hypertextually transformed in the novel. More recently, in relation to Genette's categorisation of transtextuality, within the framework of postmodernism, Linda Hutcheon refers to the concept of adaptation in its different meanings, which involve "an acknowledged transposition of a recognisable other work," "a creative and interpretive act of appropriation," or "an extended intertextual engagement with the adapted work" (8). In analogy with Genette's classification, this gradation from a more faithful to a less obvious adaptation of a previous work, thus from intertextuality or direct reference to hypertextuality or transformation, finds correlation in Morton's novel as including examples of these categories in the different influences that it reveals throughout its pages.

Drawing on Genette's broad notion of transtextuality—and given its different typologies comprising intertextuality, architextuality, metatextuality, and hypertextuality—this article aims to approach Morton's novel *The Forgotten Garden* in order to retrace the influences that Victorian novels, Gothic fiction, fairy tales and classical myths exert on the different narratives comprised in its plotlines involving the three main female characters. This transtextual analysis will pave the way to claim that Morton's novel can be described as a contemporary text that contains influences from these four literary genres as sources that allow the author to revisit past narratives and transform them in her novels. Besides, it will be argued that these four genre typologies are evoked in Morton's novel through instances that respond to different degrees of transtextuality, ranging from explicit reference to subtle transformation. Finally, this analysis will also prove that Morton's novel arises as a self-reflexive text that acknowledges the textualities that have influenced the author to write historical fiction with Victorian references, gothic tropes, fairy-tale narratological components, and imagery pertaining to classical myths.

2. Retracing Victorian novels: intertextual references

Although Morton's *The Forgotten Garden* is a contemporary novel, its pervasive interest in reviving the Victorian period evinces that it presents traits pertaining to neo-Victorian fiction, which concerns itself with the

paradox of resurrecting a historical period from a present perspective. Dana Shiller was one of the first theorists to refer to the neo-Victorian novel as emerging in the context of postmodernism, since it casts doubt on actual knowledge about the past, thus resulting in nostalgia and the blurring between historical referents and self-reflexive textualities (538). In Morton's novel, given the fact that Nell and Cassandra own an antiques shop, after her grandmother's death, Cassandra recollects that Nell loved "books written at the end of the nineteenth-century—late Victorian with glorious printed texts and black and white illustrations" (89), hence revealing Nell's fascination with the Victorian past, which inevitably connects her with her mother Eliza and exerts a haunting influence on her and, later on, on her granddaughter Cassandra as well.

Regarding the nostalgic revival of Victorianism, Christine Krueger envisions the Victorian legacy as both "an intrinsic part of who we are and an alien other […] from which we still may have much to learn" (xii). Conversely, Simon Joyce argues that we never really encounter the Victorians, but a mediated image in resemblance with the reflection in a rearview mirror (3). This paradox is explicitly tackled in Morton's novel, since the Victorian past emerges and impinges on the present of Nell and Cassandra as they try to shed light on their respective fragmented identities. Nell's biological mother, Eliza Makepeace, lived during the Victorian period in England and Cornwall and, as Cassandra reads Nell's notebooks about Eliza, the youngest member in the family becomes acquainted with Victorian times. Theorists Rosario Arias and Patricia Pulham have resorted to tropes that metaphorically regard the Victorian past as a spectre that haunts us, in the same way as John Kucich and Dianne Sadoff also consider neo-Victorian textualities as "ghostly forms of the past in fictional pastiche" (xxiv). In this respect, as Cassandra moves to London following in Nell's footsteps, and by extension, Eliza's, she discovers that London is a city with "mist-filled streets and looming horses, glowing lamps that materialised, then vanished again into the fog-laden haze" (157), hence bringing back the haunting Victorian past in contemporary times.

Additionally, Cora Kaplan underscores the aesthetic pleasure involved in invoking the Victorian past, which is often tinged with a feeling of unease that recalls the dilemma between familiarity and strangeness (11). As a symbolic trope of perpetuation through time,

before Cassandra eventually finds Eliza's Victorian mourning brooch buried in the cottage garden in Cornwall, it is unveiled that Eliza's mother, Georgiana, gave it to her daughter as a valuable symbolic gift that "reminds us of those we've lost" and "those who came before and made us who we are" (147), thus blurring the boundaries between past and present. As Ann Heilmann and Mark Llewellyn claim, postmodern novels that seek to evoke Victorian texts offer "a revival of previous literature repackaged and rebranded for a contemporary audience to provide them with an alternate view of the original literature" (3-5). As a case in point, in Morton's novel, it is stated that "Rose Mountrachet at 18 was fair indeed: white skin, a cloud of dark hair swept back in a loose braid, and the full bosom so fashionable in the period," which contrasts with Cassandra's contemporary perspective of the Victorian ideal of womanhood, as she imagines Rose as a "a girl who'd spent her entire childhood imprisoned by ill-health" (318). Nonetheless, a series of intertextual references to Victorian works give further emphasis to a pervasive sense of nostalgia that seeks to retrieve the Victorian past.

In Morton's novel, through her childhood memories, Nell recollects an early passage in which she pictures herself clutching a tiny white suitcase while waiting for a woman at a harbour, and during one of her visits to her grandmother's house, Cassandra discovers this same suitcase hidden under a quilt. As Cassandra eventually unveils, when Nell was a child, her mother Eliza took her to a harbour in England and told Nell to wait for her, but Eliza never came back. This passage in Morton's novel brings to mind Oscar Wilde's play *The Importance of Being Earnest* (1895), particularly in relation to Lady Bracknell's eventual discovery about the family nursemaid, Miss Prism, who left the manuscript of her novel in a pram, and misplaced the baby in a handbag, which she eventually forgot at Victoria Station. Years later, as happens with Nell in Morton's novel, Jack identifies the handbag which evinces that he is the lost son of Lady Bracknell's late sister and that his real name is Ernest. Correspondingly, in Morton's novel, it is also owing to her subsequently found luggage that it is unveiled that, as a child, Nell got lost in a harbour where Eliza had left her along with a suitcase containing her collection of stories, thus causing Nell's adoption and final discovery that her original name was Ivory. This starting point paves the way for a series of intertextualities with different displays of Victorian fiction and art throughout Morton's novel.

The hazardous life that Eliza and her twin brother Sammy lead as children in the city of London is remindful of many of the orphans in Charles Dickens's novels. When their mother, Georgiana, is rejected by her family owing to her elopement with a sailor, following her death, Eliza and Sammy, are hosted in the house of the Swindells, where Mr Swindell often threatens Eliza, exclaiming that "if she didn't find a way to earn the coins of two, she'd find herself in the workhouse" (207), thus exposing their bleak and despondent childhood as orphans in Victorian England, which was often portrayed in Dickens's novels. Analogously, in *Oliver Twist* (1838), its bereaved protagonist moves to London, where he meets a gang of juvenile pickpockets led by an elderly criminal named Fagin until Oliver discovers the secrets of his parentage and reestablishes ties with his family. In Morton's novel, Eliza and Sammy are also obliged to work for the Swindells and even take part in some unlawful errands, until Eliza is taken back to Blackhurst Manor to live with her uncle Linus and his wife Adeline.

The portrayal of Eliza's youth also presents intertextualities with the heroines in some of the novels of the Brontë sisters. When Eliza moves to Blackhurst Manor, where she lives with her uncle Linus, her aunt Adeline and her cousin Rose, her arrival calls to mind several passages in Charlotte Brontë's novel *Jane Eyre* (1847). At Blackhurst Manor, Eliza catches sight of "a door, thick with glistening red paint" (226), which evokes the red room where Jane is locked by Aunt Reed in Gateshead Hall and triggers her fears as a child. Similarly, Adeline treats her niece Eliza with detachment and never considers her an actual family member, in the same manner as Mrs Reed treats Jane in Brontë's novel, as she excludes her from taking part in the family activities. In addition, as young girls in Blackhurst Manor, Eliza and Rose fantasise about their other cousin, whose existence is kept secret, stating that "they keep her locked upstairs" (312), in a manifest intertextual reference that evokes the presence of Bertha Mason in the attic of Thornfield Hall.

Besides, the relationship established between Rose and Eliza as cousins is highly remindful of that of Cathy and Heathcliff in Emily Brontë's *Wuthering Heights* (1847), particularly insofar as when Rose meets Eliza for the first time, she is initially dressed as a boy, thus stating that Rose's femininity and exquisite manners contrast with Eliza's tomboyish demeanour and unorthodox views in resemblance with the

respective portrayals of Catherine Earnshaw and Heathcliff. Likewise, although Eliza and Rose develop a close relationship, particularly in their youth, they grow gradually apart when Rose becomes engaged to Nathaniel Walker, a wealthy American artist whom she meets in New York, in the same way as, after Heathcliff runs away, Cathy marries Edgar Linton and grows detached from the beloved friend in her youth.

In Morton's novel, the different personalities of Eliza and Rose are often symbolised through artistic manifestations. When the character of William Martin, who knew Eliza in her lifetime, describes her to her daughter Nell, his portrayal of Eliza is closely evocative of Miranda in John William Waterhouse's Pre-Raphaelite painting (1916), since Martin describes Eliza sitting on "that black rock in the cove, looking out to the sea" and with her "red hair […] all the way to her waist" (421). Conversely, in the scrapbook journals that Rose keeps in her youth, she reflects upon the confined condition to which she feels subjected by means of establishing an explicit intertextuality with the central character in Alfred Lord Tennyson's ballad "The Lady of Shalott" (1842), since Rose also feels "cursed to spend eternity in her chamber, forced always to experience the world at one remove" (326). In analogy with the Lady of Shalott—who suffers from a mysterious curse which prevents her from looking directly at the world and must apprehend it instead through its shadows reflected in a mirror—Rose is prevented from leaving her enclosure in her family manor, which turns her into an enfeebled young Victorian woman.

As Rose comes of age, after her betrothal, she feels wary about sexuality because she is mostly unaware of even the basic notions, given the reserve and prudery assigned to women in Victorian times. Rose thus resorts explicitly to Thomas Hardy's novel *Tess of the d'Urbervilles* (1891), stating that she consulted this novel "in the hopes that he [Hardy] might offer some insight into what I might expect when Nathaniel and I are wed" (414). At the time of its publication, Hardy's novel challenged the sexual morals in Victorian England, as it dealt with women's sexuality and motherhood out of wedlock. Rose soon becomes obsessed with becoming a mother, despite her useless efforts, which lead Doctor Matthews to diagnose, from a Victorian mindset, that Rose cannot become pregnant owing to "an unhealthy tendency towards physicality" (479). As Maureen Moran claims, as regards Victorian sexuality, female

passivity was strictly reinforced through religious convictions and medical theories alike (35), which categorised women into either angels of the house or fallen women. When Rose realizes that she cannot bear children, it is her cousin, Eliza, who is asked to lie with Nathaniel and conceive a child out of wedlock, thus turning into a fallen woman according to Victorian prescriptions of sexuality assigned to women.

As shown in Morton's novel, the process of coming of age of young girls in Victorian times often acquired some gothic undertones in relation to sexuality and motherhood. Hence, according to Marie-Luise Kohlke and Christian Gutleben, neo-Victorianism and neo-Gothicism were doomed to converge, given their common revivalist purposes (2), thus revealing a shared generic and ontological kinship (4), which categorises Morton's novel not only as neo-Victorian, but also as pertaining to the genre of the neo-Gothic.

3. Architextual traces of the Gothic: female Gothic, family secrets, doubles

In the context of neo-Gothic narratives, Fred Botting wonders whether an assimilated contemporary version of the Gothic would eclipse the notions of difference and otherness that remain so intrinsic to the Gothic genre (200). Nonetheless, as Julian Wolfreys argues, in neo-Victorian and neo-Gothic texts, "what returns is never simply a repetition," but "a repetition with a difference" (19). Morton's novel is pervasively endowed with instances of architextuality in terms of the literary Gothic tradition. In fact, it complies with representative features often attached to Gothic narratives, as David Stevens puts forward, such as the fascination for the past, the exploration of psychological insights, the stimulation of fear, the portrayal of exotic locations, and the introduction of plots within plots. Particularly, though, Morton's novel, as a postmodern Gothic narrative, mostly focuses on narratives pertaining to the female Gothic, the family as a source of abjection, and the uncanny archetype of the double from a neo-Gothic perspective.

The genre of the female Gothic usually portrays heroines who must face their fears in order to come of age and resolve the mysteries surrounding their identities. As Diana Wallace argues, Ellen Moers coined the term female Gothic to refer to "the work that women writers

have done in the literary mode that, since the eighteenth century, we have called the Gothic" (90). Besides, Moers identifies two different stages of development in the female Gothic, which involve a first phase addressing female concerns in relation to courtship and marriage—finding in Ann Radcliffe's novels its most paradigmatic exponent, in which a young woman is both a persecuted victim and a courageous heroine (91)—and a second phase exploring horrors related to maternity— as is the case of Mary Shelley's seminal novel *Frankenstein* (1818), which Moers defines as a birth myth (92). In narratives illustrative of the female Gothic at its first stage of development, young heroines are threatened with imprisonment in a castle by a male tyrant and must escape through labyrinthine passages and sublime landscapes to find their lost mother. In Morton's novel, *The Forgotten Garden*, the three heroines—Nell, Eliza, and Cassandra— share the absence of a mother figure, which triggers them to initiate a symbolic journey in search for her. In particular, it is Eliza's story which mostly complies with Tania Modleski's depiction of the classic female Gothic (1990), stating that the heroine's progress involves a separation from home, a series of oedipal conflicts, and the primal fear of identifying with the lost mother. In Eliza's story, as a result of the death of her parents, she must leave her parental house and this separation revives oedipal conflicts which find correlation in the appearance of substitute parental figures, who are embodied by the Mountrachets, since, for Eliza, her uncle Linus and her aunt Adelina become her respective wicked father and evil mother. As a Gothic heroine, Eliza symbolically fears that she will face the same fate that befell her mother, Georgiana, until she finds a kind substitute father figure, her lover Nathaniel, who allows her to reconciliate with her father and sever her symbolic ties with her mother, which will allow her to sanction her symbolic process of coming of age.

As regards the second stage of development of the female Gothic, which mostly explores female fears of motherhood, in Morton's novel, it is unveiled that Eliza's cousin, Rose, is unable to bear children as a result of the severe medical treatment that she was prescribed to treat her ill-health when she was a child. Determined to bear a child of her own at all costs, Rose approaches her cousin Eliza and concedes, "my body fails me as it has always done, but yours, Cousin, is strong—I need you to have a child for me, Nathaniel's child" (606). Having crossed the established ethics of morality, as she must lie with Rose's husband, Nathaniel, Eliza

gives birth to Ivory, who will eventually be left to face her own fate as a child, and her identity will remain unknown even for herself, as Nell will not learn about her true origins, and her original name as Ivory, until much later in her life. As a result of an unorthodox way of conceiving a child, Ivory's birth brings disgrace to the Mountrachet family, as also happens with Victor Frankenstein's progeny, who unleashes a curse on his family.

As a Gothic text, *The Forgotten Garden* also tackles female fears about the family, since women pertaining to different generations gradually unravel family secrets, incestuous relationships, and ancient curses which condition their female identities. In resemblance with the Gothic tradition and the decadent genealogies of its narratives, as is the case of Edgar Allan Poe's tale "The Fall of the House of Usher" (1839), in Morton's novel, the Mountrachet family is also haunted by events that conjure the Kristevan notion of abjection, which disturbs the established boundaries of the self, mainly through incest. As Kristeva contends, the source of abjection is "what disturbs identity, system, order" along with "what does not respect borders, positions, rules," hence it consists of "the in-between, the ambiguous, the composite" (4). Linus displays an incestuous infatuation with his sister Georgiana, and when Georgiana's daughter, Eliza, comes to live at Blackhurst Manor, Linus resumes his fantasies of recovering his Georgiana by means of his niece, stating that, "he'd been too late to recover his Georgiana, but through this girl she would be returned" (530). In the Gothic tradition, narratives often refer to a curse, befalling family lineages, resulting from the sins committed by their ancestors.

In Morton's novel, Adeline dies with her "face all contorted so that she looked to be grinning like a ghoul" (588), and Linus "went queer by all accounts" (588), thus bringing to the fore the motif of the house haunted by repressed family secrets. In Gothic fiction, the house becomes an extension of the family, while its locked rooms suggest the secrets of their dwellers, thus involving a symbiotic relationship between the building and the family, as is the case with Roderick and Madeline Usher in Poe's seminal tale about their manor, which also bears the family name. Analogously, when Eliza arrives at Blackhurst Manor for the first time, she notices that the building is "shrouded in dark mist, with tall trees and branches laced together behind it" (222-3), thus displaying a

symbolically discomforting atmosphere as nature holds dominion over the house. Inasmuch as Blackhurst Manor is deeply associated with the Mountrachet family, it also reflects the curse haunting its dwellers. Rose's husband, Nathaniel Walker, who is a reputed painter, describes the family manor as "the house of the dead" (473) owing to the synergetic relationship between the decadent abode and its tormented residents. There are also forbidden places that are associated with certain family members and their alleged sins. Adeline gives orders to build a wall that separates the manor from the cottage where Eliza is confined so that her pregnancy is never disclosed. All these forbidden places, particularly Eliza's cottage and the garden surrounding it, are considered haunted by ghosts years later, even though they are truly haunted by secrets from the past that await to be divulged.

In addition to the female Gothic and family secrets, the narratives involving the three main female characters in the novel also engage in architextuality with the archetype of the double, which often pervades Gothic narratives. According to Otto Rank, the terror of the double lies in "a wish-defence against a dreaded external destruction" (86), which involves protection against impending death, but also evinces the individual's approaching dissolution. As children, Eliza and Sammy roam along the streets of London at night playing a game in which each of them is assigned a role, thus reinforcing the dual identities between them as doubles. Besides, Eliza and Sammy are recurrently portrayed as double figures, stating that, "they were twins, it was little surprise that they should look so similar" (171), and in an uncanny scene, which brings to the fore Eliza's repressed self, following Sammy's tragic death, Eliza looks at herself disguised as a boy in the mirror, and it is stated that, "she smiled very slightly, and Sammy smiled back at her," while she touches "the cold glass of the mirror no longer alone" (171). In the following generation, when Eliza is summoned to the family manor, she finds in her cousin Rose her missing double to the extent that the symbolic bonds established between both female characters are elicited through their reflections in window glasses. After Sammy's tragic death, Rose arises as Eliza's missing double, hence developing a strong bond between them, since, drawing on Freudian premises, "the uncanny proceeds from something familiar which has been repressed" (247). Upon her arrival, Eliza notices someone is looking at her from above, as is described that, "Eliza moved closer to the window to get a better

look, but when she did the face was gone" (223), thus establishing a close bond between them from the start. Correspondingly, in the following generation, Nell admits that "a peculiar sense of duality, not unwelcome, followed her all the way" (304), particularly as she retraces her origins, and her past blends in the present. Nonetheless, Nell mostly feels a sense of doubleness in relation to her granddaughter Cassandra, since, despite their age difference, it is often conceded that Nell acts younger, whereas Cassandra acts older, thus establishing a symbolic connection between them in terms of age.

Morton's novel thus reverts to the Gothic tradition through the inclusion of narratological elements pertaining to the female Gothic, the pivotal role of the family as embodied by the manor house and its abject secrets, and the archetype of the double as indicative of the uncanny and repressed selves. According to Sarah Maier and Brenda Ayres, neo-Gothic narratives, which evoke past textualities, have the purpose of appeasing a sense of nostalgia, but also of correcting the past through retrieving suppressed stories, and of deconstructing as well as relocating readers in their postmodern alienation (6). Given the fact that it presents gothic undertones and evinces diverse instances of the strange as a modality of the fantastic, some passages of Morton's novel also bring to the fore references to classic fairy tales and children's stories through resorting to metatextuality.

4. Metatextual traces of children's stories and fairy tales

Passages from Morton's novel also reveal instances of metatextuality with children's stories, insofar as Eliza as a narrator, but also Morton's own writing persona, bring to the fore the self-reflexive quality of texts within texts and the craft of literary creativity. In particular, the trope of Eliza's garden acquires metatextual references, since it is there that Eliza becomes a writer of fairy tales, establishing recurrent correlations between her everyday experiences and the magic events taking place in her narratives. As an evident display of metatextuality, in Morton's novel, the writer of children's stories Frances Hodgson Burnett makes her appearance as a character, as she is invited to a party held in the gardens of Blackhurst Manor, and before making her acquaintance, Rose's husband, Nathaniel, is browsing through the pages of her novel *Little Lord Fauntleroy* (1886). Nonetheless, for the most part, as its title

evinces, Morton's novel mainly looks back to Hodgson Burnett's *The Secret Garden* (1911), whose plot revolves around Mary Lennox, who is sent to England with her uncle Archibald Craven and her aunt Lilias Craven, and discovers her aunt's private walled garden, which her uncle had locked following the tragic death of his wife, and so, along with her cousin Colin, Mary determines to restore the garden to its former splendour. In a display of metatextuality, inasmuch as Eliza is also a Victorian writer of fairy tales, Morton's novel evokes Hodgson Burnett's classic Victorian children's story, since Eliza is also summoned to live with uncle Linus and aunt Adeline in Blackhurst Manor, where she discovers a neglected garden that she restores to its full bloom with her cousin Rose's help. Nonetheless, in addition to metatextual references to Hodgson Burnett's narratives, other children's stories are also evoked in Morton's novel. When Cassandra first travels to London and visits "destinations like Kensington," she feels "like being dropped into a story book from her childhood" (172). Cassandra imagines the city of London in which Eliza lived as a child, which bears resemblance with the city portrayed in J.M. Barrie's play *Peter Pan* (1904). Like Wendy, who is introduced into a world of magic by Peter Pan and acts like a mother to the lost children, Eliza also attempts to extricate herself from her bleak existence, turning into a mother figure for her brother Sammy, while, like Wendy, who is shielded by the pendant she wears around her neck, Eliza also finds strength in her mother's mourning brooch, until both Wendy and Eliza are respectively kidnapped by wicked patriarchs like Captain Hook and Linus Mountrachet.

In addition to children's stories ranging from Hodgson Burnett's to Barrie's play, since Eliza is an author of fairy tales, the presence of characters, tropes and imagery pertaining to folklore becomes pervasive all through her narrative. Drawing on seminal volumes—like Vladimir Propp's syntagmatic analysis of folk tales, Stith Thompson's comprehensive index of folk narratives, and Claude Lévi-Strauss paradigmatic analysis—which contributed to systematising the recurrent elements comprised in folk tales, more recently, from a contemporary perspective, Marina Warner has synthesised the basic components of the fairy tale. As Warner claims, a fairy tale involves a familiar story which has been passed on down from generation to generation, in which the presence of the past becomes pervasive through the combination of recognizable plots, and which elicits wonder by

means of the intervention of the supernatural, while it also resorts to the narratological convention of a happy ending. Morton's novel comprises metatextual references to fairy tales, both classic and original, which contribute to fictionalising emblematic biographical events, but also to establishing connections between family members from generation to generation, and to accentuating a child's imaginative mind that will later give way to the writer's creativity.

Eliza's book of fairy tales acquires significance among the different family generations because it is bequeathed to the next generations as part of her personal legacy. Initially, Eliza becomes acquainted with storytelling on behalf of her mother, Georgiana, who used to tell her fairy tales when she was a child. In due course, Eliza would tell her twin brother the first tales that ever came to her mind, and in her youth, when Eliza's collection of fairy tales is published, she gives it to her daughter as a present and puts it in the tiny suitcase that Nell takes on her journey to Australia. As a young child herself, Cassandra discovers Eliza's collection of fairy tales in Nell's house and begins to read it, thus establishing connections among the different family generations.

Passages from fairy tales are evoked metatextually throughout the novel to underline particular dramatic events. Some events are strongly reminiscent of those in Brothers Grimm's "Snow White" (1812), especially in relation to the characterisation of Adeline and her treatment of her niece Eliza. Adeline gazes at her reflected image in the mirror and ponders about the cruelty of age, which contrasts with the vivacity and strength of her niece Eliza. Besides, during her stay in the cottage, Cassandra plucks an apple from the tree and bites it, as she realises that "her lids were heavy and she closed her eyes" (364), thus suddenly falling asleep until Christian wakes her up. This event in Morton's novel also bears strong resemblance with the passage in the classic tale "Snow White," in which its young female protagonist is visited by an elderly woman, who is actually her wicked stepmother in disguise and gives her a poisoned apple that will cause her to fall into deep sleep until she is finally awakened by the prince.

Other dramatic events in the novel are also evocative of Brothers Grimm's tale "Hansel and Gretel" (1812). When Eliza dies upon attempting to jump off the carriage which takes her back to the manor, Adeline cunningly intends to bury Eliza's body in an unmarked grave at

the other end of the maze. To that purpose, Adeline asks the gardener, Davies, to take her through the maze, while, along her path, Adeline has "one hand in the pocket of her dress, fingertips emerging at regular intervals to drop tiny white pebbles from Ivory's collection" (634) to ensure that she will be able to retrace her steps on her own. This passage brings to mind the one in "Hansel and Gretel," in which a woodcutter's wicked second wife urges him to abandon his two children in the woods, and Hansel sneaks out of the house and gathers as many white pebbles as he can in order to lay a guiding trail that will shine at night and will enable them to go back home.

Additionally, other events in the novel recall passages from Charles Perrault's story "Sleeping Beauty" (1697). When her friend Ruby visits Cassandra in the cottage that she has inherited from her grandmother, she pays attention to the antique spinning wheel, which remains from the time when Eliza lived in the cottage. As Cassandra warns her friend not to prick her finger, Ruby replies, "I don't want to be responsible for putting us both to sleep for a hundred years" (501). Ruby's ironic reference alludes to Perrault's tale, in which seven good fairies are invited to be godmothers at the christening of the infant princess, although an old fairy, who is uninvited, curses the princess so that one day she will prick her finger on a spinning wheel and fall asleep.

If passages in the novel are evocative of fairy tales, the stories in Eliza's collection arise as a fictional interpretation of actual events that she translates into her world of fantasy, thus engaging once more in metatextuality. When Eliza talks to the gardener, Davies, about her intention of compiling fairy tales as Brothers Grimm had done, he retorts, "why you'd want to be like your pair of grim German fellows is beyond me," advising her, "you should be writing your own stories" (337). Three of the stories in Eliza's collection of fairy tales are inserted as metafictional displays that echo significant events in the respective narratives pertaining to the three female protagonists.

Eliza's fairy tale "The Changeling" revolves around a sad queen and an absent king who have a baby girl, but the queen is always concerned about her child, because the fairy queen has told her that the princess will be taken from her on her eighteenth birthday. By means of this tale, Eliza expresses her concerns about the way her cousin Rose is treated in Blackhurst Manor, as, like the queen in the tale, her mother

Adeline is constantly wary that her daughter may fall ill. In "The Golden Egg," a young princess suffers from poor health and, when her mother resorts to her magic looking glass to find a cure for her daughter, she has the vision of a young maiden in a cottage who is the guardian of the golden egg that will ensure the princess's happiness. Through this story, Eliza allegorically refers to the fact that, given Rose's inability to have children, it is Eliza who is chosen to give birth to a child, Ivory—who is later called Nell—in order to fulfil Rose's wish to be a mother. Finally, in "The Crone's Eyes," a young princess, who has no parents, is hosted by a blind crone who narrates that her father removed her eyes so that she would not see the evil things in the world. To repay the crone's kindness, when the young princess comes of age, she determines to cross the sea and find the crone's eyes. By means of this story, Eliza anticipates events that will befall her daughter Nell and her granddaughter Cassandra. This tale reflects Nell's symbolic blindness as regards her true origins, and following Nell's death, Cassandra decides to travel across the sea to England to disentangle the mystery of her grandmother's parentage. Given the fact that identity issues acquire particular significance in Morton's novel, journeys of self-discovery, genealogies and heroines attain mythical dimensions through hypertextual links to classical myths.

5. Hypertextual echoes of classical myths: female triads, journeys, and goddesses

The three main female characters in Morton's novel call to mind Robert Graves's myth of the triple goddess. According to Graves, the figure of the triple goddess consists of the Goddess of the Sky, who encompasses the three phases of the moon, namely the new moon, the full moon, and the waning moon; the Goddess of the Earth, who comprises the three seasons of spring, summer, and winter; and, the Goddess of the Underworld, who is concerned with the three life phases of birth, procreation, and death (378). In terms of aging, the stages that the triple goddess represents correspond with a girl who symbolises youth and enthusiasm, a woman who personifies ripeness and fertility, and a hag who embodies wisdom and rest. Nonetheless, given the link between the three stages that each goddess comprises, the identities of the three goddesses become obliterated, which ultimately suggests

the blurring of identities among the life stages of youth, maturity, and old age. Accordingly, the narratives revolving around the three female protagonists in the novel—Eliza, Nell, and Cassandra—acquire a mythical quality, because, in analogy with the figure of the triple goddess, their narratives establish hypertextual links with characters and tropes from classical myths, which transform them from their original narrative into contemporary adaptations. As the plot unfolds, the three main characters in the novel face long journeys to foreign lands, they personify female lineages in relation to nature, they embody mythical triads, and they are evocative of certain mythical goddesses.

As regards mythical journeys of self-discovery, the voyages that the female protagonists in the novel must make bring to mind passages from the myths of Odysseus, Oedipus, and Daedalus. As an older woman, Nell makes a journey that acquires particular significance, as it is stated that, "after all this time, a lifetime, she was finally going home" (71). The symbolic journey of going back home recalls Odysseus's myth, as the Greek king of Ithaca eventually returns home twenty years after his departure, when he left his homeland to take part in the Trojan War. Besides, Cassandra resumes Nell's mission, and making it the purpose of her life, her actions bring to mind Oedipus's act of coming to terms with his fate after consulting the Delphic Oracle. Along her journey, Cassandra discerns Nell's mistaken parentage, which ends up with the respective sudden deaths of her biological parents, as happens in Oedipus's classical myth. Likewise, Eliza's narrative portrays the existence of an intricate maze that leads from the cottage to the manor house. The presence of the maze is evocative of Daedalus's labyrinth, which concealed the Minotaur, which Theseus destroys with the help of Ariadne's thread. In Eliza's narrative, Rose's secret about her child finds correlation in Pasiphaë's secret in relation to the Minotaur. Besides, in resemblance with Theseus, Nathaniel is guided across the maze by Eliza, as a counterpart to Ariadne, to symbolically slay the Minotaur that signals the terrible secret about Rose's child.

As she retraces Nell's origins, Cassandra realises there are recurrent cases in her family in which mothers and daughters have been separated from each other. After Nell passes away, her foster sisters cynically tell her granddaughter Cassandra that, "Nell came from a tradition of bad mothers, the sort who could abandon their children with ease" (77). The

different narratives that make up Morton's novel mainly relate to each other since they all comprise a search for a missing mother figure and a bereaved child, as happens to Eliza with her daughter, to Nell with her mother Eliza, and to Cassandra with her grandmother Nell. The close bonds, but also tragic separations, between mothers and daughters evoke the Eleusinian Mysteries and the classical myth of Demeter, the goddess of agriculture, and her daughter Persephone, who was seized by Hades, the god of the underworld, thus obliging Demeter to look for her, until Zeus allowed Persephone to return to her mother. This myth explains the cycle of seasons, as when Demeter and Persephone are reunited, the earth returns to prosperity in spring, whereas, when Persephone is separated from her mother, the earth is deprived of its splendour during winter. In Morton's novel, the union between female relatives also acquires mythical dimensions as is reflected in the blooming of Eliza's garden when her daughter is with her. Given its mythical qualities, the garden, where Eliza and Rose play as children, also evokes the Garden of the Hesperides, as these nymphs were responsible for tending Hera's orchard after Gaia had given the goddess a tree with golden apples as a wedding gift. It is also at the Garden of Hesperides that Eris, the goddess of discord, drops the golden apple that unleashes the dispute among Hera, Athena, and Aphrodite. As a counterpart to the goddess of discord, Adeline is also responsible for causing the estrangement between Eliza and her cousin Rose.

Theorist James Ellen Harrison refers to the existence of mythical female trinities as chronological symbols representing different life stages. In Morton's novel, as Eliza, Nell and Cassandra visit the cottage in their respective lifetimes, the three of them catch sight of the antique spinning wheel which symbolically connects the genealogical threads of the three characters. Accordingly, this imagery calls up the mythical female triad of the Moirai as goddesses who shaped the destiny of mortals by means of controlling the threads of life. In particular, Clotho spins the threads of life in the womb, Lachesis determines the length of life allotted to each mortal, and Atropos cuts off the threads of life. In Morton's novel, although each of the female protagonists belongs to a different generation and is portrayed as a woman of a particular age—Nell in her old age, Eliza in her maturity, and Cassandra in her childhood—their ages are recurrently blurred along with their identities as an embodiment of their trinity.

Finally, the three main female characters in Morton's novel present traits that are remindful of a series of heroines in classical myths, like Penelope, Pandora, and Cassandra. As Odysseus's wife, Penelope waits twenty years for her husband's return, and analogously, the three female protagonists in Morton's novel spend their lives waiting to be reunited with those who are absent, particularly Nell who must wait a lifetime to resume her former life. Besides, in Pandora's myth, after humans receive the stolen gift of fire from Prometheus, Zeus decides to punish them by commanding Hephaestus to cast from earth the first woman, Pandora, who brings a jar containing countless evils. In Morton's novel, Eliza possesses a pot with "three items inside: a leather pouch, a swatch of red-gold hair and a brooch" (638), which she conceals as a child and will eventually bring disgrace to the whole family, as, when she intends to retrieve the pot, Eliza is kidnapped and separated from her daughter forever. Finally, in some versions of Cassandra's myth, it is described that, upon falling asleep, some snakes whispered into her ears and endowed her with the gift of prophecy. In Morton's novel, Cassandra has a recurrent dream in which "she was looking for someone," noticing that "if she were only to walk in the right direction, she would find them" (108), thus resembling Cassandra and her intuition in the classical myth.

As has been evinced, by means of hypertextual connections, classical myths involving self-discovery, female genealogies, and mythical heroines are evoked and transformed into different narratives related to the three female protagonists, who arise as a mythical triad that joins and blurs the respective identities of the characters.

6. Conclusion

Morton's novel *The Forgotten Garden* presents manifold instances of transtextuality, to use Genette's term, in relation to Victorian novels, Gothic fiction, fairy tales, and classical myths. In addition, though, this amalgamation of textualities contributes to fictionalising an actual narrative by means of which the author of the novel aimed to come to terms with a traumatic episode involving her own family lineage. Through a display of metafiction, in an appended final note in her novel *The Forgotten Garden*, Morton confesses that, "my own grandmother's secret first inspired the story" (647), since, when Morton's grandmother

turned twenty-one years of age, her father told her that he was not her biological parent. According to Morton, as an author, this event urged her to approach identity as a "mutable creation we all rely upon as we make our way into the world" (647), taking into consideration that narratives of identity are susceptible to suffer changes and modifications through time. Inasmuch as Morton approaches identity as a permanently changeable text, made up of different transtextual influences, her novel *The Forgotten Garden* reflects her ideas by means of resorting to transtextuality in all its different manifestations.

In relation to Victorian fiction, Morton's novel presents instances of intertextuality with novels by Charles Dickens, the Brontës, and Thomas Hardy, in addition to the play by Oscar Wilde, and poetry by Alfred Lord Tennyson. Explicit and subtle references to these Victorian works give evidence of the influence that Victorian literature has exerted on Morton as a writer and as a Victorian scholar. Besides, Morton's novel presents architextual connections with Gothic fiction, particularly in relation to narratives pertaining to the female Gothic, the role of the family in gothic tales, and the gothic archetype of the double. Morton's novel is mostly related to Gothic fiction owing to narratological conventions in terms of plot development, tropes and archetypes, hence presenting architextual connections with Gothic narratives like novels by Ann Radcliffe and Mary Shelley as well as Edgar Allan Poe's tales. Additionally, since one of the protagonists, Eliza, is a writer of fairy tales, Morton's novel presents metatextual links with children's stories like Frances Hodgson Burnett's book, which is suggested in the title of the novel itself, but also with James Matthew Barrie's narratives of Peter Pan, alongside some of the folktales of the Brothers Grimm and Charles Perrault. Hence, as Morton's novel evokes passages from classic fairy tales, Eliza's own original stories fulfil a metatextual function, as they make a critical commentary as well as underline turning points in the plot of the novel itself. Finally, by means of resorting to journeys of self-discovery, female triads and the portrayal of mythical heroines, Morton's novel also presents hypertextual connections with classical myths which are evoked and transformed. The pervasive presence of instances of transtextuality throughout the novel gives evidence of the self-conscious quality of the text as reflective of the way Morton envisions identity, that is, as an amalgamation of different textualities joined together through transtextuality.

Works Cited

Arias, Rosario and Patricia Pulham. "Introduction." *Haunting and Spectrality in Neo-Victorian Fiction: Possessing the Past*, edited by Rosario Arias and Patricia Pulham, Palgrave Macmillan, 2009, pp. xi-xxvi.

Bakhtin, Mikhail. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays by M.M. Bakhtin*, translated by M. Holquist and C. Emerson, U of Texas P, 1981.

Book Browsers LLC 1997-2024. "An Interview with Kate Morton." https://www.bookbrowse.com/author_interviews/full/index.cfm/author_number/1556/kate-morton. Accessed 30 March 2024.

Botting, Fred. "Gothic Culture." *The Routledge Companion to the Gothic*, edited by Catherine Spooner and Emma McEvoy, Routledge, 2007, pp. 199-213.

Freud, Sigmund. "The Uncanny." *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*, vol.17, edited and translated by J. Strachey, Hogarth P, 1961, pp. 219-252.

Genette, Gérard. *The Architext: An Introduction*, translated by Jane E. Lewin, U of California P, 1992.

---. *Palimpsests: Literature in the Second Degree*, translated by C. Newman and C. Doubinsky, U of Nebraska P, 1997.

Graves, Robert. *The White Goddess: A Historical Grammar of Poetic Myth*. Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2013.

Harrison, Jane Ellen. *Themis: A Study of the Social Origins of Greek Religion*, Cambridge UP, 1912.

Heilmann, Ann and Mark Llewellyn. *Neo-Victorianism: The Victorians in the Twenty-First Century, 1999-2009*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.

Hutcheon, Linda. *A Theory of Adaptation*. Routledge, 2006.

Joyce, Simon. "The Victorians in the Rearview Mirror." *Functions of Victorian Culture at the Present Time*, edited by Christine Krueger, U of Ohio P, 2002, pp. 3-17.

Kaplan, Cora. *Victoriana: Histories, Fictions, Criticism*s. Edinburgh UP, 2007.

Kohkle, Marie-Luise and Christian Gutleben, editors. *Neo-Victorian Gothic: Horror, Violence and Degeneration in the Re-Imagined Nineteenth-Century*. Rodopi, 2012.

Kristeva, Julia. *Powers of Horror: An Essay on Abjection*. Columbia UP, 1982.

Krueger, Christine. "Introduction." *Functions of Victorian Culture at the Present Time*, edited by Christine Krueger. U of Ohio P, 2002, pp. xi-xx.

Kucich, John and Dianne F. Sadoff. "Introduction: Histories of the Present." *Victorian Afterlife: Postmodern Culture Rewrites the Nineteenth-Century*, edited by John Kucich and Dianne F. Sadoff, Minnesota UP, 2000, pp. ix-xxx.

Lévi-Strauss, Claude. "The Structural Study of Myth." *Journal of American Folklore*, vol.68, no. 270, 1955, pp. 428-444.

Maier, Sarah and Brenda Ayres. *Neo-Gothic Narratives*. Anthem Press, 2020.

Modleski, Tania. "The Female Uncanny: Gothic Novels for Women." *Loving with a Vengeance: Mass-Produced Fantasies for Women*, Routledge, 1990, pp. 59-84.

Moers, Ellen. *Literary Women: The Great Writers*. Women's Press, 1976.

Moran, Maureen. *Victorian Literature and Culture*. Continuum, 2006.

Morton, Kate. *The Forgotten Garden*. Pan Books, 2023.

Parasca, Ana-Maria. "The Sense of Otherness in Kate Morton's Novels." *Caietele Echinox* vol. 35, 2018, pp. 244-56.

Propp, Vladimir. *Morphology of the Folk Tale*, translated by Laurence Scott. U of Texas P, 1968.

Rank, Otto. *The Double: A Psychoanalytic Study*, edited and translated by Herbert Tucker, U of North Carolina P, 1971.

Shiller, Dana. "The Redemptive Past in the Neo-Victorian Novel." *Studies in the Novel*, vol. 29, no. 4, 1997, pp. 538-560.

Stevens, David. *The Gothic Tradition*. Cambridge UP, 2010.

Thompson, Stith. *Motif-Index of Folk-Literature: A Classification of Narrative Elements in Folktales, Ballads, Myths, Fables, Mediaeval Romances, Exempla, Fabliaux, Jest-Books, and Local Legends*. Indiana UP, 1955-1958.

Wallace, Diana. "Female Gothic." *The Encyclopedia of the Gothic*, edited by William Hughes, David Punter and Andrew Smith, Wiley Blackwell, 2016, pp. 231-236.

Warner, Marina. *Once Upon a Time: A Short History of Fairy Tale*. Oxford UP, 2014.

Wolfreys, Julian. *Victorian Hauntings: Spectrality, Gothic, the Uncanny and Literature*. Springer, 2002.

Received / Recibido: 8/4/2024 *Accepted / Aceptado: 4/7/2024*

Victorian Women in Gaskell's Gothic Tales: A Study on "Lois the Witch," "The Grey Woman" and "The Old Nurse's Story"

Blanca Puchol Vázquez (bpuchol@ucm.es)
Universidad Complutense de Madrid

Abstract: Elizabeth Gaskell, a famous and prolific Victorian novelist, known as much for her involvement in the society around her as for her use of her fiction to criticise it, published several Gothic tales in which she pays special attention to the situation of Victorian women. In these texts, she took refuge behind a genre which, thanks to the distance it offers from reality, as well as its fantastic nature, as opposed to the realism of her novels, gives her greater freedom to aim her sharp and accurate satirical remarks at the patriarchal society of the nineteenth century and its values. Nevertheless, as in her longer works, Gaskell once again shows her knowledge of human nature by portraying the world as a vast mosaic of greys in which not every man is a tyrant and not every woman a poor, helpless victim. This study will therefore allude to three of Gaskell's gothic stories, "Lois the Witch," "The Grey Woman" and "The Old Nurse's Story," in which the author shows, among other things, how Victorian women were not only victims, but could also be vile and ruthless.

Keywords: Elizabeth Gaskell, Gothic literature, social criticism, Victorian women.

Las mujeres victorianas en los relatos góticos de Gaskell: Análisis de "Lois the Witch," "The Grey Woman" y "The Old Nurse's Story"

Resumen: Elizabeth Gaskell, famosa y prolífica novelista victoriana, conocida tanto por su implicación en la sociedad que la rodeaba como por el uso de su ficción para criticarla, publicó un buen número de cuentos góticos en los cuales presta especial atención a la situación de la mujer victoriana. En estos textos, se parapeta tras un género que, gracias al distanciamiento que este ofrece de la realidad, así como su carácter de fantástico, en oposición al realismo de sus novelas, le da mayor libertad para apuntar sus afilados y certeros dardos contra la sociedad patriarcal del siglo XIX y sus valores. No obstante, y como hace también en sus obras más extensas, Gaskell muestra una vez más su conocimiento de la naturaleza humana al retratar el mundo como un enorme mosaico de grises en el que no todo hombre es un tirano ni toda mujer una pobre víctima desvalida. En este estudio se aludirá, pues, a tres de los relatos góticos de Gaskell, "Lois the Witch," "The Grey Woman" y "The Old Nurse's Story," en los que la autora muestra, entre otras cosas, cómo las mujeres victorianas no sólo eran víctimas, sino que también podían ser viles y verdugos.

Palabras clave: Elizabeth Gaskell, literatura gótica, crítica social, mujer victoriana.

1. Introduction

Elizabeth Gaskell is a famous and fruitful Victorian novelist. As a realist author, she is known both for her involvement with the

surrounding society and her use of her literary production as a way of criticising the social woes of her time. Her novels' main themes include masters versus workers, women's situation and their rights in this period, and the living conditions of the poorest in large industrial cities, such as Manchester.

Gaskell lived in Manchester all her married life, and as the wife of a Unitarian minister she was involved with all kinds of people: poor and wealthy, masters and labourers, unknown social outcasts and renowned authors such as Charles Dickens, Charlotte Brontë, Harriet Martineau, William and Mary Howitt, and John Ruskin, among others. So, it can be said that her position as a minister's wife gave her first-hand knowledge of both human nature and Victorian society.

Although Gaskell is mainly known as the author of *Cranford*, her two so-called 'social novels' *Mary Barton* and *North and South*, and the first biography of Charlotte Brontë, she was also a prolific short story writer. In her novels and novellas, readers can observe Gaskell questioning of several Victorian standards and showing how other reality was possible. Thus, she created strong female characters, such as Margaret Hale (*North and South*) or Molly Gibson (*Wives and Daughters*), who do not fit the Victorian stereotype, just as she presented kind male characters, concerned by their family, who raise and protect their children, let their daughters act with an unusual freedom, etc., like John Barton and Job Leigh in *Mary Barton*, or Mr Hale in *North and South*, who do not fit the Victorian tyrannical male standard. Together with this, Gaskell shows that, when the traditional family fails, other possibilities arise—as Haefele-Thomas points out. She also focuses on the importance of marriage and the family, the respectability of spinsterhood (*Cranford*) and the fallen woman's possibility to improve her behaviour and amend her life (*Ruth*). Thus, through her stories and characters, Gaskell hinted that not everything in life was black or white (life was not a collection of established and immovable clichés), but a huge mosaic of greys in which not every man is a tyrant and not every woman a poor, helpless victim.

Nevertheless, Victorian readers not always were prepared to accept these facts or ideas, as attets the fact that her novel *Ruth* was burnt by some people. Thus, this could be the reason why Gaskell seems to be more subtle in her novels, turning to the Gothic tale as a means to express her sharper criticism. In this vein, it would also be interesting

to have a look to what Diana Wallace establishes in her *Female Gothic Histories: Gender, History and the Gothic*, as commented by Carolyn Lambert in her review of Wallace's text:

> Wallace's chapter on Gaskell focuses on the short stories. She claims that Gaskell understood from early in her writing career that Gothic and historical fiction could be used to say the unsayable. It was in her short stories that Gaskell was able to explore and test controversial ideas more freely, and, as Wallace notes, these are replete with Gothic motifs and conventions. Gaskell re-historicises the Gothic and in doing so, offers "a searing proto-feminist indictment of the vulnerability of women and children within structures which support and even encourage male power and violence". (Lambert 143)

As mentioned above, Gaskell was a prolific short story writer, and among the more than forty stories she published, there are several Gothic tales. Gaskell's talent for frightening and wild tales appears early in her literary career, starting with her school days' essay 'Clopton House', so, as Tracy Nectoux points out, '[b]y the time she wrote *The Old Nurse's Story*, Gaskell's skills at writing ghastly, yet entertaining, supernatural tales had been honed to perfection' (26). On her part, Shirley Foster alludes to how her shorter works 'show Gaskell at her most original and inventive, experimenting with genre and narrative methodology, and dealing with topics which, though also explored in her novels, often have a sharper impact in the more restricted space' (Foster 108). Here it should also be remembered that Dickens referred to her as his "dear Sheherezade," and that there are several anecdotes mentioned by various of her contemporaries:

> An 1859 letter to her from William Wetmore Story, her friend in Rome, for example, recalls nostalgically how she had entertained them on a visit: "let us see your face and hear your voice again… Will you not tell us more of your charming stories – and give us some more living sketches of character." … An early biographer reports that she was famed as "an excellent narrator of stories… A gentleman in Manchester, who was a frequent visitor at the house, told me how Mrs. Gaskell had once kept him up through

> many a night while she told ghost stories, of which she possessed a goodly store." Gaskell herself recounts how, when Charlotte Brontë was staying with the Gaskells in April 1853, she had to stop telling "some dismal ghost story" because the younger woman was afraid of being kept awake all night by it (LCB, II, 12: 406). (Foster 108-109)

Gothic was a popular literary genre throughout the nineteenth century. Moreover, elements considered to be typical of Gothic literature, such as castles, shadowy characters, or ghosts, can be found in Victorian literary works which belong to other genres. Andrew Smith and William Hughes claim that 'It is important to acknowledge the diverse ways in which the Victorian Gothic was manifested. To that end there are contributions … which explore its presence on the stage, in poetry, and in specific textual formations such as the ghost story' (6). Catherine Spooner and Emma McEvoy state that the Gothic has been defined according to its emphasis on the returning past just like to its interest in transgression and decay, its aesthetics of fear and its combination of reality and fantasy (1). Referring to Victorian Gothic, Alexandra Warwick says that '... in the popular imagination Victorian is in many ways the Gothic period, with its elaborate cult of death and mourning, its fascination with ghosts, spiritualism and the occult ...' (29). She also alludes to the fact that, throughout the century, there were a great number of writers who were interested in the Gothic, even though they were more frequently associated with realism, mentioning George Eliot's *The Lifted Veil* (1859) and Elizabeth Gaskell's *Disappearances* (1851) as examples.

Victorian Gothic articulated the political and social matters of the time in contemporary settings, but the anxiety of the legacies of the past also remains, now intensified by the self-consciousness of modernity. Warwick mentions that '[t]he earlier work of Dickens and the Brontës has enabled the Gothic to come home, from the cultural, geographical, religious and chronological margins to permeate every area of Victorian life: domesticity, the family, the streets, the empire, the future' (35). Warwick also refers to the Brontë sisters' depiction of domestic spaces, marriage, and family life —all supposedly safe and peaceful spaces— as terrifying places where mean events happened.

In addition to this, Warwick alludes to the way they address gender issues in their fiction:

> The novels are full of images of doors and windows, with women inside prevented from leaving and the same women outside, barred from entering. Their desire to be inside or outside switches constantly through the narratives, and the consequences are shown as potentially fatal to the women. The ambivalent desires are associated with Gothic images: the crazed laughter from the attic in *Jane Eyre* (1847); the desperate ghost in *Wuthering Heights* (1847); the dead nun in *Villette* (1853). The Brontës' novels take up the questions of gender that are apparent in earlier Gothic, but within the highly wrought drama of the stories the heroines are modern women seeking a place for themselves in a world that is hostile to them. (31)

As in the case of the Brontë sisters' writings, we can also observe that social evils of different nature are present in all of Gaskell's literary works. Sometimes they appear openly and with a clear authorial intention of denouncing them. In other texts, their presence is subtle, but they are always there. Within her major novels, we find the conflict between masters and labourers; the living conditions of the poorest in large industrial cities; the social and cultural differences between the north and the south of the country; or women's situation and their rights (or lack thereof). This latter issue, which appears intermingled with others in Gaskell's social novels, becomes the main topic of her short fiction, especially her Gothic tales, in which Gaskell confronts the reader with questions such as girls' lack of education, male tyranny exerted over women by fathers and husbands, and the female rivalry that arises as a result of the so-called "marriage market."

It is worth noting Laura Kranzler's introduction to her edition of Elizabeth Gaskell's *Gothic Tales* (2004), where she underlines the fact that, in Gaskell's Gothic stories, female characters often appear as victims of male characters. In these stories, the domestic space is the place where women are most vulnerable and threatened by danger, a danger that comes from men who exercise tyrannical authority over them, supported by the patriarchal Victorian society in which they live. Like those of the Brontë sisters, Gaskell's Gothic narratives

depict that, in the nineteenth century, danger for women came from home, a supposedly peaceful and safe place, an idea supported by several critics, like Julia McCord who, in her analysis of "Lois the Witch" and "The Grey Woman," states that "[i]n an extension of the Brontë sisters' pioneering fiction of the 1840s, Gaskell resituates Gothic villainy in these stories within domestic spaces and familial relationships" (McCord 59).

Kranzler links Gaskell's Gothic narratives to her concern for women:

> In Gaskell's Gothic scenarios, it is usually the female characters who are victimized by the males, and it is this investment in exposing the conflict between the powerful and the powerless that links the stories and novellas most explicitly with the themes of her better-known full-length works. ... Part of what constitutes the Gothic experience in these stories is the split between different forms of identity and between different forms of authority—in terms of gender, history and textuality—and how those boundaries are themselves transgressed. In Gaskell's stories and novellas, what has been repressed continues to return, fact continually merges into fiction, and it is these shifts between what is real and what is imagined—seeing that ghost in the everyday street—that makes these stories so compelling. (Kranzler xi–xii)

However, as will be seen throughout this study, Gaskell also demonstrates that when the standard family fails, other family possibilities emerge, and she presents a deep analysis of human nature, displaying how men did not have the exclusive right to evil and tyranny, but women could also exercise them.

2. Gothic Features in Gaskell's Texts

Regarding Gothic features, Warwick's words are worth recalling here. When referring to Victorian Gothic, this scholar maintains that '... in the popular imagination Victorian is in many ways the Gothic period, with its elaborate cult of death and mourning, its fascination with ghosts, spiritualism and the occult ...' (29). This comment leads us to the ghosts in "The Old Nurse's Story," two of them female and the

other male. The two female ones, who belong to Miss Maud Furnivall and her daughter, are spirits seeking revenge for what they suffered as living souls, coming out against those who caused their sufferings and deaths. Therefore, they appear to torment Grace, Maude's younger sister, for her past actions, as it was her who told her father that Maud was secretly married to their piano teacher, and this led to both Maude's and her daughter's death, as we can see at the end of the tale:

> … and the terrible phantoms moved on, regardless of old Miss Furnivall's wild entreaty, —and the uplifted crutch fell on the right shoulder of the little child, and the younger sister looked on, stony, and deadly serene. But at that moment, the dim lights, and the fire that gave no heat, went out of themselves, and Miss Furnivall lay at our feet …
>
> She lay with her face to the wall, muttering always: 'Alas! alas! what is done in youth can never be undone in age! What is done in youth can never be undone in age!' (Gaskell 31-32)

As for the male ghost of this story, who belongs to Lord Furnivall himself, we encounter a punished soul condemned to wander eternally as punishment for his cruelty. This is due to his discovery of his daughter Maude's secret marriage to a foreign gentleman. As a result of this marriage, Lord Furnival threw Maude and her daughter out of his castle on a dark and stormy night. This led to the death of the child and, subsequently, to Maude's descent into madness and eventual death. In addition to this, Gaskell underscores the point that social condition does not matter: if we act cruelly, sooner or later, we are going to pay for our sins and crimes. Beside the three ghostly figures, this narrative, which is pervaded with mystery and some terror, is made up of elements such as the gloomy castle, mysteries, secrets, and issues not to be talked about, forbidden wings of the castle, stormy nights, lightning, thunders, and music that seems to come from nowhere. All these features remind us of Spooner and McEvoy's statement that Gothic is defined by its interest in transgression and decay, its aesthetics of fear and its combination of reality and fantasy (1).

Warwik's allusion to Victorian fascination with spiritualism and the occult, together with the Gothic's emphasis on the returning past (cf. Spooner and McEvoy 1), brings us back to "Lois the Witch," a text in which witchcraft, the supernatural, the rational versus the irrational, curses, forests, and darkness, form the setting for a story that is set at the time of the famous Salem witch trials of the seventeenth century. Here, Gaskell presents a young woman, Lois, harassed by her cousin Manasseh, a young man disturbed and tormented by the clash between his puritanical morality and his most primitive instincts, and his two sisters, Faith and Prudence, who denounce Lois for witchcraft and thus cause her death. In this story, Gaskell places us before the Gothic topic of "the curse," as Lois had been damned by a woman condemned for witchcraft, when she was a child as vengeance on Lois's father, who refused to help to save that woman from death:

> 'They are fearful creatures, the witches! and yet I am sorry for the poor old women, whilst I dread them. We had one in Barford, when I was a little child. ... I saw old Hannah in the water, her grey hair all streaming down her shoulders, and her face bloody and black with the stones and the mud they had been throwing at her, and her cat tied round her neck. I hid my face, I know, as soon as I saw the fury —poor, helpless, baited creature! —and she caught the sight of me, and cried out, "Parson's wench, parson's wench, yonder, in thy nurse's arms, thy dad hath never tried for to save me, and none shall save thee when thou art brought up for a witch." Oh! the words rang in my ears, when I was dropping asleep, for years after. I used to dream that I was in that pond, all men hating me with their eyes because I was a witch; and, at times, her black cat used to seem living again, and say over those dreadful words.' (Gaskell 149–150)

So, it could be said that Lois's suffering is the result of that spell, which she recalls when she is later accused of witchcraft:

> Lois did not know if the words were in her favour or not. She did not think about them, even; they told less on her than on any person present. She a witch! and the silver glittering Avon, and the drowning woman she had seen in

> her childhood at Barford, —at home in England, —were before her, and her eyes fell before her doom. (Gaskell 205)

The use of a malediction that punishes a daughter for the sins of her father is especially interesting considering that Gaskell argued the idea that descendants should not be penalised because of their parents' faults, an idea previously shown by the author in *Ruth* (Williams 111-114). By using the curse as the possible origin of Lois's fate, Gaskell is once again criticising the fact that Victorian society tended to punish someone because of their parents' sins.

Additionally, Gaskell writes here a tale where lonesomeness is the only companion of the main characters. Manasseh is completely alone in his madness, while his family tries to deny his illness and pretends nothing is wrong. None of his relatives pays real attention to his revelations, and when Lois dies, he leaves, never to return. Faith and Prudence seem to have no friends or anyone to rely on, and when they find that 'someone' in their cousin Lois, they finally betray her causing Lois's death by accusing her of witchcraft. Lois herself is completely alone in a foreign and strange country, surrounded by people who do not like her and treat her as a disturbing burden. Gaskell describes both how she feels completely alone, helpless and condemned by her relatives, and how she longs to be back in England, in the place she actually feels to be her home and with those who really love her. The whole text conveys a strong sense of loneliness, as well as an anguishing atmosphere of tension and pressure.

Finally, something similar happens in "The Grey Woman," where the cruel husband isolates Anna in an old castle, full of intricate passages and unexpected doors, installing her in a suite of rooms set apart. Here, again, isolation and loneliness are Anna's companions, as her husband prevents any contact with her family or anyone else apart from him and his butler.

While reading these tales, readers find gloomy castles and forests, mysteries, secrets that should not be told, stormy nights, lightning, thunders, mysterious music, curses and darkness, all of them Gothic elements used by the author as tools to create the appropriate settings for her tales, settings which help her to achieve her actual intention of

denouncing the social problems of her time. Moreover, it can be argued that Gaskell understood fiction as "one way of telling the truths that cannot be expressed in other ways … and "the Gothic as both a mode of history and a symbolic language of the psychological which could convey the female experience repressed in other modes of writing" (Wallace 67). And it is not only the Gothic itself that gives Gaskell the opportunity to tell such otherwise inexpressible truths, but also the fact of setting the action outside England (as in "Lois, the Witch" and "The Grey Woman") or in the distant past (as in "The Old Nurse's Story"). Thus, as Haefele-Thomas explains:

> In some ways, it could be said that Gaskell was 'playing it safe' by placing the action of "Lois the Witch" and "The Grey Woman" outside England, and thus away from the British imagination. There is, however, a way to read her tales as direct commentaries on many of the controversial social and cultural issues of the day in England. Gaskell's foreign settings enabled her to explore some of these issues that haunted Victorian Britain in the late 1850s and early 1860s more fully. Gaskell's unconventional narrative style – she often ends her tales abruptly – functions much like her setting of the action outside of England in that she breaks the bounds of confinement (which is also particular to Gothic), reiterating on a structural level the layered possibilities for complex queer readings. (50)

3. Gaskell's Gothic characters: neither tyrants nor innocent angels

Within the different Victorian social situations which Gaskell repeatedly denounced through her literary works, male tyranny and female rivalry can be mentioned as those that Gaskell primarily criticises and condemns in the three tales studied here. According to Kranzler (xiii-xiv), Warwick (35), McCord (59), or Ludlow and Styler (9), in the line of the Brontë sisters' and Dickens' earlier work, Gaskell presents the domestic space as the place where women are most vulnerable and threatened by danger, a danger that comes either from men (fathers, lovers, husbands…) who exercise tyrannical authority over them, supported by the patriarchal Victorian society in which they live, or from female family members (sisters, cousins, sisters in law…) moved by jealousy. Therefore, Gaskell's

Gothic tales suggest that in the nineteenth century, danger for women came from home, a place supposedly peaceful and safe.

In "The Old Nurse's Story," Gaskell portrays the competitive dynamics that emerge between women in the pursuit of a marital partner, particularly when they are simultaneously courted by the same man. It is necessary to remember here that nineteenth-century girls were mainly educated with the purpose of finding a husband in the so-called "marriage market" and becoming devoted wives. In "The Old Nurse's Story," Gaskell goes a step further, as in her story those competing for the man in question are sisters, Grace and Maude. Both women are seduced by the same man, a music teacher who, despite marrying Maude in secret, continues courting and giving hope to Grace. When Grace finally discovers her sister's secret marriage, she reveals their relationship and the existence of Maude's daughter to her father, Lord Furnivall. As we have already seen, Grace's revelation leads to the death of both Maude and the child.

It could be suggested here that the lack of female positive alliances may be a result of patriarchy, which permeates society and isolates women, not allowing them to be conscious both of their situation and of their possibilities to change the status quo, but Gaskell's narrative is full of examples of different kinds of female friendships and alliances, such as *Cranford* and its society mainly ruled by women, or the friendship between Molly and Cynthia in *Wives and Daughters*. Gaskell may be criticizing not only Victorian stereotypes and strict social rules, but also those people who, male or female, act with malice, hiding behind those rules and standards. As an example, we can pay attention to the following quote from "The Old Nurse's Story," where we can see a young Grace "with a look of relentless hate and triumphant scorn" while her father drove Maud and her daughter away as a punishment to Maud for her secret marriage:

> All at once, the east door gave way with a thundering crash, as if torn open in a violent passion, and there came into that broad and mysterious light, the figure of a tall old man, with grey hair and gleaming eyes. He drove before him, with many a relentless gesture of abhorrence, a stern and beautiful woman with a little child clinging to her dress. ...

> But just then I saw—we all saw—another phantom shape itself, and grow clear out of the blue and misty light that filled the hall; we had not seen her till now, for it was another lady who stood by the old man, with a look of relentless hate and triumphant scorn. ... It was the likeness of Miss [Grace] Furnivall in her youth; and the terrible phantoms moved on, regardless of old Miss Furnivall's wild entreaty, —and the uplifted crutch fell on the right shoulder of the little child, and the younger sister looked on, stony, and deadly serene. (Gaskell 30–32)

Jealousy is also the main cause why Lois is denounced for witchcraft in "Lois the Witch." In this case, readers find a young woman, Faith, who, thinking of Lois as a rival for Pastor Nolan's love, accuses her of being a witch (Gaskell 198-201), which finally brings about the death of the latter.

> 'Spare thy breath, cousin Lois. It is easy seeing on what pleasant matters thou and the Pastor Nolan were talking. I marvel not at thy forgetfulness. My mind is changed. Give me back my letter, sir; it was about a poor matter—an old woman's life. And what is that compared to a young girl's love?'
>
> Lois heard but for an instant; did not understand that her cousin, in her jealous anger, could suspect the existence of such a feeling as love between her and Mr Nolan. ...
>
> 'Take care, another time, how you meddle with a witch's things,' said Faith as one scarcely believing her own words, but at enmity with all the world in her bitter jealousy of heart. Prudence rubbed her arm and looked stealthily at Lois.
>
> 'Witch Lois! Witch Lois!' said she at last, ... (Gaskell 198-201)

Another example of feminine rivalry and jealousy can be found in "The Grey Woman," where Babette's jealousy causes Anna's journey to visit a friend in Carlsruhe, where she meets de la Tourelle, who will end up becoming her husband. In this tale Gaskell presents a situation that

differs from the previous ones. Here Anna and Babette are not rivals in the search for a husband, since Babette is already married and is Anna's sister-in-law, but she is constantly jealous of the latter: "That Babette Müller was, as I may say, the cause of all my life's suffering. … Babette Müller looked upon me as a rival" (Gaskell 292). First, she tries to force her engagement to Karl so that Anna will leave the family home: "And then came thy uncle Fritz's marriage; and Babette was brought to the mill to be its mistress. … by-and-by I began to see that Babette was egging on Karl to make more open love to me, and, as she once said, to get done with it, and take me off to a home of my own." (292-293); afterwards she supports Anna's trip to Carlsruhe:

> Things were in this way when I had an invitation to go to Carlsruhe to visit a schoolfellow, of whom I had been very fond. Babette was all for my going; … When this was ascertained, my father made no opposition to my going; Babette forwarded it by all the means in her power, and even my dear Fritz had his word to say in its favour. … I yielded to circumstances—to the pulling of Sophie and the pushing of Babette. … (293)

And finally, she forces a hasty marriage between Anna and de la Tourelle, not allowing it to take place in Anna's home:

> There was some difficulty, which I afterwards learnt that my sister-in-law had obviated, about my betrothal taking place from home. My father, and Fritz especially, were for having me return to the mill, and there be betrothed, and from thence be married. But the Rupprechts and Monsieur de la Tourelle were equally urgent on the other side; and Babette was unwilling to have the trouble of the commotion at the mill; and also, I think, a little disliked the idea of the contrast of my grander marriage with her own. (297)

Gaskell demonstrates how a young and inexperienced woman in the ins and outs of Victorian society is compelled to an unwanted betrothal to de la Tourelle. When Anna meets him, he seems to be head over heels in love with her, and everybody around her thinks that Anna should feel happy because he has a small chateau, is the owner of some land,

and has a large income, besides being handsome and polite. So, Anna is encouraged to get engaged to de la Tourelle:

> When he was gone away, Madame Rupprecht congratulated me on the conquest I had made; for indeed, he had scarcely spoken to anyone else, ... He was a propriétaire, had a small chateau on Vosges mountains; he owned land there, but had a large income from some sources quite independent of this property. Altogether, he was a good match, as she emphatically observed. She never seemed to think that I could refuse him after this account of his wealth, nor do I believe she would have allowed Sophie a choice, even had he been as old and ugly as he was young and handsome. ... He loaded me with presents, which I was unwilling to take, only Madame Rupprecht seemed to consider me an affected prude if I refused them. ...; by accepting these I doubled the ties which were formed around me by circumstances even more than by my own consent. ... I learned from Madame Rupprecht that she had written to my father to announce the splendid conquest I had made, and to request his presence at my betrothal. I started with astonishment. I had not realized that affairs had gone so far as this. But she asked me, in a stern, offended manner, what I had meant by my conduct if I did not intend to marry Monsieur de la Tourelle—I had received his visits, his presents. All his various advances without showing any unwillingness or repugnance— ... what could I do but hang my head, and silently consent to the rapid enunciation of the only course which now remained for me if I would not be esteemed a heartless coquette all the rest of my days? (Gaskell 297)

These words illustrate Gaskell's denouncement of the Victorian idea of marriage as what every woman should aspire to. Somehow, Madame Rupprecht leads Anna into an unwanted marriage, maybe also moved by jealousy, as it is Anna and not her daughter Sophia who marries de la Tourelle. At this point, it is important to emphasise that Gaskell strives to make clear that danger for women is not only caused by tyrannical

men, but also women. As we have already seen, she repeatedly shows that women are perfectly able to inflict grief, execute wicked actions, cause others' misfortunes, etc. The author also hints that jealousy is a dangerous companion as it can lead a woman to her evillest version.

However, Gaskell does not neglect to deal with male tyranny, which is also exposed and denounced in other writings. We can point out that, after her marriage, Anna moves to live with her husband in his castle. She fears him because after their marriage he becomes rude and bad-tempered, and turns out to be an authoritarian and tyrannical man: "These little events and plans were the only variations in my life for the first twelve months, if I except the alternations in M. de la Tourelle's temper, his unreasonable anger and his passionate fondness" (303). Moreover, de la Tourelle forces Anna to cut off contact both with her family and her friends, compelling her to an isolated life. When Anna discovers that her husband is, also, the leader of a gang of murderers and that he killed his former wife because she knew too much, she is forced to run away to save her life. In her escape, she is assisted by her maid, Amante. It should be mentioned here that both, Amante and her relationship with Anna, have been usually studied by critics as a consequence of the maid's name; her role, as she plays both male and female roles throughout the narrative; and the relationship that flourished between the two characters throughout the story (Reddy (1985), Nectoux (2001), Foster (2013), McCord (2015), among others). In this vein, Haefele-Thomas (2012) points out two different types of relationship between both characters, first a mother-daughter one, while they are still in de la Tourelle's home and at the first steps of their fled, and then a love relationship "through the course of their wanderings as husband and wife" (68), once both cross-dressed entering the queer space of a heterosexual couple. Now, beyond the possible sentimental relationship between Anna and Amante, what Gaskell illustrates here is that other families, beyond the traditional one, are possible. This can also be seen in the novels *Ruth* and *Cranford,* and in "The Old Nurse's Story," as Hester takes care of little Rosamond, and later considers Rosamond's children her own grandchildren. In this regard, we can again mention Haefele-Thomas, who states that:

> Whereas, in "The Old Nurse's Story" and "The Grey Woman," Gaskell takes her critique a step further when she not only exposes the weakness of biological family

> bonds, but through her Gothic kinships, looks to the strength and the tenacity of chosen families that are forged through adversity.
>
> Through those who are truly 'most intimately concerned' – the plucky Hester and the daring Amante – Gaskell exemplifies the ways that emotional ties rather than legal or familial ones can act as revolutionary examples of the ways that 'family' can be defined. These two tales illustrate the ways that gender, class and subversions of 'normative' heterosexual family structures could function together to create transgressive critiques and narratives.
>
> These 'devious' families actually prove to be much more loyal and loving than the ones society then (and now, for that matter) would deem 'normal' and 'good'. For Gaskell, love makes a family. (45)

As a final note on "The Grey Woman," we should mention that Gaskell presents fear as a crucial element in this tale, where she portrays Anna as a character consumed by her persistent fear from her wedding day till the end of her days: fear of her husband, fear of running away, fear that her husband will find and kill her, and fear that the creature that grows inside her (given that at the moment of escape she is pregnant) will be a boy who can follow in his father's footsteps. All these fears end up turning Anna into the grey woman of the title, with a ghostly appearance.

> … But the perpetual state of terror in which I had been during the whole months succeeding my escape from Les Rochers made me loathe the idea of ever again walking in the open daylight, exposed to the sight and recognition of every passer-by… (336)
>
> … there I lived in the same deep retirement, never seeing the full light of day … my yellow hair was grey, my complexion was ashen-coloured, no creature could have recognized the fresh-coloured, bright-haired young woman of eighteen months before. … They called me the Grey Woman. (339)

Another example of male tyranny, as discussed above, is that of Lord Furnivall in "The Old Nurse's Story." Lord Furnivall is described throughout the tale as a fierce, severe old man, eaten up with pride (26), to the point of throwing Maude and her daughter out of his castle when he discovers her secret marriage:

> Once fearful night, just after New Year had come in, when the snow was lying thick and deep, and the flakes were still falling—fast enough to blind anyone who might be about and abroad—there was a great and violent noise heard, and the old lord's voice above all, cursing and swearing awfully, and the cries of a little child, and the proud defiance of a fierce woman, and the sound of a blow, and a dead stillness, and moans and wailings dying away on the hill-side! Then the old lord summoned all his servants, and told them, with terrible oaths, and words more terrible, that his daughter had disgraced herself, and that he had turned out of doors—her, and her child—and that if ever they gave her help, or food, or shelter, he prayed that they might never enter heaven. (28)

Although in Gaskell's Gothic tales women usually appear as victimized by men (Kranzler, xi), she also shows through her narrative the existence of men such as Lois' father and her beloved, or Anna's father and the doctor to whom she finally marries (Dr. Voss), all of them described by the author as goodhearted, friendly, and affectionate men concerned with the welfare of those around them. In this regard, and after Amante's death, Anna gets married again to a young and tender doctor. He knows Anna's whole story, as Amante tells him on her deathbed, and wants to marry her and protect her and her daughter.

It is interesting to remind the following words of Julia McCord, who defends that:

> Gaskell moves beyond typical feminist critiques of male power within the family and shows women's vital and powerful role in replicating the oppression of the public world within the private sphere ... Stoneman argues,

> Gaskell's inclusion of female tyrants represents "a rational challenge to the institutions of the family and the law ...".
>
> Indeed, Gaskell complicates gendered boundaries in order to deconstruct a Ruskinian notion of home as sanctuary ... Home is not always a refuge, even in the absence of the tyrannical authority wielded by villains of eighteenth-century Gothic fiction ... Patriarchy is not just a problem of male authority, in other words, but instead an invasive and systemic problem within the family structure itself ... (70)

It can be suggested that one of the main intentions of Gaskell's writing is to show that not everything was so polarized in the Victorian period, a time maybe characterised by more greyness than what has traditionally been assumed. And to do so, Gaskell goes beyond the typical feminist critique and shows in her works the vital and powerful role of women. Thus, the fact that Gaskell complicates gendered boundaries through the representation of not just strong and powerful women, but also wicked ones, as well as presenting men who do not fit to the villain stereotype, rather than a challenge to the institution of the family, it can be considered an example of the greyness she tries to reflect.

Gaskell believes in the institution of the family, but she is also aware of its imperfections and dangers and, as the realist author she is, she exposes them in her writings. Furthermore, both in her major novels and in her tales, Gaskell always confronts the reader with characters that do not follow the Victorian stereotypes, as *effeminate* men (Mr Hale in *North and South*, Osborne Hamley in *Wives and Daughters*, de la Tourelle in "The Grey Woman"), *manly* women (Amante in 'The Grey Woman'), kind and good-natured men (Job Legh in *Mary Barton*, doctor Voss in 'The Grey Woman', …) alongside cruel and tyrannical ones (de la Tourelle in "The Grey Woman", young Mr Carson in *Mary Barton*, Bellingham in *Ruth*, ...), and strong and independent women (Mary in *Mary Barton*, Margaret in *North and South*, Molly in *Wives and Daughters*, …) among others, and being all of them examples of the fact that Victorian period, as we have just mentioned, was perhaps a time characterised by more greyness than what has traditionally been assumed.

4. Conclusion

Issues such as domesticity problems, the dark side of female identity, and the tyranny of a patriarchal society like the Victorian one, which victimised and subjugated its women, are the main problems that Gaskell presents and condemns in her short fiction, where danger for women comes from home, a supposedly peaceful and safe space. This danger is even more interesting to find in the works of a writer like Gaskell, who is known for her defence of marriage and domestic life. In addition, the threat comes not only from tyrannical fathers or husbands but also from sisters, female cousins, or sisters-in-law. Thus, through these stories Gaskell denounces the social problems of her time by giving voice to silenced women. It can be concluded that the importance of Gaskell's Gothic tales lies in the fact that, in her texts, what is truly terrifying is the actual possibility of their realisation. More than the supernatural elements, gloomy castles, and tense atmospheres, which are mere settings or consequences of evil acts, what are frightening are their causes: jealousy, revenge, tyranny, etc. These are, culturally and socially speaking, the evils of her time, and what Gaskell actually denounces in her works. The choice of a non-realistic genre such as the Gothic may have made it easier for readers to accept and assimilate what she wanted to denounce. And, as Elizabeth Ludlow and Rebecca Styler state, "The form of the short story is not accidental to these Gothic themes, since it could evade the pressure towards resolution that novels were bound by to please the popular taste pandered to by circulating libraries" (10). As Margaret Davison has pointed out, the Gothic "serves as a barometer of socio-cultural anxieties in its exploration of the dark side of individuals, cultures and nations – to interrogate socially dictated and institutionally entrenched attitudes and laws relating to gender roles, identities and relations" (125), to explore new ways to convey social criticism and reach the public.

Thus, we can finally conclude that Gaskell was aware of the world in which she lived and clearly denounced the woes of her time in all her texts, condemning, as we have seen, male tyranny and the situation of Victorian women, thus giving voice to the voiceless. But, as a woman who was aware of the world around her, she also criticised those who, moved by jealousy, envy, pride... acted maliciously, regardless of their sex or status, thereby showing that not every man was a tyrant and nor every woman an innocent victim. And, to this end, she turned to the

Gothic since, thanks to the distance the genre itself establishes between reality and fiction, it allowed her to launch sharper and more incisive criticism.

Works Cited

Davison, Carol Margaret. "The Victorian Gothic and Gender." *The Victorian Gothic: An Edinburgh Companion*, edited by Andrew Smith and William Hughes, Edinburgh UP, 2012, pp. 124-141.

Foster, Shirley. "Elizabeth Gaskell's shorter pieces." *The Cambridge Companion to Elizabeth Gaskell,* edited by Jill L. Matus, Cambridge UP, 2007, pp. 108-130.

Gaskell, Elizabeth. *Gothic Tales*, edited by Laura Kranzler, Penguin, 2004.

Haefele-Thomas, Ardel. *Queer Others in Victorian Gothic: Transgressing Monstrosity*. U of Wales P, 2012.

Haefele-Thomas, Ardel. "'Those most intimately concerned': the strength of chosen family in Elizabeth Gaskell's Gothic short fiction." In Andeweg, Agnes and Zlosnik, Sue (eds.) *Gothic Kinship*. Manchester UP, 2013, pp. 30-47.

Kranzler, Laura. Introduction. *Gothic Tales* by Elizabeth Gaskell. Penguin, 2004, pp. xi-xxxii.

Lambert, Carolyn. Review of Diana Wallace, *Female Gothic Histories: Gender, History and the Gothic.* Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2013. *The Gaskell Journal*, vol. 27, 2013, pp. 140-144. (Accessed 09 December 2013)

Ludlow, Elizabeth, and Rebecca Styler. "Elizabeth Gaskell and the Short Story." *The Gaskell Journal*, vol. 29, 2015, pp. 1-22. (Accessed 19 July 2018)

McCord Chavez, Julia. "Gaskell's Other Wives and Daughters: Reimagining the Gothic and Anticipating the Sensational in 'Lois the Witch' and 'The Grey Woman.'" *The Gaskell Journal*, vol. 29, 2015, pp. 59-78. (Accessed 09 January 2021)

Nectoux, Tracy Marie. *The Selected Short Stories of Elizabeth Gaskell: Gothic Tradition, Forgiveness and Redemption, and Female Friendships in Mrs. Gaskell's Short Fiction.* University of St Andrews, MPhil thesis. *St Andrews Research Repository*, 2001. https://research-repository.st-andrews.ac.uk/handle/10023/14749 (Accessed 29 May 2016)

Reddy, Maureen. T. "Gaskell's 'The Grey Woman': A Feminist Palimpsest." *The Journal of Narrative Technique*, vol. 15, no. 2, 1985, pp. 183–93, http://www.jstor.org/stable/30225125. (Accessed 18 July 2018)

Smith, Andrew, and William Hughes. "Introduction: Locating the Victorian Gothic." *The Victorian Gothic: An Edinburgh Companion*, edited by Andrew Smith and William Hughes, Edinburgh UP, 2012, pp. 1-14.

Spooner, Catherine, and Emma McEvoy, eds. *The Routledge Companion to Gothic.* Routledge, 2007.

Wallace, Diana. *Female Gothic Stories: Gender, Histories and the Gothic*. U of Wales P, 2013.

Warwick, Alexandra. "Victorian Gothic." *The Routledge Companion to Gothic,* edited by Catherine Spooner and Emma McEvoy, Routledge, 2007, pp. 29-37.

Williams, Merryn. *Women in the English Novel: 1800-1900.* Macmillan, 1985.

Received / Recibido: 1/4/2023 *Accepted / Aceptado: 14/4/2024*

Natural Imagery in Margaret Atwood's Recent Poetry

Pilar Sánchez Calle (psanchez@ujaen.es)
Universidad de Jaén

Abstract: Margaret Atwood's concern for nature, the earth and its species as well as for environmental topics has always populated her fiction and poetry. My aim in the present essay is to explore how Atwood represents nature in a selection of poems from her more recent poetry volumes (*Morning in the Burned House*, 1995; *The Door*, 2007; *Dearly*, 2020). Some poems in these collections attest to her concern for the environment, its degradation and poisoning. Others represent apocalyptic environmental relationships as well as themes of natural renewal as an effort to deal with human mortality and vulnerability. We also find poems where nature is presented as a commodity, as a repository of necessary knowledge or as a mythical resting place. Metamorphosis and change play essential roles both in human life and in the natural world, and figure prominently in the selected poems.
Keywords: Nature, imagery, environment, apocalypse, renewal, metamorphosis

Imágenes de la naturaleza en la poesía reciente de Margaret Atwood

Resumen: El interés de Margaret Atwood por la naturaleza, el planeta, y sus especies ha sido una constante en su ficción y poesía. El objetivo de este ensayo es explorar cómo Atwood representa la naturaleza en una selección de poemas de sus poemarios más recientes (*Morning in the Burned House*, 1995; *The Door*, 2007; *Dearly*, 2020). Algunos poemas en estas colecciones confirman su preocupación por la degradación y contaminación del entorno, mientras que otros abordan relaciones medioambientales apocalípticas además de temas como la renovación natural para afrontar la mortalidad y vulnerabilidad humanas. También hallamos poemas donde la naturaleza se representa como un bien de consumo, un repositorio de conocimiento imprescindible o un lugar mítico donde yacer después de la muerte. La metamorfosis y el cambio desempeñan papeles esenciales tanto en la vida humana como en el mundo natural y figuran de manera prominente en los poemas analizados.
Palabras clave: Naturaleza, imágenes, medio ambiente, apocalipsis, renovación, metamorfosis.

1. Introduction

Margaret Atwood's obsession with the interconnection between human beings and our natural environment has been pivotal since the publication of her first poetry collections (*Double Persephone* 1962, *The Circle Game*, 1966). In her well-known poem "This is a Photograph of Me" (*TCG*), "the representation of landscape possesses apocalyptic

overtones where the speaker occupies a liminal space -there but not there-" (Waltonen x),

> In the background there is a lake,
> and beyond that, some low hills.
>
> (The photograph was taken
> the day after I drowned.
>
> I am in the lake, in the center
> of the picture, just under the surface. ...) (ll.13-18)

Frank Gorjup argues that "the photograph of 'me' is the photograph of a landscape" (Gorjup 134). As Waltonen notes, the speaker in "After the Flood We" (*TCG*) shares that sense of natural destruction by wondering if someone else has survived a flood (x).

The collection *The Animals in that Country* (1968) includes several poems which relate environmental issues to more comprehensive philosophical concerns. Both the title poem "The Animals in that Country" and "The Festival" focus on the cultural contextualizations of animals, which Lothar Hönnighausen reads "in contrast to the sophisticated rituals of fox hunting in Britain or bull-fighting in Spain, the speaker in those poems describes how the deaths of animals in Canada occur as banal road accidents" (100). "Progressive Insanities of a Pioneer," an early poem about the Canadian wilderness, represents nature as a fluid and unconfined entity, conveying the white man's fear of being devoured by the vastness of an unknown space (see Gorjup 132). The documents describing borders and walls that endow him with the possession of the wild land become useless when the wilderness surrounds him, and highlight the disconnected relationship he/we have with the natural world (see Maxwell 8). For Charlotte Beyer, this poem "recreates the destructive consequences of human attempts to dominate nature and control what we fear or do not understand" (283).

The Journals of Susanna Moodie (1970) and *Procedures for Underground* (1970) both place emphasis on the power of landscape to shape the human mind. In the first volume, Atwood recreates the voice of Canada's most famous woman pioneer, Susanna Moodie. Gorjup claims that the poetic persona, a fictional Susanna Moodie, embodies the tensions between the civilized world she has left and the chaotic and unpredictable Canadian

wilderness she has entered (136). The titles of the opening poems in *Procedures for Underground*, "Dream: Bluejay or Archeopteryx," "The Small Cabin," "Two Gardens," "The Shrunken Forest," "Midwinter, Presolstice" reveal a similar setting to that of Atwood's novel *Surfacing*, a northern Quebec bush. According to Shannon Hengen, speakers in these poems struggle to accept that we all exist between nature and culture, and that we can escape neither (Hengen, "Atwood and Environmentalism" 76).

"Spring Poem" (*You Are Happy*, 1974) articulates the potential for rebirth after personal and environmental disaster, as Lauren Maxwell has pointed out (2). In "Marsh, Hawk" (*Two-Headed Poems*, 1978), the speaker tries to understand the voice of a degraded natural environment. This poem anticipates the inscrutability of the languages of nature developed in "Marsh Languages," written almost twenty years later (*Morning in the Burned House*, 1995). In *True Stories* (1981), Atwood uses the cycles of nature in "Vultures" and "Mushrooms" as metaphors for human behaviour. The poems "Bluejays," "Damside," and "Blue Dwarfs" depict nature as a refuge and consolation for the speaker who is suffering because of her partner's illness. "High Summer" reimagines the natural world in existential terms, as a mysterious other that resists appropriation and domestication (see Jarraway 280). And, according to Hengen, the poems "The Burned House" and "A Blazed Trail", from *Interlunar* (1984), continue with the theme of nature's very slow but very certain power to self-renew ("Atwood and Environmentalism" 77).

My aim in the present essay is to explore and discuss how Atwood approaches and represents nature and the environment in a selection of poems from her last three poetry collections *Morning in the Burned House* (1995), *The Door* (2007) and *Dearly* (2021). To this end, my theoretical background involves Sherrill Grace's concept of "violent duality" in her definition of Atwood's aesthetics, as well as Gorjup's ideas on the presence of oppositional forces in Atwood's poetry, such as civilization and nature, male and female, self and other, subject and object (130-131). Gorjup refers to Atwood's poetic world as protean and fluid, governed by principles of uncertainty and accident as well as cause and effect, where previous dualities can be transcended and the gap that separates the self from the natural world can be closed (132). Hengen also insists on the play of contrasts and contrasting imagery that identifies Atwood's poetry.

According to Hengen, in a number of Atwood's poems, the presence of elements from the natural world such as stones, trees or the moon seem apart from the human field of language, lust, murder, love. Humans appear unable to understand the natural world as both different from and part of themselves, which leads to the destruction of the human and natural worlds ("Strange Visions" 43). Building on previous reflections on Atwood's play of contrasts and opposed imagery, this discussion will demonstrate how a duality between apocalyptic environmental relationships and themes of survival and rebirth operates in nature. Atwood's interest in apocalypse can be traced back to her earliest works, such as *The Circle Game* (1966) and *The Animals in that Country* (1968). Critic Karma Waltonen describes several definitions of apocalypse, which range from an extinction level event to end times (end of a civilization, population, world, time, relationship or individual time). She also mentions that the oldest definition, a religious one, is of revelation, that is, truth revealed in a time of darkness (Waltonen x). This inconvenient truth is evident in Atwood's poems addressing environmental destruction, climate change and the extinction of species. Some of these apocalyptic overtones participate of Atwood's fascination with mortality. In her 2002 essay *Negotiating with the Dead*, she states that "*all* writing of the narrative kind, and perhaps all writing, is motivated, deep down, by a fear of and a fascination with mortality -by the desire to make the risky trip to the Underworld, and to bring back something or someone back from the dead." (156, emphasis in original). But, like the title of one of her early poems, "After the Flood We," after her downward journey to extinction, and the death of species, air and trees, Atwood recovers nature's own power and its constant cycles of death and renewal which offer a promise of eternal rebirth. Rebirth is linked to survival, a prevalent topic in Atwood's writing and in Canadian literature more broadly. In fact, *Survival*, published in 1972 is the title of Atwood's foundational work on Canadian literature. A key feature of both rebirth and survival is metamorphosis. Then the apocalyptic scenario gives way to nature presented as refuge for the living and mythical resting place for the dead. The wonders of the natural world offer consolation and may strengthen our sense of environmental belonging positively. Atwood does not romanticise nature as merely a passive refuge; instead she acknowledges its complexities and occasional harshness. This dynamic understanding of nature as both beautiful and indifferent pushes readers to confront their place within the larger ecosystem, ultimately fostering a deeper connection and appreciation for the environment.

2. *Morning in the Burned House* (1995)

Aging, male-female relationships, reflections on death, dramatic monologues spoken by women of myth, legend and popular culture (Ava Gardner, Manet's Olympia, Helen of Troy, Daphne) appear in this poetry collection. We also find elegiac compositions where Atwood evokes the figure of her recently departed father (the entomologist Carl Atwood deceased in 1993), often depicting him outdoors, in a natural landscape. Other poems delve into the deterioration of the natural world and into nature's perpetual cycle of death and life.

In "Marsh Languages", Atwood explores the presence of a pre-patriarchal, pre-colonisation "mother tongue," as well as the possibility of imagining languages which are linked to the feminine and to the natural world. The poem starts with a crisis scenario in which those languages are threatened, possibly by environmental degradation,

> The dark soft languages are being silenced
> Mothertongue Mothertongue Mothertongue
> falling one by one back into the moon (ll. 1-3)

The speaker anthropomorphizes nature by attributing it linguistic abilities, but implies that this linguistic vitality and diversity are at risk of being lost. The cells present in the vegetation of marshes and in the roots of rushes are in a constant process of replication till the "pathways of hidden light in the body fade and wink out" (l. 9). This progression can be interpreted as an anticipation of biological death,

> Languages of marshes,
> language of the roots of rushes tangled
> together in the ooze,
> marrow cells twinning themselves
> inside the warm core of the bone:
> pathways of hidden light in the body fade and wink out.
> (ll. 4-9)

The poetic voice evokes emotive connections between humans and non-human matter by parallelling the materiality of the earth with the materiality of human bodies. The natural, non-human world finds expression in language, and different matters speak different languages: "languages of marshes" (l. 4), "language of the roots" (l. 5), "the cave

languages" (l. 11), "The languages of the dying suns" (l. 19). According to Meredith Minister, by ascribing speech and emotion to non-human entities, the poem constructs a dynamic image of matter that possesses potential beyond human agency (18).

The vocabulary of stanzas one to four foreshadows an impending apocalypse in which vitality is removed from matter, "silenced" (l.1), "fade," "wink out" (l. 9), "lost syllable" (l. 14), "no longer/heard" (ll. 15-16), "no longer spoken" (l.16), "ceased to exist" (l. 18), "dying" (l. 20).

> Language of marshes,
> language of the roots of rushes tangled
> together in the ooze,
> marrow cells twinning themselves
> inside the warm core of the bone:
> pathways of hidden light in the body fade and wink out.
>
> The sibilants and gutturals,
> the cave language, the half-light
> forming at the back of the throat,
> the mouth's damp velvet moulding
> the lost syllable for 'I' that did not mean separate,
> all are becoming sounds no longer
> heard because no longer spoken,
> and everything that could once be said in them has
> ceased to exist. (ll. 4-18)

Matter must speak in order to mean and, if it ceases to speak, it will cease to exist. Speech is not just a logically and grammatically correct sequence of words but it involves cherishing, farewell and longing,

> The languages of the dying suns
> are themselves dying,
> but even the word for this has been forgotten.
> The mouth against skin, vivid and fading,
> can no longer speak both cherishing and farewell.
> It is now only a mouth, only skin.
> There is no more longing. (ll. 19-25).

Lines 22-24, "The mouth against the skin, vivid and fading,/can no longer speak both cherishing and farewell./It is now only a mouth, only

skin" illustrate the dissociation of language from matter and demonstrate the deadliness of the human agent who has attempted to deny the vitality of matter and has destroyed it in the process (Minister 18). By refusing to recognize the life and value inherent in the natural world, we contribute to its degradation, and ultimately, to our own loss. This dissociation feels familiar in a world where environmental devastation is often a result of human detachment from nature's vitality.

The fifth stanza changes into short, dry and hard lines, as it depicts the devastation derived from the silencing of the languages of biodiversity, of the natural world: the impossibility of translation (Beyer 294), "the one language that has eaten all others." (l. 32), because translation, as Tegan Zimmerman states (348), involves recognising and respecting the other, in this case, the languages of nature. Military terms such as "conquest" (l. 28) and "metal" (l. 30) insinuate violence against nature. Only the human agent and the human language survive. Translation did not exist because it involves equivalence and the speaker mentions "conquest", (ll. 27-28), that is to say, the subjugation of one language to the other,

> Translation was never possible.
> Instead there was only
> conquest, the influx
> of the language of hard nouns,
> the language of metal,
> the language of either/or,
> the one language that has eaten all others. (ll. 26-32)

The "sibilants and gutturals" (l. 10), the "mothertongue" (l. 2) and "the lost syllable for "I" that did not mean separate" (l. 14); these organic images that provided "a sense of fluidity and of the connectedness of all beings," as Beyer notes (294), have dissolved into the unified discourse of the hard nouns, the language of metal and the binary language of either/or. The poem anticipates an apocalypse stemming from human interactions with the natural world. But, according to Minister, attributing agency to matter may stop this future apocalypse. The world can reorganise in unexpected ways. By assigning linguistic agency to matter ("Language of marshes/language of the roots of rushes tangled", ll. 4-5), the poem challenges anthropocentric discourses that either presuppose human control over nature or that humans bear the responsibility of paternalistically caring for nature (Minister 19).

"The Ottawa River by Night" is one of the elegiac poems devoted to Atwood's father included in this volume. The opening line evokes a nocturnal dreamscape, "In the full moon you dream more" (l. 1), and then the poetic persona introduces the father figure within the context of death. She recalls two factual episodes in her life (ll. 4, 11). The first one describes a canoeing accident where children died, which anticipates the father's death,

> In the full moon you dream more.
> I know where I am: the Ottawa River
> far up, where the dam goes across.
> Once, midstorm, in the wide cold water
> upstream, two long canoes full
> of children tipped, and they all held hands
> and sang till the chill reached their hearts. (ll. 4-7)

This canoeing accident contrasts with the speaker's own canoe trip with her father along a lake (ll. 11-19). Images of the father on a canoe accumulate till the final part of the poem when the father rows in a boat towards the sea before disappearing,

> Once, my father
> and I paddled seven miles
> along a lake near here
> at night, with the trees like a pelt of dark
> hackles, and the waves hardly moving.
> In the moonlight the way ahead was clear
> and obscure both. I was twenty
> and impatient to ge there, thinking
> such a thing existed. (ll. 11-19)

The natural landscape appears as threatening, "(…) trees like a pelt of dark/hackles, and the waves hardly moving." (ll.14-15). The lake's dead calm contrasts with the young woman's impatience, "(…) I was twenty/ and impatient to get there, (…)". (ll. 17-18). In the third stanza the speaker returns to the dream vision that foresees her father's death. He is paddling his canoe surrounded by man-made structures and a natural landscape,

> (...) Just the thick square-
> edged shape of the dam, and eastward

> the hills of sawdust from the mill, gleaming as white
> as dunes. To the left, stillness; to the right,
> the swirling foam of rapids
> over sharp rocks and snags; and below that, my father,
> moving away downstream
> in his boat, so skilfully
> although dead, I remember now; but no longer as old. (ll. 21-29)

The sea is the father's final destination, but, according to Janice Fiamengo (159), an unbridgeable gap has opened between the real sea and the "other sea" (l. 34),

> (...) He's heading eventually
> to the sea. Not the real one, with its sick whales
> and oil slicks, but the other sea, where there can still be
> safe arrivals. (...) (ll. 32-35).

Two unacceptable losses are alluded to in the previous lines, that of the speaker's father and the human destruction of the natural world. This is represented in the image of a polluted seas with "sick whales" and "oil slicks", as Fiamengo has noted (159). However, the speaker imagines her father as the energetic and skilfull person he once was. He is not old anymore. The father's restored energy and agency identifies him with "the swirling foam of rapids" (l. 25).

> the swirling foam of rapids
> over sharp rocks and snags; and below that, my father,
> moving away downstream
> in his boat, so skilfully
> although dead, I remember now; but no longer as old. (ll. 25-29)

In the face of death, he has overcome passivity and is in control of his final voyage, as Sara Jamieson has pointed out (60). The paradisal "other sea" (l. 34) of "safe arrivals" (l. 35) serves as a resting place for the father, who becomes an integral part of it.

In the final stanza, the speaker wakes up from the dream and can still hear the distant sound of the sea waves on a beach and a figure (her father) striding along the shore,

> Only a dream, I think, waking
> to the sound of nothing.
> Not nothing. I heard: it was a beach, or shore,
> and someone far off, walking (ll. 36-39)

Jamieson (61) affirms that the the sound of the father's footsteps walking on the shore echoes John Milton's lament for the absent body of Lycidas, which "the shores and sounding seas/Wash far away" (ll. 154-155), however, in the present poem, the father is not the passive victim of the water. On the contrary, his agency and dynamism are highlighted. The entire poem is marked by the duality of life and death, the contrast between dreamlike and real landscapes, the dream world and reality, the idealised middle-aged father figure and the absent old, sick father; the reality of a polluted sea and the "other sea" as a mythic resting place where the father figure can rest in peace.

The first lines of "Vermilion Flycatcher, San Pedro River, Arizona" convey strong images of environmental degradation, "The river's been here, violent, right here where we're standing,/you can tell by the trash caught overhead in the trees" (ll. 1-2). After a flood, a tiny desert river remains, in the middle of a devastated landscape. This place is presented as a locus of death, the speaker standing in trash (l. 2) (see Van Spanckeren 113). The initial picture of desolation, flood and destruction contrasts with the energy of a red flycatcher, highlighted by the juxtaposition of present tense verbs, "A vermilion/flycatcher darts down, flutters up, perches." (ll. 4-5). The bird is indifferent to violence, devastation or death. Its dynamism possesses a magic quality, foregrounded by words such as "tranced" and "conjures" in "He's filled with joy/and the tranced rage of sex. How he conjures," (ll. 7-9).

I agree with Kathryn Van Spanckeren's view that the name "flycatcher" echoes the word "corpses" (113) and that its red color evokes blood, anticipating an upcoming violent death mentioned in the following stanza. The bird has been attracted by the dense weeds and sings despite or because of death. The corpse's "brown/or white skin" contrasts with the vermilion bird and the lack of water reinforces this place as a locus of death. The man's brown or white color symbolises the anonymous deaths of so many South American immigrants who try to cross the Mexico-United States border. The image of "vanished water," like the man's vanished dreams, reinforces this place as a death locus,

> (...) Everything bad you can imagine
> is happening somewhere else, or happened
> here, a hundred years of centuries
> ago. He sings, and there's the murder:
> you see it, forming under
> the shimmering air, a man with brown
> or white skin lying reversed
> in the vanished water, a spear
> or bullet in his back. At the ford, where the deer
> come at dusk to cross and drink
> and be ambushed. The red bird
> is sitting on the same tree, intensely
> bright in the sun that gleams on cruelty, on broken
> skullbone, arrow, spur. Vultures cluster,
> he doesn't care. He and his other-coloured mate
> ignore everything but their own rapture.
> Birds never dream, being their own. (ll. 10-27)

Like the phoenix, the vermilion flycatcher flutters up over a waste land, completely indifferent to desolation and death, and acting according to his own instincts. The bird suggests rebirth, and the denial of an environmental apocalypsis. It remains enigmatic ("Who knows what they remember? Birds never dream, being their own./Dreams, I mean. ...") (ll. 26-28), like the figure of the dead father in the previous poem, "The Ottawa River by Night". The final lines revisit the image of the river as locus of death and violence, "(...) As for you, the river/ that isn't there is the same one/ you could drown in, face down." (ll. 28-30), where the expression "Face down" functions as a counterpoint image of the dead man in lines 15-17, who lied "reversed". In this poem, the landscape is linked to apocalyptic images of desolation, dryness and death, as well as to images of life and rebirth.

3. *The Door* (2007)

This volume includes poems written between 1997 and 2007. Its poetic language articulates loss and acceptance rather than struggle. Among the most prevalent topics we encounter the author's repeated attention to childhood memories, the figures of her parents, reflections on death, as well as environmental poems.

"Reindeer Moss on Granite" celebrates the beauty, and richness of even the humblest natural things, such as reindeer moss. The speaker highlights its quiet potential for expression, revealing nature's ability to communicate in subtle, intricate ways:

> This is a tiny language,
> smaller than Gallic;
> when you have your boots on
> you scarcely see it. (ll. 1-4)

The human agent does not destroy nature, but becomes the patient witness who carefully appreciates the synonyms in the language of nature "A dry scorched dialect/with many words for holding on," (ll. 5-6). This merging of language and bodies is life-giving and opposes the death-dealing dissolution of language and bodies in "Marsh Languages," where the poetic persona referred to the human/nature binary.

Both poems share similar vocabulary (language, words, mouths, syllable), but in "Reindeer Moss on Granite", the speaker links the round syllables "*o*", "*o*" (l. 14) uttered by reindeer moss to the "dumbfounded/ eyes of minnows" (l. 15), thus associating sounds with shapes, and emphasizing the potential of nature to produce visual and sound messages. The poem shows the inadequacy of modes of language that assume either a domineering or paternalistic relation of humans to nature.

> In the final lines,
> Thousands of spores, of rumours
> infiltrating the fissures,
> moving unnoticed into
> the ponderous is of the boulder,
> breaking down rock. (ll. 16-20)

The key to arrest environmental degradation is to remain as respectful witnesses and listeners to "spores" which are presented in form of linguistic agents ("rumours") whose powerful impact on other natural elements is alien to human intervention. The sequence of gerunds ("infiltrating," "moving," "breaking") highlights their independent actions.

"Bear Lament" insists on some of Atwood's environmental worries by referring to the degradation of the living conditions of bears. The

apocalyptic overtones intensify as the poem unfolds, emphasizing the connection between natural disasters and personal loss and crisis. The poem opens with the mythic figure of a bear, and the speaker's fantasy to inhabit its body as a form of refuge and consolation against the burdens of life. The apparently naive speaker projects a benevolent vision of the bear, "(...) Let you enter /into its cold wise ice bear secret / house, as in old stories. (...)" (ll. 8-10), longing for its strength, "(...) its big paw / big paw big paw big paw" (ll. 4-5), which reveals his/her intimate wish to find a safe haven in nature,

> You once believed if you could only
> crawl inside a bear, its fat and fur,
> lick it with its stubby tongue, take on
> its ancient shape, its big paw
> big paw big paw big paw
> heavy-footed plod that keeps
> the worldwide earthwork solid, this would
> save you, in a crisis. Let you enter
> into its cold wise ice bear secret
> house, as in old stories. In a desperate
> pinch. That it would share
> its furry winter dreamtime, insulate
> you anyway from all the sharp and lethal
> shrapnel in the air, and then the other million
> cuts and words and fumes
> and viruses and blades. But no,
> not any more. I saw a bear last year,
> against the sky, a white one,
> rearing up with something of its former
> heft. But it was thin as ribs
> and growing thinner. Snuffing the brand-new
> absences of rightful food
> it tastes as ripped-out barren space
> erased of meaning. So, scant
> comfort there. (ll. 1-25)

The repetition of "paw" echoes "pa," the shortened version of the word "papa," evoking the speaker's desire for the protection symbolised by totem animals, such as the bear in indigenous tales, where they serve as spiritual guides and guardians. Although the speaker desires to be

saved/safe in the bear and with the patriarch of the family, she concludes that bears in those stories no longer exist, and father figures no longer protect, and maybe they never did.

In the first two stanzas, the poetic voice is a "you" which simultaneously includes both the reader and the speaker, as is typical in most poems by Atwood, whereas the third one opens with an "I". The change of pronoun in the poetic voice emphasizes the transition from wishful thinking, dreams and tales in the initial stanzas, to the reality of skinny bears in the third one, "it was thin as ribs/and growing thinner" (ll. 20-21). The bear is placed in a desolate landscape deprived of food or water, without life, "Sniffing the brand-new/absences of rightful food/ it tastes as ripped-out barren space" (ll. 21-23), consequence of human intervention as suggested by the expression "ripped-out" (23). This human desert is different from the natural desertic area mentioned in the poem "Vermilion Flycatcher, San Pedro River, Arizona," which is a dry place, not a waste land, and where life emerges in the form of a red bird.

The restlessness experienced by the poetic persona concludes with several disturbing questions in the final lines, revealing his/her anxiety,

> Oh bear, what now?
> And will the ground
> still hold? And how
> much longer? (ll. 26-29)

The degradation of the natural world is linked to a feeling of personal alienation and crisis. The poetic voice has evolved from an inclusive "you" to a realistic "I" now witness to a potential environmental disaster; from the fairy tale world where bears offered comfort and wisdom to the possibility of their extinction. These animals represent the otherness of nature whose once-intimate connections with human beings have grown tenuous, thus severing its potential for regeneration and rebirth.

4. *Dearly* (2020)

Atwood's more recent poetry collection features a diverse range of poems, both in form and tone, often with the playful language, social commentary, detachment, irony and humour that characterise her poetic

work. Atwood deals with the passing of time, and the painful loss of a loved one, her long-time companion Graeme Gibson, as Montassine argues (109). Other poems continue her exploration of the impact of language on our representation of reality. The relationships between human beings and the environment, the wonders of the natural world, the way other creatures, even the humblest ones, form connections and communicate also appear as relevant topics. By shedding light on darkness around us, this poetry collection insists that loss, both in the human and environmental sense, makes what is most dear more apparent. The effects of what might be lost if we do not cultivate a sense of environmental belonging become prevalent.

The poem "Aflame" starts with the image of a world in flames. Part of the first line alludes to an ecological catastrophe, "The world's burning up." (...), (l. 1), which is immediately discarded by the sharp and colloquial conclusion of that initial line, "(...) It always did." (l. 1). Images of heat and burning, together with black and grey colors populate the rest of the stanza,

> Lightning would strike, the resin
> in the conifers explode, the black peat smoulder,
> greying bones glow slowly, and the fallen leaves
> turn brown and writhe, like paper
> held to candle. It's the scent of autumn, (ll. 2-5)

The speaker describes nature's regular cycles of death and renewal, and uses the pronoun "you" to persuade the reader to side with it, "(...) It's the scent of autumn,/oxidation: you can smell it on your skin,/that sunburn perfume." (ll. 6-8).

The second stanza recreates children's apocalyptic stories, full of fires, matches, smoke, fake volcanoes. There was always something burning in their "ardent stories" (l. 13), even "marshmallows on fire on purpose" (17). Children play with fire and enjoy its promises of adventure and entertainment, as far as it remains a harmless pastime.

The poem ends with the poetic persona regretting that those innocent recreations of a world in flames have come true, "(...) All those yarns/ of charred apocalypse concocted/back when we played with matches-" (ll. 10-12). The apocalyptic stories they sealed in bottles and threw into

the sea as part of a game (ll. 21-22) have broken the "lead seals" (24) and emerged in a monstruous way. But, why complain, if, ironically, the speaker states that their childhood reverie of smoke, fire, burning and volcanoes has materialised. They, we, all of us, are experiencing the apocalyptic scenario we never thought could abandon the symbolic realm of tales, children's games or messages in bottles,

> We had to know
> how such tales really end:
> and why.
> They end in flames. (ll. 28-31)

The painful repetition of line 28, "We had to know" insists on our condition as fake victims of a world in flames. Playing with fire is never innocent, and inevitably, we must confront and cope with its consequences. The use of the pronoun "we" highlights our common responsibility. The dream of flames engenders monsters, the monsters of a devastated environment where the flames, candles and ardent stories of our childhood have become more real than ever.

"Feather" offers a more benign connection between the speaker and the natural world. The poetic voice reflects on the handfuls of feathers that fall on her "quasi-lawn!" (l. 5) and wonders why they are there. We find associations with writing ("calligraphy of wrecked wings", l. 7) and a new reading of the myth of Icarus, "remains of a god that melted/ too near the moon." (ll. 8-9). These "wrecked wings" seem to anticipate what we can read in the fourth and fifth stanzas, that "Every life is a failure//at the last hour,/the hour of dried blood. (ll. 12-14). These lines depict a downfall heading to the ground and to death, no matter how high flyers we once were, birds or persons. However, the speaker is saved by her intimate belief in nature's powers for renewal and rebirth. Instead of indulging herself/himself on the fragments of a bird, instead of hunting birds, he/she "hunted for ink" (l. 18) and decided to use one of the feathers for a creative activity, that of writing a poem,

> (...) I picked up one plume from the slaughter,
> sharpened and split the quill,
> hunted for ink,
> and drew this poem
> with you, dead bird.

> With your spent flight,
> with your fading panic,
> with your eye spiralling down,
> with your night. (ll. 16-24)

The use of the anaphora “With your” and the syntactic parallelism in the final four lines accentuate the contrast between the dead bird and the vitality infused by the poet. The remains of the bird do not represent death or decadence anymore, but are endowed with the potential for life, the life of art. As we read in lines 15 and 16, “But nothing, we like to think,// is wasted, (...)”, the speaker has been able to resurrect the bird’s “spent life” (l. 21). From the ashes of its “fading panic” (l. 22), and its “eye spiralling down” (l. 23), a new phoenix emerges, symbolising the neverending cycle of life and death in nature.

“Short Takes on Wolves” presents four playful vignettes about wild creatures as commodities available to be consumed by twenty-first century men and women. The poem is divided into four “takes”, similar to cinematographic sections in a film. In an ironic and didactic tone, the poetic persona explains details about wolves to an ignorant audience, treating them like simpletons, as when he/she says “A wolf in pain/admits nothing” (l. 1), “You can’t go far with a ripped foot:/among wolves, no doctors. (ll. 6-7), “A wolf is courteous up to a point.” (l. 8)

“Take iii” opens with a string of imperatives the speaker/teacher delivers to a passive crowd who want to see a wolf in its natural habitat, “Sit in the dark. Keep quiet.” (l. 12) Ecological and sophisticated people hate zoos as disgusting locations, but wish to observe wolves without taking risks, without all those dead hours nature photographers must spend in hiding to obtain the perfect take. These spectators are in a hurry, and have paid to see a wolf in the wilderness, but / yet the wolf shies away from contact with people, “You want to see the wolf/or demand your money back,/but the wolf doesn’t want to see you.” (ll. 17-19).

“Take iv” establishes a duality between wolves’ nightmares and dreams. The former are populated by hard metal elements that prefigure violence and death (“cars,” “long needles,” and “iron muzzles”). Wolves are prisoners in “cramped cages with hard bars” (l. 23) where the smell of humans repels their nostrils. The last stanza, that of wolves’ dreams, relates to open spaces (“endless taiga,” l. 25), freedom, dens

instead of man-made cages as well as the tender bones of caribous. The commodification of nature and wild creatures produces monstruous situations and limits humans' respect for the natural world.

The long poem "Plasticene Suite" is composed of nine sections dealing with environmental degradation derived from the abuse of plastic materials. We are going to discuss sections 1 and 7, "Rock-like Object on Beach" and "Whales." The noun "plasticene" has been invented after some geological eras such as Paleocene, Eocene, Miocene and Pleistocene. Which name would suit our age best but "the Plasticene"? (l. 3)? Ours is the age of plastic. The first stanza presents a littany of the earth's geological eras, "The Paleocene the Eocene/the Miocene the Pleistocene"/and now we're here: the Plasticene." (ll. 1-3). The poetic voice evolves from neutrality to a colloquial and ironic tone everybody can share, "and now we're here: the Plasticene." (l. 3).

The speaker is walking along a beach and paying attention to all the stones on the sand. She seems to be talking to herself and to anybody, in a persistent colloquial tone. Among the natural remains, she detects something she cannot identify at first sight. It does not belong to the rocks he/she has enumerated so far, "It's black and striped and slippery,/ not exactly rock/and not not." (ll. 7-9). It is described in the following stanza as "Petrified oil, with a vein of scarlet,/part of a bucket maybe." (ll.11-12). The last two stanzas imagine a future where humans have become extinct and a new race of aliens colonize the earth. Again, the poetic persona ironizes over plastic objects being fossils of our transit in this world. In the final stanza, some rhetorical questions condense the lights and shadows of the human condition: our intelligence, wit and vanity can lead us to a premature death. The word "puzzle" (l. 14) evokes what an external observer may feel when reflecting on human relationships with the environment,

> When we are gone and the aliens come
> to puzzle out our fossils:
> will this be evidence?
>
> Of us: of our too-brief history,
> our cleverness, our thoughtlessness,
> our sudden death? (ll. 16-18)

Section 7, "Whales," shares the self-questioning attitude and colloquial tone of the previous section. The speaker, a collective "we" describes a scene in a TV documentary where a mother whale carries a dead baby whale for several days, its death caused by "toxic plastic." The key lines in the poem are "how did we do this by just living/in the normal way" (ll. 10-11). The normal person who is a good citizen and just leads a normal life, "cutting our way to our food/through the layer by layer that/keeps it fresher" (16-18). The poetic persona even defends this way of life, considering how plastic has contributed to human survival, "What happened before?/How did we ever survive/with only paper and glass and tin" (ll. 18-20). However, those layers of normality and plastic film prove lethal for the environment.

A sense of guilt is voiced in the sixth stanza, but with the hypocrisy of the TV witness. The lines that opened the poem, "Everyone cried when they saw it/in the square blue sea of the TV:/so big and sad" (ll. 1-3) are evoked again, "But now there's a dead whale/right there on the screen:/so big and sad (ll. 22-24). This ecological disaster leads to an apparently firm statement about action, "something must be done" (l. 25). However, the final stanza exemplifies the contradictions and the fake promises we use to deceive ourselves, "It will be! Will it be?/Will we decide to, finally?" (ll. 26-27). The use of the future tense reveals that we have already seen this movie and that we tend to underestimate our participation in ecological disaster. The collective speaker seems to involve everybody but maybe what is necessary is a strong individual action. When everybody is guilty, nobody really is.

In "Oh Children," the poetic persona builds an apocalyptic poem by posing questions to an audience of children. The repetition of the phrase "Oh children, will you grow up in a world without...?" (ll. 1, 13, 21), and the anaphoric lines "Will there be (..)? convey the speakers' fears and restlessness about the disappearance of the natural world he/she has been familiar with. The questions and the answers are simple but terrifying in their simplicity. A world without birds, crickets, pines or mosses, ice, mice or lichens. A world with waves, stones and dust. This vanishing open world of nature gives way to an apocalyptic scenario of "a sealed cave with an oxygen line," (l. 16), as the setting for these children's future lives, "Will your eyes blank out like the eggwhite eyes/of sunless fish?/In there, what will you wish for? (ll. 18-20). The words "blank,"

"eggwhite," and "sunless" echo the "world without" previously mentioned in the poem. In this context, the answer to "what will you wish for?" (l. 20) would be "nothing" and nothing is linked to the idea of blankness.

The growing suspense and crescendo articulated in the poem through the juxtaposition of unanswered questions is left unresolved in the final line/question, "Oh children, will you grow up?" (l. 23). We experience the uneasiness concerning the real threat of life's extinction and the faint hope of a future generation of responsible people who are more sensitive towards the environment.

"Blackberries," the last poem in this collection, possesses an intimate and hopeful tone. The poetic persona introduces an old woman who "is picking blackberries in the shade" (ll.2). This activity connects the woman, the speaker and the addressees with the wonders of the natural world. Nature is generous, because, as mentioned in the second stanza, a diversity of living creatures benefit from berries, squirrels and bears among them. But we humans can also taste them without remorse, with the pleasure of ephemeral things,

> Some go into the metal bowl.
> Those are for you, so you may taste them
> just for a moment.
> That's good times: one little sweetness
> after another, then quickly gone (ll. 7-11)

In the third and fourth stanzas, the poetic persona reveals that the old woman of the beginning is herself. The memory of her grandmother and mother establishes a genealogy of women repeating this action of picking blackberries. This reinforces their sense of environmental belonging and strengthens their family links as members of different generations of the same family. But, who will continue with this activity?

The speaker addresses a "you" who is enigmatic and ambiguous, her son/daughter, any of us? We are all invited to participate but the poetic voice is not sure whether this privilege of picking blackberries will be preserved maybe because of a premature death or because of the degradation of nature,

> Once, this old woman
> I'm conjuring up for you

would have been my grandmother.
Today it's me.
Years from now it might be you,
if you're quite lucky. (ll. 12-17)

The speaker insists on the generosity of nature, and the fascination for the wonders of the natural world in the last two stanzas. Now the metal bowl is full of berries which resemble the glass ornaments of Christmas trees. The simile "The blackberries gleam like glass" (l. 27), and the alliteration of the sound "gl" evoke an image of blackberries as precious stones. If glass ornaments hang on Christmas trees as a sign of gratitude for snow, berries are a natural treasure we should thank nature for.

In the last two lines, an old person shares her knowledge about nature's hidden treasures with the new generations, "It's as I always told you:/ the best ones grow in shadow" (ll. 33-34).

5. Conclusions

Despite the political dimension of Margaret Atwood's concerns on environmentalism and the degradation of the natural world (Hengen, "Atwood and Environmentalism" 84), she remains a conscientious poet, never neglectful with language. The author displays a wide range of poetic tones, spanning from intimacy to detachment, from irony to humor and parody. Atwood's literary personae are troubled by doubt more than by tragedy, and do not indulge in victimisation (Hengen "Strange Visions"; Gorjup 139; Perrakis 351-353). Also, her poetic voice frequently addresses a "you," which may speak directly to the reader or include both the speaker and the reader.

The discussion and analysis of the previous poems confirm my initial hypothesis about the duality in Atwood's nature poems between pessimistic environmental relationships and survival and renewal. "Marsh Languages", "The Ottawa River by Night," "Vermilion Flycatcher, San Pedro River, Arizona" (*Morning in the Burned House*, 1995), combine apocalyptic overtones about the disappearance of biodiversity and the languages of nature with oneiric visions of the author's father in a natural landscape after his death, which appears as a mythical resting place, offering consolation against human pain. In

contrast to this, some creatures, particularly birds, symbolise nature's potential for rebirth after an ecological disaster.

"Reindeer Moss on Granite" and "Bear Lament" (*The Door*, 2007) also exemplify Atwood's dual perception of nature. The first poem celebrates the languages of nature which human beings should respect in order to strengthen their connection with the natural world, whereas the second, in a pessimistic tone, establishes a link between the extinction of species and personal crisis in order to portray a gloomy picture of our planet's future.

The duality of nature poems in *Dearly* (2020), Atwood's latest poetry collection to date, reveals both a sense of urgency and desperation in the face of the loss of natural landscapes and animals and a belief in human potential to counter that ominous scenario. A sarcastic poetic voice announces impending ecological catastrophes ("Aflame," "Plasticene Suite," "Oh Children"), and poses many unanswered questions about the future of human beings and the earth. However, pessimism does not prevail and poems like "Feathers" and "Blackberries" confirm a positive connection between the speaker and the natural world, and highlight the neverending cycle of life and death in nature. The poetic persona's faith in nature's regenerative powers is reinforced by a sense of awe at the wonders of the natural world, no matter how modest those are.

In sum, Atwood's nature poetry reflects a profound understanding of the interconnectedness between human existence and the environment. While her warnings of environmental degradation and species extinction may seem bleak, they are always tempered by hope -an acknowledgement of nature's capacity for rebirth, even in the face of destruction. This tension between despair and optimism is what makes Atwood's nature poetry so compelling, inviting readers to not only reflect on the state of the world but to also consider their place within it. By blending political urgency with poetic intimacy, Atwood offers a nuanced perspective that resonates far beyond environmental activism, reminding us of the enduring power of both nature and the written word to inspire change and renewal.

Notes

[1] According to Charlotte Beyer, "the poem explores the possibility of imagining languages and modes of being which precede patriarchy and western civilisation" (2000, 294). In that sense, the languages the poem mentions are linked to the feminine and to the natural world.

[2] In most of her novels, Atwood challenges numerous discourses that perpetuate the oppression of women, while, with irony and humour, also addressing women's self-victimisation. This theme is explored in *Surfacing* (1972), *Lady Oracle* (1976), *Bodily Harm* (1981) and *The Robber Bride* (1993).

Works Cited

Atwood, Margaret. *Dearly*. 2020. Vintage, 2021.

---. *The Door.* 2007. Virago, 2013.

---. *Morning in the Burned House*. McClelland and Stewart, 1995.

---. *Negotiating with the Dead. A Writer on Writing*. Anchor Books, 2002

Beyer, Charlotte. "Feminist Revisionist Mythology and Female Identity in Margaret Atwood's Recent Poetry." *Literature and Theology*, vol. 14, no. 3, 2000, pp. 276-298.

Fiamengo, Janice. "'A Last Time for This Also': Margaret Atwood's Texts of Mourning." *Canadian Literature*, vol. 166, 2000, pp. 145-64.

Gorjup, Branko. "Margaret Atwood's Poetry and Poetics." Howells, pp. 130-144.

Grace, Sherrill. *Violent Duality: A Study of Margaret Atwood*. Véhicule Press, 1980.

Hengen, Shannon. *Margaret Atwood's Power: Mirrors, Reflections and Images in Select Fiction and Poetry.* Second Story Press, 1993

Hengen, Shannon. "Strange Visions: Atwood's *Interlunar* and Technopoetics." Wilson, pp. 42-53.

---. "Margaret Atwood and Environmentalism." Howells, pp. 72-85.

Hönnighausen, Lothar. "Margaret Atwood'd Poetry 1966-1995." *Margaret Atwood: Works and Impact*, edited by Reingard M. Nischik, Camden House, 2000, pp. 97-119.

Howells, Coral Ann, editor. *The Cambridge Companion to Margaret Atwood*. Cambridge UP, 2006.

Jamieson, Sara. "Mourning in the Burned House: Margaret Atwood and the Modern Elegy." *Canadian Poetry: Studies, Documents, Reviews*, vol. 48, 2001, pp. 38-68.

Jarraway, David R. "Com[ing] Through Darkness": Margaret Atwood's 'I'-Opening Lyricism." Moss and Tobi Kozakewich, pp. 279-290.

Maxwell, Lauren Rule. "'[A]pocalypse coiled in my tongue': Apocalyptic Vision in Margaret Atwood's Poetry." Waltonen, pp. 1-10.

Minister, Meredith. "The Languages are Being Silenced: Ambivalent Apocalyptic Vision in Margaret Atwood's Poems." Waltonen, pp. 13-25.

Montassine, Pauline. " 'The Shape of Your Absence' - Coming to Terms with Loss and Grief in Margaret Atwood's *Dearly*." Études *canadiennes/Canadian Studies*, vol. 94, 2023, pp. 109-126. DOI:10.4000/eccs.6573. Accessed 28 July 2023.

Moss, John and Tobi Kozakewich, editors. *Margaret Atwood: The Open Eye*. U of Ottawa P, 2006.

Perrakis, Phyllis Sternberg. "Negotiating with the Looking Glass: Atwood, Her Protagonists, and the Journey to the Dead." Moss and Kozakewich, pp. 349-359.

Van Spanckeren, Kathryn. "Humanizing the Fox: Atwood's Poetic Tricksters and *Morning in the Burned House*." Wilson, pp. 102-20.

Waltonen, Karma. "'[It] was zero hour, you said Be Brave': Tracing Atwood's Apocalypses." Waltonen, pp. ix-xix.

Waltonen, Karma, editor. *Margaret Atwood's Apocalypses*. Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2015.

Wilson, Sharon Rose, editor. *Margaret Atwood's Textual Assassinations: Recent Poetry and Fiction*. Ohio State UP, 2003.

Zimmerman, Tegan. "'She - Nature, Woman, Goddess': Mythic, Ethical and Poetic Feminist Discourse in Margaret Atwood's 'Marsh Languages' and Luce Irigaray's *In the Beginning She Was*." *Feminist Theory*, vol. 24, no. 3, 2023, pp. 333-356.

Received / Recibido: 22/4/2024 *Accepted / Aceptado: 24/6/2024*

Recensións / Reseñas
Reviews / Rezensionen

Llàcer, Eusebio V. *El placer estético del terror: tres cuentos de Edgar Allan Poe*. Publicacions de la Universitat de València, 2022. 180 páginas

Juan José Calvo García de Leonardo (Juan.J.Calvo@uv.es)
Universitat de València

El placer estético del terror, de Eusebio V. Llàcer Llorca, que salió a la luz en 2022, en *Publicacions de la Universitat de València*, con el número 188 de la extensa y más que notable nómina de títulos de la Biblioteca Javier Coy d'Estudis Nord-Americans que dirige la profesora Carme Manuel, es, valga la redundancia, un placer. Que el autor estuviera capacitado para acometer la empresa es algo que nadie podía dudar, dada su tesis doctoral de 1995 y su especialización ulterior, con una decena larga de títulos de autoría singular o compartida, desde 1996 a 2023; de hecho, el *know-how* acumulado provee de solidez y fiabilidad a la obra sin procurar el deleite alternativo que mencionaba Horacio (*aut prodesse volunt aut delectare poetae*) en su *Ars Poetica*, tal y como la presente recensión tratará de demostrar.

Para empezar, la elección de autor y de antología resultan particularmente atractivos. No es que hiciera falta rescatar la figura de Edgar Allan Poe, poeta, escritor, ensayista, crítico y editor literario e incluso oficial frustrado de West Point, de donde consiguió que lo expulsaran al cabo de tan sólo seis meses, pero cuyo capote conservó como propio. El bostoniano trasladado con cinco años a Richmond (Virginia) y con seis a Inglaterra, es un autor universal desde su consagración por los simbolistas franceses (traducción por medio incluida), que supieron beber de sus innumerables valores y que vieron en él a la personificación del poeta *maudit*, del poeta cuya excelsitud se habrá de entender a partir de una situación de alienación social y personal marcada por la pobreza económica, sumada al consumo de opiáceos y de alcohol y a las patologías asociadas con el trastorno mental. Como prueba de la importancia de Poe en el panorama literario universal, con motivo del bicentenario de su nacimiento (1809-2009) se celebraron multitud de congresos especializados por todo el mundo, desde Viña del Mar hasta San Petersburgo, de Ciudad de México a Madrid y, obviamente, en Filadelfia (Pennsylvania), celebraciones a las que se han sumado, subsiguiente o colateralmente, multitud de publicaciones notabilísimas.

En cuanto a la elección, las obras de Poe nos son familiares por dos vías distintas y complementarias. Por un lado, la puramente óptica y reflexiva del texto escrito y, por otro, la dinámica, visual y sonora, del lenguaje fílmico. Desde casi los albores de la cinematografía como arte, habiendo dejado atrás su carácter inicial de atracción de feria, contamos, desde 1928, con una admirable versión expresionista, *La Chute de la maison Usher* de Jean Epstein; en la década de los sesenta del pasado siglo, el binomio Roger Corman-Vincent Price resulta tan básico, tan indisoluble de los *Tales*, que no se puede leer esa misma *The Fall of the House of Usher*, pero tampoco *The Masque of the Red Death*, *The Pit and the Pendulum* o *The Oblong Box*, por ejemplo, sin tener presente la señorial y altísima corporeidad del actor estadounidense.

En la obra que reseñamos, Llàcer se detiene a analizar, de manera precisa y pormenorizada, desde la doble perspectiva literaria y lingüística y a lo largo de más de 150 páginas, tres de los relatos más famosos de Edgar Allan Poe: *The Masque of the Red Death* (1842), *The Pit and the Pendulum* (1843) y *The Cask of Amontillado* (1846), todos ellos fruto del último septenato de su existencia terrenal.

Como corresponde a un escritor tan prototípicamente romántico, la biografía de Poe ha sido y sigue siendo punto de referencia, piedra de toque y brújula indispensable para innumerables críticos, tanto para ensalzarlo como también, como le ocurriera en vida, para denigrarlo. Es cierto que su periplo vital le afectó personal y literariamente, desde su propio nacimiento de actores de la legua y su adopción a los cinco años por el comerciante de tabacos John Allan, pasando por su matrimonio con una prima suya menor de edad mediante falsificación de documento público y sus ulteriores bandazos profesionales, sus amoríos, más sus problemas mentales y los derivados del consumo de alcohol y estupefacientes —*under the influence* como se dice, eufemísticamente, en inglés. Todo ello hubo de dejar huella en su personalidad, pero también en su genio poético y en su *Weltanschauung*, perfectamente plasmados en su obra. En su primer capítulo, Llàcer nos sitúa al autor en la historia y nos narra sus diversas vicisitudes vitales.

A continuación, en el segundo capítulo y siguiendo la lógica académica de la exposición de tesis, se detiene en el concepto poeiano de *plot*, de modelo de construcción de relato. El crítico subraya los *topoi* más identificativos de Poe, entre los que se cuentan la tristeza, lo sublime, la

belleza y el terror. Asimismo, resalta su destreza poética y compositiva y, cara al sujeto lector, la eficacia de su oferta y reclamo, todo ello con una doble finalidad también: la del erudito que nos ilustra como filólogos y la del divulgador que se esfuerza por aproximar lo clásico al lector neófito de hoy en día.

Su tercer capítulo lo dedica al estudio de lo que se pueda entender por 'miedo' y, a partir de ahí, por 'terror' o por 'horror', términos éstos últimos que se complementan o se solapan, no solamente desde el latín *horror* (asociado etimológicamente con 'erizar' y hoy en día —en castellano, que no en inglés, donde se confunden ambos— con la aprensión moral y/o estética) y *terror* (que igual nos paraliza que nos espolea a la huida), sino también en el griego *phóbos* ("temor" y "espanto," pero también "fuga," "huida," "derrota") y *trómos* ("terror," "miedo," a la vez que "temblor" y "escalofrío").

Además, el autor desmenuza y hace recuento del caudal que atesora la narrativa de Poe y cómo mezcla lo gótico, lo fantástico, lo grotesco (*Tales of the Grotesque and Arabesque*, fue el título que eligiera en 1840 para su compendio narrativo) con el terror.

Como se ha mencionado anteriormente, los relatos elegidos muestran los rasgos que se incluyen en el canon textual poeiano, en su estética de tradición 'gótica' y también aquellos que son consubstanciales al *tale* o *short story* de terror. Tanto en *The Masque of the Red Death* como en *The Pit and the Pendulum* y *The Cask of Amontillado*, dicha estética se nos ofrece enmarcada, ubicada, en un escenario de aislamiento y de confusión del que los sujetos lectores, como las víctimas, no tienen escapatoria posible y cuya consecuencia, inexorable como el Hado, es el terror paralizante de un Fortunato aherrojado en un nicho de catacumba y emparedado vivo. Al mismo tiempo también se destaca que la riqueza que destila la narrativa del bostoniano ha superado, en el trascurso de estos dos siglos, lo meramente gótico-prerromántico o el *Schauerroman*, la novela de terror, permitiendo hasta interpretaciones psicoanalíticas, como las de Marie Bonaparte, publicadas en 1949, que fueron aclamadas por el propio Sigmund Freud.

No obstante, Llàcer prefiere concretar su estudio en los aspectos textuales o lingüísticos. De este modo se centra en la riqueza, escrupulosamente detallada, del léxico, en las características gramaticales,

en la *variatio* de la adjetivación y en la capacidad verbal. Para él, todos estos elementos lingüísticos se van impregnando de una atmósfera de terror *in crescendo* en el lector, constituyendo, además, una parte esencial del andamiaje de su estética literaria.

Una vez concluidas las presentaciones generales de la vida, el tema y los rasgos literarios de Poe, el investigador pasa al análisis del corpus seleccionado, empezando por el más debatido y ensalzado de los tres: *The Masque of the Red Death*. Además de la intertextualidad de analogías obvias con el retiro a la finca campestre del *Decameron* (no con el castillo de Silling de *Les Cent Vingt Journées de Sodome, ou l'École du libertinage*, aunque existan coincidencias, pues Poe no pudo haber leído a Sade) y la alusión a la *Primera Epistola a los Tesalonicenses* 5, 2, donde San Pablo dice que el día del Señor llegará *sicut fur in nocte* ("como un ladrón en la noche") y hay que estar vigilantes y sobrios —al revés que los participantes en la mascarada—, merece resaltarse la simbología de las salas, los colores y los personajes que embellecen este relato que se hace eco de los desenfrenos que se sucedieron en la Europa azotada por la peste bubónica de mediados del siglo XIV, y que se nos antoja una representación de la Danza de la Muerte, con un Próspero como coreógrafo de la mascarada, que, aun careciendo de los poderes del protagonista de *The Tempest*, de Shakespeare, será igualmente imponente.

Asimismo, para el autor, como para tantos otros críticos, *The Pit and the Pendulum* constituye uno de sus relatos más representativos, aunque no cuente con el número de trabajos que se dedicaron a *The Masque of the Red Death*. Llàcer resalta los aspectos más relevantes desde el punto de vista lingüístico y temático, la estilística que asociamos con la reiteración de palabras clave tanto sensoriales como mentales o psíquicas, incluido el valor de lo onírico en su aspecto más aterrador; todo ello se encuentra orientado a crear un clima opresivo que se transmite al lector y que lo transporta a esa mazmorra, a esa *oubliette* inquisitorial y propia del *Ancien Régime* que da nombre al relato.

Llàcer sitúa el último relato de los tres, *The Cask of Amontillado*, en Francia, atendiendo, entre otros detalles, al nombre del protagonista, Montresor, que no el de la víctima, Fortunato, ni Luchresi, el experto en vinos que se menciona. Por contra, la acción se podría situar en Italia o, quizás, en la fronteriza Saboya, territorio entonces (tanto en la ficción como en vida de Poe) de soberanía italiana y amplia población

de habla francesa, pero es cierto que Montresor se refiere a los italianos en tercera persona: “few Italians have the true virtuoso spirit (…) their enthusiasm” (274). Sea en Francia o sea en Italia, la localización no escapa a la geografía estereotipada de la novela gótica, puesto que, para el protestantismo inglés que engendra el género a finales del siglo XVIII, la maldad tenía su hábitat natural en los países católicos: Italia en *The Castle of Otranto, a Gothic Story* (1764) de Horace Walpole, Francia e Italia en *The Mysteries of Udolpho* (1794) de Ann Radcliffe, y España en *The Monk* (1796) de Matthew G. Lewis. Por correlación, pues, tendremos las ubicaciones de *The Masque of the Red Death*, *The Cask of Amontillado* y *The Pit and the Pendulum* reforzadas, en el caso de los dos primeros, con esa festividad, obviamente inmoral y exclusivamente católica, del Carnaval. Llàcer destaca aquí la naturalidad, la mundanalidad del acto luctuoso (un asesinato a sangre fría por celos y venganza), frente a la escatología de la encarnación del primero de los cuatro novísimos en *The Masque of the Red Death.* También se resalta la progresiva angustia que se le trasmite a un lector que presiente, incluso ve, el desenlace antes que la propia víctima, en paralelo a la definición que ofreciera Hitchcock del suspense. El investigador valora el uso de ciertos adjetivos para lograr el objetivo de transmitir melancolía, ansiedad y miedo.

A modo de conclusión y siguiendo en todo momento el protocolo de la investigación científica, el autor subraya los elementos que resultan comunes a los tres relatos: lo gótico, el autor omnisciente, los protagonistas y la relación —que aquí no es ni estamental (*Hop Frog*), ni familiar (*The Fall of the House of Usher*, *The Oblong Box*, *The Tell-Tale Heart*, *The Black Cat*, etc.), ni un desdoblamiento de la propia individualidad (*William Wilson*)— entre víctima y verdugo. Todo ello se ve sumado a los valores oníricos, a la *mise en scène* siniestra y/o perversa, amén de los elementos lingüísticos y estilísticos ya mencionados y que le permiten a Poe lograr su objetivo literario.

Para el observador externo, se valora de manera notable el enfoque ‘holístico’ —por así decirlo— del profesor Llàcer, procediendo a la par que *top to bottom* en el desarrollo del trabajo, analíticamente, desde lo general de los primeros tres capítulos al análisis específico de cada una de las obras en los otros tres; y, a la vez, *bottom up*, sintéticamente, desde los elementos comunes, lingüísticos y pragmáticos, con sus correlatos, hasta las cuestiones generales, el *leit-motiv*, el género, el concepto y la

literatura en general; todo ello sin olvidar las exégesis que se han dado, las que se pueden avanzar y la recepción ulterior (e hipotética) por parte del lector.

En conclusión, Eusebio Llàcer ha logrado presentarnos un trabajo académicamente sin tacha y, a la vez, salpicado del tipo de información que le permite al lego adentrarse con mayor confianza, con íntimo deleite incluso, en ese universo tremendo, fascinante, que es la obra de Edgar Allan Poe.

Obras citadas

Llàcer Llorca, Eusebio V. *La traducción del terror: un enfoque integrador.* Tesis doctoral. Universitat de València, 1995.
Poe, Edgar Allan. *The Complete Tales and Poems*. Penguin, 1982.

Beaumont, Francis y John Fletcher. ***El necio (The Coxcomb).*** **Traducción, introducción y notas de Francisco J. Borge, Luna de Abajo, 2023. 176 páginas**

José Montero Reguera (jmontero@uvigo.gal)
Universidade de Vigo

La inacabable erudición de Juan Bautista Avalle-Arce puso ante nuestros ojos, ahora hace más de medio siglo, una tradición que se remontaba al siglo XII, centuria que, en lo que se refiere a la literatura española, incorpora la primera versión de un relato de origen oriental de largo recorrido por toda Europa. La *Disciplina clericalis*, original en latín debido a Pedro Alfonso, incluye –es el segundo de sus relatos– uno cuyo asunto principal es la amistad entre dos amigos, bagdadí el primero, egipciaco el segundo, que anteponen aquella al deseo de casamiento de este. Una veintena de relatos, que llega hasta José Zorrilla, ya en pleno siglo XIX, muestra la fortuna de una tradición que, con menos erudición y otro alcance, amplió Hans-Jörg Neuschafer proyectándola hacia la literatura francesa (Marguerite de Navarra, Madame Lafayette, entre otras). En esta tradición, la novelita que ocupa los capítulos 33-35 del primer *Quijote* cervantino constituye un hito de especial significación, no solo por la bondad del relato –justamente alabado por su autor en el capítulo 44 de la segunda parte–, sino por ser origen también de otros textos en buen número –relatos en prosa, obras dramáticas–. Sin salirme de este campo, el preciso estudio de Agapita Jurado Santos registró una decena de comedias directamente relacionadas con *El curioso impertinente* a cargo de autores como Lope de Vega, Tirso de Molina, Gaspar de Aguilar, Pedro Calderón de la Barca, Antonio Coello y Juan de Matos Fragoso. La novelita cervantina funciona, en realidad, como catalizador de una tradición que recibe mayor impulso y se proyecta fuera de España gracias, en buena medida, al éxito del *Quijote* más allá de las fronteras peninsulares –Inglaterra es magnífico ejemplo de ello–, pero también por haber sido recogida en otras obras de extraordinaria difusión, como el *Decamerón* bocaciano (X, 8: *Sofronia, creyendo ser la mujer de Gisippo, lo es de Tito Quinto Fulvio y con él se va a Roma; adonde Gisippo llega en pobre estado, y creyendo ser despreciado por Tito, afirma, para morir, que ha matado a un hombre, Tito, reconociéndolo, dice, para salvarlo, que lo ha matado él, lo cual, viéndolo quien lo había hecho, se culpa a sí mismo; por la cual cosa son*

todos puestos en libertad por Octavio, y Tito a Gisippo da a su hermana por mujer y reparte con él todos sus bienes).

Si se añaden a todo ello las circunstancias biográficas de Francis Beaumont y John Fletcher, y los argumentos aducidos por el profesor Francisco Borge en su estudio preliminar, será fácil coincidir con él en la intermediación cervantina para esta comedia, *The Coxcomb*, y la oportunidad de su traducción, que permite hacer llegar a un público no necesariamente especializado un texto teatral escrito y representado aún en vida de Cervantes. Si *El caballero del pistadero ardiente* (h. 1610-1613; cfr. Pardo, 2006), del propio Fletcher, y el recuperado *Cardenio* del mismo autor en colaboración con Shakespeare (1613) parecían constituir lo esencial de la primera recepción del *Quijote* en Inglaterra, y en términos teatrales, este *Necio* (todo un acierto la elección de este adjetivo para la versión española), de Beaumont y Fletcher, constituye una magnífica tercera columna para los cimientos de la presencia de Cervantes en aquel país que abre, además, el camino a media docena de comedias directamente inspiradas en *El curioso impertinente*: *The Second Maiden's Tragedy*, de Thomas Middleton (1610); *Amends for Ladies. A Comedie*, de Nathan Field (1618); *The Amorous Prince; or, The Curious Husband*, de Aphra Behn (1671); *The Disappointment, or The Mother of Fashion*, de Thomas Southerne (1684), y *The Married Beau; or The Curious Impertinent. A Comedy*, de John Crowne (1694). España e Inglaterra, pues, siguen caminos parecidos en el siglo XVII.

A la traducción le precede un texto introductorio en el que, de lo general a lo particular, se ofrece, primero, una contextualización de la comedia inglesa de principios del siglo XVII centrada en los dramaturgos creadores de la aquí editada (pp. 11-17); después se ofrecen los elementos más destacables de la huella de Cervantes en ambos (pp. 17-24), para, seguidamente, centrarse en la comedia, a la que el profesor Borge, titular de filología inglesa en la Universidad de Oviedo, dedica tres capítulos: el primero proporcionar los datos cronológicos esenciales para la escritura, representación e impresión de esta pieza. Escrita seguramente en 1610, en este mismo año se representó en la corte de Jacobo I. Constan otras representaciones en 1613, 1616, 1622, 1633 y 1636, y se imprimió en las *Comedies and Tragedies* de Beaumont y Fletcher publicadas en 1647 (pp. 97-120), que inicia el recorrido editorial de esta comedia, casi siempre como parte de volúmenes colectivos de ambos escritores; con alguna excepción,

como el texto publicado en 1718, "Printed for J. T. And Sold by J. Brown At the Black Swan without Temple-Bar," no citada por Borge, pero seguramente reimpresión (si no es errata) de la de 1711 a cargo de Jacob Tonson ("J. T."), sí citada (p. 27; el texto puede consultarse en este enlace: https://ia600500.us.archive.org/5/items/bim_eighteenth-century_the-coxcomb-a-comedy-w_beaumont-francis_1718/bim_eighteenth-century_the-coxcomb-a-comedy-w_beaumont-francis_1718.pdf). Hubiera agradecido una mayor minuciosidad en la descripción de esta tradición editorial que, no siendo muy extensa, no deja de tener su interés y ofrece detalles –sobre todo en la edición príncipe de 1647– que hubieran enriquecido el apartado; por este mismo camino, echo de menos una información más precisa sobre las ediciones recientes (es un decir: la última se publicó en 1966). Volveré sobre esta cuestión más adelante. Seguidamente, Borge analiza la comedia (apartado 4, pp. 27-47) desde dos ángulos bien interesantes: el análisis de los elementos para defender la ascendencia cervantina de la comedia y el proceso de "inglesización" (p. 41) de la misma. Aunque yo he caído en la misma tentación más de una vez –la de incluir un resumen de la comedia en el prólogo (aquí apartado 5)–, pienso, en realidad, que, pese a su bondad, es innecesario –orientan demasiado al posible lector y pueden contribuir a no pasar adelante en su lectura–; en su lugar hubiera incluido un análisis más pormenorizado de la estructura, del papel de algunos personajes menores (ese juez, necio sobre necio, que aparece al final); incluso extenderse más en la larga tradición en la que se inserta esta comedia. Las páginas dedicadas a las protagonistas femeninas son estupendas.

Considero que es un acierto el adjetivo escogido para traducir el título: "Necio." Empleado por Cervantes varias veces en el relato para referirse al protagonista causante del desastre final, supera con mucho otras propuestas previas ("tonto, fatuo, mastuerzo, vanidoso, o, como algunos cervantistas han sugerido, mentecato," p. 50) y en especial la de "petrimetre" (Ardila, 2008, p. 4862a), galicismo incorporado a la lengua española más de un siglo después de la escritura de esta comedia, que significa otra cosa completamente distinta de lo que se describe en el texto de Beaumont y Fletcher: "El joven que cuida demasiadamente de su compostura y de seguir las modas. Es voz compuesta de palabras francesas e introducida sin necesidad" (*Diccionario de Autoridades*, 1737).

No se indica, en cambio, la edición inglesa que se tiene en cuenta: ¿acaso la mencionada en p. 27, de 1966, a cargo de Irby B. Cauthen? No es dato menor, no tanto porque el texto pueda sufrir muchas modificaciones de unas a otras, que también, sino porque se incorporan en la traducción elementos que no figuran en el *First folio* de 1647 ni en otras ediciones antiguas: así la separación en escenas que en las ediciones de 1647 y 1718 quedan restringidas al acto y primera escena, y no se incluyen referencias explícitas a las siguientes; así también la incorporación de referencias locativas, inexistentes en aquellas (acto primero, segunda escena: "Una estancia en la casa de Antonio," p. 67). No dudo de que la separación en escenas facilite la lectura, no dudo de que la inclusión de este tipo de didascalias también ayude, pero me gustaría saber asimismo si cae en la cuenta del traductor o en la cuenta de los autores (incluso de impresores intermediarios).

La traducción es ágil, convincente, bien escrita, con momentos magníficos (el monólogo de Viola, p. 76; la intervención de Ricardo en la que hábilmente se maneja el futuro de indicativo para crear un ritmo de gran intensidad, p. 110). Tengo unos muy pocos reparos: el viejo artículo de Fernando Lázaro Carreter (pasado ya medio siglo, hoy legible en el celebérrimo *El dardo en la palabra*) sobre el uso de "vale" me lleva a proponer huir de él siempre cuando tiene valor de asentimiento o conformidad, como aquí en pp. 83, 96, 117, máxime cuando esta acepción –incorporada al *DLE* durante un tiempo– no se registra ya en el mencionado diccionario académico. De acuerdo con lo expresado en nota 37 ("*Tinker*, en esa época, se podría traducir como «gitano», refiriéndose a alguien que lleva una vida desarraigada y basada en el pequeño hurto. Como explico en la nota previa sobre esta traducción, he decidido mantener el nombre de Tinker para el personaje, pues no recibe ningún otro nombre en la obra y la traducción a «Gitano» podría conllevar connotaciones erróneas en castellano", p. 95 y antes en p. 52), entiendo que esa palabra se debería evitar en tres casos (pp. 96, 111 y 173) cuyo original remite siempre a "tinker" (manejo el *First folio*, pp. 102b, 105B y 117a); no así en p. 101 ("estos tipejos deberían recibir mayor castigo / que los que nuestras leyes reservan para los gitanos"), que remite directamente a "these fellowes would bee more severly punisht then wandring Gipsies" de la edición inglesa (*First Folio*, p. 103b). No tengo claro que la manera de mantener el original para "enfatizar este recurso teatral de caracterización" (p. 104, nota 46) en el

caso del impostado acento irlandés de Antonio (p. 104 y ss.) sea el más eficaz. Creo que hubiera bastado con realizar la traducción e incluir en nota al pie el original pues facilita la lectura. En todo caso, deberían haberse traducido al pie todos los originales respetados en el cuerpo del texto (también: "Dulce dama, *a cree* [¿por Dios?], soy irlandés," p. 106; "¡*Oh, hone*, *oh, hone*! ¡Oh, San Patricio! ¡Oh, *a cree*! ¡Oh, dulce señora!, p. 107; más en pp. 118, 119 y 120).

La traducción incluye un buen número de notas que aclara con precisión momentos puntuales del texto; acaso la expresión "lengua de sabueso" (p. 97) o la alusión –explicada muy vagamente– a una posible taberna de aquella época requerirían una anotación más precisa. Por este camino, la obsesión por la fama de Antonio (pp. 121-122) y las alusiones eróticas de p. 98 dan espacio a una nota al pie o, incluso, a una subsección en el prólogo.

La bibliografía, muy completa, adolece de un mínimo error en el caso de la entrada dedicada a Burningham (referida por el nombre, no por el apellido, pero que no tiene influencia en el orden alfabético) y, acaso, habría de registrar edición del *Quijote* más solvente que la referenciada; por otra parte, las entradas de los profesores Pardo, sobre Beaumont, y Ardila, sobre Fletcher, en la nunca suficientemente bien ponderada *Gran Enciclopedia Cervantina* (tomos II y V respectivamente), junto con los trabajos de Avalle-Arce, Neuschafer y Jurado Santos mencionados al principio de esta reseña redundarían en un mayor aprovechamiento del lector.

Todas estas propuestas no son sino resultado del vivo interés que ha despertado en mí un trabajo bien hecho, que me ha descubierto una comedia bien interesante –más allá del vínculo cervantino–, muy directa, explícita, divertida, procaz en ocasiones, entretenida, que lleva naturalmente a querer acabar su lectura. Todo un acierto del profesor Borge que ha merecido además el cobijo de una magnífica editorial que sabe acompasar el fondo con una forma muy cuidada dentro de la colección dirigida por los profesores Mata y Ferreiro, quienes vienen proporcionando, al calor del Grupo de Estudios Cervantinos de la Universidad de Oviedo, textos muy cuidados. Mi enhorabuena por esta nueva entrega.

Obras citadas

Ardila, Juan Antonio Garrido. "Fletcher, John". *Gran Enciclopedia Cervantina*. Castalia, 2006, vol. V, pp. 4861a-4864b.

Avalle-Arce, Juan Bautista. "Una tradición literaria: El cuento de los dos amigos". *NRFH*, vol. XI, 1957, pp. 1-35.

Jurado Santos, Agapita. *Obras teatrales derivadas de las novelas cervantinas (siglo XVII).* Reichenberger, 2005.

Neuschafer, Hans-Jörg. "*El curioso impertinente* y la tradición de la novelística europea". *NRFH*, vol. XXXVIII, no. 2, 1991, pp. 605-620.

Pardo García, Javier. "Beaumont, Francis". *Gran Enciclopedia Cervantina*. Castalia, 2006, vol. II, pp. 1215b-1217b.

Mocanu-Florea, Vasilica. *Language Learning in Study Abroad: Social, Cultural, and Identity-Related Factors. Erasmus Students in Northern, Southern, and Eastern-European English as Lingua Franca Contexts*. Publicacions de la Universitat de València, 2023. 219 pages

Sofía Peña Fernández (sofia.pf@usal.es)
Universidad de Salamanca

The Erasmus program is a European initiative that aims to promote education and mobility abroad, giving European students the possibility of spending a sojourn abroad by attending a different European University for between 2 and 12 months, to "bring positive and long-lasting effects in the participants and participating organizations involved" (European Commission, 2023). Within the last decades, studying abroad has become more and more popular and has been acknowledged as a source of language learning as well as a "way to a more flexible and dynamic identity" (Mocanu 13).

One of the most obvious objectives of the Erasmus program is to achieve "increased competence in foreign languages" (European Commission). Multilingualism is one of the European Union's greatest points of pride, which explains this institution's efforts to promote the teaching and learning of other European languages in the Union. As stated by Enric Llurda et al., "multilingualism represents the distinguishing feature of an increasing number of globalized, hybrid and multicultural societies, like the European" (7), and it can be considered a recognition of European identity by its citizens. In addition, studying abroad not only entails contact with a target language but also provides broader personal and cultural experiences. As stated by Michael Bryam, "[i]f language learning is to be part of a policy of internationalization, it has to be more than the acquisition of linguistic competence" (29). When studying abroad, students not only learn the language and customs of other countries but also become involved in a holistic learning event entailing social, cultural, and identity-related outcomes that challenge their expectations and beliefs; thus, identity plays a key role in sojourns abroad and above all in language learning. Such is the importance of identity in the process of language acquisition that one of the main objectives of the Erasmus program is "to strengthen European identity and active citizenship" (European

Commission). This sense of belonging to the Union is particularly involved in language acquisition, since it "depends on the ability to interact and communicate with other Europeans using the full range of one's linguistic repertoire" (Llurda, 8). For this reason, the linguistic, the cultural, and the identity-related factors are closely intertwined when speaking about European citizenship and study abroad sojourns.

Vasilica Mocanu's *Language Learning in Study Abroad: Social, Cultural, and Identity-Related Factors* covers a remarkable study that illustrates the social, linguistic, and cultural aspects of language learners when studying abroad and how participation in the Erasmus program impacts their identities, language attitudes, and professional development. The value of this monograph is that it examines the impact of studying abroad on language learning and identity building, through participants' reports. By combining qualitative and quantitative methods, Mocanu presents in-depth research on the attitudes and expectations of European students before and after their sojourn abroad in three different European locations, namely Oulu (Finland), Bucharest (Romania), and Lleida (Spain), thus successfully providing a deeper understanding of the real outcomes of study abroad sojourns in the European continent.

Mocanu's volume comprises five chapters. The introductory section establishes the background of the study, which is based on the connection between language and identity. Language learning cannot be understood only as a linguistic phenomenon but also as "part of a complex life experience" (21) that has social, cultural, and linguistic consequences. The main purpose of this overview is to explore the sociocultural facets of language learning and study abroad experiences. This part also includes an overview of the theoretical background, the research questions, the methodology used, and a summary of the focus and aims of the study.

Following this brief overview, the author introduces the theoretical framework of her research in Chapter 2. This section explains the impact of studying abroad and provides evidence of previous studies on this same question. As previously stated, studying abroad is understood as a holistic experience that convers linguistic, social, cultural, and identity-related facets. As the author observes, study sojourns abroad make participants develop new abilities as they become not only

language learners but also language users (27). This chapter considers the experience of studying abroad as a challenge to the self by delving into the social and psychological impact of language learning, and the effect of a neoliberal ideology within language learning, which sees language learning as a profitable endeavor for the future which makes the acquisition of wealth and status possible.

Chapter 3 presents the methodology of the study. The author uses mixed methods research, which "combines elements of qualitative and quantitative research (…) for the broad purpose of breadth and depth of understanding and corroboration" (Johnson et al., 123). This approach offers a wide-ranging perception of a phenomenon, as it answers questions that a qualitative or a quantitative method alone could not answer. In this case, Mocanu combines a questionnaire, through which quantitative data was gathered, and a semi-structured interview, employed to collect the qualitative data. Data were collected at two different points corresponding to the beginning and the end of the participants' sojourn abroad, which helped participants to reflect on their experiences and was beneficial to the research process in that initial expectations and outcomes could be compared. This chapter also introduces the procedure, analysis, location, and participants in the study. Regarding the procedure, the questions in both the questionnaire and the interview were based on an extensive reading of literature on language learning in study abroad. To guarantee adequate research, a pilot study took place, in which participants corroborated their understanding of the questions, made the necessary changes, and completed the study by adding more questions. The analysis focused on the selected tests to collect the data and observe the results, utilizing a Mann-Whitney U Test that analyzed the participants' responses, to a Wilcoxon signed-rank test that examined the evolution between the PRE and the POST questions answered by the participants. The research took place in three different European destinations, namely Oulu in Finland, Bucharest in Romania, and Lleida in Spain. The number of participants differed in the qualitative and the quantitative data, but all of them came from different geographies, levels of education, and socio-political backgrounds to offer a broader and more accurate study.

Chapter 4 examines the results of the study, taking into account the role of the host context, the socio-cultural and linguistic contact,

and identity-related factors, in all cases comparing the beginning and the end of the participants' sojourn abroad. Concerning the context, the participants were asked about their expectations, their language learning motivation, and their language use. For the linguistic and socio-cultural contact situation, questions about the participants' sense of belonging, self-perception, and future mobility were asked. The identity-related inquiries were related to the personal, academic, and professional benefits expected by the participants. This last category of the study paid attention to the participants' motivation and investment in the improvement of their knowledge of English, other languages, and other cultures, the sense of growth regarding their autonomy and self-confidence, and their acceptance of other cultures. This section also pays attention to the notion of "neoliberalism" from the point of view of sociolinguistics, which considers that language learning is an investment that will benefit the learners' future and make them more "employable." Overall, the participants in Finland felt more disappointed at the end of their stay because of the darkness of the climate, the high prices, and mixed feelings regarding the locals and the institutions; the participants in Bucharest felt much more welcomed than they had expected and benefited from the Romanian friendliness and inexpensive lifestyle; the participants in Lleida also felt welcomed by the locals but quite dissatisfied with the dominance of Catalan, the local language mainly used in the institution. In addition, the participants noted a tendency towards a lower use of English and local languages during their sojourn abroad than initially expected. The only exception was that students in Lleida believed they had improved their skills in Spanish (not in Catalan), although not because of contact with other local citizens but with Latin-American exchange students, especially those coming from Mexico. In general, the participants felt more prepared for the professional world although they did not feel they had improved much on the academic level. In addition, the results on personal issues such as self-confidence autonomy, or acceptance of other cultures were lower in Oulu in contrast to Romania and Spain.

The fifth chapter highlights the main findings in the previous chapter and triangulates them with the results of previous literature on the topic. This section ends the monograph with some concluding remarks on the socio-cultural, linguistic, and identity-based outcomes of the study. At the beginning of the sojourn abroad, the participants'

expectations tend to be high, especially the ones related to their knowledge of other cultures and their use of English. However, the outcomes differ in each Erasmus location, starting with the Oulu group, whose initial expectations were high because of the high expectations linked to Northern European countries but were rather disappointed at the end of their study abroad. The opposite tendency was observed in Bucharest, where students traveled with relatively low expectations but concluded their sojourn with a positive experience. Similarly, the students in Lleida chose this destination because of the presence of Spanish and its importance in the linguistic panorama. The students in Lleida completed their sojourn with their desires accomplished. Regarding their identity, this tended to be more complex at the end of their stay abroad, since contact with different people and cultures can confuse some students in their prospects.

Although the Erasmus program has proven to produce mostly successful results, these experiences abroad may trigger "a destabilization and hybridization of identity" (193) as the participants' ideas about Europe, the world, and themselves change. This "alteration of the self" is explained by the use of a second language and an international atmosphere that leads to an expansion of people's horizons. Nevertheless, the improvement experienced at a personal and professional level is enormous, as the students end their sojourns abroad with a more open mind, feeling more confident about being mobile abroad and more attracted to discovering new places. All in all, the study reveals that those students with high expectations at the beginning of their sojourn abroad tend to end their experience with rather disappointing results, while those who have low or no expectations undergo startling fulfillment.

The last pages of the monograph offer an appendix with the specific questions asked in the PRE and POST questionnaires and interviews.

In summary, this book provides a highly valuable study of the impact of study abroad sojourns on social, cultural, linguistic, and identity-based gains. Although study abroad has been a subject of concern for sociolinguistics within the last decades, Mocanu's study offers a broad view of the repercussions of sojourns abroad as experienced by European students. The variety of locations chosen and participants interviewed allows for a wider analysis that thoroughly exemplifies the object of the study. The insights and descriptions of the research conducted

are rigorous and well-explained so that they are comprehensible and relevant for the reader. The statistics, explanation of the graphs, and final appendices are a reliable complement to this study.

Works Cited

Byram, Michael. *From Foreign Language Education to Education for Intercultural Citizenship: Essays and Reflections*. Multilingual Matters, vol. 17, 2008.

European Commission. "The Erasmus+ Programme Guide." *Erasmus+*, erasmus-plus.ec.europa.eu/erasmus-programme-guide, 2023. Accessed 22 Oct. 2023.

Johnson, R. Burke, Anthony J. Onwuegbuzie, and Lisa A. Turner. "Toward a definition of mixed methods research." *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, vol. 1, no. 2, 2007, pp. 112-133.

Llurda, Enric, Lidia Gallego-Balsà, Cláudia Barahona, and Xavier Martín-Rubio. "Erasmus student mobility and the construction of European citizenship" *The Language Learning Journal*, vol. 44, no. 3, 2016, pp. 323-346.

Rodríguez Salas, Gerardo. *Vivir sola es morir: El modernismo comunitario de Katherine Mansfield*. Editorial Comares, 2023. 104 pages

Antía Román Sotelo (antia.roman.sotelo@usc.es)
Universidade de Santiago de Compostela

Vivir sola es morir: El modernismo comunitario de Katherine Mansfield discusses the social relations that characterized the life of the New Zealand-born writer as well as her understanding of affection and community, both of which are rendered in her works through the embrace of alterity in the margins of society, and the desire to achieve significant communication and physical connection, thus defying the traditional conception of the modernist subject as solipsistic and alienated. Thus, the book offers a new approach—in line with new studies on modernism—to Mansfield and contributes to enhancing her recognition on the occasion of her centenary. Gerardo Rodríguez Salas, a pioneering expert in Katherine Mansfield studies in Spain, demonstrates his mastery of the author's character and narrative with a thorough analysis of the symbolism and hidden meanings of her short stories, while simultaneously providing a classification of the affective relations that preponderate in her writing, mostly based on the theoretical frameworks provided by Jean-Luc Nancy and Maurice Blanchot.

As exposed in the introduction, the life and work of Katherine Mansfield were conditioned by her colonial origins, which prevented her from entering the literary canon at first instance and also from fitting into the intellectual circles of the time, such as the Bloomsbury Group. In addition, Rodríguez Salas argues how the characters in Mansfield's fiction partake of the writer's loneliness, communication problems and a sense of the closeness of death that characterized her own life, marked by abortion, miscarriage and illness. Notwithstanding, Rodríguez Salas vindicates that Mansfield's works address issues pertaining to class, race, gender and age, thus denoting empathy towards the other. Indeed, in the face of her imminent death by tuberculosis, Mansfield decided to live to the fullest, which, for her, implied communion: "What is important is to try and learn to live—really live, and in relation to everything—not isolated (this isolation is death to me)" (xi). This challenges Georg Lukács's association of modernism with asocial and apolitical attitudes

which still pervades contemporary studies on the movement, proving that social concern can actually be combined with the aesthetics of fragmentation, the use of free indirect style and focalization, and the recourse to the iceberg theory to which Mansfield frequently resorted. Moreover, Rodríguez Salas also asserts that the publication of new materials and letters by Katherine Mansfield—*The Katherine Mansfield Notebooks* (1997)—evinced the restless and controversial behaviour of the author, which did not correspond to the myth around her figure that was posthumously nurtured by her second husband, John Middleton Murry.

The book begins with the chapter "Hacia un modernismo comunitario," which provides the theoretical background on both modernism and models of community to be employed in the analysis of Mansfield's short stories in the following chapters. The first section questions traditional conceptions of modernism by exploring the new approaches observed from the turn of century, which aimed to expand its temporal and geographical boundaries, aesthetic criteria, and literary canon through the establishment of intersections with postcolonial and gender studies, while simultaneously attempting to provide a redefinition of the modernist subject that could reconcile its introspective character with new notions of community through the recognition of finitude and vulnerability. In this respect, Rodríguez Salas mentions Linda Hutcheon's distinction between high modernism—characterized by a vindication of high art as opposed to mass culture and thus by a focus on formalism—and a historical avant-garde with an ideological orientation, already heading to postmodernism by offering "an example of the possible subversion and democratization of high art, of aestheticist hermeticism, and of nostalgia politics" (Hutcheon 218). In addition, the author also refers to the volume *The Gender of Modernism*, edited by Bonnie Kime Scott, where "the 'experimental, audience challenging, and language-focused' writing that used to be regarded as modernism" becomes associated with a masculine modernism (Scott 4), allowing for the establishment of an exclusively female modernism in which alternative relations in the margins of society, in between the domestic and the public sphere, are usually explored. The second section of the first chapter addresses the redefinitions of community developed in the philosophy of communitarianism of the 1980s as a result of the crisis of the old models of communism and socialism. These theories shared a turn towards finitude and death as elements of social union, as seen

in Jean-Luc Nancy: "Death is indissociable from community, for it is through death that the community reveals itself—and reciprocally" (*The Inoperative Community* 14). Rodríguez Salas mostly focuses on the works by Jean-Luc Nancy and Maurice Blanchot, but also exposes the theories on social structures from the 1880s on which the former based their studies. In this sense, he highlights the distinction made by Ferdinand Tönnies between community or *Gemeinschaft*—"[a]ll kinds of social co-existence that are familiar, comfortable and exclusive" and which, therefore, have "real organic life"—, and society or *Gesellschaft*, which "means life in the public sphere, in the outside world" and is conceived "as a purely mechanical construction, existing in the mind" (Tönnies 17-18), echoing Hegel's civil society. In this vein, according to Rodríguez Salas, scholars of the 1980s considered community fictional. Nancy named *substance* a number of essentialist aspects of identity that produce feelings of belonging and a natural sense of identity—"be these homeland, native soil or blood, nation, a delivered or fulfilled humanity, absolute phalanstery, family, or mystical body" (*The Inoperative Community* 15)—which constitute a social contract created by myths. This communitarian model, known as "operative community," gives a sense of protection through the imposition of homogeneity and control. Its opposite model is the "inoperative community," which questions the former by highlighting singularity and alterity, as well as by abandoning the sense of security for the recognition of vulnerability. This is what Blanchot, using George Bataille's words, defines as "the community of those who have no community" (Blanchot 24). Both Blanchot and Nancy resume, in this respect, Bataille's concept of the "community of lovers," defined as temporary associations of singularities that act as liminal and disruptive spaces between the subject and society—"antisocial society or association, always ready to dissolve itself, formed by friends or couples" (Blanchot 33). Rodríguez Salas prefers the term "asociaciones afectivas" (14), seen to be more inclusive, and analyzes Mansfield's works around three specific associations: lovers, literary circles, and fraternal relations.

The second chapter, "Amantes", deals with the first of these alternative communities, characterized in Mansfield's short stories by failures of communication, but also by a mutual understanding of isolation: "Mansfield reemplaza la idea romántica de la fusión orgánica con una confrontación más realista con la finitud y una comprensión del aislamiento mutuo" (16). The first section, "Deseo y amor inmaduro,"

focuses on the short story "Something Childish but very Natural," which portrays an unreal and pseudo-platonic relationship, only feasible in liminal spaces—during a train ride, in dreams—which contrasts with the social conventions that the lovers encounter in the real world. The romantic idealization of their love is emphasized by Coleridge's poem, which gives the story its title, whereas social oppression is symbolized by the wearing of a hat. The second section, "Diálogos utópicos," analyzes "Psychology," in which the characters do open to alterity and have potential for social rupture and transformation, in spite of which their communication always ends up taking place throughout fictional dialogues inside their heads. Both of them are unable to verbalize and rationalize their feelings because they fail to acknowledge that physical communication requires other codes. The third section, "Matrimonio y adulterio," also exposes the gap between internal and external conversations, between those imagined and those verbalized in "The Black Cap." In this last story, gender stereotypes impede real connection through a truthful exploration and acceptance of alterity, which results in frustrating experiences of both marriage and adultery. In the final section, "Mansfield: amor romántico y maternidad simbólica," Rodríguez Salas traces parallelisms between the love relations of her characters and Mansfield's own autobiographical experience, going through the idealization of her husband, John Middleton Murry, her unfulfilled expectations of marital life and her failed attempts to become a mother.

The third chapter, "Círculos literarios y artísticos," revolves around the second of the affective associations observed in Mansfield's literary production and life. The first section, titled "El orden de los artistas," comments on the fact that Mansfield's colonial origins, and her extroverted and carefree character, were not well accepted in the literary circles of Bloomsbury, Garsington or Paris. Mansfield was torn between her wish to belong to an artistic community and her dislike of the elitism of its members, and the disguised forces of oppression and control those groups exerted. In this sense, Rodríguez Salas relates Bourdieu's ideas on modernist groups, which, in his view, searched for social disruption and autonomy only to end up constructing a new power structure, with Nancy's model of the operative community — "it will be a matter of a veritable structural subordination which acts very unequally on different authors according to their position in the field" (Bourdieu 49). The second section, "Sororidad artística: cartas y diarios," delves

into theories of female relationships in line with revisionist gender studies of the 1980s. In this regard, Rodríguez Salas employs Janice G. Raymond's distinction between "hetero-relations," which refer to "the wide range of affective, social, political, and economic relations that are ordained between men and women by men" (Raymond 7) —and which are, therefore, constructed by the "hetero-reality," that is to say, "the world view that woman exists always in relation to man" (Raymond 3)— and "Gyn/affection," which "can be defined as woman-to-woman attraction, influence, and movement" and often functions as "a synonym for female friendship" (Raymond 7). In addition, the author references Elizabeth Abel's view of female friendships as inherently different in nature; opposed to men's conception of friendship as instrumental and group-oriented, "friendship becomes a vehicle of self-definition for women, clarifying identity through relation to an other who embodies and reflects an essential aspect of the self" (Abel 416). Rodríguez Salas pertinently points out that Mansfield's failed attempts to build female friendships might have been due to the context of the "hetero-reality," while her rejection of female writing could be owed to an excessive identification with the other; he examines, in this respect, Mansfield's relationship with the painter Dorothy Brett and with the writers Sarah Gertrude Millin and Virginia Woolf. The third and last section of the chapter, "Sororidad artística: ficción," contains the analysis of two short stories, namely "Bliss" and "Carnation". "Bliss" depicts a party of intellectuals and artists around whom snobbism and compliance are palpable. The protagonist, Bertha Young, feels detached from such community and attempts, instead, to establish a relation with one of the female guests that can be understood in terms of the community of lovers: "Bertha, al seguir los designios de su cuerpo, está liberándose de ese entorno intellectual opresivo buscando una conexión sensorial con la señorita Fulton, con la que espera recrear su propio espacio […] [b]uscando la pulsión antisocial de la que hablaba Blanchot en su teorización de la comunidad de amantes" (59). Nevertheless, this effort to establish an alternative model of community ends up in enmity when Bertha finds that the woman is having an affair with her husband, which subjects both women to "hetero-relations". In opposition to this, in "Carnation," gyn/affection dominates over patriarchal structures in a French classroom where the decrepit and pathetic figure of the teacher serves as the perfect allegory for a critique of the male-dominated canon —"La historia es un ataque frontal al canon literario patriarcal y una

apología de la escritura de mujeres" (61). The female students of the class are presented as a solid literary community against their teacher; they metaphorically reject oppressive teachings and dominate the man with their sensuality, projected through the carnation, which stands as symbol of homosexuality.

The last chapter, "Intimidad Fraternal," delves into the last community of lovers by exploring Mansfield's relation with his brother Leslie, who died at the front during the First World War, and her subsequent fictional representations of siblings who encounter the shadow of death. The first section, "Pulsión de Muerte," takes into consideration the presence of death in Mansfield's own life, as she suffered from tuberculosis, and connects that to the recurrence of the *memento mori* motif in her fiction, exemplified, as Rodríguez Salas notes, by "The Wrong House," "Her First Ball" and "The Doll's House." The next section, "Intimidad fraternal y communion," looks into the death bond that Mansfield believed she shared with her brother and the enshrinement and mystification she creates around his figure and their connection: "Con Leslie, Mansfield crea una intimidad y proximidad alternativas a las de los amantes, sin el impulso sexual, donde la pureza del amor se ve realzada ante la inminencia de la muerte" (76). The third section, "La escritura del cuerpo: derrotar a la Muerte," analyzes two short stories in which the alterity of death is confronted through a notable corporeality. "The Wind Blows" depicts a fleeting connection between a brother and a sister when they find themselves out of their solitary routine and take off their hats—a symbol, as mentioned above, of social conventions and constraints—to experience the force of the wind, which stands as a symbol of death. The symbol of the wind is also used in "The Garden-Party" as an omen of death that briefly intrudes a bourgeois party before the death of a neighbor is announced. The girl later sees the corpse and has no words to account for that encounter when she tries to share it with her brother, who nevertheless manages to comprehend. Thus, using Nancy's correlation of corporeity with *epopteia* — "The mysterical *epopteia* […] is properly and absolutely a vision of death, an absolute, mysterical desire that cannot be fulfilled without blasting bodies apart" (*Corpus* 45)—, Rodríguez Salas concludes that the mystery of death in Mansfield's fiction cannot be revealed through communication or mystification, since it can only be expressed through direct corporeity (84).

In conclusion, Gerardo Rodríguez Salas provides a novel and enlightening contribution to the studies on Katherine Mansfield by exploring the affinities between the author's own views and experiences concerning community and affective relations and their fictional representations and interpretations. Moreover, Rodríguez Salas, through an insightful and well-structured literary analysis supported by a solid theoretical framework, allows for the categorization of Mansfield as a precursor of postmodernism, proving that the relations of small groups depicted in her works can function as social structures that act as liminal and disrupting spaces between the isolated modernist subject and the general community. Mansfield's intention, shared by postmodernist writers, to find and establish meaningful attachments in fiction that defy conventional senses of community in favour of the recognition of vulnerability and singularity is therefore demonstrated in this book, even if those were frequently interrupted or unattainable due to predominant social restrictions throughout Mansfield's lifetime. This discussion thus fosters a reflection on traditional conceptions regarding modernism and philosophy on community and invites further research on non-normative and liminal practices.

Works Cited

Abel, Elizabeth. "(E)Merging Identities: The Dynamics of Female Friendship in Contemporary Fiction by Women." *Signs*, vol. 6, no. 3, Spring 1981, pp. 413-435.

Blanchot, Maurice. *The Unavowable Community*. 1983. Translated by Pierre Joris, Station Hill Press, 1988.

Bourdieu, Pierre. *The Rules of Art: Genesis and Structure of the Literary Field*. 1992. Translated by Susan Emanuel, Stanford University Press, 1996.

Hutcheon, Linda. *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction*. 1988. Routledge, 1995.

Nancy, Jean-Luc. *Corpus*. 1992. Translated by Richard A. Rand, Fordham University Press, 2008.

---. *The Inoperative Community*. 1986. Translated by Peter Connor, Lisa Garbus, Michael Holland, and Simona Sawhney, University of Minnesota Press, 1991.

Raymond, Janice G. *A Passion for Friends: Towards a Philosophy of Female Affection*. Beacon Press, 1986.
Scott, Bonnie Kime, ed. *The Gender of Modernism: A Critical Anthology*. Indiana University Press, 1990.
Tönnies, Ferdinand. *Community and Civil Society*. 1887. Translated by Jose Harris and Margaret Hollis, Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Mirrlees, Hope. *París. Un Poema*, edición y traducción de María Isabel Porcel García, Cátedra (Letras Universales), 2022. 152 páginas

María Isabel Romero-Pérez (maribelromero@correo.ugr.es)
Universidad de Granada

(Helen) Hope Mirrlees fue una escritora y traductora de gran relevancia en el entretejido modernista europeo que, sin embargo, ha pasado a la posteridad de forma casi inadvertida y rondando los márgenes del canon modernista. El trabajo publicado de la autora consta de dos obras poéticas, *Paris: A Poem* (1920) y *Moods and Tensions: Poems* (1976); tres novelas, *Madeleine: One of Love's Jansenists* (1919), *Lud-in-the-Mist* (1926) y *The Counterplot* (1929); dos traducciones del ruso al inglés conjuntas con su compañera de vida y clasicista en Cambridge, Jane Ellen Harrison, *The Life of the Archpriest Avvakum by Himself* (1924) y *The Book of the Bear: Being Twenty-One Tales Newly Translated form the Russian* (1926); una biografía, *A Fly in Amber: Being an Extravagant Biography of the Romantic Antiquary Sir Robert Bruce Cotton* (1962); y una reedición póstuma de *Paris* (que además alberga un apéndice de anotaciones y un poema inédito que Harrison dedicó a Mirrlees en 1921: "To Her. A twilight poem") junto a una colección de poemas y ensayos en un volumen editado por Sandeep Parmar titulado *Collected Poems* (2011). Únicamente *The Counterplot* fue traducida al francés en paralelo al año de publicación del original por Simone Martin-Chauffier con el título de *Le Choc en Retour*, incorporando un epílogo de Charles Du Bos. En el caso de la obra que nos ocupa, a las puertas del centenario de su publicación, *Paris: A Poem* ha sido recientemente traducido al español de la mano de María Isabel Porcel García como *París. Un Poema* (2022) como parte de la colección Letras Universales para ediciones Cátedra.

Con una intención de ser fidedigna al texto original y un imperativo académico para con los estudios feministas y joyceanos, la traducción de Porcel García ahonda en una edición del poema que maduró en imprenta entre 1919 y 1920 y que, a pesar de haber sido acotada en un principio a una tirada de 175 copias, fue decisiva para la revisión académica de Mirrlees por Julia Briggs y Sandeep Parmar a principios de los años 2000. *París* se alza como una piedra angular del modernismo, un trabajo pionero que antecedió en dos años a *La Tierra Baldía* (1922), siendo ambos ejemplares modernistas del método mítico, y que Porcel García

examina en esta edición de una obra poética cuyos entresijos yacen esperando a ser descubiertos. En la traducción se marca la relevancia de la obra y su autora atendiendo a la premisa de conservación artística de Mirrlees que desarrolló en su tratado sobre la historia, la biografía y el anticuariado en *A Fly in Amber*. Mirrlees se convierte en anticuaria en la génesis de *París*, cuya tarea es la de recuperar el pasado e inmortalizar el presente de forma tangible, transformándolo en poesía mientras que, a su vez, Porcel García restaura y preserva el poema como repositorio cultural y documento historiográfico. Si situamos *París* como punto de referencia en la literatura modernista en lengua inglesa, como bien señala Porcel García (11) en la propia introducción, "no es aventurado ni fortuito aseverar" que dichos versos de Mirrlees comparten una trascendencia reputada como la propia de James Joyce en la novela o de T. S. Eliot en el campo poético. Porcel García retoma la premisa del olvido sistemático (o mayormente institucional) de la obra de la autora, que figura en antologías modernistas o libros de referencia de forma casi anecdótica y, en la práctica, con alusión exclusiva a *París*. Será en este sentido motivación filológica e hilo conductor de Porcel García para focalizar en esta edición la labor artística e incluso artesanal de la propia Mirrlees, de su editora Virginia Woolf, y del acervo modernista de principios del siglo XX. Esta edición se estructura en cinco secciones principales: una introducción sobre la autora y su obra, *París,* con respecto al modernismo de sus contemporáneos (dividida a su vez en los siguientes epígrafes: "Hope Mirrlees en el contexto modernista," "Apuntes biográficos sobre la autora: un 'misterio' por descubrir," "El estilo literario y estético en la(s) obra(s) de la autora," "Breve guía de lectura para *París. Un poema*," "Los mitos, la cultura clásica y la diosa de Isis en *París. Un poema*"), un comentario acerca de la edición y traducción, una exhaustiva bibliografía de fuentes primarias y secundarias sobre la autora, el propio poema anotado junto con las notas originales de Mirrlees y una sección final que contiene las notas críticas de Porcel García. Con esta elección de contenidos, se pone de manifiesto el interés literario y académico de *París*, que no sólo reabre el atractivo clasicista durante el modernismo, sino que también resitúa de forma sólida a Mirrlees en la línea canónica temporal de sus contemporáneos masculinos.

Al comienzo de esta edición Porcel García enfatiza la ausencia velada de la autora en el canon de la crítica literaria y, por consiguiente, la necesidad de estudio de esta con respecto a sus escritoras coetáneas

(Virginia Woolf, Vita Sackville-West o Hilda Doolittle, también conocida como H.D., entre otras muchas) y al paradigma modernista. Mirrlees, afirma John T. Connor (178), es un desafío a la historia literaria, una de las piezas restantes del rompecabezas humanista que había hecho el modernismo a su medida en la crónica historiográfica. Asimismo, Porcel García (12) advierte que *París* comprende los axiomas del paradigma modernista (en tanto como se documenta la obra de Joyce en sus descripciones de la ciudad de Dublín) en "su gusto por lo 'oculto', la fragmentación, el carácter o el 'método mítico' como trasfondo de composición de la base, las alusiones literarias, políticas, culturales e históricas, la variedad de voces y registros, la cacofonía de algunos recursos fonéticos, y la yuxtaposición de versos, la falta de reglas formales prosódicas, la multirreferencialidad cultural e intertextualidades, de todo tipo."

Con este planteamiento, Porcel García ejerce un efecto bipartito en la edición. Por una parte, resitúa el valor modernista de *París* en una cronología atemporal (si atendemos a las implicaciones eventuales de un poema que fusiona pasado, presente y futuro en una misma pieza); por otra parte, ejecuta un ejercicio reparador de la memoria de mujeres escritoras, quienes enriquecieron el entramado cultural con aportaciones (de mecenazgo, edición, distribución o sociales) más allá de sus escritos. El nombre de Mirrlees ronda (en su gran mayoría, de forma pasajera) las biografías, fotografías, diarios y correspondencia de intelectuales reconocidos, como el matrimonio de los Woolf, T. S. Eliot, Lady Ottoline Morrell, Bertrand Russel, Katherine Mansfield o Gertrude Stein. Las obras de Mirrlees fueron reconocidas por sus contemporáneos y contemporáneas, como Jane Harrison, Virginia Woolf, T. S. Eliot, Christopher Isherwood, Reginald Brimley Johnson o Lady Robert Cecil. Sin embargo, Mirrlees ha sido mencionada en la crítica como una modernista olvidada o periférica con respecto al grupo Bloomsbury londinense, o incluso adyacente a los salones parisinos de Stein. Al igual que Julia Strachey, Hope Mirrlees fue al modernismo lo que Eleanor Alice Burford Hibbert (bajo el pseudónimo de Victoria Holt) a la novela neo-victoriana, es decir, una de las escritoras más menospreciadas y desconocidas de su misma época, tal y como observa Suzanne Henig (8).

Tal y como nos adelanta Porcel García (12) en la apertura de su edición, *París* es muestra de la escritura genuina de Mirrlees, un escrito legítimo en la complejidad con la que su autora estaba familiarizada con la composición poética, "estilística y prosódica." A pesar de las afirmaciones de Joyce sobre *La Tierra Baldía* como exponente del final de la idea de poesía para las mujeres (como avezadas intelectuales) (Ellmann 495), *París* prosigue una genealogía de modernistas que afianzaron una tradición literaria de escritoras. *París* es la prueba remanente del cometido literario de las poetas modernistas (entre las que destaca el retrato de Londres que figura Nancy Cunard en su poema *Parallax,* reminiscente al de Mirrlees y publicado en 1925 para la Hogarth Press) que, a pesar de la aseveración de Joyce, sí que influyó en modernistas circundantes a la Hogarth Press, como fue el caso de Woolf en la redacción por excelencia de *El Cuarto de Jacob* (1922) (Briggs 5).

Una vez contextualizadas autora y obra en el enclave literario modernista, Porcel García vincula *París* con las sucesivas novelas de Mirrlees (*Madeleine, The Counterplot* y *Lud*). La revisión de *París* va a convertir al poema en un receptáculo de los temas que Mirrlees desarrollará en sus siguientes obras, entre ellos el mundo clásico, los antiguos mitos, la mujer, la historia, el arte y el ritual. De hecho, *Madeleine*, novela con la que *París* comparte referencias culturales, va a reivindicar una tradición de *salonnières*, de mujeres cuya influencia fue determinante en el terreno cultural, pero cuya narrativa se ha satirizado o se ha postergado de forma secundaria en la historia. Ambas obras muestran una remitificación de la mujer desde el anteriormente masculinizado clasicismo, así como su cometido como artista. Se asimilan ambas obras en efigie de la mujer, primordial en los "roles sociales, artísticos, culturales y religiosos" (Porcel García 32). Si atendemos a las menciones de Mirrlees en la correspondencia de Woolf, se evidencia que *París* fue con toda certeza gestada bajo el influjo de ideas ya contenidas en *Madeleine.* En una carta dirigida a Lady Cecil y fechada a 1 de septiembre de 1925, Woolf comenta la ardua tarea en la publicación de *Madeleine*, la cual Mirrlees tardó varios años en escribir y fue en principio rechazada por seis o siete editoriales (Woolf 201). Estos datos subrayan la tarea editorial, la cuestión de la literatura escrita por mujeres y la retroalimentación intertextual con el modernismo y con respecto a otros textos de la misma autora, cuyas cualidades de carácter artístico y filológico concurren en paralelo al formato y las elecciones de revisión y traducción de Porcel García.

Para esta edición, Porcel García (57) nos remite al texto original, bilingüe, manteniendo algunos versos en francés con motivo de respetar la "multirreferencialidad lingüística" del texto, con una alianza cruzada entre el inglés, francés y español. Con respecto al proceso traductológico, Porcel García pone en práctica la propuesta de George Steiner, esto es, retiene una serie de versos en francés, cuyo léxico custodia y anota cuando la referencia lo precisa. Con la finalidad de ejemplificar lo descrito, se citan a continuación los versos del 166 al 170 (Mirrlees 90, 91) en la edición aquí revisada:

> Echoes of Bossuet chanting dead queens.
> *méticuleux*
> *belligérants*
> *immonde*
>
> Ecos de Bossuet cantando reinas muertas.
> *méticuleux*
> *belligérants*
> *hebdomadaire*
> *immonde.*

Porcel García (132) conserva las cualidades sonoras del original en la traducción y anota las referencias a la oración en mención al clérigo Jacques-Bénigne Bossuet y a las voces dispersas en francés de una posible multitud en un café parisino o en los recortes de prensa sobre la Gran Guerra. En este sentido, esta reproducción del texto contribuye a enfatizar aún más el carácter dual de la obra que Nina Enemark (2014) califica como un objecto entre lo visual y lo auditivo. En líneas generales, *París* se asemeja como artefacto literario a lo que fueron las obras de Eliot o *Finnegans Wake* de Joyce. Junto con las anotaciones de Mirrlees en su modelo de anticuariado, *París* es un canto y un artefacto si atendemos a hipótesis de Enemark, afín a la visión de Porcel García (55), sobre la fragmentación de la poesía en los papiros egipcios:

> ¿Es acaso la representación del texto poético un extracto ficticio de un papiro ya que su comienzo *in media res* nos deja desde el principio, con una cierta incertidumbre y un sentido de pérdida espaciotemporal? ¿Acaso el poema es una ficticia construcción que imitara una hoja arrancada de algún papiro de fórmulas empleadas en rituales 'mágicos' o de los misterios isiacos?

Coinciden la convergencia entre lo material y lo inmaterial con las ausencias y las presencias del poema, el ciclo de la vida tras la Primera Guerra Mundial, la Conferencia de la Paz de París y la firma del Tratado de Versalles. Porcel García reconoce a la ciudad como tropo, como una visión a caballo entre el impresionismo y surrealismo modernistas, un testigo libertador de la posguerra. *París* es aquí retratada como una "psicogeografía," en consecuencia, como un estudio de los dorados o locos años veinte (Porcel García 36). En el palimpsesto modernista, o aproximadamente metatexto, el estilo experimental, los espacios en blanco, la tipografía y su evocación a la poesía de Guillaume Apollinaire que caracterizan la de Mirrlees se mantienen en esta edición actual, tal y como se observa en los versos del 1 al 14 (Mirrlees 77), que reproducimos a continuación:

Quiero una holofrase

NORD-SUD
ZIG-ZAG
LION NOIR
CACAO BLOOKER

Ánforas de figuras negras en tumbas etruscas

RUE DU BAC (DUBONNET)
SOLFERINO (DUBONET)
CHAMBRE DES DEPUTES

Brekekekek coax coax cruzamos por debajo del Sena

DUBONNET

La Mujer Escarlata gritando BYRRH ensordece
a san Juan en Patmos

Vous descendez Madame?

Si nos adentramos plenamente en la sección dedicada al propio poema, hallamos un gran *collage* de posibilidades. En los 445 versos, la voz poética de *París* toma la forma de un paseante que recorre la ciudad en proyección con la tradición francesa del *flâneur* de Charles Baudelaire en sus escritos como, por ejemplo, *El Pintor de la Vida Moderna* (1863) o el *Spleen de París: Pequeños Poemas en Prosa* (1869). El paseante, o la paseante si atendemos a la voz de Mirrlees, finalmente termina su

itinerario al anochecer, casi con certeza de vuelta a la habitación de hotel, como la que la autora compartía con Harrison y bajo el que firma en el 3 de la Rue de Beaune de París. Esta paseante que Porcel García (42) entrevé en esta edición es parte de la redefinición del concepto de *flâneuse* propuesto por Lauren Elkin (288), quien señala cómo la misma no se limita a observar como único interés, en cambio, es trasgresora de lo establecido, decide observar o no observar, ocupar el espacio o no hacerlo, y organizar este último acorde a sus propios términos. La *flâneuse* de *París* realiza un viaje espaciotemporal que transita la geografía e historia de la capital, los modernos centros comerciales, el metro, el Moulin Rouge, Notre-Dame, los Campos Elíseos, el río Aqueronte de la mitología griega y los cambios arquitectónicos en la ciudad tras la Haussmanización en el siglo XIX. La experiencia de la paseante de *París* permea en el lector y lo sumerge en las observaciones de esta como si fuesen las suyas propias, o como si en aras de la vieja París de Baudelaire, el lector fuese otro testigo del entramado modernista de 1919.

A modo de conclusión, la edición bilingüe de María Isabel Porcel García atañerá a la reconstrucción (feminista) del canon modernista y a la revalorización y relocalización de la escritura de mujeres que mantuvieron la tradición literaria reclamada por Virginia Woolf en *Una habitación propia* (1929), ya iniciada por sus precursoras hoy reconocidas, Jane Austen y las hermanas Brontë. El trabajo de ensamblaje en esta edición no ha estado exento de dificultad, pero sí colmado de méritos. El resultado es un estudio impecable, minucioso y que, ante la ausencia de traducciones previas, se erige como un acercamiento necesario a la literatura modernista, con exactitud, a aquella escrita por mujeres y a la no canónica. El valor de esta edición no sólo radica en la novedad editorial, sino también en la investigación académica acerca del poema. Las anotaciones de Porcel García son más que necesarias para la comprensión de *París*, pues es la edición anotada del poema más completa y exhaustiva publicada hasta la fecha.

Un siglo después de la publicación inicial del poema, esta edición abre nuevas vías de investigación sobre la vida y obra de Hope Mirrlees. Se habilita la revisión de *París* como fuente de convergencias socioculturales, de carácter historicista al mismo tiempo que mítico. En definitiva, la traducción de *París* amplía el horizonte de la obra al público hispanoparlante, a un nuevo contexto geográfico y a nuevas posibilidades de estudio y traducción del resto de su obra.

Notas

[1] La redacción de esta reseña tuvo lugar en el trascurso de una estancia de movilidad internacional Erasmus + Traineeship en Trinity College Dublin, The University of Dublin.

[2] El actual catálogo de la British Library recoge dos libros más de poesía escritos por Mirrlees, *Moods and Tensions: Seventeen Poems* (1920) y *Poems* (1962), cuyo contenido se encuentra posiblemente recogido de forma conjunta en su publicación ulterior, *Moods and Tensions: Poems* (1976).

[3] El 30 de octubre de 2021 la BBC Radio 4 emitió una adaptación de *Lud* en formato radioteatro, guionizada por Joy Wilkinson, y en la que Neil Gaiman interpretó al duque Aubrey.

[4] Con posterioridad a su lanzamiento, exclusivamente *Paris* (1973; 2007; 2020) y *Lud* (1970; 2000; 2013) han contado con la suficiente notoriedad para ser reeditadas. En 1973, *Paris* fue reimpreso con alteraciones de Mirrlees en varios versos para el primer volumen de la revista *Virginia Woolf Quarterly,* entonces editada por Suzanne Henig. En 2007, una copia facsímil de *Paris* fue incluida por Julia Briggs en la monografía de Bonnie Kime Scott, *Gender in Modernism.*

[5] Las primeras traducciones de *Lud* aparecen en los años 2000, tal y como es el caso de la versión de Hannes Riffel, *Flucht ins Feenland* (2003) en alemán, o la de Emilio Mayorga, *Entrebrumas* (2005) en español. La versión de Mayorga es casi una serendipia, un reconocimiento a una obra precursora del género de fantasía, impresa en 2005 por ediciones Minotauro, y ciertamente fruto del redescubrimiento de Michael Swanwick (2009) y Neil Gaiman (2020) de un libro que evoca a *El Hobbit* (1937) de J. R. R. Tolkien (Carter ix; Mills 97).

[6] Entre los años 2020 y 2022, Project Gutenberg llevó a cabo un proyecto de digitalización de *Madeleine: One of Love's Jansenists*, *Lud-in-the-Mist* y *The Counterplot.*

[7] Al tiempo que Henig (8) escribe sobre Mirrlees y la importancia de su obra publicada hasta entonces, la autora se encontraba presuntamente trabajando en un segundo volumen de la biografía de Sir Robert Bruce Cotton, el cual no llegó a publicar.

[8] Como una muestra de afinidad al modernismo de Eliot, Joyce anota en su cuaderno (actualmente archivado en la Universidad Estatal de Nueva York en Búfalo) lo siguiente: "T. S. Eliot ends idea of poetry for ladies" (como se citó en Ellmann 495). No obstante, el éxito de su *Ulises* (1922) estará posiblemente en deuda perpetua con las aportaciones

de muchas de sus contemporáneas, entre ellas, Harriet Shaw Weaver, Margaret Anderson, Jane Heap y Sylvia Beach (see Hutton).

[9] El ensayo de Woolf *Una Habitación Propia* y los volúmenes críticos de Susan Gilbert y Sandra Gubar, *No Man's Land* (1988-1994), pusieron el foco en la existencia de una tradición literaria de mujeres que precedió a las modernistas y aún latente en sus idearios.

[10] En el contexto inglés, la formación en los clásicos había sido una demarcación de género hasta la entrada de las mujeres en facultades y universidades a finales del siglo XIX. El estudio del latín y el griego ofrecía a sus alumnos una "*patrius sermo*" privilegiada frente a la "*maternal lingua*" (Gilbert y Gubar 243-271).

[11] Los versos que se incluyen en francés aparecen traducidos en las notas críticas finales. Porcel García (57) salvaguarda los anuncios, carteles y topónimos en francés del original que Mirrlees emplea para "crear ese falso sentido de verosimilitud" con la ciudad.

[12] Según Elkin (96), los propios parisinos han retratado con especialidad los elementos que ha perdido París en preferencia a los que aún se conservan a la vista.

Obras citadas

Briggs, Julia. *Reading Virginia Woolf*. Edinburgh UP, 2006.

Carter, Lin. Introduction, "About LUD-IN-THE-MIST and Hope Mirrlees: The Golden Apples of the West." *Lud-in-the-Mist* de Hope Mirrlees, 1972. Ballantine Books, 1970, pp. vii-x.

Connor, John T. "Hope Mirrlees and the Archive of Modernism." Reseña de *Collected Poems,* editado por Sandeep Parmar, *Journal of Modern Literature*, 37, 2 Invierno de 2014, pp. 177-182.

Elkin, Lauren. *Flâneuse: Women Walk the City in Paris, New York, Tokyo, Venice and London.* Penguin Random House UK (VINTAGE), 2017.

Ellmann, Richard. *James Joyce*. Oxford UP, 1982.

Enemark, Nina. "Poetry as Preservation Ritual: Jane Harrison, Antiquarianism and Hope Mirrlees's *Paris*." *Interactions,* vol. 23, no. 1-2, 2014.

Gaiman, Neil. Introduction. *Lud-in-the-Mist* de Hope Mirrlees, 1926. Millenium, 2020, pp. vii-viii.

Gilbert, Sandra M., y Susan Gubar, *No Man's Land: The Place of the Woman Writer in the Twentieth Century. Volume 1: The War of the Words.* Yale UP, 1988.

Henig, Suzanne. "Queen of Lud: Hope Mirrlees." *Virginia Woolf Quarterly*, vol. 1, no. 1, 1972, pp. 8-22.

Hutton, Clare. "Curator's Introduction." Women and the Making of Joyce's Ulysses Conferencia, 2 de febrero de 2022, (online) Loughborough University.

Mills, Jean. *Virginia Woolf, Jane Ellen Harrison and the Spirit of Classicism*. Ohio State UP, 2014.

Mirrlees, Hope. *París. Un Poema*. Traducido por María Isabel Porcel García, Cátedra (Letras Universales), 2022.

Swanwick, Michael. *Hope-in-the-Mist: The Extraordinary Career and Mysterious Life of Hope Mirrlees*. Temporary Culture, 2009.

Woolf, Virginia. *Change of Perspective: The Letters of Virginia Woolf. Vol. 3: 1923-1928,* editado por Nigel Nicolson y Joanne Trautmann, Hogarth Press, 1977.

Artigos / Artículos / Articles / Artikel

'Forever young': The eternal child archetype in the post-apocalyptic world of Gary Shteyngart's *Super Sad True Love Story* (2010).
David Brandt Ablanedo (MA graduate - U. Vigo) ------------------------------ 7

Early Modern Spanish and Portuguese Material Culture in the Works of James Shirley (1596-1666).
Eroulla Demetriou & Luciano García (U. Jaén)---------------------------------- 27

An Approach to Transtextuality in Kate Morton's *The Forgotten Garden*: Traces of Victorian Novels, Gothic Fiction, Fairy Tales, and Classical Myths.
Marta Miquel-Baldellou (U. Lleida)--- 55

Victorian Women in Gaskell's Gothic Tales: A Study on "Lois the Witch," "The Grey Woman" and "The Old Nurse's Story."
Blanca Puchol Vázquez (U. Complutense de Madrid)--------------------------- 79

Natural Imagery in Margaret Atwood's Recent Poetry.
Pilar Sánchez Calle (U. Jaén)--- 101

Recensións / Reseñas / Reviews / Rezensionen

Llàcer, Eusebio V. *El placer estético del terror: tres cuentos de Edgar Allan Poe*. Publicacions de la Universitat de València, 2022, 180 páginas.
Juan José Calvo García de Leonardo (U. València) ------------------------------ 127

Beaumont, Francis y John Fletcher. *El necio (The Coxcomb)*. Traducción, introducción y notas de Francisco J. Borge, Luna de Abajo, 2023, 176 páginas.
José Montero Reguera (U. Vigo) --- 133

Mocanu-Florea, Vasilica. *Language Learning in Study Abroad: Social, Cultural, and Identity-Related Factors. Erasmus Students in Northern, Southern, and Eastern-European English as Lingua Franca Contexts*. Publicacions de la Universitat de València, 2023, 219 pages.
Sofía Peña Fernández (U. Salamanca) -- 139

Rodríguez Salas, Gerardo. *Vivir sola es morir: El modernismo comunitario de Katherine Mansfield*. Editorial Comares, 2023, 104 pages.
Antía Román Sotelo (U. Santiago de Compostela)------------------------------ 145

Mirrlees, Hope. *París. Un Poema*, edición y traducción de María Isabel Porcel García, Cátedra (Letras Universales), 2022, 152 páginas.
María Isabel Romero-Pérez (U. Granada) ------------------------------------ 153